RISING VOICES: BEDOUIN YOUTH NAVIGATING EDUCATION AND THE FUTURE AMIDST PROTRACTED CONFLICT

by

Terra Alysa Tolley
A Dissertation
Submitted to the
Graduate Faculty
of
George Mason University
in Partial Fulfillment of
The Requirements for the Degree
of
Doctor of Philosophy
Conflict Analysis and Resolution

Committee:

___________________________________________  Chair of Committee

___________________________________________

___________________________________________

___________________________________________  Graduate Program Director

___________________________________________  Dean, School for Conflict Analysis and Resolution

Date:  _________________________________  Summer Semester 2015
        George Mason University
        Fairfax, VA
Rising Voices: Bedouin Youth Navigating Education and the Future amidst Protracted Conflict

A Dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at George Mason University

by

Terra Alysa Tolley
Master of Science
George Mason University, 2009
Bachelor of Arts
Lewis and Clark College, 2004

Director: Susan Hirsch, Professor
School for Conflict Analysis and Resolution

Summer Semester 2015
George Mason University
Fairfax, VA
This work is licensed under a creative commons attribution-noderivs 3.0 unported license.
DEDICATION

This is dedicated to all those I love and to all those I have lost throughout this process. Dr. Wallace Warfield’s last words to me were a reminder to follow the heart and preserve authenticity. Dr. Ken Pool taught me that every morning is glorious. This is for you both.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank the students, faculty and staff of Ahed School for allowing me into their world. It is an inspiration to those of us working in the fields of conflict analysis and resolution and education! This dissertation would not have been possible without the energy and support of Wendy Sternberg the CEO of Genesis at the Crossroads and my initial introduction to Bedouin education in the Naqab.

I also would like to thank the village of Lakiya which now feels like a second home to me. Thank you to all the families for feeding me, laughing with me and teaching me Bedouin Arabic, customs and humor. I am especially indebted to the Abu Bader, Elbedour and El Sana families. I hope one day my maglooba will taste nearly as delicious as yours Sara!

I offer my utmost appreciation for the support and faith of many people allowed this process to take place: My glorious committee members Dr. Susan Hirsch, Dr. Sandy Cheldelin and Dr. Al Fuertes. Thank you for all the faith, input, patience and energy! I am fortunate to have colleagues like Megan Price, Roland Wilson, Phil Gamaghelyan, Tres Thomas, Jay Moon, Saba Kidane, Gul Gur, Lori-Ann Stephenson and many more. Thank you all for keeping me inspired.

I would also like to thank my dissertation “coaches” and SCAR alumnae Jessica Felix-Romero and Jennifer Rowley. Thank you Dr. Terese Finitzo and Dr. Ken Pool for all your support and patience. To Brendan Hieber– thank you for starting this whole expedition. Dana and Doron Zulikan this research was possible because of you two.

Finally, to my mother, Melanie Tolley, who always has faith in me and to my father, Rick Tolley, for being my number one fan.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter One: Entering the Desert</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evolution of the Project</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem Statement</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rising Voices</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Story of Ahed School</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Multiple Meanings of Bedouin</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in Bedouin Culture and Land</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education as a Locus of Contention</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Scope of the Dissertation</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Two: Exploration of the Literature</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education as Conflict Prevention and Post Conflict Development</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Power of History Education</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education as Liberation</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamics of Race, Identity and Violence through Education</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bedouin Experiences of Conflict and Marginalization</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcoming Marginalization and Increasing Agency</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reviewing Dynamics of Religion and Gender</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploring Culture and Ethnic Identity</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Three: Research Methodology and Analysis</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Questions</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Design and Data Collection</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Analysis</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitivity of Ethnography</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complexity of Fieldwork and Ethical Discussion</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Four: Navigating Gender, Education, Culture and Economic Opportunity</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navigating Culture, Gender, Education and Economic Opportunity</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Politics and Economics of Bedouin Education</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO Responses to Gender and Education</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender, Conflict and Economy</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges and Celebrations for Women</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women and Health Care</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Five: Ahed School - A Dream in The Making</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Landscape of Ahed School</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Amal Network</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education in Construction: School Access</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bedouin Student Identities</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profiles of Ahed School</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marginalization versus Empowerment</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Founder and his Daughters</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Heartbroken Poet</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The English Teacher</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alienation versus Acceptance</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Weaver</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Patient</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Transfer Students</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those Who Must Choose</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe Spaces for Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Tracker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Political Youth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Graduate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Non Terrorist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Six: Negotiation in Practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program on Negotiation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Negotiations in Practice” and the Young Negotiators Network</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting to Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiation in Practice Conflict Scenarios</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict Workshop One: Israeli Gas Opportunity Scenario</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict Workshop Two: The Sakhnin/Misgav Land Conflict Scenario</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant Responses to Conflict Scenario Workshops</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responses to the Overall “Negotiations in Practice” Conference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debate and Conflict Resolution in Schools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PON in Practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Culture of Negotiation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Seven: Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Strengths and Vulnerabilities of Ahed School</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demarginalization and Assimilation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revisiting CAR in the Schools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possibilities for Ahed Graduates</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Further Research and Action</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afterword: Reflecting on the Desert</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix One: Interview Questions ................................................................. 277
Appendix Two: Review of the Voices of Ahed School ....................................... 278
Appendix Three: Program on Negotiation Agenda ........................................... 281
References .......................................................................................................... 284
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1 Average Years of Education among Bedouin, Arab-Israeli and Jewish Men and Women, Age 15+, 1990-2007</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.1 Bagrut Certificate Examination Results</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.2 Themes from Participant Responses</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.1. Layout of Sayag and Designated Bedouin Communities</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.1. Bedouin Youth and Sheik on Garbage Mound in Unrecognized Village. Image demonstrates the exposure to emissions from the power plant</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.1 Research Design</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1 Boundary Map of Area Settlements</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.2 Extent of Bedouin Traditions</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.3 Themes Representing the Tension between Experiences of Marginalization and Empowerment</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.4 Themes Representing the Tension between Experiences of Alienation and Acceptance</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.5 Themes Representing the Tension between Experiences of Alienation Violence and Safety in Education and Community</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.6 The Weaving of Education</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.7 Fruitful Land</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.8 O’Live Olive</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.9 Proud Mama</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.1 Contested Economic Zones by Country</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Ahed School for Science.......................................................... Ahed School
Amal Network............................................................................ Amal
Conflict Analysis and Resolution ........................................... CAR
International Relations and Security Network ......................... ISN
Middle East Negotiation Initiative ......................................... MENI
Middle East Peace Institute ...................................................... MEPI
Ministry of Education ............................................................... MOE
Program on Negotiation (Harvard Law School) ......................... PON
Young Negotiators Network ...................................................... YNN
ABSTRACT

RISING VOICES: BEDOUIN YOUTH NAVIGATING EDUCATION AND THE FUTURE AMIDST PROTRACTED CONFLICT

Terra Alysa Tolley, Ph.D.
George Mason University, 2015
Dissertation Director: Dr. Susan Hirsch

Access to education is one of the foundational steps to improving agency and equality in a social system, and it is a prominent theme in the responses to conflict through peacebuilding, international development, and the conflict analysis and resolution field more broadly. Bedouin youth are the most academically marginalized and the lowest performing population within Israel. Ahed School, a Bedouin high school for science and technology in the Naqab, is an exception in that it is outperforming the majority of Israeli schools. This modified ethnographic case study draws on field interviews of students, educators, and a wide range of Bedouin community members, to analyze the role of education amidst protracted conflict. The argument is made that the very educational systems that can enhance agency for marginalized populations in a conflict setting may also lessen the saliency of Bedouin cultural and ethnic identity. Moreover, such schools might further the Israeli state agenda of Bedouin assimilation and acquiescence. The
focus on Ahed School in a landscape of asymmetric conflict illuminates multilayered
tensions, such as marginalization versus empowerment, alienation versus acceptance, and
violent versus safe spaces for education, all of which may be relevant for understanding
other, similar contexts. The analysis shows how the model of education promoted in the
Ahed School both challenges and supports traditional notions of Bedouin culture, gender
dynamics, and identity. Overall, the dissertation shows that educational systems provide
a key site for addressing conflict.
CHAPTER ONE:
ENTERING THE DESERT

Introduction

Since the 2011 “Arab uprisings” throughout the Middle East and North Africa (MENA), armed conflict has increased in 76 countries (Maplecroft, 2014, pp. 1–3). Violence has destroyed lives, economies and communities. The highest amount of wars since the Cold War are now taking place (Pinker & Mack, 2014). Following the completion of World War I, the world has observed the Israeli/Palestinian conflict in its evolution. In 2015 the voices of Israeli politicians stir debate in the United States congress over Iran (Dovere, 2015) while British graffiti artist Banksy advocates for Palestinian rights through political images in the ruins of Gaza (Akkoc, 2015). In the recent Israeli/Palestinian conflict schools have been bombed, teenagers have been used as weapons of war, and people are struggling to provide safety, food and security for their families. Yet, on the border of this conflict is an unusual story of hope, education and demarginalization in a contested land.

This dissertation investigates an educational success story in the Bedouin\(^1\) village of Hura in Israel/Palestine\(^2\) where a unique Bedouin high school has brought students

---

\(^1\) Bedouin/Beduin/Bedun all are terms for the same tribal people. Bedouin/s can be plural with or without the “s”.

\(^2\) The author elects to use the term Israel/Palestine to represent the contested land, much like Carroll 2012, Dowty 2008, and Shalaim 2009.
from the lowest national academic performance rates to outperforming top Israeli schools and creating international scholars (R. Abu Rabia, 2010; Ahed School for Science, 2013; Guarnieri, 2010; “Israeli Science High School Advances Bedouin Community,” 2011). This analysis is important to the fields of international conflict and resolution, education, and development, because it highlights the complexities and tensions surrounding the role the education in a landscape of asymmetric conflict.

This dissertation analyzes theories of education and conflict, alienation and assimilation, culture and ethnic identity, and shares the voices of Bedouin youth in their attempts to negotiate culture and conflict in the pursuit of education and entrance into adulthood and Israeli society. This chapter begins with a description of how this project evolved and is followed by the problem statement. The chapter then continues to share perspectives of Bedouin youth in the Naqab/Negev Desert. The background information begins with the voices of young Bedouin trying to design their futures, then it moves into the study of Ahed School and the surrounding community tensions. The section following highlights multiple interpretations of what it means to be “Bedouin”. The chapter concludes with the scope of the study and the aims of the dissertation.

### Evolution of the Project

I have been interested in the role of education in conflict areas, as well as the traditions of nomadic tribes since 2003 when I was a guest of the nomadic Hadza tribes in

---

3 The desert area is widely referred to as the Negev (Hebrew) and al-Naqab (Arabic). Beer Sheba is located in the northern section of the desert, and the southern region includes the city of Eilat. This analysis will refer to it as Negev and Nagab interchangeably, dependent on the representation by the interviewees or sources.
Tanzania, and witness to the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda in Arusha. Once I arrived in the Naqab, nearly a decade later, I found similar negotiations of young people working to preserve ancestral nomadic knowledge while integrating into new economies, and education systems, in areas still affected by local and regional conflict. In the Bedouin communities of Hura and Lakiya, the population of youth is growing rapidly, and this generation of young people are poised to make, and experience, dramatic transformations in their way of life (Abu-Rabia, 2001; Aburabia-Queder, 2011; Gradstein, 2013).

I was introduced to Ahed School, and the recognized village of Lakiya\(^4\), through my work as a board member for the non-profit Genesis at the Crossroads (GATC) which has collaborated with the school since 2011, conducting cross-cultural artistic, educational and humanitarian programs. The community represented an intersection of my interests as an experiential learning educator and conflict analyst. I have traveled, researched, and worked in over 90 countries, and this case study exposed a new dimension to education in conflict areas. The story of Ahed School outperforming top Israeli schools presented a counter-intuitive story. How could the most economically and marginalized population in Israel flourish? This school represents what conflict analysts and educators are yearning for – educational systems that work. This is how my research began.

I gained introduction into the Nagab Desert’s Israeli Bedouin villages in the spring of 2012, and first visited and stayed with Bedouin families in the summer of 2012.

\(^4\) Also known as “Lakiye”, “Laqye”, “Laquia”.

This is when I conducted preliminary background research within the village of Lakiya\(^5\), at Ben-Gurion University, and at the A’dalah Naqab Office. I returned to the Naqab in May and June of 2013 to conduct interviews, guided discussions and participant observation within Ahed School the surrounding communities. During the third field visit in the fall of 2013, I conducted small focus groups with Ahed School students, and alumni. I also attended Harvard University’s Program on Negotiation (PON) Conference “Negotiation in Practice,” which was co-sponsored by the United States Embassy in Tel Aviv. I attended the conference alongside Ahed School students and faculty. The PON event, alongside interviews, focus groups, and participant observation, shaped this dissertation.

During my field visits in 2012 and 2013 I lived with Bedouin families in the Naqab, participating in daily activities of cooking, child rearing, gardening, prayer and the grocery shopping. During school days, I visited Ahed School, local NGOs, and an elementary school where my host sister is an instructor. I also visited unrecognized\(^6\) villages, University sessions regarding Bedouin land rights and culture, and community activities such as wedding celebrations and feasts remembering loved ones passed. These opportunities allowed me to observe and participate in the culture of the communities, while gaining acceptance and insights into the villages. My preliminary fieldwork in

\(^5\) Lakiya is one of the seven primary Bedouin settlements in the Naqab. It was originally designated in 1975, but construction was halted because the Israeli Authority was worried about its proximity to the southern Hebron hills and that the proximity may align the villagers with Palestinians in the West Bank and Gaza Strip. Construction resumed and in 1985, and finally, in 2000, elections to the local council occurred. There are multiple unrecognized villages surrounding Lakiya. Unlike the neighboring villages, most homes have utility services such as electricity, running water and sewage (Swirski & Hasson, 2006; Yiftachel, 2006a).

\(^6\) Bedouin villages in the Naqab and Galilee that the Israeli government deem illegal (Yiftachel, 2006a).
Hura and Lakiya cultivated questions on the role and complexities of education in conflict areas. Preliminary investigations prompted an analysis of how the very educational systems that increase agency for marginalized populations may additionally lessen the saliency of cultural and ethnic identity in the quest for educational and economic equality.

**Problem Statement**

According to the United Nations (2011), “Over 40% of out-of-school children live in conflict-affected countries. These same countries have some of the largest gender inequalities and lowest literacy levels in the world” (United Nations, Bush, & Saltarelli, 2011, p. 3). Responding to conflict and poverty by providing access (and support) to education programs is a prominent method of creating sustainable peace, development, and equality. It is also one of the few tangible and relatively new methods foreign aid contributes to international stabilization (Barber, 2013).

One method of responding to the structural inequalities (Galtung, 1996) of divided conflict societies is the emphasis and investment into educational systems. However, western or colonial models of education are often rejected, found unsustainable, or violently politicized, in contemporary conflict areas such as Afghanistan (Spink, 2005). Since the 1990 World Conference on Education for All, the international community has been challenged to acknowledge the complexity of education systems in current and conflict situations. This confrontation has led to the
admission that education is no longer considered an infallible golden path towards positive peace (United Nations et al., 2011).

UNICEF education analyst Spink also states that education is “now seen as a transforming process, which is intimately related to the peace building process. There is now an urgency not only to provide rapid educational responses to the consequences of complex emergencies, but also to address the role of education in the root causes of conflict” (Spink, 2005, p. 204). Educational systems not only have influence on conflict, but are the products of historical conflict, colonization, development and technology.

Current tensions surrounding contemporary education flag the needs, struggles, and aspirations for young Bedouin. This dissertation presents the tensions of Bedouin engaging in modern Israeli society and their experiences ranging between alienation and acceptance, marginalization and empowerment, and striving for safe places for education and living. These tensions are rooted in a history of conflict, as well as historical education policies. Ahed School is a response to the need for improved education systems and a desire to change historically poor economic and living conditions for Bedouin tribes.

In the case of the Bedouin of the Naqab, the history of formalized education is connected to the history of land conflict and changes in culture and ethnic identity. Formal education (of the British variety) was introduced to the Naqab during the British Mandate in 1917 (Abu-Rabia, 2001; Aburabia-Queder, 2011). Throughout the last century access to education has evolved and has been shaped by conflict (schools closed due to the war in 1948) and colonization. A division occurred between those who moved
into “planned settlements” in the 1960s and 70s (Dinero, 2010) and those who remained on what they believe is their ancestral land (with documentation from the British Authorities, and some dating back to the Ottoman Occupation).

To provide a context to the story of how young Bedouins are negotiating traditional Bedouin culture and education while integrating into society, a background on the local conflict is pertinent. The conflict regarding Bedouin living in unrecognized villages and the State of Israel has become heightened in the twenty-first century as new planned settlements are developed in the Naqab and “unrecognized villages” are being bulldozed. Youth from unrecognized villages have the highest school dropout rates in Israel (R. Abu Rabia, 2010; Guarnieri, 2010; Ras, 2011). This tension is palpable for Bedouin youth and those striving for Bedouin agency and self-governance. Ingrained in the conflict is the perception from Arab and Bedouin activist groups that sedentarization is a form of denomadatization (Dinero, 2010, p. 4) and the loss of Bedouin land and identity. Denomadatization is the process of Bedouin moving from nomadic lifestyles into state sponsored settlements and adopting livelihoods that are not dependent on the migration of livestock. Opinions are mixed as to whether this is a positive development.

Unrecognized villages are Bedouin villages which are deemed illegal by the Knesset. The land is contentious because Bedouin claim ownership spanning back to the Ottoman Empire and the Knesset deems the contested area state property.

Israel is concerned with the “Bedouin expansion” and has created designated communities for Bedouin to reside in. The process of Bedouin moving from semi-nomadic communities and unrecognized villages is deemed “sedentarization” as part of the state initiative for urbanization (Nasasra, Richter-Devroe, Abu-Rabia-Queder, & Ratcliffe, 2014, pp. 15–25). Sedentarization and “denomadatization” development campaigns are supported by state laws such as the Law on Public Land 2002 Eviction of Trespassers Amendment which legally denies indigenous and humanitarian rights to Bedouin living in unrecognized villages. Bedouin are not seen as legitimate owners of cultural, economic, and land rights” (Peres, 2015, p. 30).
Those in unrecognized villages prefer to continue living on their land. Some that move to settlements welcome the development (Dinero, 2010; Yiftachel, 2006b).

Some of the major complaints of unrecognized villages is the lack of access to social infrastructures such as education, health services, electricity, water, and sewage systems (Yiftachel 2012). Those resisting sedentarization desire public services. They want to be active citizens of Israel/Palestine, however many decline to change their cultural traditions or move into a designed community (Yiftachel, 2012). This tension further erodes cultural capital and heightens feelings of relative deprivation (Gurr, 2011). The youth allude to desires of diversified communities and economies. People are marrying outside of their clans and ethnic tribes. The meaning of being “Bedouin,” a person of the desert, is changing (El Sana, 2012). As the nomadic relationship with the environment transforms, so might the traditions, rituals, and culture (Schirch, 2004) of the Bedouin. There are various opinions on what these modernizing changes mean for Bedouin people and their cultural practices. Some Bedouin want to preserve past nomadic lifestyles and customs while others welcome new education systems focusing on science and technology. The youth, who are being educated, are negotiating how to assimilate into Israeli education and economic systems while preserving their families’ traditions.

The question of assimilation is complex in the Bedouin context. The goal of many Bedouin communities is to achieve higher quality of living through education, infrastructure, independent economic and social constructs (Abu-Rabia-Queder & Weiner-Levy, 2013; Dinero, 2010; Yiftachel, 2008). The State of Israel provides funding
for education for Bedouin living in the parameters of land deemed acceptable for habitation (Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013; Knesset Government, 2013; The Media Line, 2015). The crux of the issue is how Bedouin youth can be empowered as high performing citizens of Bedouin communities and of Israel simultaneously when those agendas are at odds. Youth are struggling to achieve high academic standards while losing their ancestral nomadic knowledge. As Bedouin youth assimilate into Israeli society through education their cultural heritage is at risk. Questions of culture, conflict, identity and education are analyzed through this modified ethnographic study (Parthasarathy, 2008) of Ahed School, the surrounding communities and case studies of the “Negotiation in Practice” activities.

This research explores how education contributes to the transformation of Bedouin identity and culture by focusing on a case study of the small Bedouin high school, Ahed School of Sciences\(^9\). This school has become a symbol of possibility for Bedouin who want to enter into the Israeli science and technology workforce (T. Tolley, per communication, 2012). Through in-depth interviews, participant observation and cultural exploratory group discussions, I analyze ways education has influenced gender dynamics and what it means to be Bedouin within the Naqab. This modified ethnographic case study examines concepts of ethnic identity and culture within the context of the school and the community.

The dissertation shows how this model of education both challenges and supports traditional Bedouin culture and identity. In addition, this research explores the roles of

---

\(^9\) Founded in 2009 by The Association of Academics for the Development of Arab Society in The Negev, it is the first school of its kind.
Bedouin youth and how education has influenced gender dynamics in the last few generations. I also analyze how students at Ahed School see the future, the role of education and Bedouin identity. Studying the Ahed School education model provides valuable insights to the field of conflict analysis and resolution, as well as to concepts of ethnic identity, culture and assimilation. This research begins with the perspectives of Bedouin youth and their families. The voices of Bedouin youth, and family members, represent themes arising from the data collection and analysis. These rising voices are important to the role of education and the CAR field because they represent the complexities of education and demarginalization in the context of conflict. The voices begin within the family.

**Rising Voices**

The El-Amin\(^{10}\) family has four children. The eldest is a fifteen-year-old girl named Samar, who is constantly trying to keep her three little brothers in line. Each of the children attend Jewish and Arab integrated schools where they learn Arabic, Hebrew and English. Samar is now battling with whether or not to wear a head scarf. She is preparing for high school and taking qualifying exams to determine which school she will attend. She is attempting to figure out the boy/girl dynamics and social interactions while building a Facebook account. She is studying the Quran and trying to learn to cook like her mother. Samar’s goal is to be an academic like both her parents. She is also attempting to understand her role as a Bedouin teenager in the State of Israel. Her

\(^{10}\) All names have been changed out of respect for research participants.
grandmothers tell her stories about the plight of Palestine, and how they grew up traveling with the livestock, husbands, the other wives, and the clan. Samar is exploring where her story fits in the future of Israel/Palestine, and what kind of life, education, career, and family choices she will be able to make.

Samar’s experience fits into multiple shifts in Bedouin land, culture and economic opportunity. Within her community, the predominant narratives and chosen traumas (Volkan, 1998) focus on issues of access to public services, land rights, history, and religion. The land conflict is important to Bedouin people because villagers feel it is the last option of self-governance and traditional livelihood for nomadic people. Bedouin history and culture is tied to land use and communities are reluctant to move to settlements because they feel they will lose agency and be faced with crime in larger cities. Part of the complexity is that those in unrecognized villages want public services, recognition and access to education while the government wants the land developed for Jewish settlements and agriculture. Those living in settlements such as Lakiya and Hura rarely return to unrecognized villages yet many hold nostalgia for traditional ways of living. Samar’s father fondly remembers his mother making stone ground wheat bread over the fire. Samar’s grandmother is unhappy living in Lakiya and often complains about modern day living. However, her grandmother recognizes Samar has opportunities she never had and tells her not to marry but to live her life (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2012). For Samar, education is the pathway to opportunity.

Education in the Naqab represents the future of Bedouin economy and cultural adaptation as well as the reluctance to leave the nomadic lifestyle. Some Bedouin fear
that moving into settlements and entering Israeli academia and workforce will compromise their ancient culture. Along with this fear is the concern that Bedouin youth will assimilate into Israeli society physically and economically yet continue to experience prejudice and marginalization. What is at stake is the preservation of Bedouin culture and knowledge as well as the complicated relationship Bedouin Israelis have with Palestine. This dissertation analyzes how Bedouin youth are negotiating these elements through education and preparing for adulthood.

Samar’s perspective and ethnic identity are built into generations of knowledge from her parents, grandparents, aunts, uncles, community leaders and a long protracted conflict (Azar, 1990) between members of her identity groups (Bedouin/Arab/Palestinian) and the nation that gives her citizenship (Israel). As she grapples with these concepts she thinks about her future, her life as a sophomore at Ahed School, the conflict unrest around her and the opportunities that were not available to her grandparents.

While some traditional nomadic Bedouin men may be reluctant to assimilate into sedentarized communities, education has the power to enhance agency as well as de-marginalize young people. This is especially relevant for young women by providing them with diversified educational and economic opportunities. The challenge is that the very education systems which can enhance agency for marginalized populations also lessens the saliency of the cultural and ethnic identity of Bedouins, as well as fits into the state’s agenda of Bedouin assimilation/acquiescence.
Ibrahim Badar is nineteen. He is Samar’s cousin and has sixteen brothers and sisters from his father, mother, and his father’s second wife. He grew up in the village of Hura, a mile from where he went to high school. Ibrahim is an excellent student and has been invited to present at human rights events throughout Europe and the United States. Ibrahim recently returned to his village and is working at a coffee shop bordering his village and a Jewish settlement. His father is happy to have his oldest son home from studying in Europe but is worried for Ibrahim’s safety. When Ibrahim was a high school student at Ahed School for Sciences (Ahed School) he was jailed and beaten for protesting the Israeli Government for bulldozing his school friends’ home in one of the “unrecognized” villages. Ibrahim wants to live and speak freely in his community. His family, personality and education at Ahed School all encouraged him to do so. In the town of Hura he is unable to speak freely about his political concerns, and Bedouin inequality, without a fear of violence.

Ibrahim has excelled as a young scholar. He has received international attention and funding for his passion for equality and religious freedom in Israel/Palestine. He attended a technology high school where he became fluent in English and learned about human rights and legal opportunities and challenges for Bedouin. He is of the new generation of technologically advanced Bedouin who are trying to navigate his rights, citizenship, beliefs and culture in a rapidly transforming physical and cultural terrain.

In Israel/Palestine the denomadatization of Bedouin has shifted the way of life. These changes have divided tribal populations by clans and geography. Regulations have constrained Bedouin villages to “designed communities” (also called “reservations” and
“planned settlements” (Dinero, 2010, pp. 13–17), and promoted economic and social marginalization. The conflict is situated within a larger conflict nationally (between Israelis and Palestinians), continentally (with political unrest and a history of violence with Syria, Egypt and Lebanon) and internationally with the economic relationships of Israel/Palestine with the rest of the Middle East, North America, Europe, and beyond.\textsuperscript{11}

To help understand Samar and Ibrahim’s current realities, this research looks at the history of the Bedouin in the Naqab and how educational systems have evolved. To provide a context for this unique story of education, an analysis of how Bedouin culture is transforming in the context of denomadatization is presented. The assimilation into Israeli education systems and economies puts the ethnic and cultural legacy of Bedouin livelihoods and traditions at risk.

The Bedouin landscape is changing physically in terms of land use, economics and educational systems. Israeli authorities encourage Bedouin to remain in designated communities while Jewish families also settle in the Naqab, have farms with running water and electrical power and contribute to the development of the area and desert “bloom” (Stewart, 2011). The Israeli government want both Jewish and Bedouin communities to develop and modernize within the desert. Yet for some Bedouin families this is a threat to ancestral land and nomadic culture. One of the biggest challenges for Bedouin living in unrecognized villages is access to quality education (Abu Rabia, 2010).

\textsuperscript{11} According to Yiftachel, “Bedouin have been commonly constructed in Israel as culturally unique: an exotic people whose loyalty belongs to the desert and not to any particular culture or nation. While the Naqab Bedouins do possess their own cultural and ethnic features, they have always been part of the general Arab world, and undoubtedly belong to the Arabs of Palestine” (Yiftachel, 2008, p. 7). Part of the reason Bedouin are portrayed as an Israeli population is to separate them from their history as “Palestinians of Bedouin origins” within Palestinian societies.
Ahed School is one of the only eminent high schools available to students from unrecognized villages. The story of Ahed School is an example of how education can thrive while surrounded by protracted conflict.

The Story of Ahed School

Israel is rated one of the top countries in the world in terms of quality education (Filut, 2012; Markuly, 2013). However, Palestinian Israelis and Arab Israelis have dropout rates nearly twice as high as Jewish students. Classroom sizes are often double those of Jewish classrooms and are matched with low performance and matriculation rates. The area of the Naqab suffers dramatically, with dropout rates over 40 percent. The Association for Civil Rights in Israel’s Rawia Aburabia, a female Bedouin Attorney, states the situation is “catastrophic” and that there are “37 unrecognized [Bedouin] villages with no high schools and they barely have elementary schools” (Guarnieri, 2010, para. 6). Ninety thousand Bedouin live in these unrecognized villages and only two percent of Bedouin youth attend higher education (Guarnieri, 2010, para. 6).

In response to the multilayered challenges within the Bedouin communities a group of Bedouin academics and activists established the non-governmental organization, The Association of Academic Arabs in the Negev (Ahed) was founded in 2006. Ahed established the Ahed High School for Science (Ahed School) in 2009, and was lauded as an Israeli Ministry of Education Excellence in Science school within the first three years of operation. The Ahed Association believes that education and the power of Ahed School is “The single most important achievement that will raise the overall level of the
Ahed School began with 101 students (77 boys, 34 girls) and has quadrupled in size in five years. Ahed School received tremendous national attention when President Peres visited (“Israeli Science High School Advances Bedouin Community,” 2011). Students develop the skills they need to thrive as successful students and leaders in the community through several hours a week of school time devoted to topics including speaking persuasively, effective study habits, and developing confidence. “We’re trying to help students feel they are part of society and can belong, and we’re giving them tools to make that change” (“Israeli Science High School Advances Bedouin Community,” 2011, para. 5), El-Sana notes.

The school was founded by Bedouin academics, educators and community advocates. One of the initial founders of Ahed School, Dr. Muhammad al-Nabari, is also the Mayor of Hura where the school is located. Al-Nabari is proud of the high matriculation rates of their students, and believes that schools like Ahed can improve the community. Hura is one of the poorest towns in Israel where approximately 45% of working people earn less than minimum wage along with high unemployment rates. However, the community and economic makeup are starting to transform with new leadership, economic opportunities and successful education programs like Ahed School. Tuition costs approximately 3,000 shekels a year (equaling $870 dollars) and approximately one-third of students receive scholarships to pay their fees (Dattel & Lutsky, 2014).
Ahed School is the first high school in the Naqab designed to support gifted Bedouin students. It was also created to enhance the quality of education available to young male and female Bedouin students from both recognized and unrecognized communities. One of the goals of Ahed School is to help Bedouin youth overcome alienation from Israeli society. They do not accomplish this by direct integration through the classroom but through academic achievement; preparing for possible futures outside the village through occupational skills training and by fostering pride in culture and ethnic identity. For the purposes of this dissertation, integrated education is defined as “the education together, in equal numbers, of children, who are more usually educated separately in countries that have suffered from protracted ethnic or religious conflict and which provides opportunities to develop respect and understanding for alternative cultures” (McGlynn & Bekerman, 2007, p. 689).

The founders of Ahed School all sought higher education outside the Naqab because there were limited programs available for Bedouin youth. Their families believed that the best way for Bedouin youth to gain high caliber education was to attend integrated schools in Haifa and Tel Aviv (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2012; September 2013). The experiences Ahed founders had in their own educations shaped the design of the school and their views of what it means to be Bedouin. The next section provides a background on the history and meaning making of Bedouin and continues into how Bedouin education has evolved in the last century. These dynamics provide a background for how education and colonial history have influenced both the culture and economy of Bedouin in the Naqab.
The Multiple Meanings of Bedouin

The name “Bedouin” originates from the Arabic name for desert, *badia*; signifying that a Bedouin person is a desert dweller. Bedouin are traditionally Muslims by religion and consider themselves descendants of Ishmael and Abraham (Abu-Rabia, 2001, pp. 1). Bedouin/Ahl Bedu (in Arabic) also means “dwellers in the open land” or “people of the tent”. The definition of Bedouin varies depending on who is asked and who is asking. There is no single Bedouin identity or experience yet the term Bedouin is still important to many of the semi-nomadic tribal members throughout the Middle East and North Africa.

This research is focused on ethnically Bedouin living in the Naqab\(^\text{12}\) of southern Israel, particularly in the villages of Lakiya and Hura which feed into educational and economic programs in Beer Sheva\(^\text{13}\) which is the largest city in the Naqab. The Naqab is approximately 12,000 square kilometers, and makes up sixty percent of Israel. Bedouin are descendants from Arab tribes that have been nomadic for centuries and track their origins from the Arabian Peninsula. Their tribes and family members have migrated throughout the Middle East (Lerner, 2013; Marx, 1967; Noach, et al., 2009).

The Bedouin in Israel/Palestine predominantly reside in Beer Sheva Valley where access to food and water for both people and livestock is limited. The desert conditions

---

\(^{12}\) Naqab is the name of the desert region in Arabic, it is known as Negev in Hebrew. Research participants refer to the region in both ways.

\(^{13}\) The Town Beer Sheva is also known as Beersheba, Beer Sheba, Be’er Sheva and Bi’r as-Sab’ (Arabic)
and scarce resources have contributed to nomadic culture and the movement across the landscape for survival. Abu-Rabia explains how migration and conflict have paralleled one another for the last few centuries. Lack of grazing areas and water for livestock contributed to migration. Blood feuds and intertribal conflict also influenced migration.

“Traditional Bedouin law requires that when one Bedouin kills another, the relatives of the killer move to a distant place, or else obtain the protection of another tribe (Abu-Rabia, 2001, p. 1). The Bedouin nomadic history is shaped by conflict, religion, and environmental resources. The history shows how different migrations have shaped concepts of honor, pride and resilience in Bedouin families.

The first Bedouin were recorded with the rise of Islam in the seventh century. The armies of the new religion were composed entirely of Bedouin warriors who came to Syria and Palestine with their families, tents and flocks. The second migration was in the ninth century (Abu-Rabia, 2001, p. 2). The Mameluke rulers of Palestine and Syria focused on controlling Egypt. As a result, Bedouin moved into Palestine in the mid thirteenth century. Bedouin controlled the move of traffic and were able to “paralyze commercial convoys and the flow of pilgrims to Mecca” (Abu-Rabia, 2001, p. 4). These trading paths existed until the formation of Israel.

Ginat (1997) richly documented the Bedouin in Israel/Palestine and provides insights into the variations in development and outcome of conflict and injuries, including mediation. Bedouin practice traditional tribal out-casting when people behave

---

14 The Banu Helal and Banu Sulaym tribes went north from the Najd Heights, they moved into the Sinai Desert through the Jordan Valley and made it to the Upper Egypt region in the 10th century, they continued wandering Egypt and North Africa into the 11th century (Abu-Rabia, 2001, pp. 2).
outside the accepted norms of the group. He shows the complexity of the Bedouin history in Israel/Palestine and the rural traditions of nomadic life.

The definitions of nomadism also help explain the Bedouin relationship with the environment and unique cultural practices. Ginat and Khazanov (1998) have four primary definitions for nomads:

*First*, they regard their varied environments as incapable of providing a certain living over the seasons and/or the years, so mobility is essential;

*Second*, all nomads work within a multi-resource economy, i.e., no one natural or external resource is used exclusively;

*Third*, all nomads are multi-occupational, i.e., they work part-time, have shares in several enterprises and switch from activity to activity as the need or preference arises;

*Fourth*, they work within and through a wider domestic group identity and thus access to the processes of sponsorship, guarantee, restitution, contracts, etc., comes from membership of a tribe or family (p. 25).

The definitions of “nomad” and “Bedouin” have evolved with exposure and integration in various populations and economies. Tribal identity often maintains a strong sense of pride but it also can be a disapproving label that the dominant society projects on others. “In many contemporary Middle Eastern contexts tribal identity can be a matter of pride, but “Bedouin” identity is more often a term imputed by others, and labeling someone as “Bedouin” is often disparaging” (Ginat & Khazanov, 1998, p. 25). My fieldwork found that many identify as Bedouin/Palestinian/Nomadic as well as Arab Israeli. While the imperfect ethnic term “Bedouin” is explored throughout this
dissertation I analyze what being “Bedouin” means to youth in Israel/Palestine today, as well as throughout the Middle East and Africa.

In Saudi Arabia, a nation that is 90% Arab, and 10% Afro-Arab (“Saudi Arabia Population 2013,” 2013), Bedouin have experienced similar tensions with the militarization of the state and detribalizing agendas of the government. “In Saudi Arabia the Bedouin stand in fact for ‘ancestors’ but also for ‘backward people,’ ‘primitive’ or even savage’ and the space they occupy in national representations is now more and more restricted to folklore” (Chatty & Fabietti, 2006, p. 572). Bedouin in the Arab Peninsula throughout Jordan, Morocco, Saudi Arabia, Iraq, Libya and Egypt have all experienced dramatic changes in their traditions, land use and citizenship. What is unique about the Bedouin in the Naqab is the division between religion, economy and land (as being the minority ethnic and religious population as compared to those in Saudi Arabia). Many of the tribes were literally cut in half by the borders with Jordan and Egypt. The cultural and geographic domain of the tribes in the Naqab have been changing for centuries.

**Changes in Bedouin Culture and Land**

The historical background and definitions of “Bedouin” and “nomadism” represent the adaptability of Bedouin movement and economies and how political landscapes have shaped the boundaries and movement of Bedouin tribes. Understanding the cultural practices of Bedouin and relationships between clans provides insight into the social structures of the tribes. In the Naqab, Bedouin were divided into clans typically
comprised of multiple tribes sharing bloodlines and unifying with or against other tribes in times of war.

By the late nineteenth century the Bedouin in the Naqab were strongly connected to the Ottoman domination of the area, and Bedouin were mostly left to self-govern until the 1860s when the Suez Canal was created and the Ottomans wanted control in the Naqab (Chatty & Fabietti, 2006, p. 6). Police and rule of law were introduced into the area. Taxes increased and the Ottomans hoped to cultivate a bigger population to supply the army. They viewed the Bedouin as fighters and as third party communicators with the enemy in the Sinai Peninsula. In 1908 Bedouin were encouraged to participate more in local government. The Ottomans wanted the loyalty of the Sinai Bedouin. They also wanted to limit the Bedouin raids of farms and commercial loads. Tribal boundaries were put in place by the Ottomans in 1917 and Beer Sheva’s meeting centrality was heightened. Bedouin worked for the Ottoman army and built roads and railways. Bedouin also supplied camels and other work animals to work the land or for consumption.

Throughout the 1917-1948 British Mandate of Israel/Palestine, the British acknowledged the indirect rule of the Bedouin in the Naqab. They supported the freedom of practicing Bedouin traditions and laws as long as their rituals did not clash with British policies (Abu-Rabia, 2001, pp. 39–40). From 1948 to 1953, after most Bedouin in the Naqab sided with the Palestinian cause, the majority of Bedouin living in Israel/Palestine were forcefully displaced and scattered into Jordan, West Bank (which was then controlled by Jordan), Hebron hills, south of the Arava Valley, and throughout
the Naqab including Srad, Beer Sheva, and Dimona (Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker, 2005, p. 47).

Before 1948, the Bedouin Arab population in the Naqab was estimated to be from 65-90,000 residents (Merkaz le-ḥeḵer ha-ḥevrah ha-Beduʾit ye-hitpaṭḥutah (Israel), University of California, Los Angeles: Center for Comparative Education., University of California, Los Angeles: American Indian Studies Center., & Abu-Saʿad, Ismaʿil, 2003), and as Bedouin fled to neighboring Arab nations such as Gaza, West Bank, Jordan and Egypt, only approximately 11,000 Bedouin stayed in the Naqab desert as the newly formed Israeli military claimed the land (Hattern, 2014). Bedouin were pushed into limited settlements such as the seig, a designated restricted area, much like an American Indian reservation (Marx, 1967; Merkaz le-ḥeḵer ha-ḥevrah ha-Beduʾit ye-hitpaṭḥutah (Israel) et al., 2003). The 11,000 that remained were concentrated into a parcel of infertile land deemed the sayag area which means fence or demarcation in Hebrew, or sayej/sayag in Arabic. The area was less fitted for supporting inhabitants or crops and amounted to less than one fifth of the previous Bedouin territory.¹⁵

Figure 1.1 demonstrates the boundaries of the sayag placed in the 1950s as well as current settlements (2009 to 2015) and proposed communities as provided by Avinoam Meir (2009). As of 2015, there are an estimated 190-250,000 Bedouin living in the Naqab.¹⁶ Bedouin are one of the most marginalized and disadvantaged Israeli populations. Over half of Bedouin in the Naqab predominately reside in seven government designated and planned townships (seig). Approximately 40% of Bedouin

---

¹⁵ Contemporary Bedouin are also fighting against being moved to another sayag/siyag.

¹⁶ Population estimates range from 190-250,000 Bedouin in the Naqab throughout the literature.
have remained on their ancestral land which the government deems illegal, and are referred to as unrecognized villages. Bedouin struggle to retain their land and to be legitimized by the international community as an indigenous population deserving of legal protection. They are striving to find a balance between changes in lifestyle, livelihood, economic and educational opportunities, and assimilation into Israeli society.
Figure 1.1. Layout of Sayag and Designated Bedouin Communities.

Contemporary state discourse and historical pastoral spatiality: contradictions in the land conflict between the Israeli Bedouin and the State (Meir, 2009).
Former Bedouin land was transformed into Jewish settlements and industrial and agricultural sites (Noach, Haia et al., 2009). After the 1948 war, as Israel planned its future, the sayag area was allocated between the towns of Arad, Beer Sheba, Dimona and Yeruham. The land was originally inhabited by six Bedouin tribes, and eleven more tribes were relocated to the demarcated zone (Swirski & Hasson, 2006). During World War II nearly 90% of Bedouin economy was farming and agriculture. Bedouin worked for the British Army setting up storage units, camps for soldiers, and airfields throughout the Naqab. They worked seasonally in the North of Israel/Palestine, and moved with the animals and the rain for crops.

Once Bedouin were restricted to the sayag their movement and economic opportunities were restricted. Unemployment skyrocketed and those that could not get employment as semi-skilled workers such as truck and tractor drivers, mechanics, carpenters and masons attempted working in transportation, quarries, phosphate mines, road construction and industrial agriculture. Those unable to obtain work provided by the governments’ development initiatives found alternative methods of transporting items. This is when smuggling became a shadow economy for Bedouin in the Naqab (Shmueli, 1979; (Swirski & Hasson, 2006, pp. 85–86). In the post WWII depression smuggled goods were brought to markets in Beer Sheva and were valued by Jewish residents in a time of austerity and rations. However, economic opportunities for Bedouin
continuously decreased as more rules of movement were implemented and urbanization increased.\textsuperscript{17}

Throughout the first two decades of the State of Israel, resettlement zones increased. In the eastern Naqab, the city of Arad was created in 1960 and a new highway to the city crossed tribal lands of the Bedouin which surrounded them by agricultural settlements and Jewish communities. Within the next five years sedentarization started and the first Bedouin settlement was built (Tel-Sheva). The second was designed in western Naqab at Rahat which is close to multiple kibbutzim (Joseph Ginat, 1997, p. ix). Some Bedouin settled in orchards of Jewish families, Arab villages, and in mixed Jewish-Arab cities (Lod and Ramle).

Tribes became increasingly sedentarized after the 1979 peace agreement with Egypt. This sedentarization in Israel was echoed by many nomadic tribes throughout the Middle East. Permanent settlements continued to be built in the 1980s and the settlement of Rahat became a recognized city in 1994. There has been increased sedentarization throughout the last twenty years and more relocation of Bedouin and designed communities are planned by the Knesset. The tension regarding Bedouin land rights is increasing through the region. This is a salient concern for the Bedouin living in southern Israel and permeates the daily lives of its residents; influencing not only their lifestyles but traditions and economies.

