

EXPLORING ISSUES OF RELATIVE DEPRIVATION IN THE ZABALEEN COMMUNITY
IN CAIRO

by

Nicole Eisenschenk
A Thesis
Submitted to the
Graduate Faculty
of
George Mason University
in Partial Fulfillment of
The Requirements for the Degree
of
Master of Science
Conflict Analysis and Resolution
Master of Arts
Conflict Resolution and Mediterranean Security

Committee:

_____ Chair of Committee

_____ Graduate Program Director

_____ Dean, School for Conflict Analysis and
Resolution

Date: _____ Fall Semester 2015
George Mason University
Fairfax, VA

Exploring Issues of Relative Deprivation in the Zabaleen Community in Cairo

A Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science at George Mason University, and the degree of Master of Arts at the University of Malta.

By

Nicole Alexis Eisenschenk
Bachelor of Business administration
Stetson University, 2007

Director: Monika Wohlfeld, Holder of the German Chair and Lecturer
Mediterranean Academy of Diplomatic Studies, University of Malta

Fall Semester 2015
George Mason University
Fairfax, VA
University of Malta
Valletta, Malta

Copy Right 2015 Nicole Alexis Eisenschenk
All Rights Reserved

Dedication

This is dedication to my family and friends who were there for me on this journey. I could have never done this without your encouragement and support.

Acknowledgments

I would like to express my gratitude to my thesis supervisor, Dr. Monika Wholfeld; your advice and encouragement throughout this process was invaluable. Furthermore, I want to thank our teaching coordinator for this program, Thanos Gatsias; I am not sure I would know what I would have done without your constant reassurance and assistance throughout this entire program and thesis process. To Professor Lourdes Pullicino, your assistance with my method and methodology was a tremendous help and I greatly appreciated you taking time out of your summer to assist me. To my former undergraduate professor and friend Dr. Katharine Hansen, I want to thank you for reading and editing one of the chapters if it wasn't for you I don't know how I could have made that chapter sound so well. Finally, I want to thank those who were in this cohort with me, the support system we created this past year through lectures and this thesis is what got me through this program. I want to especially thank my "partner in crime" for this last year, Lauren Corboy, your constant encouragement and reassurance throughout this past summer saved me when the voices of doubt crept in. I also want to thank all the lecturers from George Mason University and the University of Malta, your knowledge and guidance throughout this intense year prepared me for this journey of thesis writing. Had it not been for all these people plus the support of my friends and family this thesis would never have become a reality.

Table of Contents

	Page
List of Figures.....	vii
Abstract.....	viii
Introduction	1
The Research Problem.....	1
Studies Addressing the Problem	3
Deficiencies in Past Literature.....	6
Significance of the Study for the Audience.....	7
Purpose Statement.....	9
Research Question	9
Outline of Thesis	9
Literature review.....	12
Neoliberalism.....	12
Privatization.....	14
Marginalized Communities	17
History of the Zabaleen.....	19
Egyptian Identity	22
Nasser and Socialism	26
Sadat and Liberalization	28
Mubarak and Neoliberalism	30
Privatization of Waste Management in Cairo.....	32
Research Design.....	36
Research Question	36
Method	36
Methodology.....	38
Method of Analysis	40
Data.....	40
Data Collection Procedures	41
Data Analysis	42
Data Recording	43
Limitations and Delimitations	44
Summary.....	46

Data Presentation.....	47
Categories.....	47
Emotions.....	48
Perceptions.....	50
Survival	52
Identity.....	54
Actions.....	55
Themes.....	56
Loss of Identity	56
Loss of Economic Livelihood	57
Adaptation	57
Transition of Recognition.....	58
Data Analysis.....	60
Loss of Identity	61
Loss of Economic Livelihood	63
Adaptation	67
Transition of Recognition.....	69
Implications.....	72
Synthesis.....	74
Comparison with Previous Literature.....	74
Neoliberalism and Privatization	75
The Zabaleen and Egypt.....	80
Marginalized Communities.....	81
Significance to the Field of Conflict Analysis and Resolution	83
Ethnic Group	84
Basic Human Needs	87
Structural Violence and Relative Deprivation.....	93
Conflict	97
Protracted Social Conflict.....	100
Unintended Results.....	104
Limitations within the Study	106
Conclusion.....	110
Implications of the Study	115
Appendices	119
.....	121
References.....	122
Biography.....	129

List of Figures

Figure	Page
1. List of Coding Categories and Codes.....	45

Abstract

EXPLORING ISSUES OF RELATIVE DEPRIVATION IN THE ZABALEEN COMMUNITY IN CAIRO

Nicole Alexis Eisenschenk, M.S., M.A.

George Mason University, 2015; University of Malta, 2015

Thesis Director: Dr. Monika Wohlfeld

This thesis explores the effects of waste management privatization, a neoliberal policy, on a marginalized community in Cairo known as the Zabaleen. This study first introduced the economic systems such as neoliberalism and privatization while also focusing on marginalized communities. Furthermore the study looks at Egyptian identity as well as the economic policies of three of Egypt's former leaders, Nasser, Sadat, and Mubarak. The study specifically focuses on the effects on the Zabaleen community and subsequently the waste management privatization that occurred in Cairo in 2002-2004. By examining published sources, such as media documents, brochures from international organizations, and documentary, codes and coding categories were established. Those coding categories through thematic analysis yielded four themes, which articulated the effects of privatization on the

Zabaleen through a thematic narrative. The results of this study added to previous literature on the effects of privatization and neoliberalism while also confirming the research on marginalized communities. Finally this study could offer guidance and understanding to those in positions of power in how to engage with those who are marginalized within a society.

Introduction

The Research Problem

Communities are affected by the decisions their government makes all the time. The decisions can be beneficial or detrimental to the community depending on the type of decision. In the case of Egypt some of the economical decisions that were made in 2002-2004 were detrimental to one community, the Zabaleen. With economic influence from the outside, such as from the Western developed nations and the international monetary institutions, the Zabaleen were affected by the decision to privatize waste management within Cairo. As Kuppinger stated in his study on the Zabaleen, “instead of improving and investing in effective local economic circuits, officials hand over responsibility and profitable ventures to corporations who offer dazzling solutions that are open to global exploitation.”¹ The influence from the outside appears to be one of the reasons as why there is and has been conflict amongst the Zabaleen and the government in Cairo.

The January 2011 Revolution in Egypt brought the attention of the Zabaleen community to me as a researcher and I felt that their history within Cairo was a study worth examining more. The Egyptian revolution was an example of how

¹ Kuppinger, Petra. “Crushed? Cairo’s Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics.” *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015. P. 622.

decades of oppression and violence, directly or indirectly, toward a population can lead to an uprising. It could be argued that the use of neoliberal politics continued to grow the disparity amongst the elites and the marginalized. In Egypt the high youth unemployment and the growing income disparity caused the youth to take matters into their own hands and directly confront the elites. This revolution gave a voice to not only the frustrated youth in Egypt but also a marginalized group known as the Zabaleen, who had suffered at the hands of neoliberal politics imposed upon them by the urban and national authorities.² This revolution united the outspoken youth voices with the often-ignored voices of the Zabaleen to stand up to those who had oppressed them for too long.

By understanding the trials and tribulations that this marginalized community, the Zabaleen, had suffered under the regimes of former presidents: Gamal Abdel Nasser, Anwar Sadat, and especially Hosni Mubarak can help to clarify the complications with using the policies encouraged by neoliberalism. By understanding how marginalized communities have worked with and persevered against regimes that have used a neoliberal economic strategy. The purpose of this study is to focus on the ways in which a marginalized community, in particular the Zabaleen community of Cairo, handled the policies of neoliberalism imposed on them by their government. Although the marginalization and struggle of the Zabaleen had been occurring for decades this study will focus on the time period of 2002-2004 when the government privatized the waste management system in

² Ibid, P.621-622.

Cairo. The research question will attempt to answer the effects of privatization on the Zabaleen community, a community directly affected by the privatization.

Studies Addressing the Problem

The Zabaleen community, Egyptian economical structure, and neoliberalism had been studied separately, but had not all been studied all together. In this section I will address previous studies pertaining to the different areas that were used to conduct this study.