The official State of Israel’s government (Knesset) website acknowledges how Bedouin traditions have been influenced by urbanization:

\textsuperscript{17} For more information on the employment demographics of Israel, refer to the Central Bureau of Statistics annual labor force survey http://www1.cbs.gov.il/reader/cw_usr_view_SHTML?ID=417.
Urbanization and modernization in recent decades have shaken the socioeconomic foundations of the Bedouin society and brought with it delinquency, high school dropout rates, and drug abuse that were not as common before. The permanent residences also brought with it tension between the younger educated generation and the traditional leadership of Sheiks and heads of tribes. The latter are being gradually replaced in their local councils and among heads of organizations working in fields of civil rights, welfare, religion and education. The processes that have exposed Bedouin society to the Jewish culture have also brought them exposure to Arab and Islamic culture…The Bedouin population is ranked at the bottom of the socioeconomic ladder in Israel. Unemployment rates among them are relatively high in comparison to the Israeli society, and their education level is also low in comparison to other minorities. The state of Bedouins living in unrecognized villages is even worse (Knesset Government, 2013, para. 9–12).

The Israeli government perspective speaks to the socioeconomic inequalities within the Bedouin communities. With these settlements comes the economic and political transformation of the community. Bedouin have started small businesses in textiles and sustainable products made out of goat milk. Bedouin men and women are starting their own non-profit organizations, and trying to build unique businesses to sustain their villages. Bedouin have a unique status in Israel. While they are deemed citizens, there are specific Knesset councils designated to respond to the Bedouin “issue” and they do not have access to local government institutions like Jewish Israeli citizens.
Those in unrecognized villages, or in communities that are not recognized by the Knesset, are not allowed to vote or run for local government or obtain identity cards (Swirski & Hasson, 2006). This sets a tone of exasperation for those living in unrecognized villages. Residents are looking for other avenues for representation and recognize that education is a mode of entrance into economics and politics.

Israel’s Ministry of Education provides salaries for teachers working in the Naqab. There are government advocates for the Bedouin such as Israeli diplomat and Knesset Labor Party representative Kolet Avital. She shares her fears with the Knesset that further marginalization of Bedouin can potentially lead to violence: “Those people who are loyal citizens of the State of Israel who served in the army, who have always maintained good citizenship, who are paying taxes, we risk to turn them into enemies and this is not a very clever policy” (Willacy, 2005, para. 51). Bedouin have been serving in the Israeli forces for generations and even implemented traditional Bedouin methods for tracking and navigating the Naqab within the Desert Scout Battalion 585 that was founded in the 1980s (Berman, 2011).

Not only are Bedouin serving as active citizens through the military,¹⁸ but as taxpayers contributing to the economy with a right to government services such as education. Avital also believes “Every citizen in Israel is by law compelled to send children to school, education is compulsory but the fact that we do not allow those Bedouins to have their own schools or not enough schools in their own settlements,

¹⁸ Bedouin soldiers are voluntary, and only a few hundred Bedouin currently enlist. They typically serve as scouts, in regional commands, combatants within the Bedouin Patrol Unit Battalion, Border Police or other various roles (Swirski & Hasson, 2006, pp. 93–94). Other Arab Israeli citizens such as Druze are drafted. In interviews with current IDF members, Bedouin are not revered in the IDF. They are viewed as “lazy, and uncooperative” with a “few good trackers” (T. Tolley, per communication, May 26, 2013).
means that we do not observe the law, we ourselves, so I think that what we have to fight for is that Israel should abide by its own laws (Willacy, 2005, para. 22). Since the Israeli Authority does not provide funding for schools centralized in unrecognized Bedouin communities, there are attempts to self-fund education programs.

Bedouin, like other ethnic minorities in Israel, experience tension in societal structures and in daily life. Their experiences echo marginalized populations in Israel/Palestine, and within developed nations all over the globe. The Israel Land Administration created an agency to deal with Bedouin “issues” as viewed by the Knesset. Education was deemed one of the Knesset’s methods of assimilation for Bedouin youth. The changes in Bedouin land use, politics, and the evolution of Bedouin education, are important backgrounds for contextualizing the current challenges and limitations Bedouin are experiencing in the Naqab.

Education as a Locus of Contention

---

19 The Bedouin Advancement Authority (Bedouin Authority) acts like the Bureau of Indian Affairs in the United States, designating reservations/settlements, development in national parks, educational services and water rights (Swirski & Hasson, 2006). However, Bedouin do not yet have a National Council of Bedouin tribes such as American Indians created in response to colonial domination, where laws and services are protected for American Indians and represented by both intertribal organizations and national tribal organizations. American Indians, like Bedouin, are still fighting for their rights, land, and equal access to social services such as working roadways and education. On the Hoopa Reservation near where I grew up in Northern California, the Hoopa Tribal Valley Court was implemented so tribe members have some level of local self-governance. North American tribal court systems are well developed and recognized locally depending on the tribe and regional politics. Marginalized populations such as American Indians, Maori, Christian Arabs, Druze and Bedouin can benefit from recognized self-governing agencies to protect their interests, foster agency, promote education and address incidents of violence. While the tribal government systems are imperfect Bedouin activists such as human rights attorney Morad Elsana, advocate for similar systems (Elsana, 2014a, 2014b).
For all marginalized communities in Israel/Palestine, access to education has been a representative struggle between the minority groups and the State of Israel. "Education remains to date a locus of contention between the state and the Palestinian community, an arena where the right and the means to determine goals, curriculum, and administrative structures are hotly contested" (Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker, 2005, p. 22). Israeli’s attempts at enveloping Bedouin communities is viewed as a post-colonial action reminiscent of the carving of the Middle East after the first world war (Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker, 2005; Swirski & Hasson, 2006; Yiftachel, 2008).

Colonialism has dramatically influenced methods of education in the Middle East for the last hundred years. Advocates of Bedouin education dates back to the British design of modern day Iraq through European colonizers. “Queen of the Desert” British anthropologist and architect of Iraq Gertrude Bell was one of the major proponents of Bedouin education in the WWI era. Bell spent months traveling with Bedouin tribes in the early 1900s and stated “We must give the girls an opportunity for self-expression” and specifically advocated for schools for Arab women (Wallach, 2010, p. 213). Humphrey Bowman, the British education expert working in the Middle East, radicalized Arab education by encouraging and providing infrastructure for the education of females. The British changed the education system from language of instruction (Turkish to Arabic) to founding philosophies (French to British) after the British conquest in 1917. However, “this transformation failed to redefine the supreme objective of the system—namely, the cultivation of loyalty to state and empire” (Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker, 2005, p. 22). When WWI began, Beer Sheva became the Ottoman control center for supply and
transportation for the army (Ginat, 1997). This shaped both Bedouin education and the economy. Bedouin men served as suppliers, transporters and support staff for the army.

Education in Arab communities in Israel/Palestine has been a continuously politicized process. In the 1940s, teachers of Arabic descent were prohibited from protesting, being politically active, or having influence on their students and communities. "Teachers who took part in political demonstrations or helped disseminate political flyers, articles, or other publications were summarily dismissed. Palestinians began to realize that the education system was used to eradicate their national, cultural, and historic identity in an attempt to depoliticize them" (Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker, 2005, p. 55).

In the first two thirds of the 20th century, Bedouin were educated through traditional methods of livelihood attainment. They learned the business of pastoralism and merchants, agriculture and trade and were fairly isolated from the Israeli lifestyle and economy until the military control over Israeli Arabs was removed in 1966 (I. A. Saad, 1991). For the last 70 years “educating Bedouin” has been the political message promoting assimilation. Meanwhile, the State of Israel has excelled in quality education programs and technologies while Bedouin schools have struggled to reach the national average. For over 60 years, Israeli leaders ranging from war heroes and country founders Moshe Dayan and David Ben Gurion, to recent leaders like Ariel Sharon, have not included Bedouin in the new vision of Israel and advocated for the removal of Bedouin from Israel (McGreal, 2003).
In 1963, Dayan was convinced that "this phenomenon of the bedouin will disappear" (McGreal, 2003, para. 8). He stated that "We should transform the bedouin into an urban proletariat," and that "This will be a radical move which means that the bedouin would not live on his land with his herds, but would become an urban person who comes home in the afternoon and puts his slippers on. The children would go to school with their hair properly combed" (McGreal, 2003, para. 9). For 60 years the perception of Bedouin as uncivilized and in need of urbanization has dehumanized Bedouin populations. Education has been the moral method of assimilating Bedouin into society, while keeping Bedouin marginalized and increasing sedentarization.

According to Dr. Yosef Ben-David (1990), when representing the Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, “More than anything else, education can contribute to the integration of the Bedouin into Israeli society” (sec. Education). He also claims that for those under the age of 55, illiteracy was reduced from 95% of the Bedouin Israeli population to 25% (Ben-David, 1990, sec. Education). Ben-David says that Bedouin are rarely prepared to attend Israeli higher education and that “universities now tend to ease admission standards for Bedouin students” (sec. Education). These controversial claims are abundant in the Knesset Government archive, and demonstrate the marginalization of the Bedouin population. The Knesset believes that education is the key to Bedouin assimilation. Bedouin are also committed to the education and opportunities of their youth, and this dissertation analyzes the case of Ahed School, an academically flourishing high school which was built to demarginalize Bedouin youth, and is simultaneously receiving accolades from the Knesset for performance.
Working with one high school, Ahed School, which brings in Bedouin students from multiple Naqab townships and villages is helpful because it is a pre-established place of learning that is only five years old, and is already out-performing the majority of schools in Israel (“Israeli Science High School Advances Bedouin Community,” 2011). It has gained acknowledgement from Israeli President Shimon Peres and opens a space to look at how Ahed School’s model of education has flourished within the layers of conflict surrounding them. This school serves as a positive side of denomadatization and attempts to transcend experiences of marginalization. Yet it represents, and may be contributing to, the change of Bedouin culture through technology, globalization and modernization.

Bedouin schools help elevate students and Ahed strives to reduce the enormous economic and social gap between Jewish and Bedouin citizens of Israel. The tension that education is causing within Bedouin culture is palpable and it influences the relationships between those who are economically elevated through education and those who continue to have limited access within the unrecognized villages. These complicated dynamics inspire questions of academic success and assimilation in protracted conflict because they represent a clash in interests. Bedouin families want the youth to overcome poverty and marginalization but not lose Bedouin knowledge and cultural capital (Lareau & Weininger, 2003; Sullivan, 2001).

According to Maayana Miskin (2013), a journalist for Arutz Sheva/Israel National News, the Naqab/Negev is a “powderkeg” of economic disparity between Jews and
Bedouin (Miskin, 2013). The leader of the Bnei Shimon Region Council\textsuperscript{20} told Miskin that “The gap today is unthinkable. On the socio-economic scale they’re at ‘1,’ we’re at ‘6.’ Their children look at our children, and it doesn’t exactly make them like us,” she continued to say that “The gap creates hatred. It’s a powderkeg,” (Miskin, 2013, para. 5–6). These feelings of social and economic inequality are not eased upon integration. Often the first time Bedouin students are integrated into Jewish institutions, other than in shopping at the same malls or markets, is in higher education, and the few Bedouin students who have achieved entrance into universities within Israel experience prejudice and racism on a daily basis (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2012; September 2013).

There is palpable racism against Arab Israeli minorities, especially within the universities. While walking with my Bedouin colleagues, someone would call out derogatory things to my companions on a daily basis. Sometimes in English for my benefit, “Go home, Bedouin bitches.” They were called dogs, whores and trash. This happened on the beach in Ashquelon (just north of Gaza), the streets of downtown Beer Sheva, at Ben Gurion University, and on the bus. Many young Bedouin women feel uncomfortable leaving the village unescorted, unless they are going directly to classes at the university or college. Many of the Bedouin students I talked with chose to attend all

\textsuperscript{20}The Bnei Shimon Regional Council represents seven kibbutzim (collective communities, four moshavim (cooperative agricultural communities) and two rural towns for Jewish settlers. The council responsible for the Bedouin villages in the Naqab is called the Abu Basma Regional Council). The Abu Basma Regional Council was the response to the Bedouin Education Authority that was implemented in 1981 as branch of Israel’s Education Ministry responsible for the execution of schools and education services from building to furniture, to funding, and materials for both recognized and unrecognized villages (Swirski & Hasson, 2006). Such councils are controversial, and Bedouin leaders are trying to get more Bedouin representation within them, as the Bedouin Education Agency and Regional Councils are typically led by Jews. The Bedouin villages had to petition the High Court to allow local elections to appoint community members from the region to the Abu Basma Regional Council, rather than Israeli Authority determining the local and regional councils (Masos, Ar’ara, Shoket etc), regulations.
Bedouin colleges, technological schools or predominately Arab universities in Jordan because they preferred to limit their experiences of conflict and racism.

Many of these university and college students had not experienced such racism in their elementary and high school years, because they attended predominately Bedouin schools, while violence may be present, it is not rooted in the otherness of ethnicity or religion. In the Naqab, Bedouin education is a locus of contention on multiple levels. The Knesset views education as the avenue for Bedouin assimilation. Bedouin perceive education as an act of demarginalization. For Bedouin, education is a double-edged sword. It is the hope for Bedouin youth to have new opportunities, and it is an avenue into Israeli society where exposure to prejudice and violence are possible. This dissertation explores the tension surrounding the role of Bedouin education, and analyzes how it permeates multiple dimensions of the lives of Bedouin youth.

**The Scope of the Dissertation**

This introductory chapter has introduced voices of Bedouin youth and their unique educational and cultural experiences. It also shared the story of Ahed School which is an example of a burgeoning innovative high school trying to educate and empower Bedouin youth from both recognized and unrecognized villages. The many meanings of “Bedouin” and the changes in Bedouin culture and land use are also reviewed along with the history and current realities of Bedouin education in the Naqab. The problem statement recognizes the goals of this study and the complex dynamics of gender, ethnic identity and ideas of assimilation and alienation.
Chapter Two advances into the theories of education and conflict, marginalization, alienation and assimilation. The literature provides a foundation for the research. The benefits and the limitations of the literature are discussed. The multiple roles of Bedouin within Israeli society are discovered and past ethnographic research is additionally explored. It is here that the research questions are presented.

The third chapter presents the fieldwork and design of the dissertation through the research methods and analysis. It begins with Ahed School, lays out the research design, data collection, and methodology of this dissertation. It also looks at research challenges and the heart of reflective practice, which has inspired my work in the field of Conflict Analysis and Resolution and which has allowed me to conduct this research.

In Chapter Four, the study deepens into the relationships between gender and education for Bedouin youth, and concepts of integration, addressing one of the research questions, “What does it mean for Bedouin youth to be integrated into Israeli society through education?” This research question looks into the challenges and benefits of education for Bedouin youth.

Chapter Five continues with the other two research questions “How are young people negotiating the difficult and contradictory challenges between maintaining traditional Bedouin culture and integrating into Israeli society? “ As well as “How does Ahed School manage to flourish in the midst of the overarching conflict locally, and nationally?” Chapter Five looks closely at the operations, goals, and stories of Ahed School. This chapter demonstrates how students navigate their Bedouin upbringings and the world after high school in a time of transforming society and culture. It is here that
the research questions are analyzed through the voices of Ahed students and faculty. The data show how young people are negotiating the difficult and contradictory challenges between maintaining traditional Bedouin culture and integrating into Israeli society.

After an exploration and discussion the stories and interviews with Bedouin high school students, teachers and faculty, and community members, the dissertation moves into the case study of Ahed students’ role at the “Negotiation in Practice” conference. Chapter Six looks at the influence of international development and mediation trainings on students from Ahed School. This helps explain how Ahed School manages to flourish within the nation and what different forms of Bedouin integration look like. In this chapter integration is viewed through a unique collaboration with the U.S. Embassy of Israel programs, the Young Negotiators Network and trainings from Harvard’s Program on Negotiation.

As the dissertation comes to a close the final chapter brings together the data analysis and stories of Bedouin youth to provide conclusions and recommendations for further research and action. The study of Ahed School presents the tension between education as a means of demarginalization and the shift away from Bedouin culture and ethnic identity. This analysis demonstrates that education arising out of minority populations can result in assimilation into the dominant society more than increased agency. This final analysis presents the strength and challenges to this model of education. Revisiting concepts of demarginalization and assimilation show how integrated education is important for Bedouin youth. Conflict resolution training is also recommended for Ahed School and a discussion on the future possibilities for Bedouin
youth is presented. The discussion provides further recommendations and shows how this story is something that the field of Conflict Analysis and Resolution can learn from.
CHAPTER TWO:
EXPLORATION OF THE LITERATURE

Introduction

One of the predominant responses to conflict and poverty is the development and improvement of educational systems. Education is considered integral to increasing social mobility to people from all backgrounds whether a student begins as a refugee, migrant worker or a member of the privileged upper class, “Education is popularly conceptualized as one factor integral to achieving the economic parity and geographic dispersal presumed basic to integrating diverse citizens…Yet, while it is clear that education improves individual chances for social mobility, it is equally apparent that schools work less well for impoverished…school children.” (Davidson, 1996, p. 11). Davidson’s research on schools investigates the complexity of race, class and politics in integrated schools in impoverished areas. Her work echoes the questions of acculturation, assimilation, marginalization and alienation which penetrate this chapter. Conflict literature highlights the significance of education and promotes peer mediation, conflict resolution and cultural communication in schools.

The benefits of the conflict and education literature include the role of culture, identity and marginalization which all contribute to conflict. The limitations include the question of assimilation and alienation through education in conflict zones and the following sections respond to this disconnect. The need to look at schools arising from
communities in conflict is significant in the conflict field. This dissertation analyzes the complexities of schools arising from poverty, marginalization and conflict.

This chapter provides a literature review of education and conflict resolution theories, ethnographies and research. The review delves into the role of education in post-conflict development and CAR theories of contact and acculturation which can both lessen and contribute to conflict in educational settings. It then looks at dynamics of schools including acculturation, assimilation, alienation and conflict resolution. This chapter also reviews the power of history education, curriculum and how education is perceived as a form of liberation and demarginalization. The dissertation then investigates elements of race, identity exploration and violence within school systems. The chapter continues to look at Bedouin specific experiences and theories of conflict and marginalization, as well as environmental and identity politics, and how to increase agency and empowerment. The following segment presents the complexities of gender and agency for Bedouin and Muslim women, and how they respond to conflict and cultural concepts of honor and shame. This leads to a deepening of culture, conflict and ethnic identity scholarship. The literature shapes the research methods and questions.

**Education as Conflict Prevention and Post Conflict Development**

Education has remained a daunting aspect of post conflict development, prevention and response for the fields of CAR and international development. The fields recognize the importance and necessity of having access to education. Schools provide valuable infrastructure for societies and typically intend to help lessen salient, polarizing,
identities (Korostelina, 2007; Peacock, Thornton, & Inman, 2007) through exposure to different people, ideas and policies. Schools may be a place where gender based violence is heightened and they may be a place where people learn to become peacemakers.

Theories of education are valuable to the conflict field and for the role of development. CAR theories need to include the role of education because young people are most engaged in the combat of war (Peters & Richards, 1998). Schools serve as venues for reducing conflict through Allport’s contact theory (1954). Allport suggests that interaction between conflicting parties in positive circumstances can reduce prejudice and increase interaction if the four elements of are applied. Contact theory requires status equality of group members, cooperation from all members, legitimization of the situation supported by the hosting institution and an equal platform without social competition (Pettigrew, et al., 2011; Savelkoul, et al., 2011).

An additional theory applied to education and conflict is the acculturation theory. Berry (1995) views acculturation as the need for individuals to “make determinations about maintaining cultural characteristics and the amount of contact needed with dominant group members to obtain a suitable means of adaptation” (McGlynn & Bekerman, 2007, p. 690). In terms of conflict and negotiation Berry (2005) finds that conflict can arise in situations of acculturation (such as integrated communities and schools with salient ethnic identities and cultures). Acculturation can be connected to assimilation but is different in that assimilation can be temporary and that acculturation can be a reactive response “by rejecting the cultural influence from the dominant group and changing back towards a more ‘traditional’ way of life, rather than inevitably towards
greater similarity with the dominant culture” (Berry, 2005, p. 701). These challenges arise within Bedouin education and navigation of the Israeli economy. Some Bedouin youth are striving to maintain traditional methods of weaving and land use and others are ready to work in the Israeli hi-tech boom. Acculturation, assimilation and marginalization are challenges for Bedouin navigating conflict and their futures. The most positive interaction Ahed School students obtain with other religions and cultures is through negotiation, debate and cross-cultural programs (which will be discussed in Chapter Six).

Most Bedouin schools are isolated and have high dropout rates. Bedouin youth are the lowest performing population in Israeli schools which are rated some of the best in the world.

The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) ranked Israel as the world’s second most educated country in the *Education at a Glance* 2011, 2012, and 2013 reports. In 2013, Israel tied with Japan for second place after Canada as the most highly educated nation. Israel has high rates of employment, there is a mandatory military service following high school (for both male and females from age 18-21) which contributes to both employment and education and increases the average university graduation age from 27 to 29 (Avraham, 2012; Haaretz, 2012; Logez & Lalancette, 2013). In the 2013 OECD report Israel was also deemed one of the youngest countries with youth from the ages five to twenty-nine constitute 41% of the total

---

21 Israel joined OECD in 2010, and has a high school graduation rate of 92%. The OECD’s average graduation rate is 84%.

22 Bedouin are not defined as a draftable population (like Druze) they serve on a voluntary basis, and those that volunteer predominately come from specific tribes like the Azazme who have a tradition of enlisting (Swirski & Hasson, 2006, p. 92).
population, with “universal” access to education (Logez & Lalancette, 2013). While this report is paraded throughout Israel newspapers, it does not reflect the experiences of marginalized communities with low matriculation rates, such as Bedouin, and other Arab Israeli youth.

The Education Policy and Data Center has very limited data on the demographics of Israeli school performance (“Israel - Search Results,” 2013). Non-profit organizations, international organizations, and those that receive funding from development organizations (such as United States Agency for International Development – USAID) contain more detailed population information for funding status reporting. They also contain literature on the status of schools and attempts for peace education. Active programs aim to increase bi-narrative education and attempt to unite Israelis and Palestinians through dialogue and peacebuilding projects.

USAID contributes to the program School for Peace in Neve Shalom/What al-Salam, and the “Change Agents” program which focuses on bringing female journalists, young politicians, environmentalists and other professionals to discuss issues of land, human rights, inequality, language and peacebuilding (“NSWAS - Change Agents,” 2013). These programs, along with multiple other exchange, education, dialogue and peacebuilding projects, attempt to destabilize the protracted conflict with Israel/Palestine, as well as the structural violence within the divided nation. However, looking at education as a form of demarginalization, a method for improving gender equality, and an obstacle to conflict deserves further research. Education systems can both combat and
contribute to conflict.

Within the protracted conflict in Afghanistan, education has been a lens for viewing development policies, gender equality, conflict, and education. A USAID Case Study on Home-Based Schools in Afghanistan showed that in the year 2004, 1.3 million girls enrolled in government run primary schools for the first time (the Taliban forbid females to attend previously) (Kirk and Winthrop, 2006, USAID.) Jeanine Spink finds that there has been a manipulation and politicization of education in Afghanistan ranging from colonizers, to local political parties, and international powers throughout its epic history of violence, unrest, and conflict. She describes the challenges for building education in Afghanistan, and the role of international development:

As Afghanistan attempts to build peace and maintain co-existence after more than 20 years of violence, there continues to be limited attention given to one of the main contributors to the social divisions. More than four million children returned to school in the first two years of ‘peace’ in Afghanistan. Hundreds of millions of dollars were spent by the United Nations and other international donors on ensuring the physical provision of schools for children. However in 2005, three years into ‘the new era for Afghanistan’, teachers continue to teach ethnic hatred and intolerance. The textbooks continue to be highly politicised, promoting social divisions and violence, seemingly unnoticed by the International Community, whose expensive investments fuel rather than restrain this problem (Spink, 2005, p. 195).
Integrated narrative historical textbooks have proven potentially successful in creating a dialogue on perceptions of conflict, providing alternative views of history and for allowing readers to understand positioning in conflict (Faculty Author Collection, 2013; Adwan, et al., 2012).

**The Power of History Education**

In Israel and Palestine, Eyal Naveh shares past protests over school textbooks and identity construction in history education, exemplifying the politicization of education (Rotberg, 2006). While new trends of research have focused on the challenges of divisions in the content of textbooks of educational systems, they still do not explain success, or challenges for education, within marginalized populations such as the Bedouin of the Naqab. Bedouin schools, like most schools in Israel (with the exception of Orthodox institutions) are required to follow the mandated Israeli curriculum with little freedom of expansion. Secondary schools include science and humanitarian studies and are geared towards the matriculation exams.

There are variations between technological, agricultural, military preparatory, and Yeshiva high schools (predominately boarding schools to observe the Jewish traditions and ways of life (Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013). Secondary students that are not enrolled in one of the State accredited schools are required by the Apprenticeship Law to study a trade at school focused on vocational training which can include culinary training, vehicle mechanics, or other trades selected by students and approved by the Ministry of Education (Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013). The Ministry of
Education provides “school curricula, educational standards, supervision of teaching personnel, and construction of school buildings” (Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013, sec. Administration and Structure). There is some room for electives, where students often learn trades, computer science, improve their language, or join schools programs like newspaper, debate, or music programs.

Ahed School follows Israel’s Ministry of Education’s recommended curriculum, but two English and literature teachers at the school feel that there are many limitations to the country’s recommended curriculum for a science and technology school. “Where are the Arab poets? There are so few texts that students can relate to. How can we create dialogue if they don’t feel like their voices are present even in our literature” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013)? The pressure for achievement of matriculation exams are very high and the social studies courses are limited, are as the range of history courses (which is further expanded in Chapter 6). The Ministry of Education is proud of its high international education ranking and promote the mantra that “Education in Israel is a precious legacy. Following the tradition of past generations, education continues to be a fundamental value and is recognized as the key to the future” (Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013, sec. Education). One of the complaints of faculty in non-Jewish Israeli schools, and in integrated schools, is that histories are not representative of the experiences of minority populations (Adwan et al., 2012; Faculty Author Collection, 2013; I. A. Saad, 1991). There are historians and educators trying to change the

---

24 Curriculum in conflict areas which is an important field. Often the historical narratives contribute to tension between different populations, and increased misunderstanding. To learn more refer to (Cole & Carnegie Council on Ethics & International Affairs, 2007; Faculty Author Collection, 2013).
homogenous history curriculum to represent multiple interpretations of history and conflict in Israel/Palestine.

Books like *Side by Side* (Adwan et al., 2012) show dual narratives of the Israeli/Palestinian perspective and are remarkable attempts at responding to the divided interpretations, and teachings, of the nation’s history. However, they also fail to represent those on the fringes of society, who were part of the land and history before the Israeli/Palestinian conflict began. As the Naqab Bedouin traditions, occupational opportunities, and systems of education are becoming more globalized, the role of education has the potential to compliment or contradict Israel’s agenda of Bedouin assimilation.

**Education as Liberation**

In the field of conflict analysis and resolution, access to education and dialogue are prominent themes in mediation, development, and capacity building responses to conflict. The western world combats the strength of the Taliban in Pakistan and Afghanistan with Army Special Forces, political influence and diplomacy, police training, weapon deliveries. In addition, extremism is responded to by supporting education and development projects for girls in rural villages. Education is politicized in numerous countries and overcoming segregation has transformed the civil rights of entire nations like the United States. The integration of schools following the United States Supreme Court decision *Brown vs. Board of Education of Topeka* transformed the
equality of education during the American civil rights movement. Access to education is one of the foundational steps to creating more equal ground in a social system.

For many oppressed people, access to education is worth fighting for. The only way to have high levels of opportunity and human security is to gain access to education and economic opportunity. When looking at systems theory, and transformative societal change, Paulo Freire, the 20th century Brazilian education philosopher, arises as a pillar of education and human rights theories. The particularly relevant elements of *The Pedagogy of the Oppressed* include discussions on dialogue, dehumanization, and fear of freedom, communication and the idea of cultural invasion which is ripe in Israel/Palestine. In Arabic globalization is referred to as *awlaamai* indicating the spread of western thought and action, historically brought on by back to back wars and economic influence (Henry, 2003). The fear of cultural invasion has been used in the rhetoric of marginalized populations as well as fundamentalist groups around the world (Griffel, 2003).

Freire indicates that cultural invasion can be respected if the educator considers education as a form of liberation through learners recognizing and uncovering critical reality. To do this an educator must question the dialogical relationship between educator and learner, teacher and student to influence the relationship between colonizers/invaders and the oppressed in an attempt to create a more equitable society (Freire, 1985; Freire, Aronowitz, & Macedo, 2000). This relationship can be viewed in schools like Ahed where the teachers and students engage in informal dialogue about power relationships, theories of occupation, and the role of conflict resolution. In terms of education in the
Naqab, freedom means the ability to observe religion, access to quality schools and social services, and to practice traditional customs in the lands they consider home (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2, 2012).

For Freire (1985) the concept of freedom is not a myth. Freedom is a potential and deserved reality and is necessary to acquire human completion (47). This concept of freedom is one of the ways in which Bedouin become a symbol for another way of life, or for what was lost in colonization. Like many education and human rights activists, Freire believes that it is impossible to live an authentic existence without freedom, and freedom is obtained through overcoming colonialism and its side effects, which begin with the pedagogy of dialogically based education. Dialogue fosters reflective, effective revolution in which the inquiry and the praxis create the true definition of being human (72).

Conflict resolution programs utilize dialogue to open understand of stakeholders narratives, positioning, interests, values and needs. Education serves as a natural platform for dialogue to occur. Freire (1985) and Giroux (2013) suggest education is a space where true dialogue can be exchanged. This is possible if within the setting of education, and the power dynamics they represent, are acknowledged. The educator and learner must “work on the deconstruction of these matrices of relations of power, and to reconfigure positions of its parties so that the once powerless category could gain voice. Failing to liberate the marginalised, it would not be possible to free these contexts from their problems and dysfunctionality” (Abu-Shomar, 2013, p. 300).
Abu-Shomar, a Palestinian-Jordanian education professor, discusses the post-colonial conditions of educational settings. He looks at the status of educational systems in post-colonial society, and how this influences national self-autonomy. Education systems like Ahed School strive for self-autonomy to raise the quality of life and education for Bedouin youth, yet they are dependent upon funding, curriculum, and support from Israel’s Ministry of Education and from private donors. They are grappling with the goal of self-determination while being reliant on the post-colonial structure that some resent. Founders and teachers at Ahed School believe in the power of de-marginalization and were inspired by Freire’s work (T. Tolley, per communication, June 5, 2012; October 3, 2013).

Freire receives much credit for encouraging liberation through education. He is lauded for transforming the education system from a *tabla rasa* “banking” system to a process of critical consciousness. This is achieved by cultivating a reflective and active system, bringing the teacher, student, and world system, into the praxis of living and learning. His work is relevant to those working as conflict analysts or structural change agents because it focuses on educating the underprivileged and ultimately redistributing power in politics, and resources. Freire was inspired by Marx, Lenin, Fanon, Fromm, Marcuse, and other renowned critical theorists. He was also shaped by childhood confrontations with poverty, the Brazilian favelas, and exposure to traditional forms of academia such as law school.

Additionally, Freire emphasizes dialogue as the centrifugal point of liberating the “oppressed” (Fanon’s *wretched of the earth* concept) from the “oppressors” (colonial-
styled powerful upper class). Dialogue operates by exploring concepts of power, knowledge and freedom. These concepts are practiced through action, reflection, theory and self-awareness. He demonstrates how the “word” is the basis of dialogue and that reflection and action are products of its power. This section of Freire’s pedagogy is not entirely convincing. It does not include other forms of communication such as body language, music, art, and dance, which are deeply revered in Brazilian culture, and can be seen within Bedouin communities. His definitions of “word” and “world” are thin much like his delineation between animals and humans. Freire says that “Animals do not see the world, they are immersed in it” (1985, p. 125). He describes those prior to education similarly, saying they have not had the ability to develop critical consciousness. He presents the difference between humans and animals, the word and world as known absolutes and does not acknowledge the diversity of behavior and communication in cultures until the end of the book. This concept is more fully explored in the role of education, when discussing ideology and cultural identity in Pedagogy of Freedom (1998), released just after he passed away.

Much of Freire’s writing shows that dialogue and revolutionary action can deconstruct oppressive colonial and hegemonic paradigms that perpetuate inequality. To Freire, pedagogy means a style of education that is directive, reflective and transformative, and is based in the theory of human nature (1985, p. 25). This is accompanied by the concept of a fear of freedom that both Freire and Kuhn discuss in their work. This fear echoes the failure of the revolution that Rosa Luxemburg so
wholeheartedly envisioned (Luxemburg 2006). Freire’s work provokes such reflections, especially when working towards conflict resolution and structural equality.

His work has inspired this modified ethnography with Bedouin youth to provide a medium (interviews and focus groups) for students to share their stories, culture, and the role of education on their world perspective. These reflections may inspire discussions on freedom and how that may have changed for contemporary Bedouin. Bedouin have always traditionally viewed themselves as a “free” people. The lifestyles in settlements, and the regulations on travel and temporary dwellings changes the mobility and independence of nomadic Bedouin. Ahed School is an attempt of putting education back in the hands of Bedouin. In the field of education, and development, the role of education is also being questioned (United Nations, Bush, & Saltarelli, 2011). The gap between theories of education and freedom, and the realities of contemporary education systems motivates the research questions, especially in the historical context of Bedouin education in the Naqab.

**Dynamics of Race, Identity and Violence through Education**

Ethnographies, and global conflict research, show structures of class, gender, violence, and compassion, all taking place within schools. While analyzing schools in post-conflict zones in Sierra Leone Sharkey shares the experiences at Brookfields School. Brookfields School tries to promote the empowerment of students, especially girls, hoping to free them from violence, and provide compassion and kindness.

---

25 Fictional name.
Brookfields School faces challenges of teacher retention, limited physical and financial resources, poor treatment from teachers (i.e. violence and teasing towards students is accepted) and level of training.

Regardless of the terror and hardship girls in Sierra Leone had already experienced, they were grateful for the social support they found within the school, education, and they found an increased self-esteem (Sharkey, 2008, p. 575). However, these girls have threats of sexual abuse walking to school, and questions of resilience, inequality and violence remain a complex discussion. Anthropologist Julie Betty’s research deepens the understanding of racial and structural inequalities within the context of education.

Bettie’s study of race and identity within a rural Californian high school shows the social, racial, and discursive divisions between students (especially white and Mexican American females). She explores the dynamics between class, fashion, gender, and sexual experience in the setting of the classroom (Bettie, 2003; Mellor, 2003). Bettie (2003) also provides valuable insights into class systems, which continue to exist within the Bedouin groups. She uses the classification of “class” versus “status” because she wants to highlight the “fact that membership in groups was largely shaped by class, and even when it was not, group membership had significant consequences for students’ class futures; status is too benign a term to express this” (p. 45).

Bettie looks at the culture of poverty, gender, family values and the students’ aspirations for the future. She additionally analyzes how family stories shape self-perception and beliefs about one’s own culture (Bettie, 2003; Bourdieu, 2003). Such
studies indicate education in conflict areas is a complex matrix of culture rooted in class, family dynamics, and physical and structural violence.

The literature on violence in schools is highlighted in some of Amnesty International’s data. They report violence against women in schools all over the world showed that “Forty percent of the 77 million school-age children not attending school live in conflict-affected areas” and that in the United States “83 percent of girls in grades 8 to 11 (aged around 12 to 16) in public schools experienced some form of sexual harassment” (“Violence Against Girls in Schools: key facts | Amnesty International,” 2013, para. 3). Amnesty International’s final point that indigenous populations girls that are racial or ethnic minorities are particularly targeted for violence further validates concerns Bedouin families have of girls attending schools unchaperoned.

One of the contributors of this dissertation is a Bedouin education and psychology scholar from the Naqab, Dr. Salman Elbedour, who currently teaches at Howard University in Washington, DC. Elbedour writes about ethnicity, and ethnic identity, among Bedouin adolescents (2009), scholastic achievement of Bedouin youth from both monogamous and polygamous families (2000). In addition, he studies mental health in Bedouin youth (2007), and the presence of drug and alcohol use and the psychosocial correlations (2008). Elbedour and colleagues also conducted research on The scope of sexual, physical, and psychological abuse in a Bedouin-Arab community of female adolescents: The interplay of racism, urbanization, polygamy, family honor, and the social marginalization of women (2006). Using surveys amongst Bedouin females between the ages 14-18, they found that:
Sixty-nine percent of the participants (n =149) reported no sexual abuse experiences, 16% reported one or two experiences, 11% reported three or four, and 4% reported more than four. Most participants indicated that they had been physically abused at least once by their father (37.1%), mother (43.7%), or siblings (44%) during the previous month. More than 50% of the participants reported being psychologically abused by members of their immediate families. Mother's age and closeness to mother significantly predicted physical abuse, and marital satisfaction and mother's age significantly predicted psychological abuse (Elbedour, et. al, 2006, p. 131-132).

Their article also calls for more research on abuse, and claims that rates are higher in Bedouin populations than within other Palestinian groups. Documentation of domestic violence within Bedouin families is available (Abu-Lughod, 2000, 2002), but not within the school context. While Amnesty International shows high rates of violence against girls in educational settings internationally, Elbedour’s research suggests more violence is prevalent within domestic situations in Bedouin communities then in public settings. Schools can be a place where students flourish, learn how to think critically and gain occupational skills. They can also serve as scaffolding for socialization, cultural influence, the labor market (Freire, 1985), and political activism.

In Israel/Palestine schools have historically served as a place of protest. In the spring of 2000 Kulud Badawi was the primary Palestinian female leader that arose in the media. She became a poster child for The Stand-Tall Generation, "members of which had been born roughly at the time of Land Day 1976, came of political age in the shadow of
two parallel processes. One was the disillusionment of Palestinian citizens with the struggle for civil equality... The other was the strides made by the Palestinian national movement since the beginning of the 1990s" (Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker, 2005, p. 113). Badawi\textsuperscript{26} received a great deal of attention from her activism and the newspapers projected an image of Palestinian youth as being blind to the State and not recognizing: Israel as their state; they have no bond with it and no commitment whatsoever toward it. Their affiliation with it is limited to technicalities. Services rendered to them by virtue of their formal citizenship are irrelevant to their sense of belonging and identity. The affiliation with it is limited to technicalities. Services rendered to them by virtue of their formal citizenship are irrelevant to their sense of belonging and identity. The affiliation that matters to them in terms of pride, meaning, and fulfillment of identity is the one they have with the Palestinian struggle for national assertion. This is where their politicized ambitions lie. They will never be content with second-class citizenship in their own homeland. These sentiments, and the assertive demand for chance that came with them, were expressed in a militant rhetoric that angered the Jewish Israeli mainstream. Not surprisingly, responses on the part of Israeli readers oscillated between disappointment, indignation, and blatant racist incitement (Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker, 2005, p. 113).

\textsuperscript{26} "Badawi" is also Arabic for "desert dweller" or Bedouin.
For Bedouin, the citizenship identity is split. They are recognized Israeli citizens, yet still not integrated into Israeli society. Some Bedouin consider themselves as Palestinians, and some Knesset leaders view Bedouin as “Palestinians with Israeli citizenship” (T.Tolley, per communication, June 3, 2012). The school setting is often a space where youth can discuss with their beliefs, ideas, hopes and discontent. In Israel/Palestine schools have been places for political recruitment, demonstrations and for conflict resolution.

Aburabia-Queder’s research and the dual sided research of Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker demonstrate how schools have been spaces of politicization, and catalysts for identity confrontation. In the 1940s in Israel/Palestine: "The school was instrumental for the consolidation throughout Israel of the militarist Gadna corps (youth battalions) dedicated to teaching basic military skills to high school students. The highly political character of these institutions, so obvious in retrospect, was routinized and naturalized to the point of misrecognition by those they came to inculcate" (2005, p. 71).

Rabinowitz & Abu-Baker suggest that schools can be a place of critical examination, scientific exploration and leadership, as well as security training and military recruitment. Militarization in schools happens within American high schools today with Reserved Officer’s Training Corps (ROTC), or international OTCs in Universities throughout Canada, the United Kingdom, Europe and the Middle East. Schools also serve as a retreat and shelter for youth in conflict to reintegrate after being child soldiers, gang members, refugees, and other survivors of conflicts and hardship.
The Bialik Rogozin School in southern Tel-Aviv is an ethnically integrated school which defines school success as rates of high performance on matriculation exams and the percentage of students that join the Israeli Army after graduation (Price, 2009). This school is unique in that in 2008 it was asked by the municipality to accept Sudanese refugees. This inspired an HBO documentary called Strangers No More. The Bialik Rogozin School is relevant to those interested in educational systems because it is deconstructing racism and segregation by welcoming international students who have fled from violence and poverty.

The Bialik Rogozin School transformed into a model of education for at-risk Jewish children and international students with various levels of school experience (students have come from Russia, Ethiopia, Israel, Nigeria, Philippines, Sudan and some are Israeli Arabs, but none have been indicated as Palestinians) (Price, 2009). Bialik Rogozin School teaches human rights and concepts of equality and justice. Like Ahed School, it receives contributions from foreign donors such as the Jewish Federation of Greater Los Angeles. The Bialik Rogozin School represents the complexities of education within conflict areas. Students are learning how to adapt to new cultures, societies, and different conflict dynamics while attempting to adapt into their new habitats. Students at Bialik Rogozin School and Ahed School are confronted with the need to assimilate while experiencing incidents of alienation.

The question of assimilation versus alienation within Bedouin education systems in the Naqab is integral to this dissertation. Ahed School was designed by Bedouin academics who experienced physical and emotional alienation while attending integrated
schools. These Bedouin were the minorities in high schools, colleges, and universities located across the country from their families. They built Ahed School as a response to their difficult educational experiences, and their hopes that a local quality education would support students in succeeding academically. However, Bedouin students continue to feel alienation once they reach university level, or when they leave the village.

This dynamic of Bedouin assimilation versus alienation is a paradoxical element in the question of Bedouin education. Sociological literature from schools and places of work help lay out the dimensions within the school. Alienation often contributes to poor performance within schools and poor behavior within the classroom (Brown, Higgins, & Paulsen, 2003; Davidson, 1996; Etzioni, 1968). The feeling of alienation within a school system refers to experiences of powerlessness, normlessness, meaninglessness, and social isolation and estrangement (Brown et al., 2003; Trusty & Dooley-Dickey, 1993). Relationships, curriculum and school culture also contribute to feelings of alienation (Calabrese & Seldin, 1987; Trusty & Dooley-Dickey, 1993).

The question of assimilation is complex in the Bedouin context. The goal of many Bedouin communities is to achieve higher quality of living through education, infrastructure, self-governance and independent economic and social constructs (Abu-Rabia-Queder & Weiner-Levy, 2013; Dinero, 2010; Yiftachel, 2008). The State of Israel provides funding for education for Bedouin living in the diameters of land deemed acceptable for habitation (Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013; Knesset Government, 2013; The Media Line, 2015). There is also the level of development that different Bedouin families are operating in. The transformation of Bedouin communities since the
1970s sedentarization campaign represent changes in both physical and educational landscapes. Education systems formerly based on survival geography (i.e. living off the land), and a culture’s inherited customs and rites (weaving, embroidery, hunting, agriculture systems or traditional medical or communication systems) are transforming. As populations negotiate assimilating into contemporary living dynamics, there are also those that resist new technology and methods of habitation.