The Zabaleen community had been apart of the Cairo landscape for decades and previous studies on the Zabaleen had focused on their garbage collecting industry. As Fahmi and Sutton noted, since the 1940s the Zabaleen had been the unofficial garbage collectors of Cairo and their recycling techniques produces an 85% recycle rate.³ A majority of the journal articles relating to this community explained the ways in which the Zabaleen collected and recycled waste to make a profit. In the literature regarding the privatization of the waste management system in 2002-2004 most studies emphasized on how the privatization economically affected the Zabaleen community and the effects it had on urbanization within Cairo.

Urbanization and development in Cairo were other areas of literature that touched on the Zabaleen. That literature looked at the increased urban development on the cityscape in Cairo as an effect of globalization. The literature focused on the physical structures and lands that the Zabaleen inhabited on the

³ Fahmi, Wael Salah, and Keith Sutton. "Cairo's Zabaleen Garbage Recyclers: Multi-nationals' Takeover and State Relocation Plans." *Habitat International* 30.4 (2006): 809-37. Proquest. Web. 3 Oct. 2014. p. 812.

outskirts of Cairo. With the recent growth and addition of new suburban and gated communities the topics of relocation were examined. The studies briefly explained the views of the residents and officials who saw the Zabaleen as unclean and squatting on the land that they have been living on for decades. This literature focused on the Zabaleen's long history in Cairo as well as the family dynamics that made up the garbage collecting system. Finally the literature examined the economical effects that privatization had on the Zabaleen in the early 2000s. Most of the literature that focused on the Zabaleen was based off of the same pool of information. Most of the information found in most of literature was a repetition of a select few authors who worked closely with the Zabaleen.

The topic of neoliberalism was an extensive and broad topic with numerous amounts of literature that featured studies from all parts of the world. There was a significant amount of books and articles that explained the principles of neoliberalism and how neoliberalism had evolved over time. The exploration of how neoliberal policies had been implemented by less developed states at the encouragement of much stronger allies was an area with significant literature. There was literature that focused specifically on neoliberalism in North Africa, the Middle East, and Egypt. This literature explained the evolution of neoliberalism within the region and the current neoliberal policies in place. There were more specific works based on the economic policies under former Egyptian presidents: Nasser, Sadat, and Mubarak. The information provided in the literature explained

each president's economic policy, the effects the policy had on Egypt as a whole, and the positive and negatives of using their particular economic policy.

When focusing more on economic policies within neoliberalism the literature on privatization was also quite vast. Privatization was also a broad topic with numerous studies done throughout the world. There were a number of studies done on privatization in less developed countries. These multiple case studies gave a background into a basic understanding of privatization and the effects that privatization had in specific situations.

There was a vast amount of literature focused on Egypt dating back centuries; in this study the focus of the literature had to be on the modern Egyptian history that began in the early 1900s. While there was still a multitude of literature on Egypt, the focus of the literature looked to the leadership in Egypt since its independence. Also present within the literature was the economic policies and practices of the Egyptian government and three of its prominent leaders over the last decades. While a lot of the literature focused on the Egyptian society from the perspective of the government some of the literature also touched on the Egyptian family dynamics and the Egyptian identity.

Since a majority of the past literature, with the exception of the Zabaleen, was quite broad the researcher had to narrow the search of literature. This action would give a more focused approach that could answer the research question, but also give the reader a basic understanding of the environment leading up to and at the time of the phenomena.

Deficiencies in Past Literature

As it was stated previously a majority of the topics for study were broad topics with a multitude of literature available. There were still some deficiencies amongst the literature, specifically in the tone of the literature. The results of this study could further add to the literature or could find avenues in which the literature was lacking and create future studies.

A majority of the literature that focused on the Zabaleen was in coexistence with urbanization and growth within Cairo. That literature focused on urbanization and globalization while looking at the effects to the Zabaleen communities in Cairo. In most of the literature about urbanization on the Zabaleens' history a majority of the literature used the same information gathered from authors who had previously worked with and studied the Zabaleen. When it came to the information presented on the Zabaleens' history and garbage-collecting structure there wasn't much variation amongst the literature. One deficiency in the literature was that the attitudes towards the Zabaleen were mostly positive. Since the Zabaleen were seen as a marginalized community, which had been continuously disenfranchised by the government, the authors tended to take a more positive tone when describing their situation. Within the literature authors did not criticize the Zabaleen's community leaders or community. There was also a lack of academic literature on the ways in which the Zabaleen identified themselves. Popular media sources and testimonials created by NGOs focused on the individuals within the community, but it was more economically focused instead of on the effects of years of marginalization. One other

area that was hardly touched upon was the topic of squatting, in most of the urbanization literature the topic was barely touched upon, which continued with the visible trend of positive attribution toward the Zabaleen community.

The literature that was focused on Egypt and economic policies such as neoliberalism are both very broad topics. From the literature that was discovered a majority of the neoliberal literature had a negative tone. The neoliberal literature was more critical of the economic policy and showcased the negative effects of using neoliberalism as an economic policy. The lack of positive literature on neoliberalism did not give a full spectrum of the policy. When the Egyptian literature focused on the Egyptian presidents and their economic policies most of the discussion focused on the negatives that happened at the time of their presidency. This lack of balance amongst the literature created a bias in the literature that could be detrimental to the study.

Although the deficiencies in the literature were minor it was still worth warranting a discussion. With a more negative tone present in some of the literature the researcher became more aware of the commonly held opinions that could be present amongst the literature used in this study.

Significance of the Study for the Audience

The significance of this study was to emphasize a particular section of the population, which can usually be forgotten or not represented when it comes to policy decision-making. The results from this study could help create a new

perspective on that section of society that was marginalized and help establish the importance marginalized communities have to the society as whole.

In this study I plan to focus on a specific marginalized community, who were part of a society that adopted neoliberal practices and how that community was affected by the decisions made by those in positions of power. Studies on economic policies seem to focus on the nation as a whole and focus on the economical outputs of those policies. A problem that could arise with such a broad perspective is that those apart of marginalized communities or a high-risk community are not usually acknowledged or recognized in the results of the study. In previous literature about neoliberalism there had been discussions on how the use of neoliberal policies can cause income disparity and high unemployment, but there wasn't as much focus on those individuals suffering from those policies. If there was a focus on the marginalized community, the results were economically focused, for example the loss of jobs and income. There wasn't further analysis on how the individuals of the community managed in a neoliberal economic situation or how on an individual level these communities overcame the economic situation they had been placed in. Understanding the lack of results in previous studies can show how it is important to look to these marginalized communities and understand how they are directly affected by decisions.

In this study I want to focus on one specific community, the Zabaleen of Egypt, so to understand how neoliberal policies affected this community. The significance of this study is to help give a voice to a community that lives on the

fringes of society within Cairo and to understand how this community handled the privatization of waste management in 2002-2004. The importance of understanding the Zabaleen community at the time of the waste management privatization could bring a different perspective onto the phenomenon. With the understanding of the community the hope would be for future cooperation amongst those in positions of power and those that are part of a marginalized community, which could lead to a more equal society.

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this study is to understand the neoliberal policies more specifically privatization, which were present in Egypt and how those policies affected a marginalized community in Cairo known as the Zabaleen. This study could bring about better understandings of the inner workings of marginalized communities within a neoliberal system, which could result in better cooperation amongst those that are marginalized and those in positions of power.

Research Question

What was the effect of waste management privatization on the Zabaleen community in Cairo?

Outline of Thesis

As Chapter 1 has just concluded the reader was introduced to the study by highlighting previous studies and deficiencies in past literature while also explaining the significance of this type of study. In Chapter 2, I will continue with an overview of the literature. I will take the reader on a journey through the broad

economical policy of neoliberalism, which was present in Cairo at the time of this phenomenon and then focus on a one part of neoliberalism, privatization. The privatization section will consist of previous studies as well as the pros and cons of using privatization in a state's economical policy. I will continue to describe marginalized communities and marginalization, which will give a broad understanding of the community that I am choosing to focus my study on. I will move on from marginalized communities to the community for which this study is focused on, the Zabaleen. The chapter will then focus on the country of Egypt, the country in which the Zabaleen live. This section will comprise of a historical make up of the country, which includes identity and significant events. I will further break down the history of Egypt, by focusing three sections on Egypt's past three long-reigning presidents and their economic policies over the past decades. This economic understanding will lead to the conclusion of the chapter that focuses on the privatization of waste management that happened in Cairo. Chapter 3 will present the research design, with a description of the method used to gather data for this study, the methodology, and a description of the method of analysis. Chapter 4 will present the data, which is composed of coding categories and an introduction of the themes used to answer the research question. Chapter 5 will focus on those themes established in chapter 4 and will continue to analyze the data presented in the study. Chapter 6 will contain the data from the previous two chapters and discuss how the data compares to past literature, the data's significance to the field of conflict analysis and resolution, the unintended consequences, and the limitations

in the data. Finally I will summarize my findings in the Chapter 7, the conclusion, and will discuss the chance for future studies on this subject.