It is frequently uncovered that even with an increase in infrastructures in a community, rural and village populations elect to return to nomadic or rural lifestyles rather than dwell in designed communities, or adjust to urban and suburban developments (Shahshahani & Bromberger, 2011). In Naqab Bedouin communities the deliberation between “traditional” ways of life and modern Israeli lifestyles is often presented to the youth. This is most evident in terms of selecting careers, educational programs, marriage and the role of nomadic culture.

Shahshahani is an Iranian anthropologist who specializes in the Middle East and pastoral nomadic communities. She finds that in the case of Iran “all attempts to study and then ‘modernise’ pastoral nomadic areas ever since Reza Shah’s period has been through forced sedentarisation. The government never had a reasonable economic project to replace this nomadic mode of life with a sedentarised one” (Shahshahani, 2002). Bedouin in the Naqab have also found these challenges in the same time frame (Reza Shah’s monarchy lasted from 1925-1979, the sedentarization campaign of Israeli Bedouin began as Israeli established the state in 1948 and continues today with designed communities for Bedouin).
In Fars Province of Iran a boarding school system was designed in attempts to contemplate pastoral nomadic life, but the project was claimed a failure. The teachers were poorly trained, the tents did not hold up, families were not content, memorization styles of education did not prepare pastoral nomadic children for practical occupations and numbers of students were falsified (Shahshahani, 2002). Shahshahani found that these tribal schools promulgated a “false myth of continuing their traditional way of life. This is preserving a characteristic, emptying it of its original meaning, and filling it with another…” (p. 318). While Iran and Israel are very different in their politics, the struggle between the dominant agenda of the state, and the traditional economic and educational styles of the minority populations are paralleled.

Understanding how schools have approached the transformation of nomadic communities into sedentarized townships contributes to questions of assimilation and alienation. The roles of schools in conflict landscapes present the multilayered issues of marginalization versus empowerment, alienation versus acceptance, and violence versus safe spaces for education. The story of the Bialik Rogozin School shows the strength of schools coming out of conflict to provide a diverse, integrated, assembly of students trying to survive and flourish. What is interesting is that there are not more integrated programs like this in Israel. With the increasing the amount of refugees in Israel from African countries (especially Sudan and Eritrea) education systems will need to adapt to support the changing population.

Approximately 60,000 African refugees are seeking asylum in Israel (Fezehai, 2014). They are without social assistance and are dependent on three month renewable
visas. The new influx of refugees has exacerbated racism in Israel, and asylum seekers have been called “infiltrators” by Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu. There is similar rhetoric towards African displaced people as to Bedouin (Fezehai, 2014). Schools are limited in their budgets, capacity, and access to students in need of education. However, schools have the potential to empower and provide opportunity for students from conflict areas. Because of the recognition of the role of schools in conflict, they are one of the most funded responses to post conflict development. The International Initiative for Impact Evaluation shows that international development, foundation, and government funding improves the quality of life, poverty reduction, education, and levels of competency in reading, writing and mathematics of youth (Spink, 2005; White, 2013).

This literature inspires the question of how Bedouin youth can be empowered to be high performing citizens of Bedouin communities and of Israel while faced with experiences that are potentially alienating. These dynamics will be explored through questions of marginalization, conflict, and identity.

**Bedouin Experiences of Conflict and Marginalization**

In Israel/Palestine, Bedouin feel like they have been treated like second class citizens. Fabetti believes this may be rooted in the idea of “under productivity” (1990) in domestic group economy theory and Sahlin’s theory of the domestic mode of production as a primitive act (Sahlins, 1974). This concept was transferred to the study of economic conditions of Bedouin in Saudi Arabia, promoting an ideological opinion that Bedouin were lazy and unproductive (Galaty & Salzman, 1981). These kinds of myths and
stereotypes allow national law to further subjectify a population that is seen as economically extraneous, lazy and unworthy. This view contradicts the image of Bedouin as fierce warriors and those that uphold traditional ways of the desert.

This tension is discussed by educational philosophers and writers such as Eduardo Galeano who uses the term “nobodies” to represent the oppressed in Latin America:

The nobodies: nobody’s children, owners of nothing. The nobodies: the no-ones, the nobodied, running like rabbits, dying through life, screwed every which way. Who are not, but could be. Who don’t speak languages, but dialects. Who don’t have religions, but superstitions. Who don’t create art, but handicrafts. Who don’t have culture, but folklore. Who are not human beings, but human resources. Who do not have faces, but arms. Who do not have names, but numbers. Who do not appear in the history of the world, but in the crime reports of the local paper. The nobodies, who are not worth the bullet that kills them (Galeano 1992).

Galeano and Freire both warn of the charities or “band-aids” that are given out by oppressors to maintain the power division between those with power and the “nobodies” without. The Israeli government has offered small amounts of money for Bedouin to resettle but many, although impoverished, have refused. Some Israelis have worried about the economic and political support from countries like the United States (T.Tolley, personal communication, May 31, 2012). Yet, the role of outside funding and political influence can be a sensitive balance for development and demarginalization. Jabri (2010) also discusses the danger of this kind of government intervention which connects to the economic instability, and insecurity, of the region.
The Israeli Government recognizes that economic threats increase the security threat and are in the process of stipulating a new tax rebate deal to issue more work permits for Palestinian laborers (Laub & Daragmeh, 2012). However, manifest conflict following the killings and kidnappings of Israeli and Palestinian youth have discouraged some coexistence activities and economic collaborations. The economic concerns are accompanied by contested land not only between Israelis and Palestinians, but between the State of Israel, and Bedouin villages. These tensions provide a context to understanding the changing lifestyle of Bedouin, the role of education, and future economic opportunities, for the young generation of Bedouin living in Israel/Palestine.

According to The Guardian, the Israeli government believes that resettling Bedouin into predetermined communities “will lift the indigenous population from unacceptable depths of poverty. Across Israeli-controlled territory, Bedouin communities argue that their culture, along with centuries – old ties to land, is being swept aside to make way for Jewish expansion” (Greenwood, 2012, para. 3). When ethnic or religious communities are forced into relocation both economic and social identity confrontations occur. “Population movements – whether voluntary migrations from rural to urban centers or forced migrations caused by violence or hardship result in pressures on resources or ethnic tensions that flame into conflicts. Economics also affects the propensity for conflict, forging functional ties that may reduce the potential for conflict in some instances and causing social dislocation that raise the potential for conflict in others” (Crocker, Hampson, & Aall, 1999, p. 49). In the case of Israeli Bedouin, forced resettlement completely disturbs the history, environment and identity of the people (Ras,
2012). However, as Bedouin advocate for their needs there is increased access to education and social services, as well as diversified economic opportunity (T. Tolley, per communication, June 5, 2012). There is a tension between Bedouin wanting, and expecting, social services and the state offering services with resettlement.

The forced settlements are politically and culturally unacceptable to Bedouin trying to preserve their traditions and way of life (Greenwood, 2012). Yet, those in planned settlements, such as Lakiya and Hura where Ahed School is located, are moving away from nomadic traditions and occupations and highlighting education as a stepping stone and gateway to economic opportunity and independence. Although there are differences within Naqab Bedouin between castes, tribes and those living in towns versus unrecognized villages, the desire for independent education is called for by the majority of Bedouin and their advocates (Abu-Ras 2012; T. Tolley, personal communication, June 6, 2012).

In June of 2012, Bedouin leaders and advocates participated in Ben-Gurion University of the Negev’s conference on *Socio-Legal Perspectives on the Passage to Modernity in and Beyond the Middle East*. Part of the conference included visiting living villages on “dead” (*mevat/mawat*) land in Bedouin Spaces around Beer Sheva with local land policy expert Dr. Thabet Abu-Ras and scholar/activist Dr. Oren Yiftachel. Yiftachel is the author of *Ethnocracy: Land and Identity Politics in Israel/Palestine*, where he shares a critical theory and comparative framework to account for the political geography of ethnocratic societies.
Yiftachel is an expert on the land boundaries and marginalization of Bedouin, and the economic needs of the communities. He also emphasizes that “Under the Israeli regime, Bedouins have become ‘invaders’ of their ancestors’ land and obstacles to development” (Yiftachel, 2008, p. 3). He also poignantly asks why is it that Bedouin experience more discrimination and poverty than any other minority group within Israel/Palestine. Yiftachel argues that land and demography block Bedouin from having a higher quality of life, and justifying continual colonial racism and marginalization of minority populations living on land desired by the majority.

Abu-Ras and Yiftachel shared that the majority of economic support this community is receiving is from the Islamic Movement. The Islamic Movement in Israel (aka Islamic Movement in 48 Palestine, an offspring of the Muslim Brotherhood) appears to be the predominant group helping to fund social services in unrecognized villages. The Islamic Movement’s major goals are to spread Islam through three veins: belief system (education, religious services and culture), social/welfare benefits and nationalistic efforts to end Israel’s occupation and support Palestinian nationalism (“Profile: Islamic Movement in Israel - Middle East - Al Jazeera English,” 2010). This is an example of an economic and structural conflict transforming the religious and social identity of the population.

The following image is of a Bedouin community that has lived in this location for over 200 years and is now bordering a toxic energy plant. According to the village leader, Ahmad Amara,27 the community has a high rate of miscarriages, cancer and little to no

---

27 This name, much like the majority of research subjects, is a pseudonym.
access to education, clean drinking water or sanitation services (T. Tolley, per communication, June 6, 2012). While we talked with the leader of the community, 12-year-old boys offered to save my soul with help from the Prophet Mohammed. The encounter encouraged further inquiry regarding the role of religion in the community.

The Bedouin consider themselves Israeli citizens, but because they feel they are being marginalized and deprived by the government, they are seeking aid in a religious movement that threatens Israelis government, and seeks followers. The situation is becoming not a conflict over land and self-governance, but an ideological one as well.

Figure 2.1. Bedouin Youth and Sheik on Garbage Mound in Unrecognized Village. Image demonstrates the exposure to emissions from the power plant.

---

28 This is expanded upon in Chapters Four and Five.
In 2003, the planning minister Ehud Olmert (who also served as Israel’s Prime Minister, Deputy Premier, Finance Minister and Mayor of Jerusalem) presented policy to condense Israeli Bedouin into seven primary urban communities. He was criticized for not considering the desires of the local communities, and in response stated: “We plan to talk to the Bedouins, but I assume they will object to our plan from the outset. Still, we shall not be afraid to implement our decisions… If we depend on Bedouin consent, it will never come… The government will implement the plan, either peacefully or by force” (Yiftachel, 2006a, pp. 3–4). This plan circulated through the Knesset without an acceptable proposal to either the Knesset or Bedouin advocates for over a decade (2004-2014) and was frozen in December of 2013 while home removals continued (Berman, 2013).

The Prawer Pact was not successful because it neglected to address both the allocation and issue of land, as well as the historical value to the people. In addition, the alternatives of moving to a Bedouin city like Rahat, or new settlement did not assuage the fears of dependence, violent communities and lack of control tribes would have over the land and community design. There were no successful attempts to seek resolution through cooperation, negotiation, legal action or the increased marginalization and alienation of Bedouin Arabs who were formerly able to negotiate integrating into the State of Israel. In defiance, the al-Touri tribe assembled an independent, noncompliant village with cattle, homes and community works (Yiftachel, 2006, pp. 4). Many other tribes have done the same. They believe in the rights, freedom and justice as defined and
shaped by their traditional ways, and do not view the Israeli policies as moral or acceptable.

The Knesset’s rhetoric portrays Bedouin as squatters who should settle and work in contemporary roles (Yiftachel, 2006). This is where the Israeli government claims modernization (and sedentarization) is the answer to the history of nomadic living within a region struggling with land conflict (Evicting the Bedouin - Israel/Palestine, 2007).

These types of settlements (and Jewish communities) have been a controversial policy throughout Israel/Palestine since the Six-Day War in 1967 (Dinero, 2010; Greenwood, 2012; Rudoren, 2012). The settlements were initiated by Israeli Labor governments from 1968 to 1977 with the intent to strategically gain Jewish territory in the West Bank (Bard, 2012). The Bedouin settlements are the answer to Israel’s challenges with semi-nomadism in a similar way in which Jewish settlements are a response to contested land with Palestinians. Bedouin who are reluctant to sedentarize see the designed communities as reservations (Dinero, 2010) not as reinforcement of Israeli land rights. This conflict divides Bedouin populations between Bedouin living in Palestinian territories, those who moved into settlements and those living in unrecognized villages. The inequality is evident within social services and access to education. More schools are available in settlements and there are government incentives to moving into these designated communities (Dinero, 2010; Meir, 1996; Smith, 2014). Bedouin education is divided and Ahed School is one of the few high caliber high schools available for students from both unrecognized villages and designed settlements.
Through private funding, Ahed School was founded by Bedouin academics from the Naqab. It is a positive response to marginalization, especially in the wake of heightened conflict and economic insecurity. The challenge is the school may evolve to represent a form of assimilation into Israeli society and traditional Bedouin culture is at risk of fading away. The literature shares theories of education, conflict analysis and resolution. Ethnographies of Bedouin contribute to the exploration of these aforementioned concepts and in turn inform the research questions and research methods looking at how Ahed School builds agency for Bedouin, as well as influences the culture of Bedouin of the Naqab.

**Overcoming Marginalization and Increasing Agency**

In 2009, a fifteen year old teenage girl opened fire on Israel Defense Forces (IDF) in the border town of Shoket Junction (Lis & Yagna, 2009) within walking distance from where Ahed School operates. This was the third time in a month the Gaza border police received gunfire, and attempts at wounding symbols of power and persecution continue. The young girl was shot and killed in her attempts to shoot the officers. Her father and uncle were held for questioning and eventually released (Curiel, 2009). Tensions between Bedouin communities and IDF are high near the borders of Palestinian territories. Border communities are often composed of tribal families divided by borders. Division is palpable, and both Bedouin Palestinians and Bedouin Israelis experience marginalization and prejudice.
The Bedouin in Israel/Palestine represent a marginalized, yet to some, revered population. Bedouin are part of the national identity, yet hold little power or choice when it comes to the development of the nation. “Marginalization is an outcome of a power-imbalanced structure which benefits only a few at the expense of many others. The analysis of ethnic conflict would be inadequate if we ignore the impact of century-old external domination and the desire of a marginalized ethnic group for self-determination reflected in their aspiration for autonomy” (Cheldelin, Druckman, & Fast, 2003, p. 155).

Other populations in Israel/Palestine also experience discrimination, neocolonialism, marginalization and ethnic conflict. Ethnic tensions exist between Christian Arabs and Druze, as well as rampant violence between Israelis and Palestinians, dominating the media and international rhetoric. While this dissertation does not focus on the Israeli/Palestinian protracted conflict, it aims to represent this smaller, yet remarkable story of Bedouin youth, and communities, vying for economic and educational opportunities on their ancestral land.

There are few Bedouin run civic organizations which represent community and tribal interests and are respected by the Israeli government. Occasionally, when there are incidents of low level crimes, the Israeli government supports mediating committees in Arab villages and towns (Ginat, 1997, p. ix). They also sporadically support inter-hamula (clan) and co-liable groups to strengthen experiences of empowerment and to decrease violence in the community. Historically, Bedouin have used their tribal law, and the leadership of the family sheik to determine justice and honor. Some Bedouin feel like they are losing their honor as citizens when their petitions to the government are
neglected. Bedouin also feel marginalized and when they do not receive basic services, or an acknowledgement of land or legal rights. Having agency through non-violent tribal justice systems such as mediation is important for Bedouin run organizations, businesses, and schools.

This need for agency is represented not only in a Bedouin versus State of Israel rhetoric, but within the Bedouin communities themselves. This literature review focuses on the experiences of Bedouin through the local and national conflict, denomadatization, and the culture and access to education. Some Bedouin women feel that colonial power segregates Bedouin society internally by supporting the traditional tribal system and by condoning practices like polygamy (Rabia 2011). Gender is an important element to understanding the marginalization and history of Bedouin women entering structured education systems. In Chapter Four the complex challenges of Bedouin women’s integration into higher education and the challenges experienced within their families, communities, and institutions of higher education are explored. These voices are important to understand what it means to “succeed” in terms of education.

Conflict theory and critical anthropology recognize the absolute need to have women’s voices not only represented, but as centrifugal agents of change (Nordstrom, 2004), (Scheperv-Hughes & Bourgois, 2003) transforming a culture of violence (Curle, 1999). Bedouin women feel segregated from men in most social structures, especially in the workforce. They feel forced to work in childcare or as elementary school teachers. If they are unmarried, educated, and older (past their twenties), they are frequently encouraged to enter polygamous relationships (Dinero, 2010).
Reviewing Dynamics of Religion and Gender

The book *Polygamous Societies* presents many of the issues that Bedouin women, and Arab women in the Middle East in general, experience (Rabia, 2012). She explores the dynamics of gender and conflict in the Middle East from the perspective of Bedouin women. She warns of cultural tokenism and confronts Western researchers with their projection of morals and traditions on other cultures. These concepts are deepened in the fourth chapter and are important to recognizing the challenges young Bedouin women are experiencing through their education and pursuit of work and family. Schools, and the workplace are some of the few venues where unrelated Bedouin females and males collaborate and are publically equals. Lila Abu-Lugod also challenges research and media’s representation of Muslim females with the question, “Do Muslim women really need saving?” (Abu-Lughod, 2002).

This question of the role of Muslim women has been used as a justification of war (i.e. The United States “liberating” and bringing democracy to women in Iraq and Afghanistan), and as a way to dehumanize, and further marginalize, Islamic communities. The gender relationships in Bedouin communities, and Arab populations overall, are based in a different set of traditions and moral values than many of the Western, Judeo Christian perspectives. This clash occurs all over the world, especially around issues of forced marriage and honor killings. Such events happen in the United States, Scandinavia, and the Middle East. Honor killings continue to occur today.
Unni Wikan, the Norwegian anthropologist, described the relationship between marginalized communities, immigration and the conversion of culture into ethnic identity politics with a complex relationship with the State in *Generous Betrayals* (Wikan, 2001). Her work explores honor killings within immigrant families in Norway, and the role of schools in negotiating freedom, empowerment and education of the new generation of Muslim Norwegians. Her work on “welfare colonialism” which she describes as “putting people on welfare rather than seeking to let them use their capacities and talents to gain self-respect and social esteem” (Wikan, 2013, p. 5) also speaks to the marginalization of minority populations internationally.

Bedouin expert Ginat says that “The killing of a woman because she has brought shame on the family is an established Arab norm” (Ginat, 1997, p. ix) is practiced within Bedouin communities. This is changing in contemporary times. The efforts of programs like Shatil are dedicated to leading social change and have specific programs focusing on empowering Bedouin women in various issues ranging from economics, nonviolence and education (*Shatil’s work with Bedouin women in Israel’s Negev region*, 2009). The complexities of gender, religion and societal roles within the Bedouin society are further explored in Chapter Four. The next segment presents the significance of culture and ethnic identity for conflict resolution and understanding this analysis of education as forms of both demarginalization and assimilation.
Exploring Culture and Ethnic Identity

Culture is a complicated concept in terms of conflict resolution, development work, and fostering access to education. Some definitions of culture defend, objectify, and exoticize populations of people. It is also an essential element to understanding the dynamic meaning, rituals, traditions and purpose of the actions and processes of people. Culture is a valuable component to understanding how people recover from violence or protracted conflict, and how meaning making shapes the future decisions and social movements of groups. "Metaphorically speaking, culture is a perception-shaping lens or (still metaphorically) a grammar for the production and structuring of meaningful action" (Black & Scimecca, 1998, p. 132)

Avruch and Black describe how parties from various cultures may have different interpretations of what creates and influences conflict. Avruch also helps researchers understand the different definitions and influence of culture on conflict resolution and mediation techniques. In a review of the Harvard model of negotiation, Avruch alludes to the different interpretations of culture from a lens of understanding how people perceive conflict, interests and values. He describes how culture is also connotatively understood as characteristics or traits. Avruch emphasizes that the context of culture is essential to conflict resolution models. He argues “that it is far more difficult to reconcile or “bridge” conflicts of values or world views than interests. I am less confident of the success of interest-based negotiation in conflicts around deeply held values such as identity, or around religiously-inspired worldviews” (Avruch, 2004, p. 396).
How memory influences culture is an important aspect of the need of survivors of conflict to create a community that represents where they come from and the identities they hold on to. As anthropologist and conflict analyst Susan Hirsch notes, “People struggle with whether they want to preserve the culture of the past. It’s a complex dynamic” (T. Tolley, personal communication, April 19, 2013). This research acknowledges that even though Bedouin history and tradition is viscerally strong, people still wrestle with conflicting desires to preserve culture, as well as the desire to have education, economic opportunities and the same opportunities Jewish Israelis have. The perceptions of conflict, culture, and conflict resolution are molded through the families, national politics, media and schools.

For past generations of Bedouin, cultural traditions and ethnic identity influenced most elements to existence. They determined who you marry, where you live, what you believe in, where you go to school, and perceptions of the surrounding conflict. For older Bedouin in the Naqab, being ethnic Bedouin is a salient, collective, identity (Abu-Rabia, 2011; Elbedour et al., 2009, K. V. Korostelina, 2007a, p. 84 ) which permeates every part of the culture of descendants whether living in Israel/Palestine, Jordan, Saudi Arabia or the Bedouin enclaves scattered throughout the world. This dissertation looks at the social identity of ethnic Bedouin and concepts of cultural preservation and assimilation through education. Social identity theory (Tajfel 1978), kinship, metacontrast and social and national boundaries theories such as site transfer (Tilly, 2006), categorization and psychodynamic theories of conflict (Volkan 1950-2008) and structural violence all help
to explain how young people are negotiating the obstacles between maintaining Bedouin culture and identity while integrating into Israeli society through education and economy.

Batchelor believes that “culture is one of the primary dimensions by which people often define their identities, along with ethnicity, religion, language, tribe and clan. These cleavages are those along which wars are most often fought, although every person has a multitude of overlapping identities which include family background, education, peers, clothes, etc” (LeBaron, 2003). These categorizations separate people through their identity, or cultural groups from each other, creating an “us” (in-group) from “them” (out-group). Although with globalization the integration of ethnic identity groups, technology exchange and the physical mobility (and longevity) of populations - identities and cultural borders are changing.

The human interpretation of a culture, or conflict situations, will always be filtered through the researcher/analyst’s lens of culturally layered perception. What is observed as “normal” will always be less explored. For some, the historical nomadic lifestyle is a threatening type of unfamiliar with mysterious dimensions. For others, it represents a back to nature movement that may be necessary with transforming environments through global climate change. For young Bedouin, the nomadic lifestyle may seem like past stories shared by their grandparents and ancestors.

An evolving definition of what is normal or acceptable is one way we as humans adapt, and culture creates the framework for such interpretation. It is important to consider “what role should culture be assigned in our explanations of conflict and our attempts to
develop theory and method for its management or resolution?” (Avruch & Black, 1991, p. 23).

The question of culture is important in this case study because Ahed School, in its movement towards science and technology, is veering away from historical nomadism, traditional arts, poetry, and storytelling, which previously were dominant in the culture. Anthropology has provided multiple windows into international Bedouin cultures. Lila Abu-Lughod is an American anthropologist with Palestinian roots and is an expert on Arab nations, issues of gender and political memory. She lived with Bedouin in the West of Egypt and found cultural richness in traditions of honor, shame, and communication through poetry.

She explains how home and community are described as those that ‘eat from one bowl’ (Abu-Lughod, 2000, p. 1). Abu-Lughod explores concepts of kinship and the Bedouin’s blood ideology and world definitions. Ancestry and the male bloodline construct the social world, and kinship. Blood relations define “individual social identity and collective cultural identity, and shapes individual attitudes and sentiments towards others… Everyday concerns of social living for the Bedouins, who hold autonomy dear and pride themselves on their egalitarianism, at least in political life, are matters of hierarchy and of power and status” (Abu-Lughod, 2000, p. 1). The caste system is palpable in some Bedouin communities and the bloodline is still important with traditional families. Education and land ownership have become levels of power and status in the Naqab. They increase marriage prospects, economic status and change perceptions of caste systems.
She also discusses the influence of education on the Bedouin community, “The introduction of education and wage labor may eventually marginalize the pastoral way of life and loosen the hold of the family and tribe as educated Bedouins abandon the life of the desert, the politics of the tribe, and the values of honor and modesty at the center of the Bedouin world” (Abu-Lughod, 2000, p. 1). This insight will be kept in mind as we explore modern education in the case of Ahed School. Abu-Lhugod also shares how for Bedouin, morality is equated to power. Yet, in the situation of the Naqab, the Israeli Government wields physical power (such as bulldozers and funding for social services), but little moral standing. This contradiction permeates the land conflict, and the responses to marginalization. Organizations like Adalah educate Bedouin activists to protest using Israeli means of communication through the Justice System, petitions, Israeli media and protests on public land. Although Bedouin protesters do not honor the Israeli justice system it is the most powerful forum for presenting their causes. They do not see it the Knesset or the Israeli Supreme Court as an honorable system but it is the way the nation operates (Fraser, 2003; Ras, 2012; Yiftachel, 2008).

According to Abu-Lughod, morality and honor are rooted in many Muslim Bedouin traditions and veils symbolize sexual modesty and shame. “Veils literally blacken the face; thus, they symbolize shame, particularly sexual shame” (Abu-Lughod, 2000, p. 1). She uses a Foucaultian terminology of discourse to describe poetic vulnerability and honor in the Bedouin context. She applies discourse as a “shorthand for a complex of statements made by numerous people in different social contexts is justified by the existence of a pattern in the sentiments expressed in the two media. People often
turn to poetry when faced with personal difficulties, but the constellations of sentiments
they communicate in response to these difficulties in their poems and in their ordinary
verbal and nonverbal statements overlap very little” (Abu-Lughod, 2000, p. 1). This is
one reason that this modified ethnographic case study elects qualitative research methods
to help bring nonverbal communication to the surface, and this will be elaborated upon in
the methods section.

Another anthropologist who spent seven years doing fieldwork with Mzeina
Bedouin in the Sinai is Israeli Smadar Lavie. She writes about the influence of the
military occupation on the Bedouin in South Sinai (contested land between Israel and
Egypt). She described how this military rule influenced the psyche of the people. “The
omnipresent occupations had permeated not only internal inter and intratribal affairs, but
also discourses as delicate and intimate as those between husbands and wives (S. Lavie,

Lavie also presents Bedouin identities in allegorical characters. Because of the
influence of the occupation and political process “Bedouin identity could be little more
that literary allegory: tribal identity appeared as moralistic, multilayered narratives
transcending the spatial and temporal boundaries of military occupation through symbolic
defiance only, because for Mzeinis to openly confront any armed or unarmed occupier
could mean beatings, jail, even death (Lavie, 1991, p. 8).

Lavie’s perspective as an Israeli is particularly interesting because she was raised
as an Israeli Jew with the belief that the Sinai desert was “the last frontier” on earth, a
forbidden terrain for “civilized” people. Like many anthropologists, she transcended her
upbringing and provided insightful and nuanced perspectives. She was adopted into their tribe and became part of the family structure. Lavie continued to visit the Mzeina for decades and brought her husband into the tribe to be accepted into the family and to bring the Bedouin and American Israeli families together. As a foreign researcher, yet adopted family member, Lavie had the freedom of movement to come and go from the village. Bedouin women have not had that flexibility of movement and are granted mobility through the acceptable avenues of education, work and marriage.

These stories are important to represent because they are lacking within the dominant narrative. Lavie demonstrates how storytelling was the safest and most powerful form of communication for Mzeina Bedouin under occupation. She presents the paradox between these stories, and poems, with the allegorical characters such as “The Fool, the Madwoman, the Old Woman, and The One Who Writes Us, who were on the margins of Mzeini social acceptability, paradoxically were able to enact allegories that palpably expressed the central issues of Mzeini identity under occupation” (Lavie, 1991, p. 39).

When discussing land conflict, Lavie notes the shocking fact that “No development policies dealing with the land of Sinai have ever been formulated without the stimuli of destructive conflict and war” (Lavie, 1991, p. 58). The land is so politicized that few decisions can be made without violence. The hope for the Bedouin in the Naqab is that peaceful solutions will be maintained and a multicultural community will flourish where Bedouin can maintain their cultural traditions and lifestyle, but also enter the economic market of science, technology, transportation, education, health and beyond.
While these anthropologists were influential in presenting images and insights into the Bedouin ways, they also have displeased some contemporary Bedouin.

When inquiring about these representations of Bedouin to two colleagues from the Naqab I received negative responses “Oh, Lavie, she doesn’t even know how to translate the poetry. They only saw what they wanted to see” (T. Tolley, personal communication, November 30, 2012). These ethnographies, describe the inner workings of small Bedouin villages, yet do not explore the role of education in Bedouin culture and conflict in Israel/Palestine. This dissertation provides insight into contemporary challenges and success stories Bedouin are experiencing through the lens of education. The Bedouin story is often overshadowed by the Israeli versus Palestinian narrative, yet there is much to be learned from this unique, and transforming, population.

In the Israeli/Palestinian context ethnic and religious identities dominate the narratives of the region. “Ethnic identity is shaped from within the group by common experiences and heritage, and from without by the larger society’s system of ethnic relations” (Peacock et al., 2007, p. 74). There are 190-250,000 Bedouin in the Naqab, and 60,000 more in Northern Israel.29 According to the Israeli Central Bureau of Statistics, as of May 2014, the population of Israel is constituted of 8,180,000 people, of which 75% of the population is Jewish (6,135,000), 20.7% of the population are Arabs (1,694,000) and the remaining 4.2% are those that identify as non-Arab Christians, Baha’i and other (Israeli Central Bureau of Statistics, 2014). This is a high rate of growth from the

---

29 Numbers vary between documents but this represents the most accurate range.
population of 806,000 residents during the State of Israel’s “conception,” and is contested by Palestinians and Bedouin.

Through the 1970s, approximately 70% of Bedouin men served for Israeli Defenses. Some government representatives, and Bedouin activists point out that they have been Israeli’s allies and it would be counterintuitive to threaten their identity and give them cause to go against the State of Israel (Evicting the Bedouin - Israel/Palestine, 2007). Prior to 1991 Bedouin soldiers were placed in either the Bedouin Desert Reconnaissance Battalion or the Bedouin Tracker units. In the last twenty years all divisions are technically open for minority soldiers but approximately 80 percent of Naqab Bedouin join the original Bedouin units. There are also ranks amongst the Arab Israelis serving in the IDF. Druze, Bedouin and Christian Arabs are divided between different units serving to a “policy of dividing and subdividing the Arab populations” (Kanaaneh, 2008, p. 4). This assimilation creates hostility from Palestinians who have been known to call Druze and Bedouin Israelis Arab el Shamnet which means “sour cream Arabs” after a popular Israeli yogurt inferring that Arab Israelis are “soft” and addicted to the modern Israeli way of life (Kanaaneh, 2008, p. 4).

Rhoda Kanaaneh, the author of Surrounded: Palestinian Soldiers in the Israeli Military (2008) states that Bedouin, and other Arab Israeli minorities, join the IDF because of limited economic and educational opportunities in their villages. This form of assimilation into Israeli society typically comes out of economic need and further marginalized Bedouin military members who became labeled as “traitors” by other Arab
Israeli and Palestinians (Kanaaneh, 2008). While this rhetoric was common in the literature review, and in interviews, there are exceptions.

The first Arab-Israeli IDF officer, Hisham Abu Varia, explains "The army is the entry pass into the Israeli society," Hisham explains. "The Arab sector thinks it's second rate here, but to get privileges one has to give and not just receive. The state protects its citizens even if they don’t serve – my parents live off income support. You must contribute to the country you live off. What other country would have an Arab Knesset member, who is being paid by the state, promoting the interests of the Islamic movement and screwing the promotion of the sector it is supposed to represent?" (Pevzner, 2010, para. 10). Abu Varia is a large red-haired man who most people assume is Druze. However he is from the northern Arab village of Sahknin which is primarily Bedouin and is involved in a land conflict that is similar to the situation in the Naqab. He finds his experience in the IDF fascinating and hopes to pursue a Master’s in Anthropology. “It’s because of the service. In the army everyone is equal, but there is no other place that gathers such different people with such different cultural backgrounds who still manage to live together. That's what interests me the most” (Pevzner, 2010, para. 26). Abu Varia’s story is unique in his pride and fascination with the army. He admits he lost his Muslim fiancé and friends because of his enthusiasm to climb the ranks of the IDF but to him this acceptance is worth the sacrifice.

Racism is still prevalent within in the military in Israel, and the United States. Druze soldier Razzi Houseysa of the Golani unit was attacked for speaking Arabic. This sparked a response Ta’al MK Ahmed Tibi who stated “Israeli society is infected with the
virus of racism” (Solomon, 2015, para. 1). Simultaneously the United States is experiencing extensive race targeted violence in the case of Michael Brown and the city of Ferguson (Edwards, 2014; M. Fisher & Lowery, 2014). And in the first five weeks of 2015 nine people were murdered in the Arab sector of Israel, following 59 murders in 2014. Two Bedouin boys, ages twelve and sixteen were shot in the Naqab near the green line (border with Palestinian territories) and the police have not discovered the shooters (Shaalan, 2015). Violence is rampant throughout Israel/Palestine and Bedouin feel that it is targeted because of their religion and ethnic identity (T. Tolley, per communication, October 2013 and February 2015).

Contemporary Naqab Bedouin also feel like their identity and citizenship are torn. Their tribes were divided by imposed borders with Palestine, Jordan and Egypt, their range of travel and residence went from thousands of miles to small government designed villages. Kinship and boundaries have transformed the lifestyle and livelihood of Bedouin, and the current land conflict, and changes in Bedouin education and economy creates new dynamics within Bedouin relationships with the State of Israel, Palestinians, and relationship to their ancestral land. Bedouin, along with other Palestinian Israelis, are also required to carry identification cards with a menorah on the outside and their entry of nationality inside indicating whether they are Bedouin, Christian, Druze or Muslim (Kanaaneh, 2008, p. 4)

Charles Tilly’s concepts of kinship and social and national boundaries theories (2001) are also insightful here. The kinship within Bedouin is extremely strong. Like multiple historically nomadic groups (Hadza, Masaii, Inuit, Bedouin, Tuareg, Dulani,
Vangawala, Batek and many more), tribes would historically fight each other for territory and livestock, yet now they reach out to each other for economic support, collaboration and ethnic identity in a complex region of politics, violence, and salient identities.

Both cultural and national borders influence the identities of individuals, and of populations. National boundary lines separate the population, and put pressure on the national politics and regional relationships (Tilly, 2006, pp. 131–142). This fosters what Tilly calls “site transfer” which can mean the social identity “maintains a boundary, but shifts the exact locations of persons and social sites with respect to differentiated relations on either side of the boundary, cross-boundary relations and/or representations of the boundary (Tilly, 2006, p. 144). This is evident in the shifting boundaries of Bedouin territories, and throughout contested land internationally. In the last century Bedouin families were divided by borders placed by the British mandate and the Israeli Government. The ethnic identities and individual identities shift in saliency depending on location and circumstance.

Vamik Volkan’s psychodynamic theories are helpful with understanding the complicated relationship between ethnic identity, political boundaries and assimilation. He is a Turkish Cypriot who was raised in conflict surrounding land and identity, and his concepts of ethnic identity illuminate the leadership, shared reservoirs of memories, minor differences and chosen traumas (2008) of Israeli Bedouin that are promulgated through narratives. Through Bedouin storytelling and poetry, past chosen traumas, and experiences, are shared as part of the tradition, and as an extension of kinship. Bedouin
Israelis are constantly struggling with maintaining a culturally salient ethnic identity, and being accepted into a nation that typically rejects that identity.

Elbedour, Owneuegbuzi, Abu-Rabia, Morad and Merrick found that the ethnic identity of Naqab Bedouin are ignored, and overshadowed by the religious and ethnic identities of Israelis and Palestinians. This research team explored ethnic identities throughout five high schools in Bedouin settlements (Rahat School, Arur School, Segev-Shalom School, Tel-Sheva School and Lakiya School which are all formally recognized by the Israeli Authority) in southern Israel. Out of 351 research subjects the team found the following results:

Sample members (46.9%) ranked religion as the most important factor in forming their identity. Although they were Israeli citizens, 73% of the participants stated that the term “Israeli” was not an appropriate definition of their identity, and 44.9% stated that the term “Palestinian” was. Moreover, when given a list of six ways of characterizing themselves (i.e., Arab, Israeli Arab, Israeli, Palestinian Arab, Israeli Palestinian, Palestinian), “Palestinian Arab” received the highest endorsement (33.5%), followed respectively by “Israeli Arab” (29.7%), “Arab” (18.7%), Israeli Palestinian (11.7%), and Palestinian (3.5%); only 2.9% characterized themselves as Israelis (Elbedour et al., 2013, p. 150)

Officer Abu Varia represents this 2% identifying with Israeli citizenship, politics, and identity.

The researchers conducted their survey under the assumption that these students identified first, and foremost, as Bedouin. While social and ethnic identities are not
central to the research on Ahed School, it is an important area to acknowledge within the changes in the Bedouin culture, denomadatization, and the surrounding conflicts. Wikan describes how individuals carry multiple identities. Essentially, “to have an identity means to be unique: no one else shares exactly your experience and memories; each of us is alone, in an existential sense” (Wikan, 2013, p. 7). The dissertation presents identities that are constantly being remolded through experiences with education, marginalization, assimilation, culture and alienation through the lens of Ahed School.

**Conclusion**

This dissertation was inspired by theories of conflict and education, marginalization, and ethnographies of education in conflict areas. The background research motivates questions on the role of education in conflict areas and in international development. The history of Bedouin in Israel/Palestine provide insights into the evolution of Bedouin education and cultural transformation through conflict and colonization. The history of the Naqab has shaped how Bedouin economies, communities, and current politics continue this pattern with unrecognized villages and poor education systems. I apply theories of acculturation, assimilation and marginalization to the tensions Bedouin youth are experiencing through education, cultural transformation, and aspirations for the future. Interviews, participant observation, conflict resolution and cultural workshops helped illuminate these questions on the dynamic and evolving Bedouin culture and the role of education within it.
Looking at theories of education as a source of freedom contextualize this challenge by explaining education as a civil right and method of gaining equality.

The literature provides a foundation for the negotiation case studies and the complexity of students trying to succeed in a society that calls for assimilation yet is in conflict domestically and internationally. Bedouin youth living in unrecognized villages have few options to achieve academic success and national citizenship. Some Bedouin youth in settlements are attempting to preserve their culture while progressing educationally and economically and are struggling with the process of attempting to fit into multiple identities and cultural structures.

Ahed School was created by Bedouin academics challenged with the same dilemmas of needing to reduce poverty, provide opportunity and honor the integrity and traditions of Bedouin culture. This pressure is particularly severe for Bedouin women in academia and the choices they must make regarding love, careers, and expectations from family traditions. These tensions are unique within this success story of education in Israel/Palestine and demonstrate what cultural knowledge and self-governance may be at stake. The literature review provides a foundation for these concepts and motivates the research questions, rationale and design in Chapter Three. The research methods and analysis presents how this dissertation was conceived, executed and how the data are analyzed.
CHAPTER THREE :
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND ANALYSIS

Introduction

The purpose of this research is to analyze the role of education in conflict situations, and to investigate how schools function as a means of demarginalization as well as an act of assimilation. These research goals gather insight on how schools coming out of conflict influence the field of conflict resolution and education as international development initiatives. The fieldwork and research focuses on Ahed High School for Science (Ahed School) and Bedouin education throughout Israel/Palestine. The site provides a compelling case study due to its complex community of education and culture in which the minority Bedouin population is academically flourishing in the midst of local and regional conflict.

This chapter presents the research questions, design, methodology and analysis. It also touches on the complexity of fieldwork. The research methodology and analysis reflect the goal of the dissertation which is to analyze the tensions surrounding education in the prestigious Ahed School, and apply these findings when addressing conflict in parallel situations. Learning from the academic success of this community designed school arising from poverty and marginalization, helps those in the CAR field address the complexity of education in conflict areas.
Ahed School students have unique insights that illuminate tensions in Bedouin culture and land through transforming economic and academic landscapes. The aspirations, opinions, and world perspectives of these youth provide deeper insight into the shifting lifestyle of Bedouins living in settlements, and the new high school (in operation since 2010) provides an important case study of the agency of a marginalized community based within multiple layers of conflict.

The literature review and background research surfaced recorded histories of Bedouin culture, education, and struggles for land and cultural freedom. School-based ethnographies showed the socialization in high schools, and issues of class, alienation, gender, violence and assimilation. Ethnographies of Bedouin kinship, storytelling, militarization and land occupation have shaped current thinking of Bedouin communities. Yet, they fail to address contemporary experiences of Bedouin youth navigating a transforming economy and complex culture where traditional roles of gender are both preserved, and altered, through economic and educational opportunities. This dissertation analyzes the role of education for Bedouin youth and explains the tensions between definitions of academic success and agency. These dynamics are presented in the research questions and design.

**Research Questions**

The research questions arose from my initial exposure to Ahed School and the surrounding communities, in the Naqab Desert in 2012, and were further shaped and explored during fieldwork in 2013 and 2014. The following questions were inspired by
observing this unique time in Bedouin experiences in Israel/Palestine where within one generation there has been a dramatic change in land use and rights, access to education, technology, and economic opportunities. The youth are living dramatically differently from their parents and grandparents, and they are building their lives and coming into adulthood in a time of both local and regional land conflict. The foundation of my research is rooted in three primary questions:

- How are young people negotiating the difficult and contradictory challenges between maintaining traditional Bedouin culture and integrating into Israeli society?
- How does Ahed School manage to flourish in the midst of overarching conflict?
- What does it mean, for Bedouin youth, to be integrated into Israeli society through education?

**Research Design and Data Collection**

This modified ethnographic case study of Ahed School included a range of qualitative research methods. The fieldwork included action-oriented, elicitive, workshops (i.e. culture exploration through workshops), embedded in-depth interviews (with students, teachers, advocates, and family members) participatory observation (by being a guest of the school, guest presenter, and by staying in the community), guided
group discussions, and site visits to regional universities, non-profits, and contested land sites.

I visited Ahed School and the surrounding villages throughout the last three years (2012-2014). During visits I led cultural exploratory workshops (in four English speaking classes, two tenth grade classes, one eleventh and one twelfth) which were followed by afterschool guided group discussions. I also relied on communicating with Bedouin interviewees and friends through social media (Facebook, Viber, Gmail, and Skype) and meeting with Bedouin living in the Washington D.C. greater area. Students were invited by myself, the Vice Principle, and two English teachers to participate in interviews. The school, and families, and students provided consent. Teachers, staff, and students also recommended family members, alumni and friends to participate in the study.

I collected qualitative data through performing one-on-one interviews on the Ahed School campus and through observing the school’s operations, relationships, rituals, and social dynamics. The interview sample consisted of a variety of Bedouin Israeli, Bedouin American and Jewish Israeli research participants. The range of interviewees included twelve Bedouin academics, teachers, and human rights advocates, and sixty-one high school students, and alumni. Each participant was recommended by word of mouth, or introduced by a previous research subject through email, creating a snowball effect. Each participant volunteered to engage in this modified ethnographic school case study. Current students of Ahed School were invited by instructors to participate optionally by verbal announcements and by consent forms. I additionally used

---

30 Online communication became a practical method of communication while school was out of session, and when travel restrictions for Americans to Israel/Palestine were in place during unrest (2014).
Human Subjects Review Board (HSRB) approved recruitment materials to invite participation. 31

The range of data varied from interviews with Bedouin academics from the Naqab to non-Bedouin professors involved in the land conflict and Bedouin advocacy at Ben-Gurion University to founders and teachers of Ahed School. The predominant focus of embedded interviews were with high school students at Ahed School. Interviews with their families, friends and community members were conducted as a second priority, since the youth perspective is the least documented narrative of the Bedouin perspectives (as determined in the literature review).