Literature review

In this chapter I will present previous literature on topics pertaining to the privatization of waste management that took place in Egypt. As it was stated previously the study is on the Zabaleen community, an apparent marginalized community in Cairo. The chapter will start with an overview of the economic system that was present in 2002-2004, neoliberalism, and then focus more specifically on one function of neoliberalism, privatization. There will then be a presentation of marginalized communities and marginalization that will lead to the more specific topic of the Zabaleen. The last sections of this chapter will focus more on Egypt and three of its leaders and their economic policies while in power: Nasser, Sadat, and Mubarak. Finally the chapter will conclude with a brief description of the privatization of waste management that went into effect in 2002-2004 in Cairo.

Neoliberalism

Neoliberalism, as described by Bourdieu, is where a “pure and perfect market is made possible by the politics of financial deregulation.”⁴ The move toward neoliberalism is seen as transformative where it draws its power from the political

⁴ Bourdieu, Pierre. “The Essence of Neoliberalism - Le Monde Diplomatique - English Edition.” *Le Monde diplomatique*. N.p., Dec. 1998. Web. 20 Mar. 2015. <<http://mondediplo.com/1998/12/08/bourdieu>>.

and economic power of those whose interests it expresses for example: stockholders, financial operators, industrialists, conservatives or social-democratic politicians. Ideally neoliberalism, as described by Steger and Ravi, is a “self-regulating market” and “the state is to refrain from ‘interfering’ with economic activities of self-interested citizens and instead use its power to guarantee open economic exchange.”⁵ The formula for Neoliberalism is “Deregulation (of the economy), Liberalization (of trade and industry), Privatization (of state-owned enterprises).”⁶ As Jessop continued, the liberalization and deregulation would consist of transactions that also go across borders but also within borders.⁷ In the public sector there is privatization and liberalization with the imposition of commercial criteria, while in the private sector there is deregulation and government measures such as ‘hire and fire,’ flexitime, flexiwork labor markets and growth of tax expenditures which are based on fiscal subsidies for favored economic activities.⁸ There is a support of free trade and capital mobility, which expects innovation, as well as the use of modern technology. This is why cities are even more important when it comes to neoliberal policies.

As Jessop continued to explain, Cities are made of larger populations where innovation and competitiveness can be showcased. Cities in most cases are the place

⁵ Steger, Manfred B., and Ravi K. Roy. *Neoliberalism: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2010. Print p. 2-3

⁶ Ibid, p. 14

⁷ Jessop, Bob. "Liberalism, Neoliberalism, and Urban Governance: A State-Theoretical Perspective." *Spaces of Neoliberalism: Urban Restructuring in North America and Western Europe*. By Neil Brenner and Nikolas Theodore. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2002. 452-72. Print. p. 454.

⁸ Ibid, p. 461

for economic, political and social innovation while still being a key international actor on the global market. In neoliberalism welfare states are discouraged because they are seen as “costly, overburdened, inefficient, and incapable of eliminating poverty, overly entitled to cash entitlements rather than empowerment.”⁹ Moving the population from welfare into work, the government must provide incentives to learn and/or prepare for a new job can provide the transformation of a welfare state.¹⁰ This type of transformation of the welfare state is why privatization of public or state sectors like health care and education are seen in neoliberal states.

Privatization

Privatization, as Adams explained, is one of the ingredients in neoliberalism and is “defined as the transfer of state owned enterprises (SOEs) to the private owners and it has become a common economic policy tool all over the world.”¹¹ Privatization, as noted by Bienen, Henry, and Waterbury, has a “range of policies from those of government disengagement and deregulation to the sale of publicly-owned assets.”¹²

The “success of privatization programs is mixed”¹³ as, stated by Börner. In some studies, as Adams noted, the public sector was seen as inefficient and the transition to the privatization was seen as efficient and provided economic

⁹ Ibid, p. 465

¹⁰ Ibid, p. 465

¹¹ Adams, Samuel. "The Impact of Privatization on Economic Growth and Income Inequality in Sub-Saharan Africa." *The Journal of Social, Political, and Economic Studies* 31.3 (2006): 295-320. Web. 17 July 2015. p. 297.

¹² Bienen, Henry, and John Waterbury. "The Political Economy of Privatization in Developing Countries." *World Development* 17.5 (1989): 617-32. Web., p. 617

¹³ Börner, Kira. "The Political Economy of Privatization." doc-type:workingPaper. N.p., Jan. 2004. Web. 8 Aug. 2015. <<http://epub.ub.uni-muenchen.de/296/>>. p. 1.

growth.¹⁴ Doyle explained that for the last two decades “privatization has become a defining feature of the modern political economy”¹⁵ with the emphasis by international monetary institutions mandating the use of privatization in structural economic reforms and had been used primarily in structural adjustment programs.¹⁶ Especially, as Younis described, when it came to the economic policies of the developing world, taking the word of the “experts” from the developed world and their international organizations was a main influence in the increased privatization in the third world.¹⁷ More recently the Middle Eastern countries had seen a rise in the privatization of administration, manufacturing, and service delivery. It was seen as a way to reduce government costs, as well as a reduction in government’s role in the economy with an increase in productivity and a broadening of investment, individual and collective, including foreign investment.¹⁸ In Egypt contracting out private companies remains the preferred form of privatization.¹⁹

There were general findings in studies of privatization especially privatization in developing countries, for example Prizzia found, that the economic performance and financial outcomes determined if privatization was a valid policy

¹⁴ Adams, Samuel. "The Impact of Privatization on Economic Growth and Income Inequality in Sub-Saharan Africa." *The Journal of Social, Political, and Economic Studies* 31.3 (2006): 295-320. Web. 17 July 2015. p. 301.

¹⁵ Doyle, David. "Politics and Privatization: Exogenous Pressures, Domestic Incentives and State Divestiture in Latin America." *Journal of Public Policy* 30.3 (2010): 291-320. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015.p.291

¹⁶ *Ibid*, p.291-292.

¹⁷ Younis, Talib. "Privatization: A Review of Policy and Implementation in Selected Arab Countries." *The International Journal of Public Sector Management* 9.3 (1996): 18-25. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015. P. 20.

¹⁸ *Ibid*, p. 18-19.

¹⁹ *Ibid*, p. 21.

to use within the country or region²⁰ and in a study by Adams, Sub-Saharan African countries privatization “contribute to economic growth” and “help reduce income inequality.”²¹ The second finding was that privatization might produce favorable economic results with its effects on society as not favorable. Prizzia noted that, a lot of privatization performances come at the expense of the internal human factors and external social factors, and that although in the short term privatization may relieve the financial burden on the government,²² the sale of a publicly owned company to a foreign investor “left the high risk and poor sectors of the affected community to fend for themselves or created a demand for new government services.”²³ One last finding, according to Adams, was that the negative impact that was seen in privatization might be “due to the lack of appropriate regulatory and institutional framework for privatization.”²⁴ This could further explain why the use of privatization in undeveloped third world countries was not a vital policy and that continued pressure by international agencies to use privatization in structural adjustment programs may be expressed too early on in the process of development of the government and infrastructure.

²⁰ Prizzia, Ross. "Privatization and Social Responsibility: A Critical Evaluation of Economic Performance." *The International Journal of Public Sector Management* 14.6 (2001): 450-64. ProQuest. Web. 6 July 2015. p.450-451.