In addition, I interviewed Bedouin male and female university students that have decided to remain locally (at Ben Gurion University,) and others who were based internationally as sampling permitted (i.e. George Mason University, University of Amman, Jordan). During interviews I explored concepts of education and culture. I participated in negotiation projects facilitated by the US Embassy in Israel, and the Harvard Program on Negotiation alongside Ahed School students. I also interviewed students and alumni on their current experiences of education, concepts of the future, family, religion, honor, shame, communication styles and social dynamics.

Interviews were documented by note taking, and audio recording. I utilized Dragon Dictate software, EndNote, audio recording, and note taking depending on the environment. Each evening I conducted a daily investigative analysis on the day’s findings, as well as reflective practice. This process included reviewing recordings to

31 The research methods, dissertation, proposal and letters of consent were all approved by George Mason University’s Human Subject Review Board in June 2013.
interpret, analyze, and draw hypothesis, questions, and ideas from the data. The majority of interviews were semi-structured with individual students, academics and during guided group discussions. The following questions were examined with student participants:

1. What does education mean to you?
2. Please describe your experiences at Ahed School -
3. What are the teachers like?
4. What are your goals and aspirations?
5. What is it like to study in Israel/Palestine?
6. Have you studied anywhere outside of this area? Would you like to? (Or) What was it like?
7. Could you tell me a little bit about the history of this area? How long has your family lived here? What are some of the stories you heard growing up about your family?
8. Did your parents go to school? Your grandparents?
9. Please tell me a little bit about Ahed School and your experiences with it.
10. What are the other local Bedouin schools like?
11. What does it mean to be Bedouin, to you?
12. How do you identify yourself?
14. How do you identify yourself? Is this similar or different to your parents? Siblings? Grandparents?
15. How are you able to express your feelings and opinions?

16. Do you use any kinds of social media? If so, how do you like to use it? Do you share pictures? Stories? Experiences?

17. From my understanding, storytelling and poetry are important parts of Bedouin communication and culture. What do you think?

18. Are you experiencing conflict currently? If so, what kind of conflict?

Open ended interviews explored questions of Bedouin identity, culture, education, conflict, and family and regional history. Within the majority of interviews the challenges as the result of the local land conflict were discussed.

These questions, matched with participant observation, provided a multi-layered approach to collecting data. As both a guest in the local family homes, and in the school, I was permitted access as a researcher, participating academic (in workshops such as the Program on Negotiation Embassy), and as a volunteer at the school, and in the community. As Lynne Haney and Kristin Luker (2010) acknowledges, “the point of doing observational methods is to document ‘practices,’ those moments when belief and action come together” (p. 158). Being a participant observant at Ahed School allowed me insight into the influence the school has on its students and the community.

I focused on the youth perspective because they represent the new generation of Bedouin and the relationships between changing economic, cultural, environmental and educational landscapes. As Jean Piaget (1972) writes, “By considering only adults we perceive only mechanisms which are already formed, whereas by following childhood
development, we reach to the formation of those mechanisms, and formation alone is explicative” (p. 139). This research focuses on the perspectives of youth, while also including adult experiences to provide a well-rounded context for not only the evolving identities, landscape and experiences of Bedouin youth, but also for a range of voices as well. Figure 3.1 demonstrates the layout of the research design including the methods of data collection:

**Figure 3.1 Research Design**

**Data Analysis**

The modified ethnography design allowed me to look at the dynamics of Bedouin
youth at Ahed School and the tensions they face through education. In-depth and embedded interviews, and participant observation within homes, schools, community events and workshop settings allowed me to collect data and analyze them for both patterns of similarity (sameness and differences between things) and contiguity (relationships and influence of things to and one another). The extensive background research, and deep reflective practice has allowed data similarities, differences, contiguities, and direct voices of youth to arise meaningfully. The following action steps comprised the data analyses:

Action I: Experiential learning as reflective practice (Workshops, review of group discussions).

Action II: Reflective journals (reviewing interviews and field notes from participant observation, watching patterns and unique experiences emerge. Looking at the connection between research, theory, and practice).

Action III: Categorizing strategies – coding of interview data and themes arising from group discussions (Fuertes, 2008; Maxwell, 2004)

The reliability, replicability and validity of qualitative research and data are often called into question in the social sciences (Golafshani, 2003). The transfer of qualitative, open ended interviews and human stories into measurable, objective, numerical values has challenged qualitative researchers’ naturalistic approach to analyzing the operations of the world and phenomena (Ibid, 2003).

Validity of data is processed through the researcher’s perception of the legitimacy of the research and the worldview, and paradigm(s) of the researcher (Golafshani, 2003).
This is where reflective practice has also become important in examining the validity and reliability of the study, and to warn of mass generalizability of findings. Triangulation in qualitative research has responded to these concerns in both qualitative and quantitative research methods. The most validating process of exploring the data has been reflective practice, mindfulness, and processing the similarity and contiguity categorical relationships with the data.

Maxwell and Miller (2008) and Maxwell and Chmiel (Maxwell & Chmiel, 2013) responded to the perceived limitations of qualitative analysis data collection techniques of interviews and participant observation by defining, comparing, and contrasting relationships between the data, to discover patterns and incongruities. Incorporating these concepts into my data analysis allowed me to find emergent patterns and themes that arose from interviews, group discussions, participant observation and classroom conversations. From these emerging similarities and differences the data showed categorizing strategies (Ibid 2007) (which will be demonstrated below) and the contiguities strategization provided “relationships of similarities” known as categorization strategies (Fuertes, 2008; Maxwell & Chmiel, 2013). Chmiel, Maxwell, and Miller’s concepts of qualitative data analysis have shaped the coding of the data, and have helped organize the analysis to respond to the research questions in this modified ethnographic study.
Sensitivity of Ethnography

Throughout the last hundred years the unique traditions and status of Bedouin within Israel has proved intriguing to academics (A. Abu-Rabia, 2001; Ben-David, 1990; Keohane, 1994; Marx, 1967; Meir, 1997). The contemporary life of Bedouin in Israel/Palestine represent a population navigating complicated identities and cultural traditions while the political and economic landscapes encourage them to move from semi-nomadic ways to settlements and assimilation into the financial and political economies. Ahed School represents a community-based response to poverty and low-quality education systems. It aims to demarginalize students and teach them about how to thrive in Israeli, and international, societies while honoring their familial traditions. These dimensions of the school invited ethnographic and qualitative research methods.

The research methods were selected by what Nancy Scheper-Hughes describes as a moral philosophy (Krisler, 2000; Scheper-Hughes & Bourgois, 2003). She describes anthropology as a type of “witnessing” and that researchers/practitioners are accountable for what they do, say, or write. In an interview at University of California Berkeley, Scheper-Hughes shares her views that the “anthropologist is always straddling a dichotomy between believing that reflection and understanding is in the nature of an intervention itself, and at times wanting to see a more direct impact on human life. And I’ve come to see that perhaps the witnessing itself and the writing are maybe the best we can do in terms of an intervention, and to leave the applications to others perhaps more suited to do that than ourselves” (Krisler, 2000, p. 6).
Ahed School represents a unique model of potential cultural transformation situated in multiple layers of local, regional, national and international conflict. Bettie’s (2003) work with high schools indicated the importance "hanging out” with students in the classroom, after school, in their homes and in the community. I became a regular guest in homes and communities and inquired about students’ perspectives on education, national politics, family, education, occupational possibilities, family history and cultural traditions.

The majority of the data collection was obtained through ethnographic methods including in-depth interviews, oral histories, and participant observation. Ethnography is particularly useful in a school setting, and is helpful in closing the gap between “educational research and educational practice, theory and practice” as well as how people make meaning within a group or population of people (Woods, 1986, p. 4). Ethnographic research methods fit this research inquiry because they provided tools to collect data on how Bedouin youth perceive, and make meaning out of their educational system, life opportunities, and the culture(s) wherein they were reared.

Ethnography and qualitative research methods are intended to be a way for scholars to use the discourse “to create and imagine a free democratic society” (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005, p. x). Denzin and Lincoln share the ethnographer’s “Experience, discourse, and self-understandings collide with larger cultural assumptions concerning race, ethnicity, nationality, gender, class, and age” (2005, p. xvi). And, the traditional perception of ethnography, living with a community for at least one year, consecutively does not fairly represent the methods, or intentions of this research. This is why, my
committee’s agreement, I have adopted the imperfect terminology “modified ethnography” to describe my research. A one-word research method has failed to encapsulate this academic research and the complexity of ethnographic research, matched with reflective practice, best speaks to this work.

**Complexity of Fieldwork and Ethical Discussion**

Throughout the fieldwork, I learned the grace required for traveling across contested cultural and political borders. As an American, I received certain freedom of movement congruent with the robust religious tourism in Israel. Being a volunteer, researcher, and educator in the local schools gave me access to academic research and deeper reflective practice. While mobility is limited for Bedouin women, it was received as socially acceptable for a lone female traveling in a traditional society because I am a foreign academic.

Emily McKee’s (2011, 2011a) research in the Naqab also found this flexibility as a young American woman. She learned to adapt between Jewish and Bedouin communities in her fieldwork. McKee found access and mobility between communities that her research participants did not have. She “learned when and how to shift languages and manners of comportment and to rearrange clothing. Learning these adjustments required attention to the subtle gestures of others, like adjusting a headscarf, as well as more obvious features in the landscape, like fences” (McKee, 2011, p. 39). McKee also found herself serving as a conduit of information and social interpreter when passing
between Jewish and Bedouin towns. I experienced this with my Jewish friends in Tel Aviv. They admitted they did not know much about the Bedouin, other than their experience in the military, and by seeing Bedouin as tourist guides with camels in southern Israel. I became a cultural translator between my Jewish and Bedouin hosts.

In the Bedouin communities I experienced an intellectual freedom with support, yet physical movement as a woman was still protected. Women (whether students or teachers) are not expected to head into the city, or even walk to their schools alone. I was accompanied each day to Ahed School by a friend of the community, or by a parent of an Ahed School student who gave me a ride. Some days I would take the school bus back to the village I was staying in and was escorted by a gaggle of five-year-old girls to the home I was staying in as they were worried I would get lost on my way. However, once leaving the Bedouin domain, and back to the train station controlled by the IDF, I was interrogated on why I was working with the Bedouin community.

Once I explained I was working in Bedouin schools I was free to go, but was previously under the suspicion of being a Palestinian sympathizer. As a non-religious American researcher, I was able to cross more boundaries without the same kind of interrogation and judgment that my friends and research participants received as citizens of Israel. However, I was still questioned by IDF guards and transportation security, and only released when I explained that I was working in schools in the Naqab. Education is an acceptable reason for an American to be in Bedouin communities, and I learned how to navigate the borders.
For my Bedouin colleagues and host families, I was under their protection, and watch while in their territory. They understood the research, and were supportive, and allowed me to also give them feedback on their research (from both Bedouin colleagues at the doctorate level in the United States, and to young Bedouin women studying English in Israel).

One evening, while finishing a typical Bedouin barbeque with lamb sausages, chicken kebabs, grape leaves, chicken liver, hummus, dates, rice, cucumbers, endless handmade pita and Coca Cola and Fanta, and Bedouin black tea, a neighbor/cousin arrived to the patio carrying stacks of papers. “Here, fill this out for Hassan” (T. Tolley, per communication, September 2013) she said while passing out stacks of papers and pens. Hassan is working on his Master’s in engineering in Italy, and was doing research on Bedouin buildings. His sister was helping him conduct surveys in his home village. No one acted surprised, and took the forms (written in Italian and Arabic) and all those who were literate (majority of the twelve people present, all aged 50 and under, both men and women) took the form.

I asked my friend and host, Hazna, if this was common, research being conducted like this. “Oh yes, we all have brothers studying in Jordan, Europe or U.S.A., and sisters studying close here in Beer Sheva or in Jordan” (T. Tolley, per communication, September 2013). The community is used to research being done, and they accepted and supported my curiosity of Bedouin education. With their natural hospitality, and recent\textsuperscript{32}.

\textsuperscript{32} In the last fifteen years the majority of families in middle class villages like Lakiya have members attending university. Often, there are more scholarships available, and higher admission rates internationally as it is very difficult get accepted by Israeli universities (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2013).
familiarity with university research requirements for education, it was acceptable for me to be interested in education in conflict areas. Community members familiar with the thesis and dissertation process were eager to help me with my research, I experienced more support from Bedouin community members, who may not have attended university, but value the importance of the process, I have from some of my American family members and community members who are unfamiliar with the research process. Overall, the community was very accepting and supportive of my research and went out of their way to support me.

There were some challenges conducting field work as an American in contested Israeli/Palestinian and Jewish/Muslim communities. The economic and political ties the United States has with Israel makes the role of being an American researching within Arab Israeli communities challenging, and some question the agendas of such research, and any ways the representation of such politicized governments can influence the research. To counteract this impression, I worked closely with my field contacts to be transparent about my research, while being careful not to become politically entrenched in the agendas of the people in my research site and community.

Ahed School is a new center of education, and has not hosted outside researchers before. However, they welcomed me to study and teach there because of my relationships with founding members of the school. I was also invited to facilitate group discussions because faculty want their students to be exposed to international people, and new ways of learning. The most resistance I met during my field work was with young members of

---

33 The value placed on education in the Bedouin community is extensively discussed in the following chapter on gender and education.
the IDF patrolling the train stations in the Naqab. They wondered why an American was
being dropped off at a desert train station by Bedouin taxi drivers, and a family that
embraced me. They were concerned that terrorism runs rampant in the Bedouin
community, and that I was a supporter. Explanations of working in education eased their
minds, as the young Israeli men and women working borders and transportation ports are
ordered to be suspicious.

The emotional toll of working in conflict areas are high. During the summer of
2014, while writing from the United States my research site was experiencing lockdowns
and bombings during the holy time of Ramadan, and I would receive phone calls of lost
loved ones in Gaza. My hosts in Tel Aviv were, meanwhile, being called Palestinian baby
killers for being Jewish. It can be challenging to stay objective as a researcher while
entrenched in both a local land conflict between the State of Israel and Bedouin
unrecognized villages, and between the IDF and Hamas when bombs are flying above. I
am grateful for the ability to cross worlds and share the stories of Bedouin youth with my
Israeli and academic colleagues, and I am grateful to my Israeli friends for giving me
broader perspectives.

**Conclusion**

Ultimately, this research is about listening, reflecting, sharing information, and
offering lessons of education arising out of conflict can contribute to the field of conflict
analysis and resolution. The following chapters lead into Bedouin student’s experiences
of education as a form of demarginalization as well as elements of alienation and
assimilation into the Israeli economy. This research also tells us the complexity of education in conflict zones and the delicate relationships between a transforming culture and economic and educational opportunities.
CHAPTER FOUR: NAVIGATING GENDER, EDUCATION, CULTURE AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY

Introduction

Education, especially of girls and young women, is at the forefront of Western rhetoric on demilitarization and economic opportunity. New York Times reporter Nicholas Kristof writes about the travesty of Boko Haram militants attacking a girl’s school in Nigeria in the name of fighting Western education and influence (2014). The Taliban attacked, and shot in the head, Malala Yousafzai when she was 15-years-old because of her advocacy of education for females in Pakistan. Kristof asks, “Why are fanatics so terrified of girls’ education?” (2014, para. 4).

Kristof and other internationally acclaimed journalists, believe that “there’s no force more powerful to transform a society. The greatest threat to extremism isn’t drones firing missiles, but girls reading books” (Kristof, 2014, para. 4). He advocates for supporting education internationally rather than funding the military toolbox. While Kristof’s advocacy for the education and rights of girls and women is remarkable, it is not a simple case in Israel/Palestine, or within the Bedouin community. There are thousands of highly educated Jewish females who are socialized into the military and believe that Palestinians, as well as Bedouin Israeli citizens, are a threat to their well-being. There are highly educated politically controversial and popular American women who are also
against foreign aid, and support for the education of marginalized women (Coulter, 2005). However, Kristof speaks to the marginalization of Bedouin, especially females, when he explains that education is essential to societal development because it transforms demography, and shows that the more educated young populations are in a society, the better economic opportunities, and the less nationalistic and violent that population becomes. For Bedouin girls in the Naqab, education is being encouraged along with the economic necessity of contributing to the livelihood and income of the family.

This chapter looks at patterns of education in conflict areas and how shifts in culture and access to education is transforming education for Bedouin youth. The amount of girls dropping out of school in unrecognized villages is still approximately seventy percent and true equality in education and economy is tied to the recognition of communities in the unrecognized villages (R. Abu Rabia, 2011, p. 119). This chapter analyzes economic, cultural, and political elements that are changing opportunities for young Bedouin. It looks at how young Bedouin are negotiating the contradictory challenges between maintaining traditional concepts of marriage, honor and culture while integrating into the economic and educational structures of Israeli society.

**Navigating Culture, Gender, Education and Economic Opportunity**

The development of Bedouin education in the Naqab coincides with increased economic and academic opportunities of girls and women within Bedouin communities. More Bedouin Israeli women hold jobs and degrees than ever before and it is influencing the gender roles within the tribes (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2008). The transformation of land
use and forced sedentarization lessens nomadism and reassembles the economic needs and roles of women.

While there are few claims stating Bedouin education is a negative aspect of contemporary times, there is contradictory research in regards to education and “empowerment”\textsuperscript{34} within the Bedouin community. In the intrinsic sense, this concept of empowerment relates to the desire and commitment for self (McClelland, 1975) and commitment to self-efficacy (Bandura, 1977) and self-actualization (Maslow, 1970). For professional Bedouin women, the attainment of self-efficacy comes with economic and educational freedoms which in turn influences identity formation.

The first female Bedouin from the Naqab to receive a PhD, Sarab Aburabia-Queder\textsuperscript{35}, a professor at Ben Gurion University in the Blaustein Institute for Desert Studies, discusses how education influences identity formation. In addition, she explains the exclusion from society Bedouin women experienced while exploring higher education. Her personal experience and research found that women who left the Naqab to go to boarding school in northern and central Israel (and others that attended Jewish Universities) experienced dual identities, resentment and ostracization from some of their community members upon returning home (Aburabia-Queder, 2011). They felt like they were immigrants returning into their own societies, and although their families were supportive of their educational endeavors, some community members did not understand their need to leave their hometowns to study, or their desire for higher education.

\textsuperscript{34} The term “empowerment”, especially when referring to women, is contested. In this dissertation, “empowerment” is intended as “a process of helping people to assert control over the factors which affect their lives” (Gibson, 1991).

\textsuperscript{35} Also publishes as Abu-Rabia.
Aburabia-Queder challenged the research showing higher education as empowering to women and the theories of resistance, and pedagogy, for opposition (Aburabia-Queder, 2011; Horkheimer and Adorno, 1969; Komulainen, 2000). Other Bedouin women have felt this same dual consciousness and identity within Israel, and have felt more supported, yet separated from their families and culture, when working and achieving graduate degrees internationally in North America, Australia and New Zealand, and throughout Europe (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2013). The “brain drain” from the Bedouin community is prevalent, especially when intermarriage (Bedouin Israelis marrying Palestinians, Jordanians, etc.) prevents Bedouin to live together within the borders of Israel. What do the threats of dual identity in education mean for the next generation of Bedouin youth entering higher education?

Ahed School prides itself on being a new method for merging into the State of Israel through education, economic opportunity through different points of access than Palestinians. Ahed School also positions itself as a moral and just form of education because it is created by community members, and attempts to integrate Bedouin into the larger society through education, and technological skill, rather than through acquiescence. One challenge for some Bedouin is the preservation of their culture while integrating into Israeli society. This research explores this dissonance for young Bedouin through the avenue of Ahed School.

Academic institutions like Ahed School prepare students for higher education and for entering the Israeli job market with technological skills. This new generation of young

---

36 “Brain drain” meaning the loss of educated citizens of developing, or marginalized communities, to more industrialized, higher paying economies (Schiff & Özden, 2005).
people are more prepared for entering integrated higher education programs than their parents. Yet students still grapple with questions of who they are allowed to marry, how to respect the traditions of the family, as well as their citizenship, identity and rights within the Naqab which shares borders, and tribal lineage, with both Gaza and the West Bank. Students must determine whether to pursue higher education within Israel, other Arabic countries, or in Europe or North America, depending on test scores, family, and financial support such as scholarships. They also are influenced by the local conflict, and feelings of relative deprivation (Gurr, 2011), prejudice, marginalization (Freire, 1985), and the politics surrounding education.

Along with other female education analysts, Aburabia-Queder questions how education influences marginalized populations. Melanie Janzen (2008), an education and post-development expert on Africa, evokes Freire’s (1985) discussion on marginalization in her ethnographic work. Janzen’s critique of Freire’s lack of gender consideration in his post-development education theory (Janzen, 2008, p. 13) represents some of the challenges female Bedouin experience through the education system. While marginalized populations are represented in Freire’s work, gender is rarely discussed, and gender plays a significant role in the historical gap in education for Bedouin families.

While Freire’s work is fundamental in understanding oppression and marginalization in education, contemporary authors such as Julie Bettie (2003), bell hooks 1994), Janzen (2008), and Shalhoub-Kevorkian (2009) understand the international gender dynamics prevalent in marginalized communities. Kenyan scholar Maria Nzomo (1995) believes that “women’s knowing” should be valued, and
appreciated, in their own right. Much of Bedouin women’s knowledge is passed down through stories, poetry, and music. How women’s knowledge is valued and transferred to the next generation is important during cultural shifts within the Bedouin community, and in an era where more Bedouin women are attending higher education than men in the areas surrounding this study (Gradstein, 2013; Pessaté-Schubert, 2003). For some Bedouin youth, access to Israeli education programs is possible, and even increasing, but it begs the question: What is the objective of the State of Israel in regards to Bedouin Education, especially for young women?

**The Politics and Economics of Bedouin Education**

Economic support for the education of Bedouin youth, and females in particular, is increasing in Israel/Palestine. In January 2012, the Knesset implemented Government Resolution 4193 (GR 4193), an initiative to provide basic education skills to Arab women over 18 years of age who have not matriculated or graduated from high school. This resolution is an initiative inspired by recommendations from the Trahtenberg Committee, and the Ministry of Education (MOE) expected approximately 300 women would receive vocational skills and ongoing academic support in 2012. This project received NIS 36 million\(^\text{37}\) in funding for 2012-2016. In addition, GR 4193 includes funding for adult education programs within Bedouin communities, especially for women, for education from pre-school through high school graduation, with NIS 11 million in funding (Paisner, 2012).

\(^{37}\) Converts to approximately 10 Million US dollars.
These physical developments within Bedouin villages are partially in response to legal action. In 1998 a case was brought before the Supreme Court regarding the rights to education in unrecognized villages. Thirteen public schools were found to be disconnected from the state electricity grid and were without heat, light, or air conditioning. The Supreme Court ruled in favor of Adalah’s petition for schools in the Naqab, and the Court found the inability of the government’s provision of safe and comfortable schools an “inconceivable situation” and a “badge of shame for the State” (R. Abu Rabia, 2010). The struggles to create and maintain safe and comfortable schools continues in both recognized and unrecognized villages.

Within the recognized villages of the Naqab, there are shells of new elementary and middle schools provided through these GRs, yet the teachers, infrastructure and accessibility of students and families are not yet available. During 2013 visits I observed three partially constructed schools in the village of Lakiya alone. There were reports of teachers being brought in from the “north” and students from unrecognized villages being bused in, however, between 2012-2013 very little progress was made in the construction and access of these schools. The concrete foundations were there, and often the rebar foundation and framing in progress, but no children, or classrooms were evident or close to transpiring.

Israel’s Ministry of Education has set its goals for increased Bedouin education, especially for girls (Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013). Approximately half of Ahed students are now female. In the 2013-2014 enrolled class 54 girls were accepted and 48 boys (Ahed School for Science, 2013). According to the Myers-JDC- Brookdale
Institute in Israel (the social policy center for applied research), the average years of education Bedouin girls receive jumped from three years in 1990 to six and a half years in 2007. For Bedouin boys, the average years of education Bedouin boys received in 1990 was six and a half years and in 2007 it was ten years. For Jewish girls, the years of education were double in 2007 (average of thirteen years) and nearly quadruple in 1990 (eleven years on average) (Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, 2012). While there are limited data on university enrollment of Bedouin students in Israel/Palestine, the majority of Bedouin reside in the Naqab/Negev and attend Ben Gurion University of the Negev. The enrollment of Bedouin males in the class of 1999-2000 was 140 males and 104 females which dramatically increased to 174 males and 298 females entering the 2010-2011 class (Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, 2012).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Average Years of Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bedouin</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab-Israeli</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Men</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bedouin</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab-Israeli</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewish</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, 2012, sec. Education).
The increase in Bedouin girls attending schools is attributed to locations of schools being closer to villages. This is one of the state’s goals, and an initiative by school networks like Amal (Amal Network, 2014; Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 2013). There is also a teacher recruitment program in the Naqab, and non-profits throughout Israel are supporting the education of girls. Sheiks have been recruited to support education advocacy, buses have been acquired, and now that there is an increase in sedentaryization, more access is available for those in designed communities. Very few schools are accessible in unrecognized villages and if a community builds one it is not recognized as a legitimate structure since they are on contested land (T. Tolley, per communication, September 30, 2013). Teachers are paid by the Ministry of Education. At Ahed School, since it is part of the Amal Network, teachers are paid by the State. Building materials were subsidized by the community. Faculty members, families and volunteers built the school. Grants and non-profits have supported the science and computer labs, and they are often looking for programs to collaborate with to improve the quality of education and access to resources for students.

**NGO Responses to Gender and Education**

Multiple non-profit and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) exist within Bedouin communities. One NGO that is committed to supporting the education of Bedouin youth, particularly females, is Alnuhud: The Association for the Promotion of Bedouin Women’s Education in the Negev (Naqab). Alnuhud is dedicated to supporting
and empowering Bedouin women by helping them attain higher education. They believe that higher education is an “instrument to achieve social change on a personal, communal and national level” (IATF, 2012). They help provide university scholarships to Bedouin women, and every year they host a pre-academic program for Bedouin high school students to prepare for college. They help Bedouin female high school students prepare for the psychometric and matriculation exams, and host trainings at Ben Gurion University. They also encourage experiential learning and volunteerism for Bedouin youth within their own community, and multiple Ahed School students are involved in such projects.

Jamal Alkirnawi is the founder and chairman of A New Dawn a non-profit located in the Naqab. Their mission is to promote equality, coexistence, education and peace among all people living in the Naqab, and stated that as Israel enters its 66th year of existence (or, as some Bedouin say, “occupation”) it is essential “to invest in and focus on Bedouin society and education” (Jaffe, Maayan, 2014, para. 23). A New Dawn provides internship programs, Arabic and Jewish language lessons, and promotes international study exchanges with Germany and France, as well as placing English speaking volunteers in Bedouin high schools. Ahed School has hosted such volunteers in the past. The organization and schools feel like it is beneficial to students to have exposure to international volunteers and native English speakers. They work with high risk adolescents in urban areas including the Bedouin city Rahat (where crime and population density are high). 38 Alkirnawi believes strongly in peacebuilding and

38 For more information on A New Dawn: http://www.anewdawninthenegev.org/
coexistence: “I feel very connected to Israel. I feel responsible for making it a better place… We need to invest in stronger connections between Jewish Israelis and Bedouin people, to bring these peoples together. We live in this area, in Israel, together. And we should make it better together” (Jaffe, Maayan, 2014, para. 24).

While many of these NGOs work in the Naqab with positive intentions, they often compete for funding and are backed by Israeli political figures (Swirski & Hasson, 2006), or “their funding sources are determined by members of the Israeli majority, [which] has tended to cripple their ability to develop indigenous models of service provision and support in the urban context, or to begin confronting issues of decolonization” (Yiftachel, 2008, p. 14). The relevance and inability to truly change structural issues when none of the political parties are ready for foundational change is a challenge many of these organizations face. Marginalized/indigenous populations are being spoken for, rather than able to have their voices heard, or non-violent actions recognized. One way that Bedouin women have found the greatest challenges and sources for better opportunities are through access to education, and the economy.

**Gender, Conflict and Economy**

As the Bedouin economy, and means of income have changed so has the increase in job opportunities, and the necessity for Bedouin women (and men) to obtain degrees to qualify for higher paying jobs. Few Bedouin can survive off traditional economic means in this new era of Israeli hi-tech (information technology), and restricted mobility
(formerly nomadic populations becoming sedentarized). Many Bedouin continue to maintain small farms, goats, and an occasional camel to subsidize the family, however these traditional means of livelihood are no longer viable. “Herd sizes and grazing areas are very tightly controlled and a special police unit patrols and confiscates flocks found in violation of regulations. Thus, very few Bedouin can subsist entirely on the traditional sources of livelihood and must seek paid employment in the larger Israeli economy” (Abu-Sa’ad, 2003, p. 106).

Bedouin who refused to urbanize were able to subsist through traditional methods of food production, and women continued to weave, tend animals and farm. But as sedentarization rose, the Bedouin economy and the role of women transformed. The change in the woman’s role in the agricultural and pastoral work of the tribe encourages new ways of thinking about livelihood, gender, technology and representation. More Bedouin women are now enrolled in school, in the work force, and involved politically in regional councils, NGOs and in academia. Yet economic challenges continue to haunt Bedouin communities and economic opportunities for Bedouin are limited.

Abu-Saad and Lithwick’s development study (2000) found that throughout all of the Naqab, only a few Bedouin private businesses are held, and that only approximately 400 Bedouin (predominantly males) work in manufacturing skills, out of over 15,000 jobs in the region. Since the turn of the century, Bedouin workers annually make 30-40% less than the average employee in Beer Sheva (Central Bureau of Statistics). The average female employee in Beer Sheva works nine of twelve months of the year outside of the
home, and even for employed Bedouin women, they only have work less than seven of
twelve months of the year on average (Abu-Saad & Lithwick, 2000, p. 16).

At the turn of the 21st century there were no Bedouin were known to be working
in the high tech industry. Now, programs like those at Ben Gurion University are
preparing Israeli citizens, including Bedouin, to pursue hi tech and engineering
employs. New training programs in technology, and science and technology schools
like Ahed School are changing the economic track (Abu-Saad & Lithwick, 2000, p. 12).

Change likely will be evident with an increasing number of Bedouin women
entering the workforce. In the last thirty years there has been a huge increase in graduate
degrees achieved by Bedouin ((nearly double (Pessate-Schubert, 2003)). Now that more
females are attending school, and new economic needs are presented for families, women
are increasingly entering the workforce (Gradsetein, 2013; IATF, 2012). The increase in
education is gradually happening, but not quickly enough to support the need for more
jobs and agency (i.e. women actively running businesses, and involved with politics)
within the nation. In 1997 no Bedouin women had completed a master’s degree and only
12 Bedouin men had. In 2006, a total number of 162 Bedouin males and 112 Bedouin
women gained bachelor degrees (Lerner, 2013). In 2013, at Ben Gurion University
alone, there are more Bedouin women enrolled then males. Both men and women had to
fight for scholarship and education opportunities for Bedouin women. Ben Gurion
University Professor and Bedouin history scholar, Aref Abu-Rabia’, explained his fight
for female education: “It took me ten years to convince the school to support genders
equally. Because if you don’t educate the boys, who will marry the girls?” (Lerner, 2013,
As Bedouin women have increased education, jobs, and agency, their voices and ability to make societal change increase. This is highlighted in the rising voices of the Bedouin community in Chapter Five. Profiles such as Hala, the Weaver, demonstrate how jobs and education have provided women with opportunity and platforms for advocacy. These voices are important to understanding questions of conflict, ethnic identity, and the role of education.

Conflict theory and critical anthropology recognize the absolute need to have women’s voices not only represented, but as centrifugal agents of change (Nordstrom, 2004) (Scheper-Hughes & Bourgois, 2003) and as means of transforming cultures of violence (Curle, 1999). As we learn from the CAR and peacebuilding fields, “The single best predictor of a state’s level of peacefulness is not wealth, democracy, or identity; it is how well its women are treated” (Hudson, 2012, p. 205). International development agencies are ripe with “women’s empowerment” programs. These programs are positive in helping support the political and social activity of women and girls, but fundamental structural change does not happen unless all genders and representatives of the group are involved in the evolution, and this varies within different cultures, and political communities.

Education for Bedouin women can be controversial within traditional Bedouin homes. Some reasons include fear of the safety of girls getting to/from school, poverty, reluctance to assimilate into Bedouin society, and fear of the unknown results of what educating women will do to the family structure. For other families and tribes, education of women is essential, as an increase in the number of women entering the workforce, to
economically help support the family and community. Janzen (2008) deems education as an “activity that takes into account and respects what women already know, values local knowings, and allows for spaces where these knowings can be extended and questioned in a non-hierarchical and non-coercive dialogue” (p. 13). This definition of education is transformed when looking at education as an entrance to economy.

The IA Taskforce mapped out their education recommendations to boost the Bedouin economy and it includes a University Preparatory (Mechina) Program, a Women’s School, an all Bedouin Technical College, and a Bedouin Teacher’s College. They function towards educating and integrating Bedouin in Lakiya into the economy (Abu-Saad & Lithwick, 2000, p. 71). Within many of the families in the village of Lakiya, women of childbearing years are working. Often, jobs are in child care, harvesting and selling of olives and dates, teaching, working as pharmacists or hair stylists, or working at the local community center mentoring Bedouin youth. Women that are young, single and college educated work, as well as older women, in polygamous relationships maintaining businesses without histories of formal education. The view of education for women and the need for all members in the society to gain an income, evolve simultaneously, especially as the traditional Bedouin economy and lifestyles of nomadic people have changed.

Although more women are in the workplace, and in school, Bedouin women continue to experience segregation from men in all social structures. They feel forced to work in childcare or education and if they are unmarried, educated and older, they are still encouraged to enter a polygamous relationship (Dinero, 2010). Other Bedouin
women are delighted to have new economic opportunities and to be engaged in society outside of the village. One effort to preserve traditional Bedouin customs and increase economic independence for women is the revival of Bedouin weaving through the non-profit sector.

One of the administrators at Ahed School, Hala, is also a member of the Lakiya Weaving Project, which has received attention from international politicians, and women leaders like Jill McCain (T. Tolley, per communication, June 4, 2012). The Bedouin weaving is supported and encouraged by Sidreh, a non-profit committed to empowering Bedouin women through developing socio-economic conditions and encouraging education, leadership, and rights of women by providing a platform for women’s voices to be heard (Sidreh, 2014).

The Lakiya Weaving Project has been operating since 1991 and provides dozens of jobs for local women. They use the traditional weaving practices with wool from Awasi sheep, and encourage girls in the community to also learn weaving. Hala says that, “Like almost everything in the world, the Bedouin women are changing… While things around us change, so do we. The role of a Bedouin woman was once bigger – when we used to live in tents the woman had a full partnership in the economy of the house with her husband. Today because of modernization, the Bedouin women lost that role” (Mustefa, 2013, para. 23).

Women from Lakiya also shared how someone committed arson against them, burning down the center and stealing their savings. The community came together to help rebuild the center, which is near the entrance of the village. Gradually men have warmed
to the idea of women having independence and their own income. Hala shared that, “Before, the men in our community didn’t like the idea of women working and succeeding in it. Now, when the men see how far we’ve reached, they are proud of us and when they have visitors, they bring them to Lakiya to show them our work. This is something we didn’t have before” (Mustefa, 2013, para. 25).

Hala also shares how the Lakiya Weaving Center preserves Bedouin culture: “We don’t want our tradition to fade away. With all of the modernizations of our culture and society, we are slowly losing more and more traditions. Weaving for us is our identity” (Mustefa, 2013, para. 6). Hala and other board members and contributors to the weaving project show how higher education helps them preserve their cultural traditions and identities. While these jobs are empowering to Bedouin women, and highlight traditional Bedouin textiles and soap making techniques, the IA Taskforce believes that new development strategies are necessary, and that more trained labor beyond agriculture and textiles will help advance the community throughout the generations (Abu-Saad & Lithwick, 2000, p. 48).

While traditions such as weaving, natural medicine, and bread baking are being preserved within villages like Lakiya, other norms, such as wearing head scarves, are less preserved. “I want my daughter to choose if she is happy covering her head or not. It is between her and God” shared one father (T. Tolley, per communication June 2, 2013). One very active mother involved in Bedouin women’s rights operates a hair salon, and believes that being the second wife in a polygamous family gives her independence, and economic freedom: “More and more women come to my salon. My children love God,
and being Bedouin. But ways of life change… Like seasons…Like fashion” (T. Tolley, Per Communication September 30, 2013).

While fashion is being explored, so are new impressions of education on the Bedouin woman’s lifestyle and identity. Sarab Abu-Rabia Qeder (2007) researches the role of education on Bedouin identity, marriage and love. She describes the exposure of Bedouin women to forbidden men, often from other tribes, through new freedoms in education and economy. She shares three dominant types of marital situations as “tragic heroines”, “matchless women” and “women ahead of their times” (p. 27). She describes how, in the Bedouin community, marrying for love is considered is not encouraged, and sometimes forbidden, because that choice does not take into account the families, and promotes individual freedom rather than tribal marriages.

Now that there is a new generation of educated, working, Bedouin women, there is a new taboo of how women meet men in contemporary times. Abu-Rabia-Qeder brings voices of educated women and love from the “margins” and again presents the dual identities of Bedouin women living and working in urban areas, and returning to their villages. She found this to be different from other Arab and Palestinian Israelis who have greater physical and sexual freedom and can live away from their homes and “fulfill their emotional needs or sexual desires” (p. 299). Bedouin women are required to return to their villages, even when their perceptions of love, economy and dual identities have been altered through their experiences, education and access to new people and economies.
Abu-Rabia-Queder shares how the “exposure to modernity is the transformation of the self as a consequence of the dialect between the global and the local. The Bedouin feminine self that has experienced liberal values of modern Israeli society through exposure to higher education is a self that is torn between personal autonomy, freedom and individuality, on the one hand, and the cultural expected feminine self, which is communal, embodied in the collective and the tribal, on the other hand” (Ibid, p.299). These identities are challenged when women return to their unrecognized village or settlement, and when these women were the first from their community to enter higher education. Their fathers were often were the advocates for them to attend higher education, and each of the women presented in the study felt that they had to forsake their experiences of love to feel independent. This ethnography presents a common theme for women internationally, and echoes the question “Can Women Have it All?” (Slaughter, 2012).

Marriage and family continue to be a goal and expectation for most Bedouin women. While education, jobs, personal freedoms, land, and children are on the horizon for young Bedouin women, marriage is on their minds. This is true for multiple generations of Bedouin women. Marriage came up in conversation with students at Ahed School. It was discussed with the grandmothers in Lakiya and with young professional Bedouin with technical, nursing, and bachelor’s degrees. When Nalam was asked what she wanted to do upon graduation she dreamily replied, “I plan to get married.” When asked if she had a gentleman in sight, she shared, in whispers so her mother wouldn’t hear. “I have a boyfriend. But sadly he is in jail. It’s about land...And a fight with the
government. But he will be out soon… He has a wife, but she doesn’t matter. He loves me” (T. Tolley, per communication, May 2013). Nalam is the top student at her Bedouin College in Beer Sheva, and she has been offered a job by the local community center to mentor Bedouin. She dreams of a quintessential Naqab Bedouin wedding:

First there is a night of being decorated with henna. There is a basket full of gold jewelry which is a gift from the family of the groom. Older women in traditional Bedouin gowns and gold headdresses carry out large platters with food and gifts balanced on their heads while everyone dances. The bride has dreamed since she was a little girl about her henna dress. It is hot pink and bejeweled. Her hair is down and massively wrapped in the latest fashion. The dress has large crystals on it. She looks ecstatic. All are dancing and celebrating. A party platform is built in the backyard. They dance until the stars disappear with the sun. The following day the wedding festivities begin. First the bride and groom take pictures as the videographer records their strolls and poses.

Family arrives and there is a caravan of cars that drive and honk through the village. The bride and groom sit in the back of the fanciest car parading at the head of the line, carefully entering the vehicle so the wedding dress will fit and not be damaged. There is a bouquet upon the hood and streamers flowing along the chariot. The first few cars are BMWs and the pride of the town. People from the streets wave and join the caravan. Eventually, they pull into the home of the bride's parents. The ladies receive the bride and traditional dancing begins. The men make a receiving line and men hand money wrapped in white paper to the groom's father. There is lots of kissing cheeks, hugs, and jovial cheers. Some wear western clothing, others traditional hair wraps. (Both male and female) and long robes, dresses and scarves. The men's side is set up like a traditional Bedouin tent with hand woven carpets and pillows and tea.

The groups integrate and the dancing continues for hours, and is one of the few times men and women are together. The groom and father of the groom are placed on the shoulders of the strongest men for a champion dance. Later, two men lift
the bride in a chair and she waves looking slightly frightened and delighted. Three girls under the age of ten wear white pretend wedding dresses. The bride's jewelry keeps getting caught on people's dresses as she hugs and kisses them. A few gasps from falling head scarves occur. At one point a yelling fight disrupts the music as a woman pulls out a gun and shoots to the sky in celebration. Some say the gun is fake and she is shooting blanks, but it looks like a heavy revolver awakening the village to the wedding party. People are delighted to be there. Fake, hip, leather jackets top cheap tight dresses, fine gold jewelry, head scarves and young unmarked women in high heels only showing their hands and faces. Babies are thrown in the air. Men hold hands and dance. It is a party not to be missed.

(T. Tolley, per observation, June 2013).

Weddings, regardless of education level and financial security, still epitomize the most joyful time in a Bedouin (and many international) woman’s life. Polygamy is perceived as a better option to some young women (or the decision makers in their families), than not getting married. Israeli Bedouin communities are experiencing increased polygamy, as well as economic independence for women.

This question of the role of Muslim women has been used as a justification of war (i.e. The United States “liberating” and bringing democracy to women in Iraq and Afghanistan (Costs of War, 2013)), and as a way to dehumanize, and further marginalize, Islamic communities. The gender relationships in Bedouin communities, and Arab populations overall, are based in a different set of traditions and moral values than many of the Western, Judeo Christian perspectives. This clash occurs all over the world, especially around issues of honor killings. Such events happen in the United States, Scandinavia, and the Middle East. Bedouin expert Ginat says that “The killing of a
woman because she has brought shame on the family is an established Arab norm” (Joseph Ginat, 1997, p. ix) which is also practiced within Bedouin communities.\(^{39}\)

While conducting my field research, I heard rumors of such honor/shame killings within neighboring Bedouin villages. There was also a rape of a young Bedouin girl in the town of Radat when she was on her way home from school and attacked by five men from an outside village (May 28, 2013). The town was in upheaval, and there were brawls and stoning of vehicles.\(^{40}\) In the spring of 2012 a story was shared about a very bright and communicative teenage boy who was killed by his family out of jealousy and shame. His cousins were supposedly jealous of his academic success and they strangled him and burned the body. In the same family a mother killed her daughter out of resentment, and put her two-year old son in a washing machine (T. Tolley, per communication, May 2013). These horrifying stories of violence reflect incidents from all over the world. They also feed the fear of parents allowing their daughters to go to school. Violence is not only a concern for Bedouin families, but for the State of Israel.

**Violence**

The Knesset is concerned about violence in the Naqab in terms of domestic and structural abuse as well as the breeding of terrorism. The Knesset Committee on the Status of Women, and the Interior and Environmental Protection Committee, held a

---

\(^{39}\) This research is not specifically focused on the gender dynamics within the Bedouin communities, but it notes the efforts of programs like Shatil, of the New Israel Fund which is dedicated to leading social change, and has specific programs focusing on empowering Bedouin women in various issues ranging from economics, nonviolence and education (*Shatil’s work with Bedouin women in Israel’s Negev region*, 2009).