²¹ Adams, Samuel. "The Impact of Privatization on Economic Growth and Income Inequality in Sub-Saharan Africa." *The Journal of Social, Political, and Economic Studies* 31.3 (2006): 295-320. Web. 17 July 2015.p. 309

²² Prizzia, Ross. "Privatization and Social Responsibility: A Critical Evaluation of Economic Performance." *The International Journal of Public Sector Management* 14.6 (2001): 450-64. ProQuest. Web. 6 July 2015. p. 451

²³ Ibid, p. 456.

²⁴ Adams, Samuel. "The Impact of Privatization on Economic Growth and Income Inequality in Sub-Saharan Africa." *The Journal of Social, Political, and Economic Studies* 31.3 (2006): 295-320. Web. 17 July 2015. p. 304

Marginalized Communities

As Cook stated, "Marginalized populations are those excluded from mainstream social, economic, cultural, or political life."²⁵ The way in which a population is marginalized is the theory of marginalization. Marginalization, as described by O'Leary, is "the process by which individuals, social groups, and even ideas are made peripheral to the mainstream by relegating or confining them to the outer edges of margins of society."²⁶ As Cook continued, their groups could include groups that are excluded due to race, religion, political or cultural group, age, gender, or financial status.²⁷ "Marginalization, as O'Leary added, keeps "others from threatening the ideological, cultural, economic, and political power of the dominant, and is therefore extremely effective in maintaining the status quo."²⁸ The marginalized are usually seen as the poor or the oppressed and are usually at a disadvantage when they try to engage in the mainstream economic system, but they are always able to earn a living.

As Rodriguez noted, the marginalized are creative and always able to make do and create possibilities in their margins of the world and can even do this with

²⁵ Cook, Kay E. "Marginalized Populations." *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Ed. Lisa M. Given. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. 496-97. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 16 July 2015.p. 496.

²⁶ O'Leary, Zina. "Marginalization." *The Social Science Jargon Buster*. London, England: SAGE Publications Ltd., 2007. 153-55. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 6 July 2015.p. 153.

²⁷ Cook, Kay E. "Marginalized Populations." *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Ed. Lisa M. Given. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. 496-97. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 16 July 2015.p.496.

²⁸ O'Leary, Zina. "Marginalization." *The Social Science Jargon Buster*. London, England: SAGE Publications Ltd., 2007. 153-55. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 6 July 2015.p 153-154.

their interactions with the mainstream systems.²⁹ In one study, O'Leary noted, that marginalization was "functional since it helps maintain cultures and even equilibrium," but the effects to those at the margins psychologically, socially, politically, and economically can be extraordinarily high especially if the populations suffers from social exclusion.³⁰

Marginalization, as described by Buda, can also be seen a construct that is applied to the community or individual by a "group and social institutions which, by marginalizing the subject, run the risk of worsening the social status of the latter, labeling, evident in particular on individual levels, leads in relation to the social environment to marginalization."³¹ This continuous labeling by the mainstream central groups can lead to the marginalized becoming despised or demonized, but depends on how close the population gets to and from the mainstream society. This construct of the society by all those not considered marginalized leads to the belief that the marginalized are morally or even biologically distinctive making them pariahs in society and permanently keeping the population on the perimeter of society. This causes an almost invisible effect on the populations leading those in top positions in society and government to ignore or even exclude these populations when policies are made.

²⁹ Rodriguez, Agustin Martin G. "Marginalization and the Multiplicity of Rationalities: A Discourse Theory of Poverty." *Theory in Action* 5.2 (2012): 104-21. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015.p. 106- 116.

³⁰ O'Leary, Zina. "Marginalization." *The Social Science Jargon Buster*. London, England: SAGE Publications Ltd., 2007. 153-55. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 6 July 2015.p. 154.

³¹ Buda, Octavian. "Marginalization Versus Mental Illness and Stigmatization. Bioethical Dilemmas." *Revista Romana de Bioetica* 6.2 (2008)*ProQuest*. Web. 18 July 2015.p. 92

History of the Zabaleen

This section will introduce the Zabaleen community to the reader. Since the Zabaleen community is the focus of this study this section will contain historical information as well as an understanding of their professional place in Cairo.

Zabaleen in Egyptian Arabic means “garbage people.”³² The Zabaleen, as Kuppinger explained, are Coptic Christians that originally migrated to Cairo in the 1940s due to the increase in waste that was produced as a result of population growth in Cairo.³³ But before the Zabaleen entered the city there was another migrant group from the desert known as the Wahi or Wahiya, which means those of the oases, and they began collecting waste from the wealthier households in Cairo at the turn of the 20th century.³⁴ The Wahiya sold the paper and other forms of waste to those in public bathhouses and makers of fuul, a bean dish, who were in need of fuel. They kept the city, especially the routes that they controlled, relatively clean and were able to make a living based on this form of employment.³⁵

As it was previously stated by, Kuppinger, in the 1940s the Zabaleen began migrating to Cairo to help with the ever-increasing waste. The organic waste was especially important to the Zabaleen since they used it for their pig rearing, which was forbidden for the Muslim Wahiya to raise.³⁶ Fahmi and Sutton added that, once

³² Alamazzini, Kim. *Egypt-The Zabbaleen Environmental Development Program (ZEDP)*. Paris: Enda Europe, n.d. Print. p. 2.

³³ Kuppinger, Petra. “Crushed? Cairo’s Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics.” *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015. P. 624.

³⁴ Ibid, p. 624.

³⁵ Ibid, p. 624.

³⁶ Ibid, p. 624.

the Zabaleen entered the landscape the Wahiya continued to control the collection of waste and its routes. The Zabaleen paid the Wahiya for access to residential buildings so to collect the garbage. In some instances there were deals made between the Wahiya and Zabaleen where the Zabaleen had to give the Wahiya access to some of the waste first so that they could continue to recycle it and make a profit.³⁷

Kuppinger explained that, once the waste began to diversify the Zabaleen improved their “recycling system to include glass, metals, bones, tin, paper, plastic, and rags, which were sold to dealers who resold them to workshops.”³⁸ The collection of waste, as Fahmi and Sutton noted, was and still is a family affair done with the assistance of donkey carts.³⁹ The fathers went out in the morning sometimes with the older children, usually sons, to collect the waste from his route. Once the father returned home he deposited the waste in one section of the home, which was relegated for sorting. The remaining family members, wives, daughters, and younger children, then commenced the sortation of the waste.⁴⁰ The waste was either recycled and sold, given to their livestock, reused to make sellable goods, or the last 15% is sent to the landfill even further outside the city limits.

³⁷ Fahmi, Wael, and Keith Sutton. “Cairo’s Contested Garbage: Sustainable Solid Waste Management and the Zabaleen’s Right to the City.” *Sustainability 2010* 2.6 1766–1783. Print. P. 1768.

³⁸ Kuppinger, Petra. “Crushed? Cairo’s Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics.” *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015.p. 625

³⁹ Fahmi, Wael, and Keith Sutton. “Cairo’s Contested Garbage: Sustainable Solid Waste Management and the Zabaleen’s Right to the City.” *Sustainability 2010* 2.6 1766–1783. Print. p. 1768.

⁴⁰ “The Zabbaleen: A History.” *A.P.E.* A.P.E, 2010. Web. 21 May 2015.
<<http://www.ape.org.eg/TheZabbaleenHistory.html>>.

As the Zabaleen migrated to Cairo, Kuppinger described, a Mu'allim, a middleman, assisted them to set up the new impoverished arrivals with "a shack, pigs and a pigsty."⁴¹ The Mu'allims began setting up settlements on the outskirts of Cairo in the 1950s and 60s when the Wahiya began to extend their services to accommodate the growth of the city. This constant urban growth and expansion continually had the Zabaleen relocating even further outside of the city limits.⁴² Finally in the 1970s authorities relegated several thousand Zabaleen to the lower plateau of the Moqattam Mountains in Eastern Cairo. Here the residents received no municipal services, but the Zabaleen persevered in their garbage collecting, recycling, and pig rearing. With the help of the Coptic Bishop Samuel the Zabaleen community started organizing in the 1970s. They founded "the first garbage collector's association, the Association of Garbage Collectors for Development (ABCCD)."⁴³ In the 1980s local and international agencies, such as the Association for the Protection of the Environment (APE) and Environmental Quality International (EQI), began to help the Zabaleen improve living conditions, infrastructure in the community, and develop new technologies for garbage collection.⁴⁴ Other programs, as Alamazzini noted, initiated by these outside organizations were the development of health centers, schools, job training

⁴¹ Kuppinger, Petra. "Crushed? Cairo's Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics." *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015. p. 625

⁴² Ibid, P. 625.