\(^{40}\) While these events were confirmed verbally by multiple sources, no report of the crime was found in the news.
combined hearing on the protection for vulnerable Bedouin women and children in 2013. The chairwoman of the committee, Dr. Aliza Lavie is the representative of the party Yesh Atid, an academic, a television personality and holds the rank of Lieutenant in the IDF. She is also a member of Operation Protective Edge, which is committed to regaining “quiet” from terrorists in the South of Israel, which includes both the Naqab and Gaza. She is an advocate of Bedouin women (Lavie, 2014).

Dr. Lavie shared that, "It is time to address what is happening in our own backyard and put the issue at center stage. We must reach out to the most disadvantaged population in the country, which is not well represented and is not sufficiently aware of its problems and possibilities for a solution. We need to consider how you can help Bedouin women with the appropriate sensitivity" (Israel National News, 2013, para. 1). Lavie continued to describe how Bedouin need development and intervention. She believes "If we do not act soon, we cannot say next time "We did not shed this blood" (para. 1).

Another member of the council, Miri Regev) of the Interior and Environmental and Protection Committee) stated that: "The Bedouin sector requires a methodical response and treatment on many issues: infrastructure, planning and construction, education and personal security. The issue of violence in the Bedouin family and society is recognized but demands a systemic examination by all the authorities in the country" (Israel National News, 2013). The Knesset is concerned with violence within Bedouin communities, and funds some non-profits to provide support for
survivors of abuse and to increase self-esteem and academic achievement (Lewando-Hundt, 1984; Shatil, 2009).

**Challenges and Celebrations for Women**

A study funded by The Robert H. Arnow Center for Bedouin Studies & Development, at the Ben Gurion University in Beer-Sheva analyzed the variable of Bedouin student school performance, self-esteem and self-concept of Bedouin, and Jewish students, ranging from 10-16 years of age, in a college preparatory after school mathematical club called Kidumatica (a play on words in Hebrew meaning progress in mathematics). The research paper found that the only significant difference in mathematical self-concept was evident between the scores of Bedouin and Jewish girls, while there was no significant difference between Bedouin and Jewish boys. Jewish students range from families from the Beer Sheva - Naqab/Negev region to recently immigrated international students.

The researchers concluded that the difference might be attributed to the “Bedouin society” and how “traditional gender roles are prominent and women's status is considerably lower, (the Bedouin girls attending the club are dressed in the traditional clothing, including full head covering, hijab, in contrast to Bedouin boys, who are dressed in modern, western style clothing)” (Neria, Dorit, et al., 2009, p. 17). The report

---

41 This report defines self-concept as: “totality of a complex, organized, and dynamic system of learned beliefs, attitudes and opinions that each person holds to be true about his or her personal existence” (Yahaya, 2000, p. 1).
also suggests that the fact that Bedouin students are primarily instructed in Arabic, and the after school math club is held in Hebrew may contribute to the gap. In addition, they speculated that the adjustment may contribute to the lack of confidence female Bedouin students experienced. While the report aimed to be exploratory, it was produced by the major Institute trying to present more information about the Bedouin community.

Students from Ahed School also show a division in gender roles when it comes to traditional clothing. Male students wear shorts and t-shirts during summer days and females wear traditional hijabs. However, this research does not support a belief that fashion or customs represent a division in academic confidence. Confidence is related to a change in territory and location. When Ahed School students were involved in the Program on Negotiation Workshops (further elaborated in Chapter Six), it took both female and male Bedouin students more time to feel comfortable in the workshops that were predominately Jewish, than when they were sharing in their own villages or school setting. They began the workshop sitting towards the back of classrooms, and not sharing much information, but as they gained confidence and familiarity, they participated in all discussions. Interestingly, high school students I have worked with across five continents, seem always to have a few confident students, both female and male, that speak out first, and are willing to share their experiences and thoughts. This is especially challenging when there is an evident minority population. The report attempts to use the math club case study to look at social factors that contribute to the high rate of Bedouin students dropping out of school, but further research is needed. Especially because the amount of
female Bedouin students at Ben Gurion University far surpasses male Bedouin enrollment. Many of the women studying are interested in pursuing the medical field.

**Women and Health Care**

A major success story in education and Bedouin women is the experiences of the first known Bedouin female medical doctor, Rania Okby. She took advantage of the support of Ben Gurion University and chose to focus on maternal fetal medicine. Mortality rates are high within the Bedouin community, and there are a series of maternal and child health issues. High incidents of birth defects such as thalassemia major, and villages with high rates of hearing loss portray the health risks within Bedouin communities and a history of inter-tribal and familial marriage. Health conditions and infant mortality are particularly dire in the unrecognized villages where only nine clinics operate without running water or dependable electricity service for tens of thousands of people (Swirski & Hasson, 2006, p. 69). Prior to the implementation of the National Health Insurance Law in 1994, nearly one third of Arab villages and townships either had no direct access to health care (no available clinics), or were underserved (Halperin-Kaddari, 2004, p. 273). The poor conditions have inspired more Bedouin, and women, to enter the field of health and medical services.

Dr. Okby, much like Professor Sarab Abu-Queder, shared the challenges of being female Bedouins studying and working within Beer Sheva, and then returning to their

---

42 I recommend SCAR Phd Student Oded Adomi Leshem’s Documentary *Voices Of El-Sayed* on the largest deaf community in the world, just outside of Lakiya (First Hand Films (Firm) Et Al., 2009).
villages in the evenings. Okby noted: “From 8 a.m. to 4 p.m. I was in the Western world and from 4 p.m. until the next day, the traditional world. It creates a lot of conflict” (Jaffe, Maayan, 2014, para. 13). She transcended extreme personal and societal pressure to achieve her dream of becoming a physician. Okby also shared how on average, Bedouin women have six children and their population is increasing at a high rate. She is devoted to improving the health of Bedouin families and receives positive responses from her community members and patients. She shared the reception she gets from the community: “I hear a lot of women saying, ‘I want my girls to become like you.’ They are proud and happy to have me as their doctor” (Jaffe, Maayan, 2014). Dr. Okby shows how anything is possible for Bedouin women and how the health of women and children is a big concern and improvement goal for Bedouin populations.

One drastic Bedouin custom that has changed in the last twenty years is the virtual disappearance of female genital mutilation (FGM) which was a tradition in Bedouin families in the Naqab. In 2009, physicians from Beer Sheva conducted gynecological exams and questionnaires in Arabic on 132 Bedouin women. The physicians found that FGM is no longer a practice within the Bedouin community, whereas it was prevalent 15 years before the study in the mid-1990s (Halila, Belmaker, et al., 2009). When research on FGM in Bedouin communities was conducted, researchers found “as part of a gynecologic examination that was indicated for other reasons. In no cases was clitoridectomy or any damage to the labia found. All women had a small scar from a 1cm. incision somewhere on the labia or prepuce of the clitoris” (Belmaker, 2012, p. 180). The study found that although the ritual was still valued, no anatomical change was made.
Over time, FGM became a small scar symbolizing a woman’s right of passage. The study concluded that “the importance of the ritual in this population was unrelated to its severity. The ritual had apparently become over time a small symbolic scar, even though this population continued to believe in its importance” (Belmaker, 2012, p. 181).

While FGM is gradually fading out, infant mortality has increased, and accessing, and achieving higher education is challenging within communities with high birth rates internationally. The Bedouin infant mortality rate is five times the national average and is attributed to lack of access to prenatal care, and high birth rates (Even, 2011; Harlap, Prywes, Grover, & Davies, 1977).

Although there are increased economic opportunities, access to medical care, and educational funding for Bedouin women, there are also more incidents of polygamy, and a rapid increase in population, experiences of racism, and structural violence. Even though Bedouins are a large percentage of the Naqab’s population, they continue to feel like second class citizens. Women experience racism and derogatory comments from both Israeli women and men, and feel less welcome into society by both Jews and other Arab Israeli populations. The places Bedouin women feel most accepted is within their villages, the open desert, community markets, organizations, mosques and schools. There is a deep sense of longing in many of the Bedouin women included in this study. Some long for freedom of movement, others for ideas of the past, and some for what lies ahead. Some of this longing is shared in the following Bedouin poem:

My longing for a tent
After an adobe house.
My longing to see
Scattered herds of white camels.
My longing to accompany
A just-departed motor. My longing to gaze
On the plain behind the mountain.
When Bedouin nomads
Disperse to desert camps,
The absent beloved
Will not be remembered.


Conclusion

This chapter discusses multiple aspects of the complex elements of Bedouin education in the Naqab and its specific influence on gender dynamics, economy, women’s health and opportunities. This is a unique time in the education of women in the Bedouin community and the world. In some high schools, girls are now attending school as much as boys. The support of families for girls to attend school is decreasing the attendance gap between girls and boys. At Ben Gurion University there are more Bedouin women than men enrolled which aligns with patterns of education in places like the United States (Lopez & Gonzalez-Barrera, 2014; Neria, Dorit et al., 2009).

Education and conflict literature do not currently represent the challenging dynamics of the meaning of assimilation and “success” in education and its impact on individual and group cultural identities. Bedouin girls are changing traditions, economic and academic possibilities within their and their mothers’ generations. Bedouin girls and women are also on the state agenda for equality improvement and more funding for higher education is available than ever before. Bedouin youth are shaped by their exposure to harsh environmental, emotional and economic conditions.
The Bedouin women who are assimilating into higher education programs are still negotiating cultural concepts of honor, shame, love and marriage. Although culture is shifting away from truncating body parts and freedoms, Bedouin women still host scars from the past and the meaning of “empowerment” is not yet clear. The women that express the most positive experiences are working with non-governmental programs providing women with economic independence and educational opportunities. These experiences are shaping how young Bedouin females want to mold their futures.

The upcoming chapter addresses these complexities in gender, education, culture and economy through the case study of Ahed School. Interviews taking place between May 2012 and January 2015 are shared through the voices of the profiles that create Ahed School. Students, founders, teachers and family members discuss changes in culture, aspirations for education and the surrounding land conflict through the lens of Ahed School.
CHAPTER FIVE:
AHED SCHOOL - A DREAM IN THE MAKING

Introduction

This chapter demonstrates the tensions arising from the role of education within this asymmetrical conflict. This chapter represents the layout of Ahed School, the trends of Bedouin schools in the region, and represents many stories of the people that comprise Ahed School. The group discussions, interviews and participant observation research of this analysis are brought together through the people that make Ahed School both unique and an example for successful education programs in conflict areas. The stories representing this special institution include a military tracker, the founder and his daughters, a weaver, patient, heartbroken poet, English teacher, the graduates and political youth. These profiles of the people comprising Ahed School represent the tensions and successes of Bedouin education in the Naqab. They are presented through rising voices representing the struggles between marginalization versus empowerment, alienation versus acceptance, and violent versus safe spaces for education. Ahed School represents a crossroads in these tensions and aims to provide students with a safe, empowering, highly academic institution of learning.

“Ahed is a dream in the making” stated the English teacher, Mickey. Ahed School is strong in its science and language courses. They have received national attention and accolades in physics and debate. They also have strong advocates in their founding
members and by international funders. This is a unique school focused on educating and enhancing opportunities for a marginalized population. The profiles of people comprising Ahed School illuminate the role of education in a transforming community and culture within a protracted land conflict. As the students are ending their teenage years, they are presented with new social dimensions through integrated universities, colleges and workplaces.

This chapter presents the layout of the school and the academic achievements and challenges to Bedouin education. It reviews academic and development trends of Bedouin schools in the region and shares the role of the Amal Network in Bedouin education. The research continues to explore data arising from interviews and group discussions with Ahed students, faculty and community members. At the heart of the chapter is a representation of the profiles of individuals that comprise Ahed School and their intriguing story of educational success in a conflict zone.

**The Landscape of Ahed School**

The four hundred student high school is set on the edge of the town of Hura, on a hill overlooking sheep, construction and a main road connecting multiple Bedouin villages to the route towards Beer Sheba, the integrated Arab and Jewish city. Beer Sheba is the technological capital of Israel, the largest city in the Naqab. It is the fastest growing city in Israel with nearly 600,000 inhabitants throughout the metropolitan area, thirty percent of them are Arab Israelis (Central Bureau of Statistics, 2010). One of the most significant challenges to Bedouin education is the lack of access to schools for students in
unrecognized villages. Figure 5.1 shows the boundary map of area settlements and Hura and Lakiya are located south of the West Bank.

Figure 5.1 Boundary Map of Area Settlements

Bedouin high school dropout rates are high in the Naqab and the human rights advocacy groups, such as Adalah, emphasize the need for schools within Bedouin communities. One of Adalah’s recent surveys in the village of Al Fur’a,\textsuperscript{43} confirmed that “out of 375 students enrolled in the village's middle school, only 205 students attend high school in the nearby towns. This fact suggests that the transition from ninth grade to tenth grade causes a dropout rate of 45% in the educational system. Further, a large number of students drop out before reaching ninth grade” (Adalah, 2014, para. 3).

The dropout rate is particularly high among girls and the Knesset is constantly petitioned to build more high schools within the Naqab. In 2005, a quarter of Bedouin youth over the age 15 living in designated communities or “recognized villages” were not attending school, nor receiving a diploma, and just over one third had completed elementary or middle school. In contrast, in while out of neighboring Jewish communities only 5.5% of high school students failed to receive their diplomas (Swirski & Hasson, 2006, p. 95). The numbers of high school matriculation for youth in unrecognized villages are extremely low and rarely reported because those in the unrecognized villages are often undocumented. As the State of Israel’s recent agenda showed, schools for Bedouins are in the making, but access, sustainability, and performance are additional layers of concerns for families, staff and community members. Looking at the achievements and challenges of Ahed School can help inform other high schools in conflict areas.

\textsuperscript{43} Population 5,000 with 400 teenagers eligible for high school, yet there is no high school within the village, and students are bused out 25 kilometers to attend the nearest high school.
Ahed High School for Science (Ahed School) is open to students from both designated communities and unrecognized villages. Ahed School was built during a time when Bedouin enrollment in elementary and high schools was decreasing. In 2010 the amount of Bedouin youth enrolled in high school dropped from 67.5% to 64.7%. High school matriculation rates are qualified at the end of 12\textsuperscript{th} grade by Israel’s Ministry of Education certificate called Bagrut\textsuperscript{44}. The Bagrut certificate is the official matriculation examination process for Israel (Fulbright Program, 2014). This exam covers compulsory topics and impacts the universities and colleges high school students are accepted. As Bedouin dropout rates are increasing, only half of Israeli students are achieving matriculation qualifications school with a 48.3% rate of passing nationwide (Hartman, 2011).

In 2011, only 29\% of Bedouin in the Naqab achieved the Bagrut certificate because of the low quality of education and high dropout rates (Yahav, Telem, 2012). Israel’s Ministry of Education supervises the Bagrut matriculation testing of students’ knowledge. It covers compulsory subjects\textsuperscript{45} such as language, mathematics and science. Bagrut achievements demonstrate an average of scores from the range of subjects covering writing, language, mathematics and civics.

\textsuperscript{44} The Bagrut testing is similar to the United States’ ETS Advanced Placement system where you can achieve a 1-5 on exams
\textsuperscript{45} Topics include Language (Hebrew and/or Arabic grammar and composition), English language (written and oral) Mathematics, Civics/National Studies (civic and minorities, Jewish history), History, Literature (Hebrew and/or Arabic literature), an elective (Computer Science, Geography, an additional language), and some schools are tested in Physical Education (although Bedouin schools are not because it is deemed inappropriate for females)
Bedouin Knesset Ministry member Taleb Al-Sana\textsuperscript{46} states that the low matriculation achievements for Bedouin youth requires an educational transformation (Hartman, 2011). He believes the system needs to be changed and acknowledges that: “Revolution is needed in the state’s education system for the Beduin\textsuperscript{47} sector” (Hartman, 2011, para. 11) suggesting that Bedouin are neglected and the Israel Lands Authority intentionally abandoned building schools (Hartman, 2011). In addition, Minister Al-Sana stated that the “Beduin education system is on the verge of collapse” (Hartman, 2011, para. 15). Others believe that Bedouin education is the best way to raise the quality of life for Arab Israelis in the Naqab and this is part of the mission of Ahed School (Ahed School for Science, 2013) Abu-Rabia-Queder and Weiner-Levy see education as a growing avenue for agency for Palestinian women in Israel as well as a strong influence on social and personal identities (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2007; Abu-Rabia-Queder & Weiner-Levy, 2013). Non-profits and development organizations are responding to the poverty and challenges of Bedouin in the Naqab through education, and this is how Ahed was created (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2006; Ahed School for Science, 2012).

Approximately 96\% of Ahed’s graduating students are eligible to sit for matriculation exams which is one of the highest rates in Israel. In the summer and winter sessions of 2012, Ahed students sat for their first matriculation and psychometric exams (which are also required to attend higher education). They excelled and placed above the national average in all courses. Bagrut results far exceed the scores of local Bedouin

\textsuperscript{46} Also known as Taleb a-Sanaa (United Arab List-Ta’al), the uncle of two of the interviewees in this dissertation.

\textsuperscript{47} Beduin is another representation of Bedouin
schools in the Naqab. Figure 5.1, provided by Ahed School for Science’s Annual Progress Report, demonstrates the percentages of students who qualified in the different subjects of the exams. Approximately 92% of students completed the exam which is far above the Bedouin and national averages in matriculation and psychometric exams, respectively. The school administration expects to improve in the years to come.

Compulsory subjects are rated from a 1-5 scale (5 being the highest) much like the United States Advanced Placement exams. To pass the Bagrut Certificate, students must achieve 20 units out of a range of 15-20 units, with a minimum of 15 units in required subjects. The majority of Ahed students are passing at least three subjects with the highest rating (5 units).

Table 5.1 Bagrut Certificate Examination Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Ahed School for Science</th>
<th>Other Bedouin Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Complete Bagrut Certificate</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four subjects at 5 units</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>0.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above three subjects at 5 units</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above two subjects at 5 units</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


---

48 To learn more about the Bagrut process refer to the United States-Israel Educational Foundation http://fulbright.org.il/en/?page_id=1286.
Ahed students are excelling in not only matriculation exams but in national and international science and English debate competitions.

There have been numerous accolades enjoyed by the school and its students. In 2013 Ahed School students received first and second place trophies for scholarship in the International Physics Olympiad, a competition held in Copenhagen, Denmark, where high school students from 400 schools in 60 countries competed (Dattel & Lutsky, 2014). The next Olympiad will take place in Israel in 2019 and Ahed School students plan to participate in the International Physics Olympiad, as well as the Math and Informatics Olympiads (Shamah, 2013). Ahed students have also competed in an Arabic Literature contest. In 2012 Ahed School won first place in the English debate hosted by the Amal Network and professors from Harvard University (Ahed School for Science, 2012). Ahed representatives took part in a Supreme Court organized by an Excellence in Education in Israel panel, and have been highlighted in the OECD *Progress Report on the Implementation of the OECD Recommendations: Labor Market and Social Policies* (Paisner, 2012). The possibilities of Ahed School seem limitless and achievable.

Currently 96% of their graduates continue on to higher education, whereas only 62% of students in Hura are eligible for their matriculation certificate. In Hura, only six and a half % of the residents have college degrees, while 13% of Hura high school students continue to college (Dattel & Lutsky, 2014). Ahed School founders and administrators continue to support student success and education after graduation, and continue to mentor and communicate with graduates. For many of the founders, the success and education of their students is personal. The students’ success not only
represents change in economic opportunity but in human rights and in hopes for peace in a violent and contested region. Ahed School is a positive story of flourishing education in a complicated history of Bedouin education in Israel/Palestine.

The Amal Network

Bedouin education falls under Israel’s Compulsory Education law mandating the state responsible for providing schools and teachers. The Ministry of Education is in charge of designing and approving curriculum, and local authorities/regional councils maintain the school structures and supplies, often with Ministry of Education support. The Ministry is also responsible for funding kindergarten and primary school teachers, and allocates money to local councils to pay for secondary school teachers and cultural programs. The Amal Education Network (Amal) is a vocational education network funded by the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, and these allocations support the work of Ahed School (Human Rights Watch, 2001). Ahed School is one of 128 academic institutions in the Amal network. Amal has been a major purveyor of schools in Israel since 1928. In 2011, 87% of Israeli education programs were designated through state schools, local education institutions and non-profit organizations like Amal. Only 4% of schools in Israel are private and another 9% are funded by private businesses (i.e. tutors, textbooks, adult education services) (Filut, 2012).

Schools belonging to the Amal Network are dedicated to teaching scientific and technological education, while preparing students to “actively participate in an ever-changing society based on information technology” (Amal Network, 2014). The entire
region of the Naqab, and BeerSheva in particular, are focused on science and technology. Beer Sheva is considered the Silicon Valley of the Middle East. This rapid development is in distinct contrast to the landscape of ancient traditions of formerly nomadic Bedouin, Arab Israelis and Druze. Amal supports schools like Ahed School because they believe in science and technology education and training to contribute to the Israeli and global economy. Amal not only believes in the mission of Ahed School, but the improvement of educational systems and enhanced access for all Israelis and minority populations.

**Education in Construction: School Access**

Throughout the Naqab cement foundations have been poured for the construction of settlements and schools. The development of the Naqab is evident and the Knesset is determined to be at the forefront of the hi-tech movement. As the Bedouin Israeli and national population grows, more space is needed for families, and more educated employees are needed for the economy. As communities expand, and redefine their parameters, regional councils negotiate the creation of schools, implement city and regional mandates and act as liaisons from the communities to the national government.

One Naqab organization that responds to the challenges between the State of Israel, the settlements and unrecognized villages is the controversial Abu Basma Regional Council. It was founded in 2003 in response to the “Abu Basma Plan” to create originally six (13 in 2015) settlements in the Naqab. This resulted in relocating thousands of Bedouin living on ancestral land/unrecognized villages (Adalah, 2013).  

---

49 The Abu Basma Regional Council is administered by an Interior Minister political appointee.
There are feelings of trepidation in the region in regards to the council and the further urban ghettoization of Bedouin. In Lakiya the foundations have been lain for a new high school and elementary school. There is a change from the “transportable” and mobile schools the government had implemented for cost savings. Approximately one third of Bedouin classrooms within the recognized villages are mobile units (Swirski & Hasson, 2006, p. 65). Some see construction of schools as hopeful indicators of more public services and increased job opportunities in the community.

In 2007, the leader of the Abu Basma Regional Council, Aram Qalaji, stated that the region supported 18,000 elementary school students spread through twenty four elementary schools, twenty one of which were mobile units (Ilan, 2007). To support these 18,000 elementary students, only three high schools were operating in the region. The lack of access to schools in the region contributed to the motivation for creating institutions like Ahed School. Typically, if families had the means, they sent their children to high schools in developed Bedouin settlements like Kseifa, Segev Shalom and Lakiya. Very few services are available to those living in unrecognized villages. Even though education is mandatory in Israel, unrecognized villages are not subject to the same social services as designed settlements because they are not acknowledged as legitimate communities by the government.

This furthers the challenges for access to education for students. Poor accessibility and costs cause massive attrition for families within settlements and in unrecognized villages. (Ilan, 2007). Lack of transportation and access to high schools contribute to Bedouin having the highest dropout rate of students in Israel, especially
among females (R. Abu Rabia, 2010). Council leader Qalaji argues that building more Bedouin high schools will, in fact, save the State of Israel money as an offset of higher transportation costs. For example, “Abu Basma spends between NIS 50 million and NIS 60 million a year on school transportation, while the cost of operating a high school is just one-tenth of that” (Ibid, 2007). However, transportation is still one of the biggest challenges for accessing schools today. This challenge is true on both an economic and cultural level. The cost of fuel is high and few families have vehicles. If families can afford a vehicle, it is usually used by the male head of the household for the family business or to work on construction sites, farms, or for trucking companies.

Another challenge in transportation for Bedouin schools, including Ahed School, is a fear of girls traveling unchaperoned. According to Ahed teachers, the demographics of Ahed School includes half female and half male students. Parents are getting used to girls being out of their homes. Yet, Ahed teachers shared that girls in Hura and Lakiya are not permitted to be outside without someone greeting them. Overwhelmingly, the routine of attending school and work is perceived positively by many parents as long as they are physically accompanied. They feel that it creates an ethic of hard work and purposefulness (T. Tolley, per communication, October 2, 2013). Families hope youth will transfer the motivation and knowledge from school to the family business or their new career.

Economic need is a predominant factor in attrition rates. Family businesses such as construction, animal breeding (camel or sheep) and textiles (weaving and clothing repair) value the investment in family business as a priority to formal education. Bedouin
youth also struggle with global epidemics such as drug use, domestic abuse and child marriages (A. Abu-Rabia, 2001, p. 100). Sometimes girls are married at the beginning of puberty to assuage any fears of her honor or sexual integrity being compromised. As a result, often boys become fathers by the time they enter high school (Ibid, 2001).

Marriages were common for middle school years or high school (ages 12 and up) in the twentieth century (A. Abu-Rabia, 2001). However, in the villages of Lakiya and Hura this was not discussed openly or evident. In Lakiya and Hura, girls were prevented from attending school because of transportation and concerns of honor, not child marriage (T. Tolley, per communication, May 2013). Bedouin scholar Aref-Abu-Rabia (2001) also blames Bedouin schools for the high attrition rates of Bedouin youth, “Most schools fail to take adequate steps to prevent early leaving, and at times even encourage it, especially among poor or troubled youngsters” (p. 100). Abu-Rabia additionally states that the mindset and attitudes, and lack of family involvement also contribute to the low matriculation rate of Bedouin youth.

These challenges help situate the creation and experiences of Ahed School and how it was cultivated from the concerns of academics and parents concerned with the educational opportunities for children. There are low dropout rates because students have to test in to be accepted, and parents have to support the students’ academic achievements with moderate fees, transportation, and extracurricular activities. Ahed students are selected by entrance exams and come from both recognized and unrecognized villages. They have to pay for transportation which can be an obstacle. Ahed School’s budget is allocated from the Ministry of Education, with supplementary grants from private donors.
(T. Tolley, per communication, June 2, 2013). The school also receives international volunteers throughout the school year and encourages students to develop English language skills and contact with these volunteers. The intent is to allow students to understand life outside of the Naqab, and beyond the State of Israel, Palestine, and neighboring Jordan. Administrators are trying to find a balance between an all Bedouin school which allows students to feel confident and empowered, and an integrated community and institution of higher education. A few students transfer to other schools because of the preference for integrated schools.

**Bedouin Student Identities**

In the fall of 2013, during the fieldwork phase of my research, I was asked by two of the teachers to discuss Muslim youth around the world and to share with the Bedouin students at Ahed School that they are not alone in their faith, aspirations and customs rooted in a nomadic culture. We addressed the Muslim Bosnian students in Sanski Most and their experiences of conflict within the Balkans War. I was also asked about Muslim youth in Mindanao, Philippines, and the stories of land conflict that has collapsed into the rhetoric of religious conflict.\(^50\) We discussed Albanian youth and their Kosovar Albanian brethren in Kosova’s conflict.\(^51\) Both Ahed School teachers, and students, wanted to know that they were not alone in their experiences, cultures, challenges, identities and

---

\(^{50}\) In 2008 I participated in the Mindanao Peacebuilding Institute (MPI) under the advisement of Dissertation Committee Member Al Fuertes. To learn more about MPI: http://www.mpiasia.net/.

\(^{51}\) I worked with Albanian and Bosnian youth from 2005-2009 through the Balkans Peace Park Project, Jugendzentrum ASTA, and the Center for Peacebuilding.
hope for peace. They also wanted to share their views on education, their identities and culture.

While exploring concepts of Bedouin culture and education with discussion groups and in individual interviews, a new pattern emerged in which research participants provided information on cultural traits and customs before they were comfortable sharing stories. This was especially true of respondents in group settings. When sharing concepts of culture within classrooms, students offered their concepts of identity, traditions and religion by listing traits and what they thought an outsider would think in terms of what it means to be Bedouin. When discussing Bedouin “culture” with Ahed students they listed traits to their culture, and what they perceived an outsider would perceive of them.
Figure 5.2 Extent of Bedouin Traditions

The data represent an interesting dynamic witnessed in initial conversations both in interviews, and in group settings when Ahed students were sharing in group dynamics “the meaning of Bedouin” history, culture and transformation in society. Not only did students bring up these issues as traits of culture, but as rituals that need to be preserved, or are at risk in their community. Students, graduates and teachers value customary Bedouin dance, clothing and the nomadic tent styles. Bedouin weaving was especially important to Bedouin teachers and staff. The data underscore these traditions and while at first it seems simply like listing traits that tourists identify with Bedouin Israelis, they
also indicate how rituals, customs, and beliefs are changing. Students mentioned they no longer know how to make bread like their mothers, or weave traditional goat hair tents. Drinking Bedouin coffee and tea is an indicator of being welcomed into Bedouin homes and communities, and it is part of the communication process. Polygamy is a growing concern for teachers who see an increase in young women becoming second wives.

Bedouin dancing is important to young people because dancing at weddings is one of the few opportunities males and females are able to meet, talk and dance in the community without being separated.

Although traditions and customs of Bedouin families are gradually changing with new levels of access to the Israeli economy, education and media. There are still evident traits Ahed School constituents find important to their identity. Bedouin participants appeared very used to being the “other” and had a list of customs to define who they are. For some these were indicators of pride, and for others a past society. A tenth grade student shared “My family continues to live in a traditional goat hair tent and we live like our ancestors” while a twelfth grade student shared that customs were changing so quickly that “My children will be running around in flip flops and shorts like Jews” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 3, 2013). The cultural customs for Bedouin youth have varying values for each family, caste and individual.

These traits are important as we look into the profiles of people comprising Ahed School later in the chapter, and themes that came from the interviews. To deepen the response to the research questions, shared stories convey meaning to the emerging themes. Through in-depth interviews, and exchanges of stories, the research participants
and I were able to extend what initially could be interpreted as folkloristic descriptions of culture. However, these cultural traits were important to students because they are some of the characteristics of culture that are rapidly changing with development.

Out of 55 participants involved in group discussions and in-depth interviews, thirty-eight were current Ahed students, eleven were Ahed alumni or students from Lakiya high, and six were teachers and faculty members. Throughout the data collection many interesting themes arose. When discussing identity 47% of respondents claimed that they identify with being Bedouin and 11% did not. All teachers and faculty interviewed believe that Bedouin communities are changing, and that there are negative stereotypes of Bedouin. A major concern for recent graduates and local teens is unemployment. Over half (55%) of Ahed students stated that freedom is important to them. All teachers and faculty members brought up the local land conflict as a concern and 35% of respondents overall discussed it as a theme.

The following themes came from open ended, in-depth interviews and group discussions. They are not definitive yes and no questions but themes, concerns and ideas that came from discussions. The data are presented in four categories. The first two numerical columns represent data derived from current Ahed Students (at the time of data collection). The third and fourth columns indicate data from interviews and group discussions with Ahed School alumni and local teens who were also research participants. The fifth and sixth columns include the number and percentages of teachers included in the study, and the final columns represent the total community numbers and percentages. These themes are divided between the predominant tensions identified in the
interview data. These tensions include the balance between experiences of marginalization and empowerment, alienation and acceptance in both Israeli and Bedouin societies, and the tension of achieving safe communities and spaces for education. Current students, alumni and local teens and teachers and faculty are presented consecutively to demonstrate the similarities and differences presented as relevant issues, beliefs, concerns and cultural pride.
Table 5.2 Themes from Participant Responses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes arising from interviews and group discussions</th>
<th>Total Ahead Students</th>
<th>Total % of Students</th>
<th>Total Alumni and Teens</th>
<th>Total % of Alumni and Teens</th>
<th>Total Teachers</th>
<th>Total % of Teachers</th>
<th>Total Community</th>
<th>Total % of Community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alienation vs. Acceptance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identify with Bedouin</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditions are changing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic beliefs</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don't identify with being Bedouin</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about Marriage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Troubled about Love</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marginalization vs. Empowerment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of Culture</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unique Bedouin Language/dialect</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride in being Bedouin</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

158
Throughout interviews and group discussions students, faculty and community members had the opportunity to share stories of their families, religious beliefs, educational experiences, and aspirations. Various tensions and themes arose throughout the interviews and discussions. These themes are topics of conversation within Ahed School and the villages and do not necessarily represent a particular view on the subject matter. There were interesting contrasts in themes between alumni and local teens versus Ahed students as well. Eighty-three percent of the teachers and faculty mentioned
unemployment challenges as a cause for concern (for Bedouin) while only five percent of current Ahed students are worried about jobs. Students discussed the pressure of finding employment but were often confident that with education they would. Some students shared the importance of religion in their lives, and the role of Prophet Mohammed, specifically, being important to Bedouin communities and themselves.

Figure 5.4 demonstrates the values of the members of Ahed School and some of the community members. Figure 5.5 represents the same information in a graph for visual representation.

![MARGINALIZATION VS. EMPOWERMENT](image)

**Figure 5.3 Themes Representing the Tension between Experiences of Marginalization and Empowerment**
Figure 5.4 Themes Representing the Tension between Experiences of Alienation and Acceptance
Figure 5.5 Themes Representing the Tension between Experiences of Alienation, Violence and Safety in Education and Community

These data provide themes and present three predominant tensions which are pertinent to Ahed students, faculty, and community members. The struggle between marginalization versus empowerment, alienation versus acceptance, and violent versus safe spaces for education encapsulate themes of gender dynamics, conflict and culture within Bedouin in the Naqab. In addition, the need to preserve folkloric concepts of Bedouin culture, and themes of religion and positive association with being Bedouin were evident when Ahed students, faculty and community members discussed the
“Meaning of Bedouin” and brought up traditional Bedouin traits. These reminders of the complexity of Bedouin identity and culture were observed in preliminary discussions, interviews and when students were interacting with students from outside communities. Many Bedouin youth identify as both Bedouin, and Palestinian; more than their Israeli citizenship (R. Abu Rabia, 2010; Elbedour et al., 2009). Youth also respond to their identity depending on who is asking them how they define themselves. Salam, a student whose name means peace, described how being “Bedouin is my culture, including my family traditional and my friends in the same city. I am proud of my belonging because I (am) proud of my Dad and we are educated and believe in peace and freedom. We maintain our culture (T. Tolley, per communication, October, 2013).”

To understand deeper meanings of ethnic identity and culture, in-depth interviews provide insights through stories. As anthropologists have shown us throughout the last 50 years, Bedouin identity and culture is shared most intimately through poetry and stories (Abu-Lughod, 2000; Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2006; S. Lavie, 1991). While stories are also a positioning of power and memory, they allow different nuances and signify the value individuals and groups place on issues like education, land, religion, and future aspirations. These themes are discussed through the profiles of people comprising Ahed School represented in tensions surrounding marginalization and education, alienation and acceptance and safe spaces for education.
Profiles of Ahed School

These stories give glimpses into the Bedouin students, faculty, and staff that compose Ahed School. This section looks at the aspirations, politics, hopes and goals of people connected to creating, or participating in this model of education. Stories are wide ranging including “experiences” in military service, smuggling family members, and jail time. Some reminisced about first loves, their dedication to education, and a deeply rooted value for ancestral land and family. These profiles provide a context to the design and aspirations of a unique educational institution existing on the intersection of land conflict, major shifts in generational culture and economic opportunities.

These profiles are all based on first hand interviews and supported by the literature. The decision to represent people through profiles of Ahed was inspired by the fieldwork and the importance of storytelling both in the schools and within family discussions. The data alone are insufficient in respectively representing the voices of Ahed School. The people that designed, built, teach, learn and support Ahed School are what makes this school such an interesting story to the field of conflict analysis and resolution. Test scores and economics do not demonstrate alone why this school is flourishing in times of conflict and dramatic cultural and economic change. It is the people that comprise Ahed who represent the struggles and achievements of this school. It is their experiences which show the complexity of gender dynamics, marriage, and the tension between those living in unrecognized villages, citizens of Bedouin settlements, and the Israeli government. The following voices explain how youth are navigating cultural change, facing the economic and academic encouragement to assimilate into
As a reflective practitioner and researcher, it became evident that the best way to understand the complexity of the school was to understand the people that create it.

All the youth included in this chapter, and the majority of voices in this dissertation, are referred to by pseudonyms. Adults who have additionally been quoted in newspaper and journal articles, and preferred to use their names are included. While all these narratives are based on direct interviews and quotes, alternative names and locations have been used to deidentify participants. These stories show the importance of education for marginalized communities, how families come together to advocate for rights and access to education, and how protracted conflict influences the dynamics of culture and economy.

**Marginalization versus Empowerment**

The goal of Ahed School is to use education to demarginalize and empower youth. This presents a tension between the Bedouin community, racism within the nation, and inequality in access and quality of education. The stories of the founder of Ahed School and his daughters, the poet, and the English teacher each show the nuances of demarginalization through education.
**The Founder and his Daughters**

One of the founders of Ahed School, Sulieman Abu Bader, dedicated himself to designing the Bedouin school after his own challenges pursuing higher education as a Bedouin man. He is committed to fighting for access to education for his children both locally and internationally. Sulieman went to Jerusalem for his undergraduate degree in mathematics and statistics at Hebrew University. He gained a master’s in Economics from Ben-Gurion University. He then traveled to the United States and earned a doctorate at Cornell University in Economics. He returned to teach at Ben-Gurion University and devoted his time and resources to Bedouin education, and supports the Bedouin Academic Association. When Abu-Bader was looking for high schools for his children (prior to Ahed’s inception), he elected to send his daughters to a Jewish run high school close to his village because it provided a higher caliber of academic education than was available in Lakiya (Lerner, 2013).

Sulieman’s mother was illiterate and he wanted his daughters to have every educational opportunity possible. Sulieman, and two of the other founders of Ahed School, have daughters and wanted to contribute to the educational empowerment of young women. He observed the women of his mother’s generation in isolation, not learning Hebrew, often becoming second or third wives with little independence or economic or academic opportunity. He wanted more for his children. Sulieman’s daughter Sheeren has many more options available to her than her mother or grandmother’s generation. Sheereen was awarded a Fulbright for a master’s in drama therapy. Her friend, Yasmeen Haj-Amer, did a master’s in education at Oxford.
University and became one of the first teachers at Ahed School. In addition, Yasmeen is involved in the Palestinian History Tapestry Project, to empower Palestinian women to obtain economic independence while sharing the stories of their communities and histories, and using traditional methods of weaving and embroidery to give themselves a voice (Chalmers, 2014). As more educational, and vocational opportunities become possible for young Bedouin women, traditional knowledge is also cherished and maintained.

Weaving and art programs both in the Naqab and in Palestine highlight changes in cultural traditions, and the need for women’s education in the home, the Palestinian History Tapestry project shares this image of education:

Figure 5.6 The Weaving of Education

(Chalmers, 2014).
Weaving is a significant part of both Bedouin and Palestinian cultures, especially for women. Bedouin women were responsible for collecting goat hair and making the tents, carpets and clothing that sheltered families from the harsh desert climate. Now women like Shereen and Hala weave to preserve their culture and sense of pride and agency.

**The Heartbroken Poet**

Following a group discussion about culture, identity, and Islam, a 17-year-old student approached me wanting to share her ideas of culture. She described how she believed in Islam, but not the restraining nature of her Bedouin community. Reem is from an unrecognized village. She wants to be a doctor. She has seven sisters and three brothers and her eldest brother is an attorney. Reem is in her fourth year at Ahed School. She lives ten miles away from the school and it takes her one to two hour by bus to reach the campus. She is required to travel with family members as chaperones to ensure she arrives safely.

Reem is from a long line of Bedouin poets. Her mother, grandmother and great grandmother all enjoy the tradition of sharing family stories through their words. She and her mother are the first literate generations of her family and she is excited about her opportunities at Ahed School. Reem loves to write poetry, she keeps a journal and enjoys the challenges for writing in her English course. She is most interested in reading and writing about love and its obstacles. Reem is in love with her classmate Hani and desperately wants to marry him when they get a few years older. They have been friends since their first year as freshmen in the second incoming class at Ahed School. Hani also
cares for Reem but the challenge is Hani is the not the same caste as Reem and she believes her parents would disapprove of such a marriage. Although the caste system is gradually changing with new economic opportunities and restrictions in land use, this is still a concern for her family.

Reem’s family is still traditional and wants her to marry after high school. She would like to get married at 25 years of age, but it is more common to marry around 20 years old. She is frustrated with her family not accepting her wishes, and she also feels limited by the physical restrictions of land use. However, she is grateful for Ahed School and for the ability to express herself through her poetry via social media:

“We no longer have camels, Israel has taken our homes and put us in camps, how else do I feel free? School gives me a place to learn and be with my friends, and the internet lets me explore the world of music, education, and who I might marry… But of course, my father does not know. That is why I don’t use my real name or picture on anything” (T. Tolley, per communication, May 2013).

Facebook, Twitter, Viber, WhatsApp and many other social media and free international texting applications allow Bedouin youth to feel more connected to the world they are physically, and culturally separated from. Reem and her friends utilize the space, and she has admitted to sharing some of her poetry on Facebook as well. It is a place where she can share her frustration with local conflict, interfamily views of the caste system, and her aspirations for the future. Not all Bedouin families continue to observe Bedouin castes. Reem’s neighbors who are community leaders in Lakiya believe in integration of families, religious education and caste systems.
Historically, Bedouin castes were divided by pastoralism levels. Those who had camels were of higher caste. Those with goats and sheep were second highest. Now it has changed depending on land ownership and cost of animals. Most Bedouin communities continue to operate in a caste system. One community leader who was born in an unrecognized village and moved to the Lakiya settlement in the 1970s shared his experience with the Bedouin caste system: “Coming from the top caste system I didn’t suffer from it (discrimination) but the lower caste feel it. We don’t want caste system. It is slowly falling apart little by little. But, the less educated and the weak in society – they move, they are afraid of diversity and the unknown” (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2012).

The community leader’s wife was not raised in a caste system. She was raised in a liberal and integrated branch of the tribe. Two of her brothers married European women, and three out of four of her children attend mixed (Jewish and Muslim) elementary schools in Beer Sheva, twenty minutes’ drive away from the village. Their eldest daughter attends a local Bedouin high school, and they have taken their children to live and study on fellowships in English speaking countries around the world. She believes in integrated education and exposure to diversity. “The more you look and see the world and fly away from borders the more you see. Our kids go to mixed schools, they don’t feel like there is a barrier. There are an increasing amount of diverse schools and families. Our communities are mixed and the barriers are unclear.” (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2012). Reem’s current poetry pieces are inspired by her neighbors, her love for Hani, and the challenges of love in the desert.
The English Teacher

Another person who has experience at multiple Bedouin schools in the Naqab is the Dana, the English Teacher. She is a gregarious, quick to laugh, teacher from the northern city of Haifa. Dana is Arab Israeli and grew up in integrated neighborhoods in Haifa with Orthodox Jews, Druze, Bedouin and Palestinian neighbors. She moved to Beer Sheba for University, and has worked at two Bedouin high schools before joining Ahed School. Dana is committed to the education and equality of Bedouin youth. She encourages her students to debate, to talk about their aspirations, and to share their artistic sides. At Lakiya High School she sponsored a women’s journal that gave students, like Reem, a place to share their poetry, photography and artwork. Together they explored concepts of tradition and modernity, polygamy, women’s organizations, motherhood, gender roles, divorce and Bedouin traditional dress. She has written about child brides, how her students protested cell towers endangering their health, and how much hope she has in this generation of young Bedouin women (Lakiya High School, 2010).

Dana is an advocate for education and Bedouin youth. She encourages her students to participate in Amal Network and international sponsored programs and has undergone three years of Program on Negotiation training. She is excited to be at a place like Ahed School which values the students’ education and progress so highly. She thinks there should be more Arabic writers in the curriculum (required by the Ministry of Education) and she wants students to know they are not alone as a minority population of tribal Muslims. Although she is not Bedouin, she is an advocate, friend and leader to the
students. While teaching at past Amal schools she collaborated with international fellows to create student newspapers and journals to express Bedouin life. Ahed School is currently predominantly focused on the scientific and technological aspects of education, but she hopes to explore the artistic and personal sides of students. Dana encourages high school students to share their heritage and artistic expression and edited and published the following pieces photographic essay pieces:

An eleventh grade student shares a poem and image about the importance and evolution of land and food production

**Fruitful land**
As you see our wheat is
Planted in this Earth that had been nothing but desert.
How the Bedouin life has changed here in the Negev!
Our people have also changed through all this time.
The land is becoming better because we take good care of it and use irrigation to grow the wheat.
I hope that we will be even better in the future.
Some students talked about the changing land, and others described the importance of animals in their tribes, especially the value of the camel, providing transportation and adaptability in the desert. Animals, land, and agriculture are important to both the traditional economies and identities of Bedouin students. The olive tree is also an integral part of Bedouin sustenance and economy. One of Dana’s students, Sahar, shares her thoughts and view of the olive tree. She uses her poetry and photographs to share the
significance of the olive tree and the struggle to keep the orchard healthy with only one tree remaining:

O’Live Olive
The olive trees are part of our life. Modernity and the fast life that we live today doesn’t change that fact. We always keep the trees near our homes and on our farms. Without the olive trees, Bedouin life would have no meaning.
Figure 5.8 O’Live Olive


Ninth grade student Doaa Salman Abu-Kaf shares her work “Proud Mama” where “The camel had a baby and in this photo, my grandfather is holding the baby camel to feed him. On the other side, my grandmother milks the camel to give to the children for drink”: 
Figure 5.9 Proud Mama


Many of the photographic essays students chose to submit deal with the balance between the old world and modernization. An eleventh grade student, Hind Abu Rizik, shared his visions of the desert: “In the desert we are isolated from the other world, the modern world. The other people think that we are disappointed and are not happy with our life, but in the desert, the sky gives us hope as it is vast like our dreams. I like the sky’s color
and I feel that it gives the hope for our life. So when we look up to the sky, we smile and also look toward an agreeable future” (Abu Rizik, 2013). Dana believes that this generation of Bedouin students have more opportunities, and potential challenges awaiting them. When students were arrested for protesting the demolition of unrecognized villages Dana shared how “I was so worried during the land protests, I didn’t know if they were going to let them out of jail” (T. Tolley, per communication, September 29, 2013). Dana has been attending the PON trainings for the last three years and tries to reiterate themes of negotiation and agency in her classroom. Dana’s commitment to her students is one of the many reasons students at Ahed School are so academically successful. She raises their voices and gives them different avenues for expression.

The founder and his daughters show the fight for empowerment through education, economic opportunity and combating gender inequality. The story of the poet represents the struggle to find love and combat a caste system that creates divisions in an already marginalized society. She uses her faith and ancestral artistry to share her beliefs. Dana’s devotion to teaching demonstrates the importance of art and education in representing culture, gender dynamics, and agency. Education serves as form of demarginalization for these people comprising Ahed School.

**Alienation versus Acceptance**

The second major tension represented by this analysis is the battle between experiences of alienation being Bedouin, and the risk of acceptance and assimilation into
Israeli society and norms. The following voices present the complexity of Bedouin education, the attributes of integrated education, and the desires for cultural preservation. The woman who weaves and educates grapples with the prejudice, religious dynamics and economic opportunities. The young patient finds herself wanting both a Bedouin marriage and a professional career. The tension of assimilation is palpable for her, the transfer students and those who must choose between unrecognized villages and Israeli economy, land use and economy. These young people are negotiating what it means to be Bedouin and how to flourish academically and economically without compromising traditional ways of Bedouin life.

**The Weaver**

Hala is one of the staff and instructors of Ahed School and a vocal advocate of Bedouin education. She shared her perspective of education as a Bedouin woman through the “Women’s Voices: An Oral History of Israeli & Palestinian Women” project led by Shimrit Lee. Hala shared thoughts about her identity as well as her goals in working with Bedouin youth and women.

First of all, I would describe myself as Muslim. This is my first identity. Then Palestinian, then Bedouin, and only then, if necessary, Israeli. But now, I identify myself only as Muslim. I’m very proud of my Bedouin heritage. It’s a way of life. It’s very visible that I’m Bedouin. But if I really want to describe myself on the inside, I’m first of all mainly Muslim

She also described the double consciousness of gaining her education and commuting between the big city of Beer Sheva, and the Bedouin villages of Lakiya and Hura (where Ahed School is).

I loved Beer Sheva, but I also felt...strange. Because I used to go to Jewish school where there were no other Arab students. I had really good friends, but still, sometimes I felt that I’m not the same. They grew up and went to the military, and I went to the University. My friends treated me like an equal. I mean, I love them until today. But still, I felt that I’m not belonging. There was a time in my life I didn’t feel like I belonged anywhere. My Bedouin community treated me like the Jewish, and here they treated me like the Bedouin. There was a time that I didn’t find myself. Well, my first year in the university I began to feel more like myself. I had some Bedouin friends, women, and we talked together. For the first time, I felt that ...this is me. They introduced me to the real Islam. And I learned in the university about Islam, I took some courses. Only then did I start wearing the hijab, the veil. I used to go without covering (Lee, 2011, sec. “It’s Hard to Express”).

Hala also shared her sense of belonging and feelings of community along with feelings of isolation:

I don’t feel like I belong to Israel. Well, it’s very complicated. I can’t say that I feel that I don’t belong. Because all my family is here and we’re getting services that we fight for and we deserve. We have Jewish friends.... But still, I feel
sometimes discrimination... I can’t blame the other side because also they don’t know us. The masses, I feel that they don’t want any connection to us. We feel alien. They also feel that we’re strangers. I don’t know why. Maybe because they have the wrong impression of Islam, and they generalize. I don’t know the reason. But this is the reality, this is what I feel. Also, I don’t want to generalize because I have a lot of Jewish friends. I grew up with them, they help us. I mean, every day we face it. Every day.

Until this moment, I don’t feel at home at all, in any place. It’s not good, it’s not a good feeling. I don’t feel free. But when I go, for example, to Lakiya, to Rahat, I feel relieved. I feel like I’m in a natural place... And we don’t have options. We can’t think about what we love and what we would like to do, for example we can’t just become an artist, because first we need to eat in order to survive... (Lee, 2011, sec. “It’s Hard to Express”).

After finishing her first degree, Hala was determined to live above poverty and find work to support her community. She began working with Sidreh and the Lakiya Women’s Weaving Project, as well as working at Ahed School. In each program she finds ways to fight for the education of women and girls, and strives to support their increased economic opportunities:
In education we teach women to read and write, in Arabic and also in Hebrew. We have a very high rate of illiterate women in the Negev. Eighty % of the women, age 30 and above, are illiterate. So we give women education as a tool of empowerment. I hope we are making an impact in women’s lives. I know it made an impact on my life... The women in the unrecognized villages face double challenges. They don’t have any services, there’s no transportation. There’s a 90 % unemployment rate among the women there. It’s an impossible life. They will not give up their land, it’s very noble. It’s very hard to see their villages demolished constantly. We all feel broken inside, like we want to help but we don’t have all the solutions. I will help them whenever I can…I hope that the Bedouin community will have rights, and a better future. I hope that we have the tools to help us develop as individuals and as a society. We’re definitely living in a very complicated situation (laughs). It’s hard to express it (Lee, 2011, sec. “It’s Hard to Express”).

Hala has completed her master’s and is hoping to pursue her PhD in Middle East Studies. Her work with the weaving community and Ahed allows her to work directly towards her goals (T. Tolley, per communication, October 2013). Voices like Hala’s help encourage younger students, such as those attending Ahed School. She serves as a role model for them, embodying multiple aspects of past traditions of Bedouin women, as well as future economic and educational opportunities.

---

52 To see Hala speak visually refer to the Women’s Voices Project http://womens-voices.net/2011/08/09/134/#more-134.
Her experiences of multiple identities and discrimination, reflects the literature and the experiences of Ahed students and graduates. She is also a strong advocate for poverty reduction and believes that women need education and jobs to lift up themselves and the community. She acts as a mentor and source of inspiration for many people at Ahed School and throughout the villages.

The Patient

When Ahed School students were asked if they talk about identities with people from other religions, Nasreen, a 17-year-old Ahed student shared: “I would never tell a Jew that I am first a Palestinian, unless I really knew and trust them. People assume I am Bedouin. I am. But my parents feel more Bedouin then Israeli or Palestinian. I feel more Palestinian than Bedouin or a person of Israel” (T.Tolley, per communication, October 2013). Nasreen is exploring what her multiple identities mean while trying to maintain her health, and her options for life after Ahed School.

Nasreen wants to be a pediatrician. She and multiple members of her family struggle with a blood condition called thalassemia major. Every month she and two of her sisters require blood transfusions to survive since the condition shortens the life-span of her red blood cells (Bain, Wild, Stephens, & Phelan, 2011). This condition is common in Bedouin communities and is attributed to centuries of intermarriage with both mother and father carrying the trait. She experiences extreme pain similar to those afflicted with sickle cell anemia and the hospital visits have become part of her routine. She only likes one of the nurses and whispers to me “They don’t like Bedouin. They think we are less”
(T.Tolley, per communication, October 3, 2013). Nasreen and her siblings feel judged for both being Bedouin and by the condition they have. Her family is now very careful about marriage with this condition and genetic testing has become available for families or couples considering children or marriage.

After Nasreen finished her transfusion we walked to the café. Her color had improved and she felt like she could breathe again. The last few days before her monthly transfusion she was extremely lethargic and had trouble focusing on school. One of her brothers not only feels fatigued but has grown abnormally because of his anemia and irregular bone growth. Bone deformations are common in children with anemia and Nasreen and her siblings have to be careful of iron overload from the blood transfusions because they can cause premature death from the transfusions (Thalessemia Foundation of Canada, 2014). None of her siblings have died with this condition. However, her aunt and uncle did not receive proper treatment in the village and did not live past forty years old.

Nasreen and I waited for her brother to finish his transfusions near the hospital café. She spotted a young Bedouin man exiting the eye clinic down the hall and rapidly covered her mouth and acted shy… She had never seen him before and wondered what tribe he was from. The hospital in Beer Sheva is one of the few places she and her sisters are allowed to travel freely outside of the village and it is one of the few places to meet new people. Nasreen wants to become a pediatrician because of how afraid she was when she was a child when she had transfusions. She did not understand why people were rude to her. She wants to be the kind of doctor who accepts all people. She gets frustrated
when she has to miss school for her transfusions. Luckily, her teachers understand the condition because it is common among Bedouin. It motivates her to study hard and she is happy to be at a school that values biology and medical sciences. She hopes to start medical school in the next five years.

Nasreen is a remarkable young woman who is inspired to become a doctor because of her traumatic experiences with this medical condition and prejudice encountered within the hospital system. There are a few role models of Bedouin female doctors, but they are rare. Nasreen is grateful that her school allows her to study sciences. Her mother can read but never learned more in school that reading and preliminary mathematics. In twenty years the educational opportunities in Hura have changed dramatically because of the devotion of people like the mayor, and the Ahed School founders.

The Transfer Students

Leena, a 16 year old Bedouin student from Lakiya, has high marks and attended Ahed School for ninth and tenth grade. While she initially enjoyed her time at Ahed she and her parents believe that she will flourish more academically, and linguistically, if she attends an integrated school. She transferred to a school in Beer Sheba about thirty minutes from her village. The schools is predominately Jewish and they have strong academics and physical education programs. Classes are primarily instructed in Hebrew and her parents want her Hebrew to be perfect. Her family values education and they both
have advanced degrees. She finds education very important and wants to both work and have a family:

   Education is important to me. It is important because it is basically what will hold me in the future to get me work, and also for general information for a good lifestyle. I go to a Jewish school that the most student in this school are Jewish and has a little amount of Arabs, Muslims and Christians. My family all goes to school.

We discussed education, racism, and opportunities for Bedouin women. Leena feels that “For Bedouin women it is normal to go to school, but to the University or college not really. The traditional saying that Bedouin women need to stay at home is fading with the years and many Bedouin women dare to get education and study at Universities and Colleges. In the future I’m interested in both work and family. To get education and have a family at the same time” (T. Tolley, per communication, June 6, 2014).

   The majority of Ahed Students who participated in this study presented themselves as very content with Ahed School. However, not all families believe the best educational opportunity is in a predominately Bedouin school. The opposite is also true. Ibrahim, an Ahed School alum who attended both public high school in Lakiya, and Ahed School, preferred Ahed School and “loved the social activities” and the respect and responsibilities students were given. At Lakiya High School he experienced problems with the teacher and was not allowed to speak his mind. He shared his experience in Lakiya versus at Ahed School. In Lakiya “I didn’t know many students and teachers, was perceived as someone out of the family, like a guest, in Lakiya the social life is bad.
Students don’t like to talk to one another, nobody cares about social issues. Asked teachers if they would give me an opportunity to talk to the school about the land conflict. No one cares. I wish I hadn’t gone to the (Lakiya) school’’ (T. Tolley, per communication, April 8, 2014). Ibrahim just entered law school and is still trying to determine what type of education system best fits his hopes and interests (T. Tolley, February 28, 2015).

**Those Who Must Choose**

Mohammed (Mo) is a 19 year old graduate of Ahed School. He shared his difficulties with his high school education. Although he scored well in his university qualifying exams he did not want to attend college right away. He prefers to work and has a job at a hotel in the Dead Sea about two hours away from his village, Al Zarhiva, which is unrecognized and is constantly in threat of demolition. Mo prefers to work and stay out of the Bedouin “politics” and land conflict that his father, who is from the Sinai Peninsula, and his mother, who was born in Al Zarhiva, are committed to.

Mo does not feel as involved in the plight of the unrecognized villages, although he has witnessed his family’s home be demolished three times. While his father is deeply involved in the rights of Bedouin, and protecting the elementary school they have built, Mo does not feel the same salient identity of being Bedouin. His father, and some of his siblings are much more political. Mo says, “I’m not Bedouin. Well, not really…In the past Bedouin were nomads, Arabs were farmers and anyone from the West Bank were
Palestinians. I think Bedouin aren’t accepted by Arabs because they stood with Israel during the Six Day War.”

His father is one of the leaders of the village and is trying to protect Bedouin rights, and feels more allegiance towards the Palestinian plight. His family helps run the unrecognized elementary school which is funded through international donations, volunteers, and by the community. His father believes their land is Bedouin, and part of Palestine, but Mo thinks differently: “Palestine doesn’t care about us, I don’t care about Palestine” (T. Tolley, June 3, 2013 personal communication). His younger sister shook her head and disagreed. She is thirteen and wants to become either a teacher or a doctor and is hoping to qualify for Ahed School next year.

Mo currently works summers at a hotel on the Dead Sea that serves tourists from Europe and the Americas. He cooks, cleans, parks cars and moves luggage. “I want to work” he shared. He enjoys the freedom of working in the tourist industry and meeting people from around the world. His parents hope he will return to university, work in Beer Sheba, get married, and live in their village. However, Mo enjoys working with different people. He frequently receives questions about his ethnic identity and his religion from foreigners, and depending on who is asking he says he is Arab Israeli or Bedouin. Many of the tourists come through the desert and take pictures with head scarves, riding camels, and posing with old Bedouin men. It is challenging for Mo to see the exotification of the ethnic identity he is rejecting. He appreciates the tourists, and the money and jobs that they support, but he feels like they do not understand where he comes from and that Bedouin are a tourist attraction that the state tourism board promotes.
Mo is reluctant to talk about his role as the eldest son of a tribal leader. He doesn’t feel the same pride of being “Bedouin” that his father does. He also is more removed from his ancestral lands and traditions. He no longer moves the sheep, goats and camels with his father. That is now the job of his two little brothers. His sisters volunteer at the elementary school when they return home from middle school and high school. He is uncomfortable in his village now that he has worked in a setting where he is exposed to international tourists and Jewish co-workers. He wants to use the skills gained at Ahed School, particularly in computer sciences and English language, to work in hospitality.

Mo is experiencing his own dual consciousness and is feeling pressure from his family to marry. Another student from Ahed School, Sara the senior debate champion, is very interested in Mo. She is from a wealthy family in Lakiya and has been interested in Mo for two years. Her father, Salman, respects Mo’s father as a tribal and Bedouin leader but does not want his daughter moving to an unrecognized village after she has had a comfortable lifestyle in Lakiya and at Ahed School. He is worried that they will get married, build a home and constantly be in fear of it being bulldozed down. He is also worried she won’t know how to work the land and feed his future grandchildren. “She doesn’t know the old Bedouin ways” Salman shared, “But she is very smart, she could be a doctor, or a professor” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 4, 2013).

Sara and Mo are experiencing transitional times of life. They are trying to determine whether to marry, work, continue their educations, and where to live. There are extreme pressures placed on these young people. They come from comparatively liberal families that value education. Sara is worried that she will become like her older sisters,
who are in their thirties unwed, working in the village in childcare and without prospects for marriage. She doesn’t want to be a second wife, but she is not ready to leave her community to study in Jordan or other parts of Israel. At 18 and 19, Sara and Mo are confronted with many serious decisions that have long-term commitments.

These young people are attempting to determine options for education, marriage, economic opportunity, and living. They are fortunate because they have choices. Many Bedouin girls are not allowed to select prospective partners (that their family will have to approve) or universities (when most cannot afford to send their children away to school, or to lose their help with family businesses and agriculture). However, the pressure is immense, and they are unsure how to fit into society as Bedouin Israelis or as habitants of unrecognized versus unrecognized villages. The Bagrut exam is approaching and Sara is having a hard time studying. “I have so much in my head. I do not know what [to do] next…” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 4, 2013). Sara feels pressure from their families to adapt to married life in the preserved semi-nomadic functions of an unrecognized village after being accustomed to the lifestyle of living in a designed community in Lakiya.

The sedentarization of formerly nomadic Bedouin is particularly challenging and complicated for women. Although they have access to new academic and economic opportunities, the traditional economies, and social fabric have been fundamentally altered (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2007; Lewando-Hundt, 1984). The preservation and celebration of weaving and soap products being made out of camel milk preserve aspects of traditional economies but the landscape is changing throughout. While this transition
from semi-nomadic to sedentarized has been invigorating and/or traumatic for Bedouin
women the young generation is rapidly adapting. New technology, exposure to education
and urban life has changed the way young men and women communicate. During my
fieldwork there were many instances of “forbidden” love. Young women use technology
to surreptitiously communicate. Malls, the Bedouin market in Beer Sheba and the
colleges and universities become meeting places. Sara and Mo are trying to get to know
one another better through using social media, while their parents debate a dowry. Sara’s
mother wants her to marry after she attends university. Her father is ready for her to be
financially supported by a husband during her studies. Families approve of the education
of Bedouin girls and women more than ever before, yet the economic incentives of
marriage continue to permeate the mindsets of many families. Having children attend a
high caliber school like Ahed is a social status indicator. It also connects families from
unrecognized villages to those in the designed communities.

For Mo and Sarah’s families it is a tremendous achievement to have a child
perform well at a high caliber school like Ahed. However, it is only the initial step in the
choices Ahed students, and graduates, must make. The students of Ahed School have
expressed the pressure awaiting them upon graduation. They have to determine how to
thrive as Bedouin university students, employees, or as wives and new mothers. They are
determining how to assimilate into Israeli society without sacrificing their values or
education.
Safe Spaces for Education

The largest preventive for Bedouin education is access to education, and living in communities that are safe spaces for learning. Bedouin members of the Israeli military and politically active youth fear for the future of Bedouin society. They recognize that physical security is integral to the education of youth. These voices represent the challenge of security and access to education, as well as the complexities of polygamy, political history, aspirations and shadow economies.

The Tracker

Not all families have access to schools like Ahed School, and some parents are fighting for the education they never had. Basir is a registered pastoralist (Israel permits him to move his herds) and moves his sheep and goats from three plots of land throughout the rainy seasons in the Naqab. His current plot is on the edge of a kibbutz where the Jewish farmers grow soybeans and corn and hire his sons to do manual labor when they are in town. He has a good relationship with his Jewish neighbors. He talks about how at one point this plot of land, about an hour northwest of Lakiya, was his tribe’s village until the 1970s when his father opted to move part of the family into the city of Rahat. Basir chose to maintain the nomadic lifestyle of his grandparents and now seeks a balance between the provisions of townships and the nomadic pastoral life.
Basir has served as a tracker for the Israeli army on and off since the late 1970s. As an Arab Israeli, and Bedouin, this is a delicate position to be in. Often Arab Israelis involved in the military feel ostracized by IDF soldiers. They are treated like spies by Jews, and Arab Israelis treat them like traitors for serving in the military (Akesson, 2014). In 2006, during Israel’s war with Lebanon he led two hundred IDF soldiers back from the border through a field of land mines. He believes in serving his country and is considered a war hero. He is also an expert in the traditional medicinal use of desert plants. He was the traditional healer for his brigade during his military days. He felt stuck between serving the country of Israel and having his military brigade concerned that he was a spy, in addition to his Bedouin peers who think he is a traitor to his Arab brothers. As Basir watches his family expand, he is concerned with what challenges they will have to overcome. He has felt caught in between the nomadic lifestyle of his parents and grandparents, and the new technology and urban lifestyle expanding throughout the desert. Basir is trying to continue to live off the land, while providing his children with exposure and understanding of the new opportunities available to them.

Basir has eight kids ranging from ages 12 to 25 years of age. Three of his children have graduated from high school in state schools sponsored for Bedouin. He recently learned about Ahed School from one of his cousins, and he wants his youngest two children to attend. He tries to help them study, and is hoping that at least one of them will get accepted next year. Although he and his family live an hour away from the Ahed

---

53 “While much fewer Negev Bedouins serve in the IDF, an estimated two-thirds of their brethren living in northern Israel serve in the army as elite trackers and scouts along the country’s borders” (Silverman, 2013, para. 13).
School campus “we would make it work”. Basir is a self-taught man and he wants his children to have every opportunity possible. He wants his children to be able to choose between the nomadic lifestyle of his ancestors and the future of Israel in technology, agriculture and medicine. He desperately wants his children to have better access to education.

Basir’s children currently attend state run schools with very low performance rates and a high rate of attrition. He described how teachers come from northern cities [like Tel Aviv and Haifa], to work for a year or two, and they don’t really care or understand about the Bedouin students, and their education. The Bedouin feel judged by outside, inexperienced, temporary teachers who are fulfilling “short term roles so they can get better jobs” (T. Tolley, per communication, May 31, 2013). He would prefer his children to be taught by Bedouin from local communities so that they could express themselves more freely. He explained how increasingly Bedouin are becoming teachers because they want their brethren to be educated by people that understand them, and he hopes that one of his children will also elect to go into education, and that they also share traditional knowledge of the land and their culture so that his children won’t be the last generation to understand the intricacies of the desert.

Basir feels a strong dichotomy as a Bedouin tribesman and a citizen of Israel. He experiences tremendous pressure from his work, family and his tumultuous relationship with the local and national government. While Basir is considered a war hero he is also on the “watch list” of the government because he knows detailed information about the land, military bases and the borders with Egypt, Jordan and Lebanon. He says he is
prohibited to leave the boundaries of Israel and explains that he is considered a security threat because of his intimate knowledge of the defense operations and the desert.

Basir wants to travel and take his family to see other parts of the world but he is not allowed to leave. This frustrates him deeply, but he says he is trying to stay positive and put his efforts into his children’s futures. He has two daughters who are married. One is a second wife and another a third wife. His third son works at a gas station, another works maintenance in a hotel near the Dead Sea. He is worried about one of his daughters whose husband is abusive. She can legally divorce him but then she would never be permitted to see her one-year old son again. His heart is heavy with this relationship and he wishes that this part of Bedouin culture would change. He hopes it will with the new generation of education Bedouin. One of his daughters, who is 15 years old, serves the family and guests tea. Basir describes how she wants to drop out of school and get married to a man in an unrecognized village. She shared how she prefers cooking to school and is intimidated by the new technology. She knows how to live in the traditional goat hair tents, and how to live off the land, but she doesn’t understand why her father strongly wants her to attend Ahed School, and then a university. “I just want her to have choices” he said.

So many of the “choices” in Bedouin societies are made by the fathers, sheiks, and other community leaders. Basir believes in education, and respects the model of Ahed School, which he views as the best option for his children in current Bedouin educational systems.
The Political Youth

Hassan is a former student of Ahed School and a serious education and land rights activist. He shared his perspectives on education and high expectations for himself and his peers: “As a Bedouin young man I expect lot of Bedouin students [to] take care of their education and their future. Even though their parents or grandparents did not go to universities or even to schools, but today our situation is more developed, we have the abilities to study in different places, such as Israeli universities and abroad. Different types of education are available for Bedouins. There are law students, pharmacy or accountant. Many Bedouin students are studying abroad, in Europe countries for example, and most of them are medical students (T. Tolley, per communication, June 5, 2014).

Many Bedouin students of this generation are pursuing medicine because of the high demand in the community as well as the enhanced access and interest in science and technology. Ahed School caters biology and science classes towards those wanting to study agriculture and medicine. The faculty are devoted to giving students practical skills and discussing the needs of the community. Hassan felt that Ahed opened his eyes to different possibilities for his education and gave him pride:

Being a student in Ahed changed different parts in my life. I started to think Oh, here is the only special school for science in the Bedouin community, and I was accepted to it. It made me proud, and gives me a motivation to be an active student in different parts. Also when I was a student in Ahed I had chances to participate in activities that I did not have these chances in other schools. My
parents went to school, to universities too. And also my grandfather went to the university in Italy. In the past years when somebody go to university it is like oh that a modern thing, people have positive thought about him, respect and proudness. And good thing to say is recently also girls are going to universities and colleges in Israel, and abroad too. Bedouin girls did not have the chances to go to universities abroad in the past years (T. Tolley, per communication, June 5, 2014).

Hassan studied in Europe and Canada and is now back living near the Ahed School campus. He is working at a local coffee shop and is applying for university in Tel Aviv. He is encouraging his younger siblings to attend school and helping to instill pride in their education. Hassan believes that education will help him and his siblings thrive in the national and international economies.

**The Graduate**

Eman is one of the first graduates of Ahed School. She was introduced to the high school by her uncle who was one of the founders. Eman joined the very first class in 2009 and was one of the graduates in 2012. Eman is now determining her next steps. She wants to be an elementary school teacher and described her decision making process. A year following graduation she observed her older sister getting married and pregnant. This inspired her to return to university to study to become a teacher. She has 29 brothers and sisters. Her mom is a second wife. Her father travels between the two homes. She has five younger siblings and feels very mature for her age after acting like a second mother
to her siblings. Eman is trying to balance her family obligations and her desire for education.

Eman loved her high school experience even though it was very challenging academically and learning how to function properly in its first year. Because of her skill in the English language Eman was involved in many of the United States Embassy in Tel Aviv’s programs for youth including the Amal English Department and Public Speaking Program, writing groups and the Program on Negotiation (PON) and Youth Negotiators Network (YNN) training.

Eman attended the PON workshop in 2013 and was impressed that the American Embassy in Tel Aviv would support such programs and invite Bedouin students. “We usually are the last people the [Israeli] government wants to invite to a meeting” she said (T. Tolley, per communication October 2, 2013). But she liked the entertainment portion of the event, the singing, the food, and the activities. Eman did not participate in the discussions. “I didn’t feel comfortable. We don’t speak like Jewish do” (T. Tolley, per communication October 2, 2013). However, she appreciated the steps towards peace building and methods of conflict resolution. She shared how in school they receive instruction on basic communication skills but unless they have a nice Jewish teacher they do not know much about how Jewish students feel about them. Nor have they received conflict resolution training.

Eman, and her former teacher Dana, are eager to be involved in more conflict resolution and communication programs. Eman, and her classmate Hassan both participated with an American Jewish exchange program and traveled with students from
California, Segev Shalom and Lakiya for two and a half weeks throughout Jerusalem, Beer Sheva and the desert. Eman and Hassan did not enjoy the program and found it “racist” and entirely pro-Israel. They appreciated the opportunity to see more of the country but found it more isolating than inspiring (T. Tolley, per communication, April 8, 2014). There are many American and Western sponsored exchange programs like this throughout Israel/Palestine. The intentions are positive, but like Birthright programs, the pro-Israel messaging can be overwhelming for people who do not fit the ideals of nationalist concepts of the future of Israel (Feldman, 2011; Pfeffer, 2011).

Ahed School tries to provide students with skills in conflict resolution, negotiation, and English proficiency through programs like PON. Teachers like Dana are hoping that more conflict resolution training will be available in Ahed School’s future. Right now students and faculty are trying to cover the provided government curriculum and exam preparation. There is little free time or creative space in the school schedule. Conflict resolution is perceived as an extracurricular and is now included in the English language and professional development programs. That is the only exposure Eman has had to conflict resolution training outside of the tribal teachings of Sulha which she has heard about but never been a part of.

Eman is an incredibly practical and slightly cynical young woman. She does not want to be a second wife but understands how it was a desirable option for her mother who wanted her own freedoms. She is also intimidated about attending university because of her limited exposure to Jewish students, which became clear during the PON
workshop and celebration. She has had more exposure to American and European Jewish volunteers in Ahed School than with Jewish youth in neighboring villages.

The Non Terrorist

“We are not terrorists” was the first thing Ramzi said to me. While doing introductions in his twelfth grade English class Ramzi made it clear that foreigners should know that he, his peers and his family members are not terrorists. After class I inquired about his statement. Ramzi is the grandson of a local sheik on his mother’s side and a notorious smuggler from the Sinai on his father’s side. He is one of the top performing students at Ahed School and speaks seamless English and Spanish which he learned from watching sitcoms and telenovelas.

Ramzi is hoping to get a scholarship through the U.S. - Middle East Partnership Initiative (MEPI) project and attend university in the United States. He wants to study physics and human rights law so he can create technologies for living sustainably in the desert and to protect his family from further loss of land. Ramzi was one of the students who was arrested for protesting the Prawer Pact in Beer Sheba (July of 2013). He shared that he was in jail and beaten for two days but was released to his father’s care. He says he was lucky to be in jail short term unlike one of his uncles who has been in jail for smuggling for many years in Jordan.

There is limited information about smuggling in the Naqab, unlike the United States, Jordan, or Egypt. Bedouin in other parts of the Middle East and North Africa are notorious for their involvement in shadow economies (Nordstrom, 2004) supplementing
changes in economic opportunity and limited mobility with pastoralism. Many Bedouin men work as truck drivers, mechanics, and small store owners and as manual laborers in cement plants and Jewish farms. Bedouin living in South Sinai and throughout Jordan and Egypt were notorious for moving hashish and a multitude of narcotics throughout the Nile Valley.

Emanuel Marx studied the drug trade and explains how smuggling, during the height of trade in the mid-1960s, constituted approximately 30% of the Bedouin aggregate income (Marx, 2013, p. 90). Evidence of Bedouin smuggling in Israel is limited (or poorly reported). Considering Israel has some of the most patrolled and regulated borders in the world, the possibility of large scale drug smuggling is less likely than in other countries. However, what is interesting about Ramzi’s story is that he wants to demonstrate that he can be a “bad boy” who does not follow the rules. Yet, he wants outsiders to know that he and his family do not want to injure Israel and that he believes in the land rights of unrecognized villages.

The history of regional conflicts with Israel, Lebanon, the Iraq War and the war in Afghanistan have shaped the way youth see where they fit in terms of society, religion, nationalism and politics. Other Ahed School students were reluctant to discuss their perspectives on the local land conflict, or Israeli/Palestinian protracted conflict because they had been beaten and jailed for protesting (T. Tolley, per communication, September 2013; July 2014). However, Ramzi was proud of his protesting and very clear in his messaging and his concern for how he and other Bedouin students are portrayed. At Ahed School he acts as the “rebel” speaking out in class and saying politically controversial
things. Underneath it all, he is a smart student who is ashamed of being perceived just for being Bedouin.

Conclusion

These profiles represent hundreds of people involved in creating Ahed School today. Like anthropologists studying education and Bedouin culture (Davidson, 1996; Lavie, 1991) I found that the best way to understand this unique school is by looking at the people that comprise it, and the tensions surrounding it. By analyzing what the individuals of Ahed School are struggling with, and what they aspire to do, the Conflict Analysis and Resolution (CAR) field can learn from the role of education in marginalized communities engaged in protracted conflict. The presentation of this research is inspired by Lavie’s lyrical allegories of Bedouin identities. The voices portrayed are ones of hope, concern, confusion and curiosity during a unique time in the history of Bedouin in the Naqab and in the field of education and conflict resolution.

Returning to one of the initial research questions: How does Ahed School manage to flourish in the midst of the overarching land conflict locally, and nationally? The interviews and data indicate that being a student of Ahed School does influence the cultural identity of Bedouin students because it exposes them to new frameworks of thought such as debate, Israeli technology, physics, and Hebrew, Arabic and English classes. At Ahed School students are given a forum to express their ideas, thoughts, cultural traditions and curiosities.
The literature and data show that young Bedouin women are having an extraordinarily challenging time negotiating the expanding opportunities (such as higher education, and job prospects) and the traditional power structure of the Bedouin families. First off, Ahed School is unique in that the students that attend have families that have applied and paid for them to attend. The families have made a commitment for their children to attend, representing a new generation of Bedouin families that value and financially support their children in their education.

If Bedouin youth are allowed the choice of education, work, and marriage, they have multiple challenges to negotiate, most of which are presented to them from the time they begin taking Bagrut exams, to when they complete their education. As the interviews demonstrated, students must choose between:

- Whom to marry (with the approval and support of the family, and with polygamy on the rise);
- How to get accepted into universities and colleges;
- Where to attend higher education (Bedouin colleges in Beer Sheva, university in a major Israeli institution, Jordan, North America or Europe);
- What to study (Ahed School focused on science and technology but certain jobs like teaching or nursing are more socially acceptable for Bedouin women);
- Where to live long-term post education (unrecognized villages, designated communities, or integrated cities. Where a family lives is dependent on
where the potential groom is from and where there is land available or room within a current paternal home); and

- How to navigate the multiple identities and dual consciousness of being an educated modern Bedouin woman working in a conservative, religious, patriarchal society.

These challenges are common for young people around the world. However, the pressures for Bedouin are concentrated when a Bedouin youth finishes high school and approaches the common age of marriage, around twenty years old (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2007; Kenan & Burck, 2002).

While there are more possibilities available to Bedouin youth, they do not feel they have the skills or confidence to navigate Israeli society-at-large. The women who trail blazed before them struggled to balance their dual consciousness and the alienation they experience. They have had to choose between love and careers, and between the tribe and contemporary urban society. The choices they make will contribute to the future of their families, conflicts their communities face and the prospect of increased education, equality and peacebuilding in the Naqab. Although this dual consciousness is challenging, they have agency through literacy, job training and knowledge and skills in science and technology that were not available to their parents and grandparents. They also have a faculty and staff that care about their future education. Their success is due to the quality of their education, the support their families have given them, and the new opportunities they have for their futures.
One of the major focuses of Ahed School is preparing Bedouin youth for higher education and the workforce. Founders want students to be empowered, politically aware and capable of social change without being in danger of judicial repercussions. This question of entering higher education while preserving cultural traditions and ethnic and religious identity has been posed throughout the Bedouin and academic communities. Janine Givati Teerling (2007) analyzes obstacles towards social change in higher education for Bedouin and the transformation from mobile industry to sedentarization and the need to overcome state control to initiate community transformation and empowerment. The story of the founder of Ahed School and the dedication of parents to education through Ahed School demonstrates this. Families and faculty wanted to take education for their families into their own hands and not rely on the state. Ahed founder Suliman, the weaver Hala, and Dana the English teacher each expressed this tension between self-government and the need for access to quality education programs. The founders of Ahed learned from their own struggles for education and change in culture and wanted to raise the quality of education and opportunities for Bedouin youth from both unrecognized villages and the settlements (T. Tolley, per communication, June 2012; October 2013).

Not only is there tension between inhabitants in unrecognized villages and government officials who want the land for Jewish settlements, but also between the generations of Bedouin as well. The struggle for safe spaces for education is real for Bedouin youth. As we saw with Mo and Sara, Mo does not want to continue living in the unrecognized village, he wants to be in a more international community in the Dead Sea.
His potential bride, Sara, does not know if she will be able to go from living in the designated village of Lakiya to an unrecognized village where the land is insecure. Other students like Ramzi want to protect the rights of his family members in unrecognized villages. The profiles that comprise Ahed School share insights into the many sides of this complex situation. One of founders of Ahed School moved from an unrecognized village into the Lakiya settlement as a child, and he is negotiating with Israeli land authorities to renew the 99 year lease on his Lakiya land, while advocating for the rights of those in unrecognized villages. He was one of the main advocates for supporting transportation and access to Ahed School for students from unrecognized villages that qualified to attend.

New academic and educational opportunities are important for young Bedouin. Over 60% of the Naqab Bedouin are under 25 years of age, living in a time with tremendous tension between the State of Israel and Bedouin and Palestinian identity and rights. These students are in a canyon between two terrains; the traditional Bedouin culture and a world of nomadic livelihoods and rights, and the hi-tech world of Israel and denomadatization of Israel. This balance between marginalization and empowerment is evident for Bedouin youth. They fight to maintain their culture and gain rights, while trying to succeed in a society where they are a minority. Ahed School is providing a bridge between this economic and cultural separation. The school’s “dream in the making” wants to support both the new global economy and the traditions and identities that are valuable to the students and their families.
Analyzing Bedouin education systems as both forms of demarginalization and assimilation are important to the field of CAR and international development. The confluence between traditions and new technology is transparent throughout all levels of society. Changes in media, communication styles and access to education have all evolved rapidly for Bedouin students who have attended Ahed School. Hala uses social media to advocate for her non-profit work. Leena, Sara and Reem find ways to communicate with their friends and engage romantic interests through Facebook and Viber without the observation of their families. Mohammed, Ramzi and Ibrahim have found social media sites as platforms for their political and educational interests. Ramzi frequently uses Twitter and Facebook to discuss land conflict, Israeli politics and the status of displaced people in Gaza and Syria. Media and communication styles became evident in the stories and interviews of people surrounding Ahed School. Questions of careers and alienation also surfaced in this transforming time of development. Students want to be prepared for the complex future of being Bedouin in Israel/Palestine. Students and faculty want youth to be educated and skillful as they enter adulthood and the next levels of academia, family structures and the economy. Ahed School excels in science and technology and collaborates with international projects and the Amal Network to provide students with more communication and negotiation skills to build confidence and agency.

The following chapter presents and analyzes the Program on Negotiation (PON) trainings that Ahed School has been involved with since 2011. The case study of the
“Negotiations in Practice” training demonstrates the exposure students have to theories and practice of conflict resolution and negotiation.
CHAPTER SIX:
NEGOTIATION IN PRACTICE

Introduction

This chapter serves as an analysis of twenty Ahed School students and two faculty members who have participated in Harvard University’s Program on Negotiation (PON) conflict and negotiation training in the academic school year of 2012-2013. One of the reasons Ahed School is considered such a success by Israeli political leaders, parents, and faculty is not only due to high test scores and physics awards, but also to the involvement in internationally renowned trainings and collaborations. Participating in the PON trainings impacted integral voices of Ahed School. Hassan, Mo, Eman and Dana all participated in the negotiation trainings and Ahed School wants to continue to be a part of the PON program.

This chapter analyzes the impact of the PON workshops and what students gain from the Harvard model of negotiation. The following segment provides a background to PON and Ahed School’s involvement with the “Negotiations in Practice” conference which looks at conflict scenarios and trains high school students in negotiation and conflict resolution. The chapter additionally explores the Harvard model of negotiation (Getting to Yes), student responses to the trainings and the cultures of negotiation.
Program on Negotiation

One of the forefront organizations in international mediation and conflict resolution training is the Program on Negotiation (PON) consortium hosted by Harvard University. It began as a research project at Harvard’s Law School in 1983 and is now supported by a network of faculty, staff and students from Harvard University, Massachusetts Institute of Technology and Tufts University (Program on Negotiation, 2015). PON offers paid courses for teachers, business professionals, attorneys and students. They work with governments, organizations, and groups to help train negotiation and conflict resolution concepts and skills.

This “Harvard” model of negotiation is currently one of the most popular styles implemented in schools and businesses around the world. It is influential in allowing parties to identify, discuss, and re-evaluate interests. This model is helpful in looking at interest-based conflicts (Avruch, 2004) and is based on the Getting to Yes mediation philosophy of Fisher, Ury and Patton (1987). The PON style of negotiation is the most exposure select Ahed School students receive in conflict resolution and negotiation in their formal education. To celebrate the knowledge and achievements of high school students trained in the PON style, a congratulatory conference brought together students, politicians, facilitators and peace builders from throughout the Middle East in the fall of 2013.
“Negotiations in Practice” and the Young Negotiators Network

On October 1, 2013, thirteen female and seven male senior students from Ahed School were invited to participate in the “Negotiations in Practice” conference. Beginning with a pilot in 2011, the PON has collaborated with the Amal Network, and the Office of Public Affairs of the U.S. Embassy in Tel Aviv to provide workshops between Arab and Jewish youth to work together to learn the “art of negotiation and conflict resolution” (Young Negotiators Network, 2014, para. 5). The pilot program originated with six schools. It has evolved into an annual conference which is now additionally sponsored by the Middle East Peace Institute (MEPI), in collaboration with Ono Academic College, Amal Network and Harvard’s PON. The 2013 event was the first celebration of this expanded scale. Because of the unrest in Gaza in 2014, the second conference was postponed, but PON and Amal are still conducting small in school workshops and hope to reunite in the fall of 2015 for another celebration.

The “Negotiations in Practice” conference was an accumulation of three years of PON workshops and focused on celebrating the 2012-2013 participants. Ahed School began with the pilot program facilitated by PON’s Senior Fellow, Dr. Shula Gilad, who has continued to expand the program and host the annual meetings. Students are selected by their interest in the program, their proficiency of the English language, and their engagement in Ahed School programs and Amal Network programs such as the debate and book clubs (which PON leaders Drs. Tal and Gilad also facilitate). Dr. Gilad also leads the PON’s Middle East Negotiation Initiative (MENI) which participants of
“Negotiations in Practice” become a part of and have opportunities for networking, and access to scholarships and cultural exchange programs.

The program attracts a diverse group of politicians, diplomats and members of the military. James Rider, the cultural attaché of the American Embassy, a presenter at the conference, believes this program is one of the best for the Embassy to support because connecting Israeli youth, and promoting collaboration between different populations in Israel are part of the predominant initiatives of the Embassy. Jordan’s Former Chief of Intelligence, Retired General Masour Abu Rachid, explained that the students in the Young Negotiators Network (YNN) are the “leaders of the future” and that is why he is eager to share his negotiation experiences. The former adviser to the President of Israel, retired General Baruch Spiegel, believes it is important to promote hope within these young people (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013; (Ziri, 2013). Each of these speakers, in addition to famous musicians and negotiators, came together to conduct a day of inspiration and celebration for the future leaders of Israel.