⁴³ Ibid, p. 625.

⁴⁴ Ibid, p. 625-626.

programs, and municipalities such as water and electricity.⁴⁵ With this outside investment families began to move out of the shacks they were given when they first entered the community and began to build more solid structures. A lot of the structures were built with cement and were 2 to 3 stories high. These solid structures also separated the Zabaleen work and home life, by separating the livestock and garbage sorting from the area in which the family would live.

By the 1990s, as Fahmi and Sutton explained, donkey carts that had been used for decades were now banned because they were offensive to the residents of the neighborhoods where the Zabaleen collected.⁴⁶ With the assistance of international organizations and the community, the Zabaleen, according to Kuppinger, were able to fund the purchase of garbage trucks. At the turn of the century the Zabaleen were only collecting 30-40% of Cairo's garbage, which was 3,000 tons out of 9,000 tons a day. There were 30,000 Zabaleen living in the Moqattam settlement and a total of 70,000 Zabaleen within the city limits of Cairo.⁴⁷ By the early 2000s another obstacle was presented to the Zabaleen and that was privatization of the waste management collection within Cairo, which has been given its own section in this chapter.

Egyptian Identity

⁴⁵ Alamazzini, Kim. *Egypt-The Zabbaleen Environmental Development Program (ZEDP)*. Paris: Enda Europe, n.d. Print. p.4.

⁴⁶ Fahmi, Wael, and Keith Sutton. "Cairo's Contested Garbage: Sustainable Solid Waste Management and the Zabaleen's Right to the City." *Sustainability* 2010 2.6 1766–1783. Print.p. 1768

⁴⁷ Kuppinger, Petra. "Crushed? Cairo's Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics." *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015. p. 626.

This section will touch briefly on Egyptian History and then focus on the Egyptian identity, more so the religious Egyptian identity. Having an understanding of identity in Egypt is significant to the study because it gives a background to some of the social elements that could have an effect on the attitudes and beliefs that will be seen in this study.

In 1922 Egypt gained its independence from Great Britain⁴⁸ and is, as Ibrahim noted, still known as a “country in transition.”⁴⁹ In that time of creation the newly created Egyptian government “copied the European models in structure.”⁵⁰ In the 1920s there was resurgence of Islam, where the constitution was changed to instill Islam as the state religion in Article 2, which stipulated the use of Islamic law or Shari’s law.⁵¹ As Ibrahim stated, even though the Egyptians copied the European Structures there was a vast rejection of western culture and values because of the belief that western values lacked moral values.⁵²

According to Ibrahim, “Egyptian Identity is built on four components: an Africa, an Asian, a Mediterranean, and a Nile.”⁵³ There are two different cultures in Egypt, the Baladi known as the local, traditional, backward part of the population and the afrangi also known as foreign which were seen as more progressive and

⁴⁸ Peretz, Don. *The Middle East Today*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963. Print. P. 109.

⁴⁹ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. p. 2.

⁵⁰ Ibid, p. 13.

⁵¹ "Report on Religious Freedom in Egypt." *U.S. Justice Department*. The Institute on Religion and Public Policy, n.d. Web. 1 July 2015. <[http%3A%2F%2Fwww.justice.gov%2Fsites%2Fdefault%2Ffiles%2Ffoir%2Fegacy%2F2014%2F09%2F29%2FEgypt%2520Immigration%2520Report.pdf%3Fid%3D1994](http://www.justice.gov/sites/default/files/foir/Fegacy/2014/09/29/Egypt%20Immigration%20Report.pdf%3Fid%3D1994)>.

⁵² Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. p. 13.

⁵³ Ibid, p. 11.

western.⁵⁴ A majority of Egyptians live in the rural areas of the Nile Valley, which has always signified the domain of life while the desert has signified death. This explains why Egyptians do not view the people of the desert as not Egyptian.⁵⁵

The Egyptian population was comprised of a Muslim Majority with a Christian minority. The Religious minority, as noted by Boles, was made up of Orthodox Christian Copts that make up around 10% of the population or about 6 million out of 64 million.⁵⁶ According to some reports 18% of the Egyptian population is Coptic Christian but the numbers are still not known, especially since a majority of the Zabaleen and other marginalized groups within Egypt are Copts.⁵⁷ The Egyptian government states that only 6% of the population is Christian and it had been speculated, by Ibrahim, that this was a way to minimize the Christian minority so that the chance of “Copts gaining a fair proportion of seats in parliament and of higher positions in the state apparatus.”⁵⁸ Although the Coptic Christians; who are part of a 2% quota system in admittance to popular institutes such as the Police, Marine and Military Academics; do not make up much of the higher levels of government.⁵⁹ The Copts have a high proportion in the civil service because

⁵⁴ Ibid, p. 12.

⁵⁵ Ibid, p. 8.

⁵⁶ Boles, Imad. "Egypt - Persecution: Disappearing Christians of the Middle East." *Middle East Forum*. The Middle East Quarterly, Winter 2001. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://www.meforum.org/23/egypt-persecution>>.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁵⁸ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. p. 25

⁵⁹ Ibid, p.25.

positions there are low paid and unattractive forms of employment, also the Copts are without the proper connections to reach any higher levels.⁶⁰

As Gorman, Anthony, and Newman explained, although Muslims are the majority in Egypt those Muslims were not descendants of the Arab invaders from the Arabian Peninsula, but descendants of the indigenous Copts.⁶¹ In the early 19th century, as Boles explained, the Christian minority began migrating from rural communities in Egypt to the major cities of Cairo and Alexandria due to persecution. Christians living in the rural communities had a difficult time due to being made targets within their community.⁶² There had been times of religious tolerance, but there had been some physical violence towards the Christians,⁶³ which was expressed by Gorman, Anthony, and Newman. In modern Egyptian times, Maddy-Weitzman noted that, there had been examples of economic discrimination, such as the djizya, which was known as a penalty that every non-Muslim had to pay.⁶⁴ During times of economic hardship, Ibrahim explained that, Christians converted to Islam to avoid the tax.⁶⁵ Although both the Muslims and Christians of Egypt are

⁶⁰ Ibid, p. 26.

⁶¹ Gorman, Anthony, and Andrew Newman. "Copts." Ed. Jamie Stokes. *Encyclopedia of The Peoples of Africa and the Middle East*. New York: Infobase, 2009. 168-70. Print. P. 168.

⁶² Boles, Imad. "Egypt - Persecution: Disappearing Christians of the Middle East." *Middle East Forum*. The Middle East Quarterly, Winter 2001. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://www.meforum.org/23/egypt-persecution>>.

⁶³ Gorman, Anthony, and Andrew Newman. "Copts." Ed. Jamie Stokes. *Encyclopedia of The Peoples of Africa and the Middle East*. New York: Infobase, 2009. 168-70. Print. P. 168.

⁶⁴ Maddy-Weitzman, Bruce, ed. *Middle East Contemporary Survey*. Vol. 21. Boulder, CO: Westview, 1997. Print. p. 313.

⁶⁵ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. p. 23.

basically ethnically the same they still separate themselves based on their religious identity.

Moving from a description of the Egyptian population, there will be a shift to those who have led Egypt in Modern times. The next three sections will focus on the three long-reigning presidents and their economic policies. Having the three leaders and their economic policies presented shows how the policies in Egypt have changed over the decades in Egypt and how those changes led up to the 2002-2004 waste management privatization.

Nasser and Socialism

From 1952 to 1970 Nasser introduced socialism, more specifically Arab Socialism⁶⁶, as the national policy following the structure of other communist states at the time. As described by Ibrahim, "Nasser tried to make the Egyptian Economy independent of western hegemony."⁶⁷ He introduced a socialist land reform, which limited land ownership and abolished the feudal land ownership where absenteeism was present.⁶⁸ This state controlled economy focused on strengthening the public sector, which led to an inflation of the public sector and a weakening of the private sector.⁶⁹ By 1961 the socialist laws gave the state full control over the

⁶⁶ Metz, Helen Chapin. "Egypt - Nasser and Arab Socialism." *Egypt - Nasser and Arab Socialism*. Library of Congress, n.d. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://countrystudies.us/egypt/34.htm>>.