The October conference was a celebration of workshops held from 2012-2013 focusing on the following subjects between twelve Jewish Israeli and Arab Israeli high schools54:

- The role of trust in negotiation
- Tensions between relationships and substance

---

54 These schools included Lady Davis Multidisciplinary School Tel Aviv and Taibeh Multidisciplinary School; Daburiyeh Multidisciplinary School and Naharia Multidisciplinary School for Science and Arts; Ahed School (Ahad Multidisciplinary School for Excellence in Science) and Ramot Multidisciplinary School in the Name of Neuman, Beer Sheva; Baka Al Garbiya Science and Technology School and Shevach Moffet Multidisciplinary School; Ramleh Orthodox School and Petach Tikva Bet Multidisciplinary School; Comprehensive High School in Abu Gosh and Boyer High School in Jerusalem.
• Value-creation versus value-division
• Positions versus interests
• Creative option generation
• Alternatives and Best Alternative to Negotiated Agreement (BATNA)
• Standards of Fairness
• Perceptions

The workshops bring students together across the region, and religions, to explore these concepts over a two-day period. Each workshop begins with two schools initially collaborating (held in English), and then all students reunite in the fall to celebrate their findings and experiences. They also experience workshops and celebrations involving musical celebrities and culinary gatherings. Their instructors (typically the school’s English teachers) also experience negotiation training independent, as well as alongside their students.

To maintain the teachings from the workshops, each student participant is automatically included in the Young Negotiators Network (YNN), a program designed to develop and train Israeli high school students in mediation and negotiation skills, providing a “shared language for creative problem-solving” (Young Negotiators Network, 2014, para. 5). The YNN helps students access information on such topics as scholarships, higher education, and job opportunities, in addition to negotiation and conflict resolution materials. Most of the students participating in the PON workshops begin when they are high school juniors and the “Negotiations in Practice” conference is held the beginning of their senior year when students are trying to determine their post high school steps. The YNN also hosts an online forum, through Facebook, to share
videos, files, pictures and stories, and students are included in the MEPI alumni group and in other special events hosted by the US Embassy in Tel Aviv.55

The 2013 celebration included keynote speakers, workshops, alumni opportunities and music performances. A primary keynote speaker was Ambassador Gabriela Shalev. She was the first female ambassador to the United Nations (UN) and currently serves as President of Ono Academic College. She described her mission: to change the social atmosphere and change Israeli society. Ambassador Shalev’s goal was to see Jewish and Arab youth excel by trying to bring equality of opportunities to everyone. Ambassador Shalev stated that young people hold the power and opportunity to change the social fabric of Israel.

In the mid-1970s Ambassador Shalev participated in a workshop influenced by Robert Fisher’s book Getting to Yes. She stated that Professor Fisher’s book served her in her academic teaching for a very long time, and influenced her styles of negotiation and communication. She was pleased the American Embassy in Israel is supporting the “Negotiations in Peace” program because “we know in these days and history, America is now and historically our most important ally” (T.Tolley, per observation, October 1, 2013).

Ambassador Shalev discussed gender dynamics and politics, and shared her personal story of her life as a female, wife, partner, mother, teacher, and friend, and how she always had to rely, subconsciously, on her diplomatic negotiation skills. “Even (with) my kids, in order to raise them I have to be diplomatic” (T.Tolley, per observation,

---

55 Facebook link https://www.facebook.com/groups/youngnegotiatorsnetwork/?ref=br_tf.
October 1, 2013). Ambassador Shalev shared her challenges at the UN between 2008-2010, when peace talks were stymied and she called upon her negotiation skills to discover appropriate ways to approach friends, allies, and representatives of different countries for support, and to discover their interests and possible room for negotiation.

Ambassador Shalev continued her session with a question and answer period with the students. She was asked about her political experiences and her role as Ambassador. She described how she was appointed by the Kadima under the leadership of Prime Minister Ehud Olmert and Justice Minister Tzipi Livni. The political leadership for Ambassador Shalev then changed under Prime Minister Netanyahu and Minister of Foreign Affairs Lieberman. Students were interested in her role as Ambassador especially during a time where leadership changed. One student asked who she feels she works for. She responded with: “The only boss I have is the people of Israel. An ambassador represents the county, the people. Our vision is to have two states living side by side with peace and prosperity” (T.Tolley, per observation, October 1, 2013).

It was fascinating to see her promote a two-state solution to this integrated audience of American Embassy representatives, and Jewish, Arab and Druze students, alongside international academics. Her speech prompted the question to Bedouin and other Arab Israeli students: what would two states mean for Bedouin who are Israeli citizens? One of the Ahed School female students asked Ambassador Shalev, “Could an Arab Israeli woman become ambassador to the United States?” (T. Tolley, per

56 Kadima means “forward” government and is the centrist and liberal political party which was the largest political party in the Knesset following the 2006 elections, but after the 2013 elections has become the smallest in the Knesset)
communication, October 1, 2013)? Shalev responded diplomatically: “I was hoping to be replaced by a woman. They knew I was only committed to two years but it took a whole year to find a replacement. They found a very seasoned diplomat, but he is a man…” (T.Tolley, per observation, October 1, 2013).

Ambassador Shalev continued to explain how the world, as she perceives it, is a world where we live in negotiation, “I hope we see soon with the peace talks, the only way we can reach peace is negotiating, by sticking to the table, talking to each other, put everything on the table, take steps to show we are sincere. I don't want to blame any party for the lack of peace proposals. I hope now, with a little help from our American friends, in this troubled area, I hope we can find peace with our Arab neighbors” (T.Tolley, per observation, October 1, 2013). Ambassador Shalev again promoted her ideas about the two-state solution to the Arab Israeli and Jewish Israeli youth under the umbrella of the US Embassy in Israel.

Ambassador Shalev’s speech during the PON session, and the entire theme of the gathering, echoed traditional Western negotiation styles outlined by Getting to Yes. The next section provides a brief background on the teachings of Fisher, Ury, and Patton and how it has shaped the pedagogy of negotiation in interest-based conflict.

**Getting to Yes**

Throughout the Program on Negotiation, Roger Fisher, William Ury, and Bruce Patton’s seminal work Getting to Yes: Negotiating Agreement Without Giving In was referred to by nearly every speaker, and the negotiation framework was the foundation
for the project. The goal of this model is to get the resolution you are looking for without giving in or bargaining over positions. The method of this style of negotiation, and primary principle, in *Getting to Yes* is to separate the people/population involved with the negotiation, and the issues at hand. Negotiators are taught to focus on interests rather than positions, to create outcomes/options for mutual gain and to utilize objective criteria for decision making (Fisher, Ury, & Patton, 1987).

Fisher, et al. also provide tips for negotiation when there are power differentials and when less than savory tactics are utilized to achieve goals. While this technique has been valuable in many conflicts, and is a convenient tool for third parties with no personal engagement with the issues, it is challenging for parties active in conflict to relate to. Fisher et al. describe the challenges in negotiating substantive issues when relationships and emotions are entangled into the conflict. For Bedouin students, some of the conflict examples became personal and emotional and not solely about a conflict interest and issue.

Fisher et al. encourage parties to imagine what it is like walking in the path, and being in the position of the other. This is valuable to the PON participants because it allows them to imagine the possible lives of others, and then talk to the others about their actual experiences and perspectives. Another level of this negotiation style is understanding one another’s fears and imagined outcomes, and avoiding blame. Students in PON often recite what grievances they have heard from their parents, community members, schools and news, but the session provided one of the few opportunities for integrated exposure of different religious groups and ethnic heritages in Israel/Palestine.
The workshop used case studies to encourage students to brainstorm and apply their negotiation skills. Ahed Students joined workshops discussing conflict scenarios surrounding the discovery of natural gas and the Sakhnin/Misgav land conflict scenarios and shared their interpretations of the experience. The negotiation workshops are important because they represent the conflict resolution case studies and skills that are introduced to students, and the examples are compared to real life conflict scenarios that influence students’ lives. This kind of training is the only conflict resolution experience many of the students have been exposed to.

**Negotiation in Practice Conflict Scenarios**

The “Negotiation in Practice” conference included conflict scenario workshops for students on real life conflict dynamics. Professional negotiators and field area experts facilitated the two hour workshops to expose participants to a variety of local and regional conflicts that are in the process of being mediated. Students were divided into case study workshops to continue using the negotiation techniques they obtained in their previous in-school training.

**Conflict Workshop One: Israeli Gas Opportunity Scenario**

Students from Ahed School, along with an Amal Jewish high school from Dimona, participated in role simulations such as “Negotiating in the Israeli Gas Opportunity” for the morning session. This session was led by Dr. Dina Wir (a business
negotiation professor), and a gas industry expert couple, Noor and Amir Foster. First, the facilitator, Dr. Wir, encouraged students to share how the PON training had personally influenced them. Few students offered to share other than “tools” and “fun, especially with friends” (T.Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013) so Dr. Wir continued to promote the benefits of negotiation. The Fosters were introduced and explained the current status of natural gas in Israel. This case study was presented to demonstrate the conflict factors and stakeholders. Students were engaged at the end of the session to explore how they would address aspects of the conflict scenario.

To provide the background of the conflict, Amir shared a PowerPoint slideshow and explained how, in 2000, geologists found natural gas in Israel, and citizens began to consume the natural gas. Prior to that, Israelis used imported gas, coal and basalt for their energy, however these materials were polluting the environment. Amir then shared how natural gas is the cleanest fuel option (other than solar, water, or other alternative energy uses). He explained how, in 2010, Israel found an enormous amount of gas and the nation didn’t know how to develop it and lacked the infrastructure for it. They explored how to use it domestically, but did not know how to export it. Amir and Noor emphasized that this was the largest amount of gas discovered in 10 years in the entire world, approximately 960 billion cubic meters of gas, at the Leviathan reserve at the bottom of the sea.⁵⁷

Next, Noor and Amir presented this scenario as a conflict between environmentalists and oil companies. They laid out the debate between what development

⁵⁷ To learn more about Israel’s natural gas discovery read Ethan Bronner’s piece. http://www.nytimes.com/2010/12/31/world/middleeast/31leviathan.html?_r=0 (Bronner, 2010).
versus conservation costs for Israeli citizens, and how the decision lies within the hands of the government. They then presented the government overview which includes the energy ministry, finance department, environmental policy, and internal production costs. The conflicting parties include multiple government offices, oil companies, and numerous environmental groups.

The Fosters then synthesized the complex negotiation into three major parties: government branches, and environmental and oil companies. Next, they presented the geopolitical groups of the natural gas industry, and conflict factors such as how Israel would become a competitor to Russia for gas, and that Europeans would prefer to buy Israeli gas even for a higher price. What the Knesset is deliberating is the need for foreign gas extractors and the risk that if they come to Israel they might affect their relationships with Arab countries like Saudi Arabia and Iraq. The next conflict factor, time, was then presented. Amir described how every month Israel does not extract gas, it loses billions of dollars on potential revenue.

He then expanded on the debate regarding the export issue in Israel and how people (like Americans and Europeans) object to exporting gas from Israel since it is a politically unstable country. The Fosters explained further history on the gas negotiation, and quoted John F. Kennedy saying: “Let us never negotiate out of fear, but let us never fear to negotiate” (Fallows, 2013). They then shared how Israel’s neighbor and enemy, Lebanon, disputed the rights to the gas, claiming the deposits were in Lebanese water, and presented their case to the United Nations. The United States backed Lebanon’s
proposal claiming rights to the oil deposits, and Israel submitted a separate proposal to the United Nations (Ravid, 2011)

The facilitators briefly touched on the 2011 protests against drilling, which gained momentum alongside Israel’s national Occupy Movement protests requesting better education, a lower cost of living, more natural gas, a balance to reserve energy and be independent and to reserve some resources to develop other energy sources. These goals were the interests that the facilitators presented to students. There are further complex levels to this case study, including the contested territory and propositions to drill in Golan Heights, and other contested lands, and heightened tension between Israel and neighboring countries additionally fighting for drilling rights as shown in the International Relations and Security Network’s (ISN) map below.
The facilitators continued to encourage the students to consider the importance of distinguishing between position and interests. They then encouraged students to map the interests of conflicting parties, such as the companies, to gain an understanding of the conflicting interests.

The Fosters suggested how different parties might be more inclined to hear different sides of the story if interests or profits can be shared. For example, if the government makes money on drilling in Israel, so will its citizens. The facilitators showed how, in this case study, negotiation can be most successful when it seems mutually beneficial. “In order to enlarge the pie, I have to think of common interests so we can help each other and create a better world together” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013).
The session also invited students to find the pyramids of people that influence a conflict, and to provide demonstrations of trust. They shared that it is important to see one another as a real person and acknowledge fears, concerns, and aspiration. They also encouraged questions that typically elicit positive responses such as: “If I find a solution that will enable you to ABC, but I do it in a different way, is that okay with you?” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013). This is what the facilitators interpret as the way to “get to yes”.

The facilitators encouraged students to discuss the conflict scenario and possible negotiation tactics. However, they did not allot time for students to discuss in small groups or to reflect on the presented information. Students were expecting to engage with the conflict scenario and to represent sides of the conflict to practice their negotiation skills acquired in the two day workshops however they were not given the opportunity in this workshop. The facilitators asked the full class of students to share what they learned in the workshop. A Jewish male student shared that he learned about "thinking outside the box, looking for other situations" (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013). A female Jewish student offered "if we put ourselves in other people's shoes we can find solutions" (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013).

Ahed students were reluctant to share their opinions on this negotiation example. Out of the approximately sixty students in the room, one third were from Ahed School, and the others from Jewish schools. The majority of the girls from Ahed gathered towards the back of the class, while the boys sat towards the front. They sat together as a group, but in the same row as Jewish students. At the end of the session, Reem, an Ahed
female student introduced in the last chapter, spoke up for the first time about what she learned from the day, “if we don't negotiate we will definitely lose” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013). This point was particularly powerful because the following case study students participated in was an example of the land conflict in northern Israel which is relevant to what current Ahed School students are faced with.

**Conflict Workshop Two: The Sakhnin/Misgav Land Conflict Scenario**

One of the case studies from the Negotiation in Practice conference included the Sakhnin and Misgav land conflict in Northern Israel. The session was facilitated by two urban planners and negotiators personally invested in the conflict. One facilitator, and former George Mason University Professor, Dr. Hussein Tarabeih is an Arab Israeli who has been very active in promoting the rights of Arab communities in Israel. The other facilitator was Dafna Sternberg Ben Baruch, a Jewish land planner who has worked as a mediator with international environmental conflicts for decades. She is also Director of the Joint Center for Strategic Regional Planning at “Neighbors – for Joint Development in the Galil,” working with regional councils (including Misgav) to achieve agreements for social and environmental justice programs (PON 2013).

Tarabeih and Baruch are both urban planners as well as facilitators. Their goals for the case study was to give students the historical background of this conflict and to think about negotiation responses and different approaches to solving conflict. They gave an extensive background and laid out root causes of the land conflict which students were able to divest, analyze and relate to. This section shares how the facilitators demonstrated
the scenario. They presented the history of the land conflict in this region of northern Israel in the Galilee area. Before the establishment of Israel in 1948, Sakhnin was a traditionally Arab community near Galilee and became a focused area for Jewish settlement with one third of the population Bedouin. As Jewish settlers increased in population, so did the tension with Arab neighbors. The facilitators believe the conflict is a microcosm of Arabs versus Jews in the Middle East, and explained how it has evolved in the last fifteen years.

In October of 2000, the second Intifada began. Riots unleashed as Ariel Sharon visited the Haram al-Sharif (the third most holy shrine in Islam at the Dome of the Rock, also known as Temple Mount which was destroyed in AD70) in what is now Arab East Jerusalem (Goldenberg, 2000). Sharon’s presence was seen as a massive insult to Palestinians because of his involvement in the 1982 massacre when Palestinians were killed in a Lebanese refugee camp (Goldenberg, 2000). Riots throughout Israel/Palestine escalated as did the tension in this small area of Sakhnin and Misgav. Sakhnin is the original Muslim side of the town and Misgav is considered the Jewish.

The facilitators explained how there are 54 regional councils in Israel/Palestine. Each regional council includes a few small villages in their jurisdiction. The Arabs in Israel constitute 20% of the population and Arabs living in the center of Galilee are the majority. One third of the population of Misgav are Bedouin Arabs. As the population grows, laws are put into place to limit construction. Villages are not allowed to be bigger than 350 families. The challenge is that this population of Sakhnin/Misgav is rapidly growing and there are major discrepancies between infrastructure and socio, economic
rates between the divided cities. On the Misgav side the socio-economic level is a 7 (out of 10) while on Sakhnin, the Arab side, receives a socio-economic rating of 2 (Baruch and Tarabeih, 2013).

The Sakhnin Municipality is a self-governing city hosting about 30,000 residents with an annual population growth of three %. In Israel/Palestine a village with a population of more than 20,000 is considered a city. Sakhnin is poor and in order to support the growing and existing population needs homes, schools, an improved economy, job opportunities and small businesses all need to grow. The city needs sanitation systems, clean water, and ways to eradicate pollution, but the city is unable to grow. Outside the city is mostly private land, which belongs to Jewish families. And surrounding Sakhnin is the city of Misgav. The city of Sakhnin and the regional council asked Misgav for land for schools. Misgav declined, and recommended using private land (which is mostly used for farming and animals) (Baruch and Tarabeih, 2013).

The facilitators shared how residents of Sakhnin feel trapped. They are surrounded by military bases, a nature reserve, and private property that owners will not sell. Arrabe is the only section where Sakhnin can widen in the north, and it has been a section of Misgav for many years (Baruch and Tarabeih, 2013). Baruch and Tarabeih explained how there is no cooperation now between the governments and tension is continuing to escalate. They talked with students about ways that this conflict could potentially be resolved. They had ideas to build a bilingual school between the towns. The first integrated school was built in Kibbutz Eshbal as part of the Hand in Hand network. They have four other schools. One of them is in Jerusalem where extremist Jews
burned a first grade classroom in December 2014 (The Media Line, 2015). The Eshbal School goes from first to sixth grade. There is another elementary school in Kfar Kara, an Arab village in lower Galilee, and there is a pre-school in Jaiia, and one in Jaffa. The Hand in Hand schools employ both Jewish and Muslim teachers, and the program hopes to expand (Ibid, 2015).

Baruch and Tarabeih prompted students with other ideas for promoting peace. Tarabeih explained how “The only thing the two towns share is shit through the sewage systems” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013). He continued by demonstrating how the Joint Center for Planning and Development responds to the needs of the communities through enhancing:

- Communication
- Cooperation through building trust
- Find interests/needs
- Common interests (industrial zones - jobs), develop green area in Sakhnin valley which is now a dump to Broader Valley

(Baruch and Tarabeih, 2013).

The regional councils aimed to take mayors and municipality representatives to Jordan to help them negotiate, and are still in the process of identifying the needs of both cities.

Tarabeih encouraged students to focus on how people in the contested zone use land together, rather than to focus on who owns it. He shared that to solve any problem in the world recognition is a necessity. Tarabeih explained how stakeholders and their positions function and gave an example of threats community members received such as
arson of farms and sewage dumping. He then presented the potential of sulha to bring people together to discuss conflict at these times. He shared how sulha usually occurs after violence and is used to shuttle diplomacy, then arbitration, and brings together a meeting of community leaders, elders and the Jaha (sulha committee in Arabic). He explained how environmental Sulha can be implemented to prevent violence.

Environmental sulha is used in shuttle diplomacy and leads to consensus-building. They include the Jaha, a religious scholar, a sulha committee member, an environmental planner, an expert in urban planning (livestock farming) and other stakeholders and professionals.  

Tarabeih shared how in the court system parties talk with the judge about what happened, and perceptions of the conflict. In sulha negotiation the goal is to preempt conflict. The facilitators then discussed with students possibilities for negotiation. They had ideas to buy off the land, and offer new land in a land swap, and students became excited about the possibilities, as this seemed like a case study where there was hope for resolution (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013).

Bedouin students were able to relate to this workshop much more than the Israeli Gas crisis. The conflict mirrors the situation in the Naqab and while it is different than the situation with unrecognized villages, it resonates with the growth limitations of the Bedouin city Rahat, and the problems of infrastructure within each community. They identified with Tarabeih and his colleagues and the perspective that “The situation facing

---

58 Shuttle diplomacy refers to mediated communication or by having an outside or third party intermediary between parties in a dispute (Fey & Ramsay, 2010).
59 Taribeh has written extensively about sulha and peacemaking. Refer to “Towards the Implementation of Sulha as a Cultural Peacemaking Method for Managing and Resolving Environmental Conflicts Among Arab Palestinians in Israel” (Tarabeih, Shmueli, & Khamaisi, 2009).
Arab society in Israel is complex, involving modernization within geopolitical conflict between the state and its Arab citizens” (Tarabeih, Shmueli, & Khamaisi, 2009, p. 56). Ahed students were encouraged to know that other communities were also trying to find a way to expand as a society while maintaining positive relationships with their neighbors. However, they were not inspired by the limited outcomes Sakhnin experienced. Sakhnin continues to struggle for access to schools and increased infrastructure in the city. Levels of unemployment are high, as is poverty and violence.

The stories of violence during the October 2000 Intifada also resonated with the Ahed students and the turbulence they experienced during protests against the Prawer Pact. There are multiple parallels between Sakhnin/Misgav and unrecognized Bedouin villages in the Naqab. Both Ahed students and teachers participating in PON recognized this connection. “This is the same as it as at home” shared Eman when comparing the Sakhnin experience to the situation in the Naqab (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013). Ahed students were able to relate to both the struggles of the northern land conflict and to the proposed mediation practices. They kept returning to the similarities with their local land conflict because that has shaped their experience as students (some of them are from unrecognized villages), as the children of activists and as members of a school that advocates for Bedouin self-governance and agency through education.

**Participant Responses to Conflict Scenario Workshops**

As the conference came to a close, the Ahed students, English teachers and I discussed the day’s events. The students had mixed reactions to the workshops. In the
morning session the majority of the students were unable to identify with the gas conflict scenario because they were not able to imagine themselves being stakeholders in the discussion. Ramzi recognized the financial gain Israel would achieve if the government receives full drilling rights. He was also unsure of the environmental impact of the drilling and what the side effects would be in the Mediterranean Sea should oil wash onshore. None of the students were able to propose a method of negotiation or problem solving. “The Knesset will get as much as it can” shared Hazna, a senior female student (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013). Students felt largely disillusioned with the discussions on the desire for gas because they did not have the same values placed on the scenario as they did the land conflict.

Students were more engaged with discussing the land conflict scenario of Sahknin/Misgav. They understood Taribeh’s suggestion of using sulha in environmental conflict negotiation. The English teacher, Dana, thought students were better able to empathize with this situation because it was similar to what they are experiencing in the Naqab. They also saw the multiple challenges in legal and negotiation practices that have taken place between Bedouin rights activists and Knesset land officials.

Ahed Students have heard, and witnessed, the negotiation efforts of their fathers and grandfathers in the land conflict in the Naqab. Eman, Mo, Basir, and Nasreen are all children of Bedouin land activists. Eman and Nasreen’s fathers witnessed negotiations fail\textsuperscript{60} and students are aware of the challenges of conflict regionally in the Naqab and in the Palestinian territories. Ahed students and staff recognize that the desire for improved

\textsuperscript{60} This will be discussed in the upcoming Consensus Building section.
communication skills and agency within the Bedouin community is why Ahed founders like Suliman and Jihad have worked so hard to advocate for Bedouin education and rights (T. Tolley, per communication June 2012 and May 2014). Bedouin activists and advocates have written petitions, gone to court, brought upon lawsuits, and protested. Protesting and legal actions have been the most productive means in reshaping the conversation (Ras, 2011; Smith, 2014).

Although students have been disillusioned with the negotiation process for freedom of unrecognized villages, the workshop sessions helped students recognize that they must be a part of the conversation. They also came to acknowledge that education systems like Hand in Hand bilingual school and Ahed School are attempts at peacebuilding. They were additionally interested in revisiting the sulha concept. Bedouin leaders such as Shiek Hamis Mahmud Abu Salluk, a sulha maker in the West Bank, as well as other Bedouin communities in Israel/Palestine (Pely, 2008).

The sulha ritual is important to Bedouin families, and it signifies peace and forgiveness and the process of dispute resolution. The process is different than typical mediation processes, especially that once participants commit to the process, they are expected to accept the outcome (Pely, 2008). Although there are variations within regions, clans, and tribes, sulha processes are ultimately designed to gain resolution within the clan/group including addressing past grievances attached to the conflict. This limits the tendency of conflicts to gain momentum and evolve into additional disputes. Confidentiality, neutrality of intervener/committee/Jaha are also expected within the sulha tradition.
The PON workshop on land conflict acknowledged the importance of culture, context, and different mediation styles in a way that Ahed School students could identify. The Sahknin/Misgav workshop also provided a glimpse at the narratives different parties had in the conflict situation. Former PON Director, Sara Cobb, points to the importance of narratives in negotiation and how positioning, and the way the parties see themselves, and others, contributes to the contractibility of conflict (Cobb, 2006). Human rights organizations such as Adalah attempt to represent the values, and interests, of Arab Israelis through negotiation, and legal justice programs. However, for many Bedouin, the Knesset has lost its legitimacy, and perception of justice (Ras, 2012; Smith, 2014; Yiftachel, 2006b). The PON workshops have the potential to give students new language and negotiation skills to represent their cultures, identities, interests and values through business opportunities, legal cases and sulha. It provides students with language and skills to negotiate the tensions they experience through education and conflict. It also continues the struggle between experiences of alienation and acceptance into Israeli society at large. The following section presents responses from participants and how the full conference impacted the people engaged.

Responses to the Overall “Negotiations in Practice” Conference

The entire “Negotiations in Practice” conference was videotaped, celebrated in social media and on the Young Negotiators Network (YNN) and Embassy websites. YouTube videos were made and students signed media releases to participate in the event. A variety of responses were collected from students about their experience. And
when sharing their opinions in public, they had very positive responses. After collaborating and interacting with students from other schools, a young Bedouin student shared that she was “a little bit afraid of what I was going to see, but now I feel more comfortable than I was in the past” (Young Negotiators Network, 2013, sec. 5). Another student sounded surprised to discover that the students she collaborated with held similar values. “I found they are pretty much the same, we may be different in some ways, but we are the same age…” (Young Negotiators Network, 2013, sec. 5).

Some students were surprised to find how natural negotiation came to them, and that “Negotiation was something in my nature” (Young Negotiators Network, 2013, sec. 5). An Arab Israeli student admitted that the project was helpful and that the “Instructor taught us to look at the bigger picture [of the issue at hand]” (Young Negotiators Network, 2013, sec. 5). In practice negotiations where the intent was to win a debate some students found that the experience was “very emotional because we had to convince them of something” (Young Negotiators Network, 2013, sec. 5).

Another young man explained how there are different goals and emotional levels when trying to win a negotiation. “It is different when you are trying to save something, or keep something that is really important to you” (Young Negotiators Network, 2013, sec. 5). At times students felt like they were trying to win a debate, rather than learn how to come to an optimal outcome for all parties. It is a challenging balance “To keep the others satisfied [and] to keep the self-satisfied. (Young Negotiators Network, 2013, sec. 5). Students practiced as negotiators, conflict parties and as audience members. A female
Jewish student felt the workshops “Also help us see things differently not only through talking, but actions. (Young Negotiators Network, 2013).

Overall the responses from participants were positive. The event was additionally a successful public relations campaign for the organizers, funders, and participants. The conference and workshops are highlighted on the American Embassy in Tel Aviv website, as well as on YNN, MEPI, Amal and Ahed School virtual pages. The event is highlighted along with additional Amal programs and national events bringing students together such as debate tournaments and further student exchanges.

**Debate and Conflict Resolution in Schools**

Ahed School is involved in another Amal facilitated project, co-sponsored by the US Embassy, through the English Debate program. In 2013, Bedouin, Arab, Druze and Jewish students gathered at the Taiba Amal School to debate topics involving the youth of Israel. This was the eighth consecutive year the program has been in place (2014). Tenth and eleventh graders from 14 schools participated in the weeklong event, for an audience of approximately 300 people and a jury from Israel Debating Society professionals. The audience was encouraged to vote using mobile phone technology and students had three minutes to make their case convincing (Ziri, 2013). Some of these students also participated in the YNN through PON and the American Embassy in Tel Aviv. Participants are encouraged to use English as their medium of communication. Students are invited to practice critical thinking, problem solving and conflict resolution and negotiation skills. These kinds of experiential learning programs are important.
because they increase exposure to students from different backgrounds in addition to different ways to use technology to express opinions. They also serve as collaborative trainings between Jewish and Arab Israeli youth and teachers. Facilitators are predominately American, European and Israeli with guests from Jordan.

Students from Ahed first became part of YNN after participating in two-day workshops with the Ramot Multidisciplinary School in the Name of Neuman from Beer Sheva in 2012. The goal was to “impart through an experiential educational foundational concepts of negotiation and problem solving that can serve the students in their day-today personal, social and professional lives, while exposing them to students of other backgrounds” (Young Negotiators Network, 2014, para 5.). These experiential learning programs are important for skills building and conflict resolution because they are empowering for students and supplement the curriculum from the high school and Ministry of Education.

Ahed School hopes to have an internal conflict resolution program in the future to supplement, or replace the PON workshops which are dependent on funding. Ahed School also wants to make training available to all students, not just the select twenty students with high English proficiencies and interest in Amal Network programs. The Ahed School English teachers who have participated in the PON teacher training are interested in bringing Fisher et al. teachings to conflict resolution in the classrooms.

Peter Coleman and Beth Fisher-Yoshida (2004) lay out different approaches to conflict resolution techniques within schools and communities and show the benefits of
such programs research has demonstrated. They present the layers of school based CAR training as follows:

- **Level 1** – The student discipline system: Peer mediation programs (cooperation and peer mediation training to address discipline problems, threat of violence and miscommunication between students).
- **Level 2** – Curriculum: Conflict resolution training (as stand-alone courses or integrated programs ranging from pre-K to University classrooms, providing problem solving skills and a “language for collaboration”)
- **Level 3** – Pedagogy (enhancing cooperative learning, positive interdependence, face-to-face interaction, individual accountability, interpersonal and small group skills, procedures for processing and analyzing, and understanding constructive controversy).
- **Level 4** – The school culture (from competition to gender dynamics, what makes up the school culture and communication).
- **Level 5** – The broader community (CAR expanding beyond the schools into homes, community organizations and larger environment to contribute to change within the individual and school level)


The students in Amal Network schools who are receiving the most exposure to conflict resolution training are those with the English language skills to attend specially funded programs. Amal administrators also hope to implement wide scale conflict resolution and negotiation trainings in the future. Their collaborations with PON have greatly increased
the trainings of Amal Network teachers and have created additional interest in these programs. The challenge is these styles of negotiation are rooted in western negotiation techniques that are interest-based and they do not take into account Bedouin or Arabic negotiation styles.

Bedouin students and faculty have concerns regarding negotiation training and the effectiveness of the negotiations as minority populations. Bedouin stakeholders rarely feel like equal stakeholders when advocating for land or educational rights. Students in the unrecognized villages have seen the potential of negotiations through the PON exercises. In addition, Bedouin youth and their families have witnessed the challenges of such negotiations within the land conflict and the attempts of PON trained facilitators from the Consensus Building Institute.

PON in Practice

One of the founders and directors of the Program on Negotiation, Lawrence E. Susskind, has been deeply involved in the land conflict in southern Israel. Susskind has conducted mediation between stakeholders regarding the contested Bedouin land and the removal of unrecognized villages. Susskind was a Professor at MIT for nearly four decades and started the Consensus Building Institute (CBI) in 1993. CBI is a not-for-profit organization that provides consulting services and training to business and political leaders around the world61 (CBI, 2011a).

CBI also provides a Teacher’s Guide to Workable Peace for teachers working at secondary schools. The training educates teachers on intergroup conflict and how conflict resolution, and civic and social skills can be integrated into social studies and humanities courses (CBI, 2011a). The training includes role playing, basics of negotiation, and conflict resolution training. While curriculum development is a part of their mission, CBI is focused on leadership and the empowerment of public, private, government and community stakeholders in decision making and negotiation. They are well known for their environmental and land conflict negotiations and Susskind is a leader in the CAR field.

Susskind directs the Environmental and Policy and Planning program at MIT and has engaged in numerous land claim mediations for the First Nations in Canada, Australia, New Zealand, the United States, as well as mediating Bedouin land claims in the Naqab (CBI, 2011b). Susskind was invited by the Israeli government (with support from Bedouin leaders) to discover if mediation would be an effective tool to respond to the land conflict. Susskind, and his team from CBI, gathered a group of ten Jewish and two Arab mediators, as well as American mediation experts and interviewed more than 250 Bedouin and government representatives and stakeholders (a third of which were Bedouin). Adva Center critiqued CBI and the mediation team for not including any Bedouin representatives. CBI’s conflict assessment of the land claims in the Naqab determined and identified:

1. Conflict Resolution
2. International Development (stakeholder engagement and decision making)
3. Organizational Governance and Strategy (changes in policy, market and leadership)
4. Social Policy and Cultural Resources (looking at social and cultural issues and perspectives on identity and community)
5. Commercial Agreements (for business practices)
• the parties that need to be part of any negotiated resolution,
• the issues that need to be addressed,
• the interests of the different parties,
• the concerns and obstacles to a location-by-location negotiation process

(CBI, 2011b, para. 21).

In 2007, the CBI cemgroup shared their assessment with members of Bedouin stakeholders and Knesset representatives in hopes of implementing a long term mediation. However, the Knesset chose not to proceed further. The Goldberg Commission 2010 Report supported the recommendations from CBI, but no further action was taken. Nearly 100 Bedouin stakeholders supported the mediation, as well as the National Security Council, Israeli police and General Security Service (the sectors that respond to protests and Bedouin resistance) (Hasson, 2005).

The Adva Center’s writers Swirski and Hasson analyzed the obstacles to this conflict assessment and mediation proposal. They found that Ehud Olmert (the former Israeli deputy Prime Minister, Minister of Industry, Commerce and Labor, and head of Israel’s Ministerial Committee for Arab Affairs) supported the CDI evaluation, but not recommended need for long-term mediation. Swirski and Hasson emphasized that CBI’s work (which began in 2005) was “taking place at a time when the government is adopting a tougher stance, whether in the form of the filing of countersuits, or in the form of demolition of Bedouin houses and the chemical spraying of Bedouin fields from the air. It may be safely assumed that in the absence of a government pledge to put an end to such actions, it will be very difficult for any progress to be made in the mediation.
process” (Swirski & Hasson, 2006). The CBI research gathered stakeholders and gave them hope and ideas for potential resolution. The failure to pursue the mediation disappointed Bedouin community members and advocates. The messages of failed negotiation transfers onto the youth who are navigating their futures within the background of this fifty-year-old conflict.

The Naqab land conflict is an example of a mediation process that was stopped before resolutions could be made for all stakeholders. It is likely that the generation of Ahed School graduates will continue to be stakeholders in this issue. The PON workshops, and the history of CBI trained negotiations have influence on how young Bedouin perceive mediation and their agency in conflict negotiations. Questions about the culture of negotiation also arose throughout the conflict scenario workshops. The following section analyzes how students, and CAR researchers and practitioners approach the culture and context that negotiation itself creates.

The Culture of Negotiation

The “Negotiations in Practice” event received a variety of reviews. National leaders, embassy representatives and enthusiastic students were pleased with the accumulation of experiences. Students learned how to explore issues with one another and look for positive solutions. One of the challenges of the program (particularly for Bedouin and other Arab Israeli students) was the assumption that all participants were sharing the same cultural context. Avruch’s (2004) discussion of culture and negotiation is illuminating here as he explains that “to see culture as context is to understand that
even before parties meet and converse for the first time, their most fundamental
comprehensions of their respective positions, interests, and values have been set and
circumscribed by the very language (i.e. culture) with which they bring them to
expression” (p. 396).

Avruch also reminds us to be mindful of the role of sponsors: “Organizations,
institutions, professions and occupations are also containers for culture and sites of
cultural difference. Each may serve to delimit its own context” (p. 396). The sponsors of
the “Negotiations in Practice” bring many cultural containers and agendas with them. The
US Embassy desires to demonstrate intercultural dialogue and work with Jewish and
Muslim students. Harvard’s PON has been working within Israel and Palestine for years
in different capacities ranging from business models to the Bedouin land conflict.

The PON system, as noted earlier, is fundamentally an interest-based negotiation
model inspired by Fisher, Ury, and Patton’s work. Avruch warns that the interest-based
style of negotiation assumes that context and meaning are homogenous for the parties. He
also shares his concern with how challenging this is to negotiate conflicts rooted in
personal and cultural values, and world perceptions (p. 396). PON is remarkably
successful in providing a safe place for students to practice negotiation. PON exposes
students to new case studies and people, and allows them to explore multiple positions
and perceptions in conflict.

A challenging element of the training for some Ahed students was the gap in
meaning making and an inability to relate to the context and values of certain aspects of
the program and speakers. When Ambassador Shalev artfully ignored questions about the
potential for a female Arab Israeli ambassador, and the two state system, students did not feel like they were coming from the same value base or cultural context. Ahed students were more engaged when Arab Israeli facilitators (like Taribeh) were presenting on the land conflict because they were able to relate to his experiences as an Arab Israeli and as an urban planner negotiating for better living conditions for Bedouin, Arab and Jewish Israeli populations. The case study also explored multiple approaches to negotiation which Ahed students could culturally identify with since many of their families continue to practice sulha.

The PON workshops help students understand positioning and placing themselves in one another’s shoes, but it has not yet been able to explore the complexity of culture in negotiation. Avruch’s suggestion for overcoming the cultural divide is to have all parties design “cultural maps” alongside with the “conflict maps,” to understand not only the issues to the conflict, but the levels of cultural knowledge and the layout of involved stakeholders. This would help not only show the positioning of the parties but allow the stakeholders to explore what the other is experiencing (Moghaddam, et al., 2008). For Bedouin students, a cultural and conflict mapping exercise would be useful, as well as an exchange of stories representing positions; stories of personal aspirations, hopes, education systems and family traditions. Rather than solidifying differences and strengthening dominant narratives the exchange of stories may help students to transverse conflicts and perceived differences between their cultures or ethnic identity groups.

---

62 “Positioning” refers to the narratives or stories conflict parties use to place themselves, and the “other” party in conflict situations.
Culture influences not only context but communication styles as well. This is why language is important. The “Negotiation in Practice” conference elected to use the English language as the medium of communication. This is not only for the benefit of the American sponsors and facilitators, but for an attempt at a more neutral language of communication than Hebrew or Arabic. In addition, Bedouin and other Arab Israeli students are required to learn Hebrew and Arabic. English is usually their third or fourth language. Standard Jewish Israeli schools do not require Arabic courses, but they are available in many of the Amal Network Schools and other integrated schools.

Part of the mission of Ahed School and the Amal Network is to expose students to multiple languages and ways of thinking. Increased language skills make students more viable candidates for higher education and jobs. The language used in PON negotiation training is also evolving and including community and tribal knowledge (such as sulha). Avruch (2004) reminds us that cultures, like languages, are not stagnant. They are constantly evolving. In the practice of negotiation there is a culture created in itself (p. 396). The culture of the “Negotiations in Practice” has evolved from a pilot project to a large event involving politicians, military captains, world renowned musicians, students and negotiators.

The challenge with western styled dialogue and negotiation workshops such as Harvard’s PON is that they do not take into consideration different styles of communication and culture. While their intention is to give youth from different religions and cultures the same tools and platform to communicate, one of the Bedouin Muslim female participants found it futile. “How am I going to speak like this in my community?
It is not possible” stated one twelfth grade female student (T. Tolley, per communication, October 1, 2013). Perhaps in the future, Bedouin students will be able to share their tribes’ view of negotiation and mediation and what conflict and resolution mean to them personally and historically.

**Conclusion**

The Amal Network and PON have provided opportunities for students to engage in different kinds of discourse and conflict resolution practice. Bedouin students from Ahed School recognize that to gain agency they have to be a part of the negotiation process. They have seen their family members involved in tribal council and attempts to negotiate Bedouin and Arab Israeli rights with the Knesset (T. Tolley, per communication, October 2013). Programs like PON are important for the future of Bedouin youth because it gives students communication and language skills. They learn how to articulate their cases and are given a forum to practice the negotiation of interests, needs, and values. Ahed students could relate to the case of land conflict in Sakhnin/Misgav and were able to see parallels in some of the workshops that they were experiencing within their own lives.

While all Ahed students are not yet comfortable articulating their opinions within a large group they are learning more about their peers throughout Israel/Palestine. They have exposure to people beyond the prejudices they have experienced. Students and faculty believed it was a very positive experience even though they did not always feel comfortable sharing their experiences or options (T. Tolley, per communication, October
These skills will help them in their final high school years and as they graduate and enter the workforce and higher education. They also have potential to help students overcome feelings of marginalization and alienation by raising their agency and ability to advocate and negotiate their needs and values.

For the next series of PON workshops it is recommended that Ahed School students also share traditional Bedouin mediation processes with examples. Discussing different ways to view conflict, shame and honor could benefit all students. Students could also share their traditions through poetry and the arts to learn from one another in more ways than interest-based negotiation. Returning to the question of culture, while Naqab Bedouin are assimilating into Israeli economy, they still return to their families and villages with little exchange between home, food, and religious rituals with their Israeli peers. If PON was matched with cultural exchanges and shared homes and hearths it may deepen the experience and conflict resolution and negotiation skills for young people of Israel/Palestine. Our cultures not only shape the values we place on systems of law, honor, and shame, but on the way we approach, perpetuate, resolve and navigate conflict. The concluding chapter reviews the accumulation of this research and provides recommendations for education and CAR programs implemented in conflict areas.

---

63 Exchange programs such as Seeds of Peace show both the benefits and challenges of exchange programs and peace camps.
CHAPTER SEVEN
CONCLUSION

“Education is the great engine of personal development. It is through education that the daughter of a peasant can become a doctor, that a son of a mineworker can become the head of the mine, that a child of farm workers can become the president of a great nation.”

– Nelson Mandela

Introduction

Nelson Mandela believed that education is the highest form of personal development. Malala Yousafzai nearly lost her life fighting for education and opportunities, and international development organizations respond to post conflict areas with plans to rebuild government, homes and schools. When the accomplished Bedouin academics of Ahed returned to their villages ensconced in protracted conflict, their first mission was to build a school that provided high caliber classes and opportunities for Bedouin youth (Ahed School for Science, 2013).

This research set out to answer questions regarding the tension between Bedouin youth attempting to maintain traditional culture while assimilating into Israeli society. The research explored how Ahed School is able to flourish when surrounded by conflict.
The thesis analyzed the significance of Bedouin youth being integrated into Israeli society through education. This final chapter reviews the pertinent questions and discoveries presented in this work and offers recommendations to Ahed School and the field of CAR and education.

The complexities of the Bedouin history of education, gender dynamics, and transforming cultures and economies all influence Bedouin youth’s experiences of education in the Naqab. Ahed School provides an example of a group of Bedouin activists coming together to use education as a form of demarginalization to uplift students coming out of poverty. The opportunities and exposure the school and curriculum provide to students informs how different ways of operating in society can contribute to multiple perspectives for youth on what the future can hold. The challenge is that the situation is complex. Education empowers students, but it can also compromise traditional meanings of “being Bedouin”. This role of education is a double edged sword for Bedouin families that want to maintain traditions and self-govern independent of Knesset control. Ahed School uplifts students, and teaches them how to succeed academically in Israeli society.

This chapter recommends increased exchange programs and conflict resolution trainings where Ahed students are also able to share their cultural mediation and communication styles. The following sections review the strengths and vulnerabilities of Ahed School and look at the potential of integrated education, CAR and economic opportunity for the future of Ahed alumni. The final segments provide recommendations for future research and concluding remarks.
The Strengths and Vulnerabilities of Ahed School

The research demonstrates the significance of education in conflict areas and the strengths and potential avenues for growth within Ahed School. Ahed is exceptional in that it brings students from recognized and unrecognized villages together. Students excel in matriculation certificates, and in physics, biological science, mathematics, debate and language. They have received international attention and funding and are one of the twelve Amal Network schools selected to participate in the PON workshops. The families, students and faculty are devoted to the success of Ahed School and this is observed through the profiles of Ahed. The appreciation for education is evident, as well as concerns for survival and assimilation within Israeli society. The Bedouin culture is changing, and people are both fearful of what this transformation can mean, and excited about the possibilities for young Bedouin men and women.