⁶⁷ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. p. 160.

⁶⁸ Ibid, p. 93.

⁶⁹ Ibid, p. 94.

industrial sector, which also established the public industrial system.⁷⁰ Nasser, as Metz added, also nationalized the private banks, insurance companies, and fifty shipping companies and firms in heavy and basic industries.⁷¹ In addition to the nationalization of private entities and the land reforms Nasser also emphasized social programs. With these programs he was able to improve the living and working conditions of the peasants and workers, which included upgrades in living standards; such as better living quarters and electricity to homes; minimum wage laws; decreased working hours; and worker participation in management.⁷² An obstacle that faced the Nasser administration, as Ibrahim explained, was that Egypt engaged and was defeated in two wars with Israel and was also involved in a civil war in Yemen. This exhausted Egypt's resources and weakened the economy.⁷³

Two commendable results, as noted by Ibrahim, of the socialist economic system was that there was special consideration to the poorer sections of the population such as the fellaheen and the workers. In this time there was an improvement of social laws as well as a policy on industrialization that served the needs of people, which encouraged the local population.⁷⁴ The death of Nasser death in 1970 lead to not only new leadership but also new forms of economic policies.

⁷⁰ Ibid, p. 160.

⁷¹ Metz, Helen Chapin. "Egypt - Nasser and Arab Socialism." *Egypt - Nasser and Arab Socialism*. Library of Congress, n.d. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://countrystudies.us/egypt/34.htm>>.

⁷² Metz, Helen Chapin. "Egypt - Nasser's Legacy." *Egypt - Nasser's Legacy*. Library of Congress, n.d. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://countrystudies.us/egypt/39.htm>>.

⁷³ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print p. 93.

⁷⁴ Ibid, p. 94.

Sadat and Liberalization

From 1971-1981 Sadat, as explained by Ibrahim, went in complete contrast to his predecessor Nasser by introducing the Open Door Policy, also known as *infatih*.⁷⁵ This policy, as described by Ates, was a way to bring in foreign investment preferably from the West and also transform the economy to a free-market model that could achieve integration with the world economy.⁷⁶ He began to liberalize the country's economy with the promotion of foreign investment as well as Egyptian capital in the country. Ibrahim described, Laws No. 43 in 1974 and Law No. 32 in 1974 aimed at liberalization of the Egyptian economy, which caused favorable conditions for Egyptian and foreign investors. Some of the conditions were: "complete or favorable customs exemption, unlimited transfer of foreign currency, easing of import and export formalities, exemption from taxation of profit gains from trade or industrial activities for 10 or more years, exemption from observation of labor laws, official guarantees of no nationalization or confiscation, and numerous bilateral guarantees for investments made."⁷⁷

The liberalization, as stated by Ates, also created a comeback for the private sector, which was encouraged by the World Bank and the IMF.⁷⁸ The privatization programs and liberalized trade system attracted more foreign investment to the

⁷⁵ Ibid, p.94.

⁷⁶ Ates, Davut. "Economic Liberalization and Changes in Fundamentalism: The Case of Egypt." *Middle East Policy* 12.4 (2005): 133-44. Web. p. 135.

⁷⁷ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print p. 161- 162.

⁷⁸ Ates, Davut. "Economic Liberalization and Changes in Fundamentalism: The Case of Egypt." *Middle East Policy* 12.4 (2005): 133-44. Web. p. 135-136.

country and the bureaucratic empire was dismantled, offices were largely depoliticized, and the public sector was decentralized.⁷⁹ The encouragement of the new *infitah* policies and the private sector, as explained by Weinbaum, created new opportunities for profits and capital gains, which was another attraction for foreign investors.⁸⁰

As Ates noted, although the private sector had made a comeback the public sector remained dominant.⁸¹ Weinbaum explained, with this shift towards realigning and creating alliances with the West, Egypt separated itself from the rest of the Arab world.⁸² Those actions and the Camp David Accords lost Sadat the Arab support, he included in Islamization policy to bring back the Arab support. His Islamization policy, as noted by Ibrahim, also allowed the formerly banned Muslim Brotherhood back into the economic and political environment in Egypt.⁸³ This policy brought about an increase of Islamic banks and investment companies.⁸⁴ As Ates described, during Sadat's time in office there was the establishment of many ultra-modern factories as well as developing the energy and tourism sectors of the economy.⁸⁵

⁷⁹ Ibid, p.135.

⁸⁰ Weinbaum, Marvin G. "Egypt's *Infitah* and the Politics of US Economic Assistance." *Middle Eastern Studies* 21.2 (1985): 206-22. *JSTOR [JSTOR]*. Web. p. 211-12.

⁸¹ Ates, Davut. "Economic Liberalization and Changes in Fundamentalism: The Case of Egypt." *Middle East Policy* 12.4 (2005): 133-44. Web. p.135.

⁸² Weinbaum, Marvin G. "Egypt's *Infitah* and the Politics of US Economic Assistance." *Middle Eastern Studies* 21.2 (1985): 206-22. *JSTOR [JSTOR]*. Web. p 206.

⁸³ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print p. 94.

⁸⁴ Ibid, p. 95.

⁸⁵ Ates, Davut. "Economic Liberalization and Changes in Fundamentalism: The Case of Egypt." *Middle East Policy* 12.4 (2005): 133-44. Web. p. 135

Some of the criticisms, as explained by Ibrahim, of Sadat's economic policies were that they caused problems for existing local investors and brought in a massive amount of foreign imports thus creating disparities amongst classes.⁸⁶ This also "resulted in uncontrolled capitalism" and the "spread of corruption."⁸⁷ After his assassination by fundamentalists in 1981 Sadat's economic policies would not be affected by his successor as he had done to his predecessor.

Mubarak and Neoliberalism

From 1981 to 2011 Mubarak, as Ates explained, tried to "achieve a balance between the socialist economic rigidity of Nasser and the free economy of Sadat."⁸⁸ This would move, as Metz noted, the infitah policy of Sadat toward production instead of consumption, which was believed to benefit all of society.⁸⁹ Mubarak, as described by Veltmeyer, continued on with Sadat's infitah policy by approaching it in two ways. The first, which was encouraged by the IMF and the World Bank, was a series of social policies that began to transform social relations in rural areas.⁹⁰ This entailed liberalized agricultural rents and allowances for the evictions of tenants by landlords after a five-year transitional period.⁹¹ This moved toward a more expert-

⁸⁶ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. p. 95.

⁸⁷ Ibid, p. 36.

⁸⁸ Ates, Davut. "Economic Liberalization and Changes in Fundamentalism: The Case of Egypt." *Middle East Policy* 12.4 (2005): 133-44. Web. P. 137.

⁸⁹ Metz, Helen Chapin. "Egypt - Husni Mubarak." *Egypt - Husni Mubarak*. Library of Congress, n.d. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://countrystudies.us/egypt/46.htm>>.

⁹⁰ Veltmeyer, Henry. "Unrest and Change: Dispatches from the Frontline of a Class War in Egypt." *Globalizations* 8.5 (2011): 609-16. Web, p. 612.

⁹¹ Ibid, p. 612.

oriented production system, which is similar to the type of agriculture processes used across all of Africa. This resulted in hundreds of thousands of Egyptians losing their ability to survive resulting in a migration to the informal sector of urban centers.⁹² The second part of the approach was a policy on privatization, which is a vital component of neoliberalism. This caused for state employment to be cut back.⁹³ Included in that policy was a shift from public to private spatial development, which saw the government owned land becoming developed and an increase in gated communities.⁹⁴

The Mubarak administration, as noted by Ibrahim, implemented Structural Adjustment Programs, which were in accordance with the IMF and began in 1991. Those programs brought about “strict measures for the liberalization of the economy and the privatization of many state-directed companies.”⁹⁵ This action moved the wealth from the public to the private sector, which was described by Veltmeyer, as “crony capitalism.” Also in 1994 the GATT, General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade, agreement was signed which was a number of trade agreements that reduced tariff duties and abolished quotas among contracting nations.⁹⁶ The state controlled prices of wheat, rice, and cotton, which were lifted; also the high

⁹² Ibid, p. 612.

⁹³ Ibid, p. 612.

⁹⁴ Kuppinger, Petra. “Crushed? Cairo’s Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics.” *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015. p. 623.