Ahed School rose from the experiences of Bedouin academics who had to fight to gain a quality education. They wanted to contribute to the community and their offspring by providing high caliber educational resources as a form of demarginalization. They have created a remarkable institution of learning and test scores and awards show that the school has a high performance rate in relation to other schools in Israel/Palestine. Nevertheless, students will still have to navigate experiences of dual consciousness and alienation as they progress into higher education and the Israeli economy. This is especially challenging for females who are required to observe strict codes of honor,
shame, and humility. These issues were addressed through the profiles comprising Ahed School and showed the strengths of the students and contributors to this unique school.

One profile of Ahed School expressed the aspiration to become a doctor after navigating prejudice and disease in Beer Sheba hospitals. Other students want to become human rights attorneys because of the legal battle over land rights in unrecognized villages. Students like Mo want to work in tourism and lessen the impact of Bedouin culture on his daily life. The options for Bedouin youth are expanding. There is increased access to information, popular culture and politics are readily available through technology. The secluded Bedouin of the desert no longer exists. The unrecognized villages often have intermittent power and utilize generators, yet access to Wi-Fi internet is readily available. New iPhones (both real and knockoff) from China are used by teenagers living in condominiums in Tel Aviv, and in traditional Bedouin tents. Access to information has changed for Bedouin youth, as have traditional practices of Bedouin culture (Abu-Lughod, 2000, p. 1). While these are all risks for change in Bedouin life, Bedouin youth in Israel/Palestine have also never had as many opportunities to achieve academic and professional development. Economic opportunities and education serves as forms of empowerment and demarginalization and demonstrate the strengths of Ahed School.

A challenge for Ahed students, and Bedouin families throughout the Naqab, is the navigation of a transforming culture and the adaptation to Israeli economy and sedentarization of formerly nomadic communities. While traditional nomadic Bedouin men may be resistant to assimilate into sedentarized communities, education has the
power to enhance self-esteem as well as de-marginalize young people. This is especially relevant for young women, by providing them with diversified educational and economic opportunities. The tension dwells in the fact that the very educational systems which can enhance agency for marginalized populations also lessens the saliency of the cultural and ethnic identity of Bedouins, as well as fits into the Israeli agenda of Bedouin assimilation/acquiescence. This generation of Bedouin youth is at the forefront of this social and cultural negotiation between the worlds of their families and tribe and the new global economy.

Ahed School has made impressive strides since its 2009 inception. It has quadrupled in size and collaborated with supplementary programs like the PON training, debate programs and physics competitions. While these opportunities are empowering for Ahed Students only a small percentage of the school population is exposed to international negotiation programs and science competitions. The majority of students have limited interaction with their Jewish, Druze and Arab Israeli peers. Ahed is also growing at a rate that may not be sustainable long term. As their curriculum and capacity develops, so will the need for increased infrastructure, evaluation and sustainable programming.

**Demarginalization and Assimilation**

The Bedouin community is at a unique threshold in terms of culture and societal structure. While state policies have dramatically transformed and limited the nomadic lifestyle (Ben-David, 1990; Dinero, 2010; Greenwood, 2012), another transformation is
occurring through forms of education. This research provides a different view of contemporary Bedouin culture, education, and gender dynamics, within the conflict resolution field. The research shows how successful schools can flourish and combat protracted conflict through increasing agency and economic opportunity for youth.

The voices of Ahed School demonstrate the commitment to education from families, teachers, students and administrators. Youth still confront incidents of alienation and racism. Yet, they have something their grandmothers did not. Ahed students have a school built by members of their community who experienced the same incidents of dual consciousness, alienation, and pressure to fit in. The founders and the families of Ahed School believe in the mission of education and want to continue to expand. While they still encounter challenges of funding, transportation and external conflict, they are committed to preparing their students for life beyond the Naqab.

Advocates of Bedouin empowerment, such as the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (CCPR), believe that “The educational system and its achievements is what will determine the ability of the Bedouin-Arab population to cope with the challenges of the future. Today this system is among the poorest in Israel, with high dropout rates, a shortage of physical infrastructures, and the lowest level of achievements in matriculation examinations” (Noach, et al., 2009, p. 37). In Chapter Four, the dynamics of gender in education demonstrate that in Bedouin communities the high school dropout rate is up to 77%, especially of girls (R. Abu Rabia, 2010). For Bedouin to thrive in Israeli society, education, the elimination of poverty and right to living without conflict are essential to
their success. This is true for all people, yet essential to demarginalizing minority and at-risk populations (Galtung, 1996; Webel & Galtung, 2007).

There are challenges for those striving for academic and economic success and being perceived as outsiders of the Bedouin community for acting against societal norms. Bedouin members of the Israeli military have been viewed as traitors, and Bedouin female academics struggle to fit into both Israeli and Bedouin social systems and identities. The story of Ahed School brings these dimensions together. It is more than a high school with remarkably successful test scores, government support, and national recognition. It is a case for understanding the role of education in conflict areas.

This research demonstrates how, for Bedouin youth in the Naqab, overcoming marginalization cannot be achieved without an increase in educational resources and economic viability. Without a strong economy, and taxes contributing to public services, Bedouin who have moved from traditional means of food production and livelihood are dependent on the government and unable to self-govern. Education and technical training for jobs are necessary gateways to new economic opportunities. Inequality remains evident in impoverished villages, as do incidences of violence and racism, and a backdrop of protracted conflict. The risk of assimilation is a loss of traditions and ancestral knowledge, and a dual consciousness of multiple identities in society.

---

64 The IA Taskforce presented their Development Proposal which includes a call for heightened technology and call centers in Bedouin towns that would employ both men and women, and support for alternative energy like solar panels and fuel-cell technology (I. Abu-Saad & Lithwick, 2000). Bedouin businesses lack major investors. Development in the Naqab needs a multi-tiered makeover, there are calls for a Bedouin Development Bank and microfinancing opportunities. The IA Task Force has requested development funds from the World Bank and International Monetary Fund.
Collaborative and integrated education systems can explore demarginalization, feelings of alienation and concerns of assimilation.

**Integrated Education**

Bedouin students continue to experience racism and insecurities in integrated groups where they are the minority (such as the PON conference). Integrated education has the potential to prepare students for higher education and provides more opportunities to dismantle prejudice and “otherness” through collaboration. The bi-lingual, inter-religious schools in Israel/Palestine are also outperforming most of the public Jewish schools (Kamin, 2013). Education systems like the four Hand-in-Hand Schools working to overcome ethnic tension helps humanize students to one another in the elementary, and pre-school level. 65 Each class has both an Arab and Jewish teachers and the schools are intended to have equal proportions of Arab and Jewish students. Hand-in-Hand schools are funded by international donors, the Jerusalem Foundation, and are recognized by the Israeli Ministry of Education.

While these schools have been popular in larger urban areas, rural districts continue to present challenges. Parents eager to have their children join bi-lingual schools and for their children to have a different experience of inclusion than the segregated Israel/Palestine in which they were raised. In one generation, more educational opportunities exist for Bedouin youth, but racism and miscommunication continue. There

---

65 The original Hand-in-Hand school began in Jerusalem in 1997, followed by schools in Galilee, Wadi Ara (Arab area near Haifa), and Haifa. A fifth school in Tel Aviv-Yafo is in development.
are still debates over the Second Lebanon War, Operation Cast Lead, a two-state nation, and Zionism, but decreasing the fear of the other is a goal of the schools, and the families that partake in them. In bucolic communities, less Jewish participation is evident. In places like Galil School, according to Rim Mi’ari, one of the parent committee leaders, “Today, there are many more Jews that like to keep their children close to home, among their friends” (Kashti, 2013, para. 5).

Efforts to breakdown inter-religious and land conflict, decrease demarginalization and increase collaboration begins with youth through education and the sharing of culture. As with Hand-in-Hand bilingual schools, “The desired outcome is youth who can acknowledge and respect one another, while at the same time cultivating loyalty to their own cultural heritage” (Bekerman & Shhadi, 2003, p. 473). There are various studies on why integration contributes to peace building, as well as the challenges bilingual education present to complex identities and ideologies (Bekerman 2005, Nasser 2011). Bekerman and Maoz acknowledge that educational processes that are rooted in positivism, and “monological understandings of identity and culture” (Bekerman & Maoz, 2005, p. 343) are insufficient to construct lasting change, and believe that liberatory pedagogies (such as Freire (1985)) and the powers of demarginalization are necessary for true peacebuilding and coexistence.

Ilham Nasser (2013) writes about perceptions on bilingual/bi-ethnic education in Israel, and has collaborated with the Near East Refugee Aid (ANERA). Nasser collaborated with Abu-Nimer to conduct a three year study on education and conflict

---

resolution in teaching and perceiving forgiveness in Egypt, Lebanon, Jordan and Palestine (2010-2013). They found that while forgiveness is woven into the predominant religions in the Middle East and Arab culture, schools fail to provide the tools, skills and vocabulary for forgiveness. This is also neglected within the PON mediation process.


Revisiting CAR in the Schools

As students are weaving their experiences of new education programs and integrating learning (like PON) into traditional CAR methods, they are confronting experiences of alienation, marginalization and prejudice. Schools like Ahed give them skills in science and technology and exposure to negotiation and communication trainings which contribute to more agency increase self-esteem. Ahed School is able to flourish in the overarching land conflict and unrest with Gaza because the designers of the school have experienced conflict their whole lives. They knew what it felt like to go to high school in Tel Aviv and be the only Bedouin (T. Tolley, per communication, June 4, 2013). The founders knew how hard it was to attend integrated universities where racism was rampant. The way to combat this alienation and prejudice was by “being the best student in the classroom” shared Jihad (T. Tolley, per communication, June 5, 2013). Hala emphasizes the importance of overcoming feelings of alienation and finding where she belonged. For her, this occurred at the University, where she felt more at home with a diverse group of students (T. Tolley, per communication, October 2, 2013). For other
Bedouin women entering academia, they felt a juxtaposition between being successful academics and maintaining the traditions of Bedouin society (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2008; R. Abu Rabia, 2010).

Ahed School is perceived as a bridge into Israeli society for Bedouin students (“Israeli Science High School Advances Bedouin Community,” 2011). It is outperforming all other Bedouin high schools and many other Israeli schools. The Amal Network sponsors leadership, wellness and physical activity programs and programs for the disabled but no direct conflict resolution programs are currently implemented. The only official exposure Ahed students get to negotiation and conflict resolution training is through annual trainings provided by the Amal Network and Program on Negotiation at Harvard University.

Ahed teachers, students and alumnae have been trained in the negotiation style of Getting to Yes. Coleman and Fisher-Yoshida’s (2004) levels of CAR provide a framework for including CAR into the curriculum. These can be modified and integrated into Ahed School’s curriculum. While a single conflict resolution training is not yet in place, these levels of conflict resolution can be adopted by language, history and civics courses. The following recommendations are adapted from Coleman and Fisher-Yoshida’s conflict resolution recommendations as included in Chapter Six:

- Level 1 – Student discipline system: Peer mediation programs (these can be incorporated in both Ahed School and through the PON trainings).
- Level 2 – Curriculum: Conflict resolution training (utilize both PON style negotiation as well as Bedouin mediation practices including sulha, and
the history of blood feuds, caste systems and how these has evolved in Bedouin history).

- Level 3 – Pedagogy: While studying both Israeli, and Bedouin specific history, this is an opportunity to discuss cooperative learning, integration, de-marginalization accountability and constructive controversy.

- Level 4 – School culture: This is an opportunity to explore the dynamics within the school from racism within, and against the Bedouin community, to tribal dynamics, to communication differences and similarities between men and women. This is where language arts and conflict resolution could intersect. Communication through storytelling, poetry, music, and expression using Arabic, Hebrew, and English could benefit the school and meet curriculum requirements.

- Level 5 – Broader community: After working with Ahed School, I recommend that the community should be invited to share traditional Bedouin modes of mediation, justice, and communication such as sulha (as discussed in Chapter Six).  

These simple recommendations enhance the teachings of Ahed School, the Amal Network and PON. They would also help prepare students for entering the next phase of their life. As well as negotiating the transformations in culture and economic opportunity.

---

67 These recommendations have been submitted to the faculty at Ahed School and are pending a response.
Possibilities for Ahed Graduates

In the last decade, a shift of mentality is occurring for Bedouin families. Israeli based forms of education were perceived for over 50 years as a way to sedentarize and destabilize the nomadic lifestyles of Bedouin. Now, education is a way for Bedouin youth to create new economies, international communities, and access the benefits of globalization.

Select programs of higher education, such as the Robert H. Arnow Center for Bedouin Studies and Development, recognize the lack of knowledge about the needs and lifestyle of Arab-Bedouins in the Naqab. Recent grants for up to $7,000 have been available for doctoral research for students from recognized Israeli and international institutions. Funding opportunities like this can potentially provide a medium for Bedouin academics to share data, recommendations and discoveries. One of Ahed School’s founders, and principle, Suleiman Abu-Bader, maintains a database on professional articles about the local Bedouin. Surely a future goal is to include work submitted by his own Ahed School Alumni.

Ahed School prioritizes language programs (Hebrew and English), biological sciences, and engineering and computer sciences to prepare students for the Israeli technology industry. The hi-tech community in Beer Sheva provides mentorship programs leading to jobs at large corporations like Cisco and Sun Microsystems, and they have implemented pilot job programs in Bedouin settlements. The IA Taskforce has also

---

68 The center is funded by Robert H. Arnow, a New York City real estate executive and chairman emeritus of the University’s board of governors who believes in the education and support of Bedouin in the Naqab.

69 http://cmsprod.bgu.ac.il/Eng/Centers/bedouin/info_db.htm.
introduced job fairs within the Bedouin settlements, and working with youth community centers to expose students to economic opportunities. Programs like this can increase the financial stability of Bedouin families.

Education and vocational training, along with support of traditional methods of livelihood (sheep and camel herding, weaving, agriculture), could support various Bedouin livelihoods for women in particular. Economic and educational opportunities must increase for Bedouin to flourish in society. Programs like Ahed School are a significant start. Integrated job opportunities and educational systems must compliment the increased programs for Bedouin, especially in education and health. While the Naqab has historically been one of the least developed regions of Israel/Palestine the economy is changing. The new hi-tech movement based in Beer Sheva and Tel Aviv are gaining international attention. Bedouin constitute approximately one quarter of the population of the Naqab and the population is increasing. The next generation of Bedouin will not be isolated from Israeli society at large. Bedouin youth are full of hope, initiative and intelligence.

Bedouin activists, scholars and advocates like Ismael Abu-Saad, Harvey Lithwick (2000) and Oren Yiftachel (2012) have proposed alternative development plans for Bedouin townships and services. Proposals aim to link Bedouin localities through rail and roads to economic bases in Beer Sheva and to transform Nevatim air force base into a civilian operating airport to link the hi-tech economy of Beer Sheba to the rest of the globe (Swirski & Hasson, 2006, p. 100). Abu-Saad and Lithwick have also called for the virtual hi-tech movement to include jobs for Bedouin women who could work from their
homes, and for a Bedouin run bank that could microfinance businesses, and the design integrated industrial sites where Bedouin and Jews could work together like at Lehavim Junction (Abu-Saad & Lithwick, 2000, p. 40). There are many opportunities for Ahed graduates economically and academically.

While Ahed students are now positioned to be able to flourish both in terms of academics and economic opportunity, they continue to struggle with concepts of marriage, balancing culture and work. One of my final evening walks in the Naqab demonstrated the continued questions of assimilation and aspirations for Ahed students and their community members.

Two cousins walk at dusk, through the dusty field, avoiding broken car parts, as the call to prayer fills the Naqab. They laugh, talk of marrying brothers or cousins so they can stay together. One just turned 28 years old, and the other about to turn 26. They both speak English beautifully. One is studying Hebrew at the Bedouin College. Neither want to be teachers although their professors encourage them. The younger lady says "I will be anything but a teacher." The older cousin, who has two sisters that are teachers says, "Being a teacher is a good job. But I don't want to be one. I want to work for government." She has an opportunity to train to be a teen mentor, she tells both boys and girls about their culture, how to behave, how to deal with family, friends and school. When asked if they talked about dating and intimacy, and how to be healthy, she made a face, “Are you crazy?! No. I teach them how to be Bedouin, and about our culture, and help them when times are difficult”
This observation shows how “being Bedouin” is still part of the struggle for identity and education within villages in the Naqab.

**Recommendations for Further Research and Action**

The profiles who comprise Ahed School inspire further research questions and concepts to be explored. The future of tourism and Bedouin tradition also encourages further research. Hura’s Bedouin Mayor al-Nabari, has been working with the Al-Kasom Regional Council to design a “colorful tourist commercial zone, combined with archaeological sites in the area, that will expose people to Bedouin society” (Dattel & Lutsky, 2014, para. 14). He is already receiving donations from the Jewish National Fund in Great Britain and North America to start this development.

The research also calls for further analysis of less visible roles within the Bedouin community. There is still much to be learned by the voices that were not represented in this research. For example, there are women and children who did not have access to education due to issues of availability or family beliefs of the importance of education. Their voices need to be represented. Topics involving homosexuality, Bedouin in the military, Palestinian Bedouin relationships and the complexities of marrying outside the tribe (Bedouin and Jewish, Palestinian and Bedouin, Bedouin and foreigner) also invite additional research.
Conclusion

This type of intervention, enveloped into the modified ethnographic case study, responds to the literature on marginalization, culture, and historical forms of storytelling valued by Bedouin cultures. These methods deepened understandings of the role of Ahed School in Bedouin youth’s culture and identity. The research also demonstrated a unique case of education in conflict because Ahed School burgeoned out of a marginalized community. Samar, Ibrahim and the profiles of Ahed School demonstrate youth’s perspectives on culture, education, position in society and potential paths in life. The fields of development and international education can learn from these experiences and perspectives in designing CAR initiatives and education programs as responses to conflict.

The Bedouin of the Naqab have adapted through changing borders and colonization. Their religious, educational and political systems have evolved with time and technology. According to Ben Gurion University’s Professor of Geography, “To the best of our knowledge, in modern time, no other pastoral nomadic society in Africa, the Middle East and Asia has crossed as many cultural frontier lines during a relatively short span as did the Negev Bedouin in Israel…This society was also severed from its previous exclusive Middle Eastern Islamic-cultural environment and became a relatively isolated cultural enclave within a modern Jewish cultural environment,” (Lerner, 2013, sec. II). This contributes to why maintaining customs and cultural practices are so meaningful to many families. Education, economic opportunities and the right to observe cultural traditions and customs will help the next generation of educated young Bedouin navigate
their future and what it means to be people of the desert. This research reviewed the challenge of education in conflict areas and how the same education systems that have the potential to empower minority populations also reduce the saliency of the cultural and ethnic identity of formerly nomadic people.

This analysis reminds us that culture matters. Education is a powerful form of demarginalization, but it is not a simple inequality equalizer or conflict eliminator. With education comes new dimensions of navigating conflict. For Bedouin women education provides an entrance into economy and introduces dual consciousness and conflicting aspirations for career, cultural preservation, and choosing who to love. For conflict educators we have learned that presenting western-based negotiation tools does not satisfy the needed skills for Bedouin youth to become equal members of Israeli society. This analysis warns that the role of education in conflict areas is not simple. The tensions between alienation and acceptance from Israeli society, marginalization and empowerment, and the need for safe spaces for education and survival are real for Bedouin in the Naqab. Schools arising out of conflict areas can utilize the lessons learned from the successes and challenges of Ahed School to improve educational opportunities. Profiles such as Hala, the weaver, demonstrate that Bedouin women can achieve higher education and professional careers while preserving the values and honor of their culture and ethnic identity. Local businesses like the Lakiya Women’s Weaving Center provide avenues for economic growth and cultural preservation.

Ahed School is managing a strict academic curriculum with determination and support from networks like Amal and PON. The exposure to external CAR trainings
improves the language and communication skills of Bedouin youth, however they do not yet empower them. PON trainings need to celebrate the differences in culture, conflict resolution styles, and encourage participants to feel part of the decision-making process. Traditional means of Bedouin negotiation, such as sulha, give Bedouin stakeholders a voice. Bedouin leaders are advocating for increased agency, businesses, land rights, and political voices within Israel. The young people coming out of Ahed School are the future leaders of their communities and they have the potential to be agents of peace. The aspirations to become doctors, scientists, human rights attorneys, dedicated parents, and business owners all contribute to the increase in agency for these young people.

These findings call for increased agency and input from communities struggling with conflict, challenges in education and demomadatization. This research sheds light on the culture of Bedouin communities in the process of sedentarization and globalization, and how Bedouin designed models of education in conflict areas can help marginalized populations flourish academically and culturally.

Ultimately, the story of Ahed School is one of hope and opportunity. “Without hope, we would not be alive” shares one of the Ahed founders (T. Tolley, per communication, October, 2013). This dissertation shows the way education is a powerful tool in conflict resolution. CAR practitioners would benefit from considering the tensions surrounding education arising from conflict and marginalization. Ahed School is an indicator of progress for a marginalized community. However, dynamics of gender, culture, and the tensions presented in assimilating or rejecting the dominant society in conflict demand attention. Education serves as both a form of demarginalization and as a
tool for acceptance into the dominant society. May Mickey’s words of “Ahed is a dream in the making” expand into a model of education that can flourish throughout the region. Without hope and perseverance Ahed School would still be simply a dream.
The first time I entered the desert I took the train from Tel Aviv and appeared to be the only non-Muslim departing the Lehavim/Rahat station where the largest Bedouin city Rahat is located. It reminded me of the first time I took the metro in Los Angeles and how few Caucasians got off at the Crenshaw stop, or when I moved to Washington D.C. and my African American friends wouldn’t let me metro to Suitland after dark. Segregation is visible by where people live, and how people look when they get on and off the bus and train stops. Multiple concerned Jewish citizens made sure I knew where I was getting off the train. The segregation became visible before I arrived.

My first Bedouin friend, Jihad, picked me up from the train station. We immediately talked about our mutual friend Wendy who introduced us and he shared history about his family and his role as a professor at Ben-Gurion University. He was excited (and incredibly busy) because that week was the first graduation for seniors at Ahed School. Jihad was jubilant that students were flourishing, and that his dreams of Bedouin education had come true. We drove 30 minutes to the village of Lakiya, passing the Lehavim Forest where the Bedouin museum is located. Jihad pointed out the plethora of camels, small children chasing their goats with sticks, the brand new mosque in the village, and points of pride for the Bedouin community such as the Lakiya Weaving Center. We drove to his home, a beautiful one story house with a patio surrounded by
flowers and vegetables. Jihad and his wife Sahar have four children. The younger boys were playing in the front yard and the older children were returning from school. Sahar is a psychologist and community social worker and an extraordinary cook. She shared Bedouin tea, British cookies, spiced chicken, vegetables and Bedouin bread. I was made to feel like part of the family.

Jihad and Sahar’s passion for education, and their advocacy of Bedouin rights and equality, rapidly enveloped me into the unique story of education in the Naqab. While the local land conflict dominated the political conversations - what Jihad and Sahar were proud of was the opportunities they have had, and what they want to give their children. Sahar has her Master’s degree in psychology, and Jihad has a PhD. They have lived in New Zealand and have traveled Europe and the Americas. They are from an upper caste family in Lakiya where educational scholarships have given them opportunities. Their children are learning multiple languages and understand that they have options in life.

This opportunity, says Sahar, is what is remarkable about the new generation of Bedouin youth. She had to fight for higher education and to live internationally. Her choices were not always accepted by family members, but she believes the possibilities for her children are endless. This first night in the Naqab sparked an idea... We always hear about marginalized people in conflict areas... We know that education is important. But what if this is a situation where community-fostered education resulted from marginalization and protracted conflict?

I was initially reluctant to focus my doctoral research in the Middle East because it was not my region of expertise. I have spent many years exploring health and conflict
in East and Sub-Saharan Africa, in the Balkans and SE Asia, and disaster management in North America. However, Israel/Palestine was a new terrain. I did not initially know if this was my story to tell. I talked about this with SCAR faculty and was surprised by the response. Committee member, Dr. Sandy Cheldelin, stated, “You are the perfect person to tell this story. You care about education. You know about environmental conflict, and you understand teenagers.” I recognized that this is a story I wanted to share, and that these rising voices should be highlighted.

After my initial night in the Naqab, Jihad and Sahar encouraged me to feel like part of the community. They took me to elementary schools, Ahed School, Ben Gurion University, and their offices. I was introduced to local non-profits, and met land rights activists, and neighbors, members of A’dalah, and academics from all over the world. I began to glimpse the fascinating role of education in this protracted conflict and understood its difference from what we hear about Israel/Palestine. It is a story of struggle, but also one of hope.

Sahar took me under her wing and shared the challenges of being a Bedouin woman. She discussed the complexities of upholding Bedouin traditions while being an academic and a social worker. She explained the importance of integration and overcoming fear of the “other”. Sahar and Jihad were born in the early 1970s and were some of the first children to move from unrecognized villages into settlements; conflict has shaped their lives and education. They can see both the benefits and struggles to changes in lifestyles and urbanization. They have been able to secure funding for higher education and live internationally. Their lives have transformed from being children in
nomadic villages to internationally recognized scholars. The possibilities for their children are limitless and yet they are surrounded by a multilevel conflict. The protracted conflict setting of Israel versus Palestine has shaped their lives. They have Israeli citizenship but are not allowed to marry Bedouin Palestinians. Or if they do (as in the case of Jihad’s brother who married a Bedouin Palestinian he met in graduate school in Canada) they are not permitted to live together within the Naqab. Conflict permeates their lives through the ongoing Palestinian/Israeli debate, the struggle for self-governance in unrecognized villages, the relationship with Egypt, and now the shadow of ISIS looms dramatically on their landscape.

As a field researcher, I was able to enter this society and become accepted and cared for. And then I was able to leave. When the summer 2014 conflict in Gaza became heightened I was forbidden to return to the Naqab by State Department warnings. I was personally warned by people working in Middle East intelligence not to return to the area because of the risk of kidnappings and distaste for Americans by extremist groups. Meanwhile, my colleagues and research participants kept asking me when I was to return. There is often a cognitive dissonance of being an academic that has the freedom of movement and saying “My government says it is not safe for me to be where you live.” This is something I have never gotten used to while working in disaster management and conflict resolution. The choice and privilege we have in movement separates us from the people we learn with and from. My American passport, income, and academic support give me the access to collaborate with communities where people are trying to find joy in a lifetime of multi-layered conflict. During my time with Ahed School, I inquired how I
could assist the education of Ahed Students. The teachers want their students to have mentors, and to teach students how to apply for international education opportunities. They advocate for Ahed students to be able to see beyond the conflicts surrounding them, and to know they have options. This in itself proved a huge testament to the work Ahed School is doing. For Ahed educators; education is a form of demarginalization. I will continue to mentor Ahed students and graduates for the years to come.

Throughout this dissertation experience I discovered new depths of my research abilities. I was reminded of my strength and adaptability when conducting fieldwork. I thrive as a guest into new communities, and find incredible amounts of joy learning from the way families, communities, and institutions operate. I also believe deeply in the power of education. I was impressed with the commitment of Ahed School’s faculty and staff, as well as families. They made tremendous sacrifices to provide this quality education program to students, which is evident in how successful it is and how determined students are. I was also reminded about the challenges of teaching conflict resolution when you have political and financial pressure.

During the PON “Negotiations in Practice” Conference I was impressed by the logistics and range of the program. The organizers have spent years on this project and believe that these integrated programs contribute to lessening conflict, and to providing youth with skills for communication. They organized many facilitators, public relations, and political representatives to inspire kids and used the celebratory conference to demonstrate their progress. While their work was deeply impressive, at the end of the day, some of the Bedouin students walked away feeling alienated, unsure of their voices,
and shy. They were the obvious minority. Jewish students typically sat away from them. There were no Bedouin facilitators or instructors. They felt most comfortable with their Ahed School teachers, and Arab Israeli facilitators like the land conflict facilitator from Misgav. The Bedouin girls were particularly discouraged by the presentation by Ambassador Shalev and her campaign for a two-state solution and her inability to answer a question on the possibility of a future female Arab-Israeli ambassador. This experience reminded me of that high profile events like this may benefit the funding and attention of the program, but not the morale of all the participants. Ahed Students were nervous and excited to attend, and yet they felt like the same messages of differences were unintentionally projected throughout the event. This is an important reminder as a practitioner – the care and awareness surrounding messaging to the participants is more important than the projection of peacebuilding to the US Embassy funders.

I was also reminded how much there is to learn about different methods of mediation. I was additionally reminded of the necessary grace, patience, and flexibility in the field. On my third site visit I was planning on having a male colleague from Brandeis University join me to volunteer in the school. A few days before returning to Lakiya I was notified that the males in my family homestay were out of town for a funeral and it would be improper to bring a foreign male into the community. It reminded me of both the power and the limitations of being a female researcher and practitioner in a community sensitive to gender dynamics and concepts of honor and shame. Bringing my colleague could unintentionally compromise the perceived integrity of the unmarried women in the village. As a woman, I had access to Bedouin women and children in a
way that foreign males would not gain as rapidly. While I was limited in my movement (because I am a woman) I also gained access to non-profits, and group conversations that were only deemed appropriate for women. I was unable to attend mosque with men, but was able to interview them socially (at group dinners), professionally (at offices) and academically (at the high school and at Ben Gurion University).

This field experience reminded me of the struggle for education, and how it is not something to be taken for granted. On the surface it appears that Ahed Students will become the future leaders of their communities with limitless possibilities. However, they still have to navigate the nuances of their culture, economies, surrounding prejudices and violence. Ahed Students have not forgotten about their friend who was shot at Shoket Junction for charging the IDF. They have been warned their whole lives about how Jewish Israelis think of them. Many evenings they hear gunshots in the distance at the borders of Palestine and Israel. They all have lost someone to the Israeli/Palestinian conflict, to health challenges or complications in childbirth. These young people are familiar with bomb scares and genetic conditions, and the fact that the majority of the country they live in believe they do not belong, and are a threat. They have learned how to thrive against all odds. They have taught me hope, perseverance and an appreciation for Bedouin traditions that celebrate the planet and family.

One of my final nights in Lakiya, Ama, the matriarch in my host family, woke with a sparkle in her eyes. “I dreamt of my husband last night. Tonight we feast” (T. Tolley, per communication, October 2013). In Bedouin tradition, when you dream of someone who has passed away and they are eating in the dream it is a message to
celebrate their lives. Ama and her daughters went to the market and returned with a lamb, fresh vegetables, flour and spices. They spent all day making handmade bread, maglooba (an amazing rice dish with chicken, potatoes, coconut rice and spices), lamb sausage, barbequed chicken, hummus, dips and plates of dates and almonds. They invited about 40 members from the village and shared stories about Ama’s husband who died ten years previously. This experience reminded me of the importance of celebration for those living and gone. I was feeling restless, worrying about the amount of data I had collected, and was stressed about my limited time and resources. It reminded me to be in the moment and be grateful to these people who have taught me so much about living, learning, and loving in the desert. The Bedouin families I had the honor to collaborate with have been surrounded by conflict their entire lives. They maintain their joy by celebrating one another. It is something that I too often forget in my life as a researcher, practitioner, and analyst. Bedouin weddings, feasts, and education systems have taught me about the importance of the tribe and family surrounded by conflict. As a Bedouin elder shared with me, “I cannot change what Israel wants. I can work to make my family happy” (T. Tolley, per communication, September 2013). I am constantly amazed by the resilience, creativity, and capacity for joy of people. Even those that have experienced atrocities and violence for years still have a goal of something more than survival with the vigorous practice of joy and compassion.

During the fieldwork, and the writing of the dissertation, the most difficult aspect of engagement was the physical containment. Bedouin women practice a very modest lifestyle. Physical activity is limited and hidden. When I was accompanying my host
sisters to the mall I was chastised for walking on the escalator. Leena asked me, “Do you want to look like a man?” Physical exercise is uncommon for women in the villages, and now that the nomadic lifestyle is less prevalent the increase in heart disease and diabetes is evident.

My Bedouin colleagues based in the United States are deeply concerned for women in the villages, and they want to build a gym just for women. I hadn’t previously realized how dependent I am on physical activity to release stress. Being unable to walk anywhere or gain enough activity to increase my heart rate was incredibly frustrating, especially with the amount of food, as a guest, you are gifted. Bedouin families are famous for their hospitality and cuisine and mealtime is where I gained many insights, friendships, and respect for people in the community. I became amused by my own physical frustration. I can barely imagine how constrained I would feel to have other limitations of my mobility or choices in life after the amount of freedom I have already experienced. I also became frustrated with myself that I couldn’t mentally transcend my need for physical movement. This was true both in the Naqab, and when writing in the United States. No amount of meditation, reflection or mental pep talks enabled me to work consistently without physical activity. I was also critical of myself for being irritated with my lack of movement. It pales in comparison to the restrictions my Bedouin friends have. Bedouin women have to get approval on proposed travel, dating, locations of study, wardrobe, and career selection. If I had the opportunity to spend more extended periods of time in the Naqab, I would travel with a male companion or rent an apartment at the university to allow more physical freedom.
I am utterly grateful for the hospitality of Ahed School, the villages of Lakiya and Hura, and the Program on Negotiation conference in Israel. I am committed to helping Bedouin youth achieve their academic aspirations and have helped write letters of recommendations for universities, and served as an editor for college applications. I have offered to be an informal academic advisor for the students and faculty at the school. I have also been adopted by two families in Lakiya that have impacted the way I see the life in the desert, the challenges of present day nomadism, and the complexities of education amidst conflict.

These people have now been in my life for three years and are new family members to me. I will honor them with my research, my support, and my analysis to help the school continue to flourish. I have offered to return and teach more cultural exploratory workshops to allow students to share their experiences and to gain pride in where they come from, and what they hope to do in their lives. I am also committed to being an “auntie” to many of the young people I had the fortune to encounter. My experience in other international communities teaches me that this mentorship and friendship lasts for decades and is increased through social media. As a researcher, I feel honored, and obligated, to continue collaboration with the communities I have worked with. I still write with my host family from Kenya in 2003. I take every research experience as a gift and as a moral opportunity to grow as person, story collector, and academic.

This modified ethnographic case study has taught me that having education and opportunity is not enough to change protracted conflict dynamics. Culture matters.
Gender equality and communication are important. Freedom of movement is important to Bedouin, and to their guests. Ahed School provides a doorway into academia and economic possibilities. The graduates of this school will confront the tensions of marginalization and empowerment, alienation and acculturation, and safe places for education and living. I hope they can increase the quality of living for their families, and preserve the aspects of Bedouin culture they cherish. We can learn from this story of hope and perseverance.

While conducting the cultural exploratory workshops with students I was impressed by the curiosity, convictions, and insight of the students. They wanted to know about other Muslim teenagers around the world. They wanted a sense of belonging in a nation where they are considered a minority, and at times a threat. Together, we were able to look at multiple definitions of culture, religion, gender dynamics, and responses to conflict. Like with many youth, families, classes and religions, the Bedouin communities in Lakiya and Hura strive for a balance of the old world and access to modernization.

Being a guest in these villages taught me the importance of observing traditions (such as prayer, Bedouin weddings, sulha) for research participants when they feel conflict is all around them. It gives them strength. I feel stronger for my time with Bedouin families and Ahed School. I only hope my friends experienced the same kind of joy, curiosity, and laughter that I did. Inshallah.

With Gratitude,
APPENDIX

Appendix One: Interview Questions

1. What does education mean to you?
2. Please describe your experiences at Ahed School -
3. What are the teachers like?
4. What are your goals and aspirations?
5. What is it like to study in Israel/Palestine?
6. Have you studied anywhere outside of this area? Would you like to? (Or) What was it like?
7. Could you tell me a little bit about the history of this area? How long has your family lived here? What are some of the stories you heard growing up about your family?
8. Did your parents go to school? Your grandparents?
9. Please tell me a little bit about Ahed School and your experiences with it.
10. What are the other local Bedouin schools like?
11. What does it mean to be Bedouin, to you?
12. How do you identify yourself?
14. How do you identify yourself? Is this similar or different to your parents? Siblings? Grandparents?

15. How are you able to express your feelings and opinions?

16. Do you use any kinds of social media? If so, how do you like to use it? Do you share pictures? Stories? Experiences?

17. From my understanding, storytelling and poetry are important parts of Bedouin communication and culture. What do you think?

18. Are you experiencing conflict currently? If so, what kind of conflict?

Appendix Two: Review of the Voices of Ahed School

Through Basir, it is evident that the hopes of parents for their children’s education do not always match access to education or what youth desire for their own futures. His story also shows the delicate relationship for Bedouin IDF members and the mistrust Bedouin military members experience from the IDF, and the critique trackers like Basir receive from Bedouin and other Arab Israeli peers. For Basir, Ahed School is a goal and opportunity for his children. He believes it is the highest quality of education available for Bedouin teenagers in the Naqab. He also wants there to be more Bedouin teachers with more quality training so that Bedouin children do not feel judged by their teachers. Basir wants his children to have more rights, and his daughters more equality not only in economic and educational standards, but within the Bedouin family structure as well.

Ahed School founder Sulieman was inspired to create Ahed School because of his own struggles attending higher education. In addition, he wanted his children to have the
best possible opportunities available. He witnessed the challenges his mother had with illiteracy and committed himself to the education of his children and community members. His daughter and her friends have taken advantage of scholarships and opportunities in higher education. This new generation of Bedouin women are devoted to agency of women through education, and economic independence through weaving.

Shereen, Yasmeen and Hala show how traditional Bedouin weaving can be a viable economic and educational aspect of the future. Hala shares how her identity has evolved through the double consciousness she experiences juggling her professional and academic life and her sense of belonging within Bedouin and Jewish Israeli communities. Hala’s work at Ahed School and at the Lakiya Women’s Weaving Project provide her with avenues to educate and empower Bedouin youth and women.

Nasreen, the young woman with thalassemia major, also struggles with her identity, discrimination, and the prospects of marriage after high school. Her experiences with the Israeli medical system have inspired her to pursue medical school. Reem comes from a long line of poets. She is struggling with the Bedouin caste system and her love for a young man from an unacceptable family. She hopes the science and technology focus of Ahed School will help her prepare for medical school. Reem uses social media as a way to express her poetry and her thoughts away from the eyes of her parents.

The transfer student, Leena, chose not to remain at Ahed School because she and her family wanted to be in an integrated school to prepare her for university and the Israeli economy. Dana, the English teacher, is devoted to students exploring poetry, photography, and cultural expression in addition to languages, hard sciences and
technology. She has worked at multiple Bedouin schools and is proud of her work at Ahed School, and with the Program on Negotiation workshops.

The political youth, Hassan, is heavily involved in Bedouin land rights, and considers himself an activist. He feels that education is his biggest tool in supporting human rights, and comes from a family that all supports education. Eman, the graduate, shares her story of being inspired to become a teacher, and how as a high school graduate there is extreme pressure to marry or attend university. She excels in languages and was one of the participants in the PON workshops. She describes her experiences with conflict resolution programs and her experiences coming from a polygamous family.

The experiences of Mo and Sara represent the pressure high school students and recent graduates undergo deciding where to live, who to marry, and whether to study or work. This pressure is heightened as students enter the larger workforce and are confronted with other people’s notion of their Bedouin identities. Mo is also trying to understand what it means to be the eldest son of a tribal leader, and what his responsibilities are to family, tribe and the future he wants to create for himself. Sara is trying to decide if she can make a life with Mo, and what it means for a modern Bedouin like herself to move to an unrecognized village with little infrastructure and physical security.

Ramzi’s story illuminates the fear that Bedouin students have of being perceived as terrorists, and as bad people. Ramzi likes to be viewed as a rebel, but not as dangerous. He is a talented student, and wants to advocate for the rights of Bedouin people. His
experience at Ahed School has also been shaped by the land conflict, and by being injured while protesting against the Prawer Pact.

No story of education is separate from the experiences students and faculty are experiencing within the community, and within the surrounding tension created by land and regional conflict. The narratives that comprise Ahed School demonstrate how students can deal with questions of alienation, marginalization, conflict and success.

**Appendix Three: Program on Negotiation Agenda**
NEGOTIATION IN PRACTICE

Conference

October 1, 2013

ONO Academic College
# Negotiations in Practice

**Tuesday, October 1, 2013**

**Ono Academic College**

## Conference Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9:30 - 10:00</td>
<td>Gathering and Refreshments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 - 10:10</td>
<td>Greetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>US Embassy, Amal &amp; PON Representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:10 - 10:30</td>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. Keith Noble, US Embassy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30 - 11:15</td>
<td>Keynote Presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professor Gabriela Shalev,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ono Academic College, Former Ambassador to the UN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15 - 11:30</td>
<td>Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30 - 12:45</td>
<td>Workshops, Session I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45 - 13:15</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:15 - 13:30</td>
<td>Gather for Workshops</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30 - 14:45</td>
<td>Workshops, Session II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:45 - 15:00</td>
<td>Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00 - 16:15</td>
<td>Keynote Presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Jim Tull, Cambridge, MA, International Negotiation Expert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:15 - 16:30</td>
<td>Break (popsicles)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:30 - 16:40</td>
<td>MEPI Alumni Opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Labibah Harash-Mousa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:40 - 18:00</td>
<td>Performance and Conversation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Mira Awad</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCES

https://www.scribd.com/doc/137234828/Um-Batin-Israel-Our-Bedouin-
Community-in-the-Negev

https://www.scribd.com/doc/137234828/Um-Batin-Israel-Our-Bedouin-
Community-in-the-Negev

https://www.scribd.com/doc/137234828/Um-Batin-Israel-Our-Bedouin-
Community-in-the-Negev

(Updated). University of California Press.

Reflections on Cultural Relativism and Its Others. American Anthropologist,
104(3), 783–790.


Problem of Female Bedouin Dropouts. British Journal of Sociology of Education,
27(1), 3–17.

Educated Bedouin women from the Negev. Ethnography, 8(3), 297–323.
http://doi.org/10.1177/1466138107081026

Case of Higher Education among Palestinians—Bedouin Women in Israel. Part of
the Special Issue, Cross-Cultural Fieldwork, 39(4), 381–400.

Transition: the Case of the First Educated Bedouin Women in Israel. Higher
Education Quarterly, 65(2), 186–205.


Publishers : In cooperation with the Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs.


289


Terra Alysa Tolley graduated Arcata High School in Arcata, CA, in 2000. She received her Bachelor of Arts from Lewis and Clark College, in Portland, OR, in 2004. Tolley received her Master of Science in Conflict Analysis and Resolution from George Mason University in 2009. She served as an instructor for New Century College at George Mason University from 2010-2013, teaching leadership, community engagement and experiential learning. Tolley is an avid environmentalist, field anthropologist, and HIV/AIDS activist. She has worked in the areas of anti-human trafficking, refugee rights, health education, outdoor experiential learning, and maternal and child health. She is currently the Business Development Coordinator at OZ Systems International. She spent much of 2005-2010 conducting damage evaluations in the Gulf of Mexico assessing the social and economic impacts associated with Hurricane Katrina, Hurricane Rita and the BP oil spill. She is a co-founder of the Balkans Peace Park Photography Project and a Shinnyo Peace Fellow. She is on the Board of Directors for Genesis at the Crossroads and is a Biosophical Institute and Adrian St. John Scholar. Tolley is currently working on the fifth volume of Oxford International Encyclopedia of Peace and leading conflict resolution and leadership programs internationally. Her regions of expertise include Central and Eastern Europe, East Africa, Latin America, Southeast Asia, Israel/Palestine, and natural resource conflict in the United States.