⁹⁵ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print p. 96.

⁹⁶ “General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) | International Relations.” *Encyclopedia Britannica Online*. Encyclopedia Britannica, n.d. Web. 12 June 2015.

<<http://www.britannica.com/topic/General-Agreement-on-Tariffs-and-Trade>>.

tariffs on imported goods were reduced.⁹⁷ All of these policies fit with what was described as neoliberalism and how the use of privatization had been an important practice within the Mubarak administration and Egypt. This could help to understand why there was waste management privatization in 2002-2004.

Privatization of Waste Management in Cairo

In the early 2000s, as explained by Butter, the government believed that the Solid Waste Management system did not have the capacity to deal with the amount of waste produced by the city of Cairo. There were complaints amongst residents and government officials that the streets were becoming too dirty. The Cairo governate decided to contract out three of its zones to international waste management companies, two Spanish companies (FCC and Urbaser; Enser⁹⁸) and one Italian/National (AMA⁹⁹) company.¹⁰⁰ Fahmi and Sutton explained that, these companies were to bring a more technologically advanced system of collecting waste, a system that was successful in developed westernized countries in Europe. According to official development strategies, this privatization of the Solid Waste

⁹⁷ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print p. 96.

⁹⁸ Fahmi, Wael Salah. "The Impact of Privatization of Solid Waste Management on the Zabaleen Garbage Collectors of Cairo." *Environment and Urbanization* 17.2 (2005): 155–170. *eau.sagepub.com*. Web.p. 159.

⁹⁹ Ibid, p. 159

¹⁰⁰ Butter, Inge. "An Informal Waste Management System in Cairo: The Garbage Collectors and Their Settlements." Thesis. University of Leiden, 2006. *Word Press*. Web. <<https://mobileafricarevisited.files.wordpress.com/2010/03/scriptie-inge-butter.pdf>>. p.42-43.

Management was fundamental to the government's' plans to rehabilitate Medieval Cairo, an area that tended to favor the more tourist-oriented areas in the city.¹⁰¹

These companies, as Kuppinger noted, were to collect 8,000 tons of garbage per day and two of the companies were to receive LE115 million per year for the next 15 years, all beginning in June of 2002.¹⁰² "The companies were expected to collect household garbage, clean the streets, manage existing fertilizer factories, service medical waste, and construct sanitary dump."¹⁰³ As Kuppinger continued, these newly contracted companies had all of the newest technology and only had to recycle 50% of the waste collected. These technologies, such as garbage trucks did not fit down Cairo's narrow streets, causing residents to bring their garbage to waste stations in the neighborhood. This new contract no longer allowed for door-to-door pickup, a service that the residents of Cairo had grown accustomed in previous decades, which had residents placing their waste in containers that were placed on streets.¹⁰⁴ The containers used to collect the trash were often stolen and the streets were left in a worse state due to the Zabaleen scouring through the trash for items to recycle.¹⁰⁵ As Fahmi described, the residents would pay a monthly fee to the companies on their monthly electric bill, which was based on the amount of electricity the resident used in the month. This caused outrage amongst residents,

¹⁰¹ Fahmi, Wael, and Keith Sutton. "Cairo's Contested Garbage: Sustainable Solid Waste Management and the Zabaleen's Right to the City." *Sustainability* 2010 2.6 1766–1783. Print. P. 1769.

¹⁰² Kuppinger, Petra. "Crushed? Cairo's Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics." *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015.p. 627.

¹⁰³ Ibid, P. 627.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid, p. 627.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid, p. 627.

because not only were they expected to pay a higher monthly fee for garbage removal they were then expected to take their garbage to a container outside their home. These types of action defeated the entire purpose of the new waste management companies and a majority of residents continued to use the Zabaleen while also paying for a service they didn't utilize on their municipality bills.¹⁰⁶

At the time of the waste management contracts, Kuppinger explained that, the Zabaleen and the Wahiya were left completely out of the process. The Egyptian government decided to not renew or dispense garbage collection licenses to Zabals whose collection route conflicted with the newly contracted companies.¹⁰⁷ There had been a proposal, as noted by Fahmi, to move operations to 25 km outside of the city, specifically to those Zabaleen who reared pigs.¹⁰⁸ These suggestions were reasonable to those Zabaleen that raised pigs but for those Zabaleen whose livelihood was based on garbage collection, it was seen as a hardship. As Fahmi and Sutton described it, the total cost of this relocation would have been devastating to the Zabaleen because not only would there be an increase in transportation costs, but also in time to enter and return from the city would affect their sorting operation. Community and NGO leaders raised some of these issues when there had

¹⁰⁶ Fahmi, Wael Salah. "The Impact of Privatization of Solid Waste Management on the Zabaleen Garbage Collectors of Cairo." *Environ Urban Environment and Urbanization* 17.2 (2005): 155-70. Sagepub. Web. 19 Feb. 2015. p. 167.

¹⁰⁷ Kuppinger, Petra. "Crushed? Cairo's Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics." *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621-633. Wiley Online Library. Web. 19 Mar. 2015. p. 627.

¹⁰⁸ Fahmi, Wael Salah. "The Impact of Privatization of Solid Waste Management on the Zabaleen Garbage Collectors of Cairo." *Environ Urban Environment and Urbanization* 17.2 (2005): 155-70. Sagepub. Web. 19 Feb. 2015. p. 159.

been rumors of waste management privatization, but their voices were not part of the discussion.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁹ Fahmi, Wael, and Keith Sutton. "Cairo's Contested Garbage: Sustainable Solid Waste Management and the Zabaleen's Right to the City." *Sustainability* 2010 2.6 1766–1783. Print. P. 1780.

Research Design

In this chapter the research question of this study and the method in which I plan to answer that question will be explained. After the re-introduction of the research question there will be a description of the method used and then the rationale for the use of that method will be explained in the methodology. The methodology will also contain the advantages (pros) and limitations (cons) of using this type of method, but also the rationale for why this method was best suited for this study. The chapter will continue on with a description of the data used and how that data was collected, analyzed, and recorded. Finally, the chapter will end with a discussion of the limitations and delimitations experienced within the research and concluding with a summary of the chapter.

Research Question

“What was the effect of waste management privatization on the Zabaleen community in Cairo?”

Method

In this study the focus was on one specific marginalized community and the privatization of waste management, a phenomenon, which affected the community in 2002-2004. I used an analytical approach to this study, which, described by

Preissle, is a process of “developing constructs such as categories, statements of relationship, and generalizations, as well as the theory resulting from integrating categories and generalizations by examining incidents, events, and other information relevant to a topic.”¹¹⁰ For this type of study I used document analysis to obtain results from the data collected. Document analysis, as described by Bowen, is a “systematic procedure for reviewing or evaluating documents- both printed and electronic- material.”¹¹¹ The data that is yielded in document analysis is usually statements or exerts that are often organized into major themes and categories.¹¹² The data will be “examined and interpreted in order to elicit meaning, gain understanding, and develop empirical knowledge.”¹¹³ Document Analysis is beneficial to qualitative research because it produces rich descriptions of single phenomenon, events, organizations, or programs.¹¹⁴ With document analysis I was able to gather background and context from the data, which can show changes and development within the event as well as be a verifier to the phenomenon. For example, in this study it was especially significant because the chance of details emerging from that time period by individuals may no longer be available or be inaccessible at the present time.

¹¹⁰ Preissle, Judith. "Analytic Induction." *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Ed. Lisa M. Given. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. 16-17. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 26 July 2015. p. 16.

¹¹¹ Bowen, Glenn. "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method." *Qualitative Research Journal* 9.2 (2009): 27-40. Web. P. 27.

¹¹² Ibid, p. 28.

¹¹³ Ibid, p. 27.

¹¹⁴ Ibid, p. 29.

Methodology

Document Analysis is one of the many qualitative research methods that could be used for this type of study. As a researcher I felt that this method could garner enough documental data since the access to the community had become increasingly difficult for foreigners in the past couple of years. What had also been present in the data was that outsiders were not trusted or welcomed within the community. The time period that I chose analyze was over 10 years ago thus finding individuals that were available and could remember that specific space in time would cause limitations within the study. The final constraint was the time and possibly funding to thoroughly conduct other forms of research methods such as interviews, observations, or surveys. With these constraints the path to document analysis seemed the proper course of action and below I will explain the advantages and limitations of using document analysis followed by an explanation as to why I finally decided upon this type of method.

The advantages of document analysis are that it is efficient. It is more, as Bowen noted, “data selection instead of data collection.”¹¹⁵ With document analysis the availability of documents were already in the public domain and the documents were unaffected by the research process since I utilized documents that were not used in previous studies. These documents gave more details especially of the dates and events, which came as an advantage instead of trying to gather information

¹¹⁵ Ibid, p. 31.

from individuals about events that happened over 10 years ago.¹¹⁶ A lot of these documents came from credible news sources and international organizations so the information was reliable and valid. The analysis of the data would be easier and it could provide an insight into what the community thought and did at the time.

The limitations of a study such as document analysis are that there still will be insufficient details and some of the documents that I wanted were not available to the public or were very difficult to attain. Some of the information may be incomplete and may not be as clear as I would like it to be. The data could be restricted to what already exists and the entire process of document analysis could be time consuming. One final limitation I would have to acknowledge especially when using media based documents is the chance for bias to be present within the documents.¹¹⁷

As the researcher and having gone over the advantages and limitations of using document analysis as a gathering and analyzing tool I feel that for this study the advantages outweigh the limitations. The amount of information and documents out in the public sphere about the Zabaleen in the media, in documentaries, and in reports was enough to gather an understanding of the community socially, economically, and psychologically. Due to the time constraints of this study and lack of access to the community document analysis was the best option to gather as

¹¹⁶ Ibid, p. 31.

¹¹⁷ Ibid, p. 31-32.

much information as possible about this community based on the time period limits I put on the study.

Method of Analysis

Data

The access to individuals in the community was previously described as difficult to attain so the next best avenue of answering the research question would be through documents. The documents were chosen from areas such as media and international organizations that had a history of working with this community. The data that was used in this document analysis was comprised mainly of media sources from international news organizations and publications such as: BBC, The Christian Monitor, Daily News Egypt, DW.com, The Egyptian Gazette, The Egypt Independent, The Financial Times, The Gazette, The Guardian, The Middle East, The Mother Nature Network, The National, The New Yorker, The New York Times, SFGate, Social Policy, and The Times of India. There were also reports from international organizations and NGOs such as: UNESCO, Association for the Protection of the Environment (A.P.E), Environment Quality International (EQI), and Spirit of the Youth, the final piece of data used was a documentary created by Mai Iskander, 'Garbage Dreams,' that follows and interviews three youths over a four-year period during the introduction of the foreign waste management companies to Cairo. These documents helped create a broader understanding of the effects of the waste management privatization that took place in Cairo in 2002-2004 and also examined the effects the community suffered for many years there after.

Using these types of documents not only provided a perspective of the citizens, but also presented a perspective from the organizations that were involved with the community at the time of the privatization. The documentary provided an opportunity for an outside observation that could corroborate the findings from the themes established within the documents gathered. These entities were appropriate to the research because of the access that was granted to them during and after the privatization, something I as the researcher would not have had access to.

Data Collection Procedures

The data was collected using Proquest's International Newsstand database and further links from organizations such as A.P.E, EQI, and Spirit of the Youth- a large number of documents were initially pulled using these avenues of data gathering. A majority of the initial documents found were not pertinent to the study and were removed from the dataset. This decision to remove documents from the dataset was done using a document analysis form,¹¹⁸ which determined the documents that were to be used and which were to be exempted. The form from the benchmark institute¹¹⁹ was a guide in how to analyze if the document would be added or exempted from the research. The form had a spaces for the source, the author, and date, while also having a space for the researcher to summarize the contents of the document, list issues within the document, list the potential benefits and prejudices present in the document, and how the document would be admitted

¹¹⁸ Located in the Appendices Section on page 109.

¹¹⁹ "Document Analysis Systems." (1995): n. pag. *Benchmark Institute*. Benchmark Institute. Web. 23 July 2015.

or excluded from the study with a final comments section. As the researcher I used this form on all data collected in the initial search. Initially there were 65 potential documents, but once all the documents were read there was an exclusion of 39 documents leaving the final number of documents at 26. A list of the final 26 documents would then be compiled leaving the researcher to move on to a more thorough analysis.

Data Analysis

Analysis for this study was done by thematic analysis. Thematic analysis is used in qualitative research as a way to move from the broad to a sort of system or set of patterns presented by the documents. The data would present themes or patterns that the researcher would identify and begin to use to answer the research question. In this study I used a six phase process to analyze the documents¹²⁰: familiarization with the data, coding, searching for themes, reviewing themes, defining themes, and writing up. This process begins with familiarization of the data, which was the reading and re-reading of the data so that I became fully immersed in the data. I then began the process of coding, which is where I identified features in the data that could have been relevant to answering the research question. Once I finished examining the codes and assembled any other data, I identified a broader pattern of meaning by creating themes. Once I created the initial themes I reviewed those themes to determine if those themes create a story along with the data to

¹²⁰ "About Thematic Analysis." *The University of Auckland- New Zealand. School of Psychology*, n.d. Web. 23 July 2015.

answer the research question. Once the story was finalized I completed a detailed analysis of each theme and gave it a name. Once I had completed the entire process, the data was ready to be written up in an analytical narrative.¹²¹ This six-phase process was tedious and time consuming, but it gave the clearest answer to the research question.

Data Recording

Once the data was finalized through the initial collection process the documents chosen to answer the research question were then analyzed by the researcher using thematic analysis. The form previously described in the data collection section served as a base for the analysis process. The documents were listed in a table in the research so that future research can analyze the same documents as the researcher.¹²²

After a thorough review of all the documents, I then went through each document coding lines or sections of the document. In some cases sentences and sections had multiple codes while other sentences had a singular code. Once the initial coding process took place I as the researcher stepped away from the documents for one day. The following day I reviewed all the codes and documents again to not exclude any codes from the analysis. After the second review of the documents I then transcribed all quotations and their corresponding codes into an Excel spreadsheet, with some sentences or phrases being mentioned with multiple code names. Those codes were then listed in an Excel spreadsheet with the number

¹²¹ Ibid.

¹²² Located in the Appendices Section on Pages 107-108.

of times each code was seen among the documents. Those codes were then placed into their corresponding category. Once the categories were established the themes that emerged from the codes and their categories were established.

The data from the 26 documents were kept in two places, in a notebook with hand transcribed quotations and in an Excel Spreadsheet separated into coding sheets. The quotations were transcribed in two locations so to help with the analysis of the codes. This process of multiple transcribing helped the researcher verify that the quotations were coded correctly or to validate that the code needed to be excluded or given a different code name. This also kept the data in two locations so that if one collection of data was lost there was secondary place where the data could be retrieved.

Limitations and Delimitations

This study was quite specific in nature. It focused on a very small community within Cairo and was focused on a time period that had seen many changes within Cairo. There were limitations that would affect the way in which the study would be analyzed. There was also delimitation placed on the study so that the topic would not become too broad in its study.

The limitations faced within the research design were mainly from the data. Since the data was mainly documents from the media the issue of trust, time period, and language were three areas that affected the data available in the research. First the lack of trust by Zabaleen community to outsiders was a reason why I could not use other qualitative measures such as observations, interviews, or surveys, but the

media too was seen as an outsider for this community. Having documents with quotes from multiple individuals from this community was a rarity. As for the time period, the information for 2002-2004 was more limited in the search options. In a majority of the instances the 2009 phenomena, the culling of the pigs, were more present in the initial findings. Information on the 2002-2004 waste management had to be searched within those documents. Finally the language barrier was a final limitation within the availability of the data. In Egypt the official language is Arabic so the search for documents was already limited when Arabic was not an option. Having documents in Arabic would not only be time consuming because of the translation that would be needed, but also financially difficult since the translation services would come at a cost.

The delimitations I placed on the research design were based off of the limitations that were present from the initial investigation into this study. The lack of Arabic skills determined that nothing in Arabic would be used as data. In the initial search about the Zabaleen it was determined that privatization of waste management in 2002-2004 was the area that was important to study so any quotation or excerpts from the 2009 cull of the pigs was not to be used as data. When looking through the documents, even those on the cull, which have sections on the privatization of waste management, the focus was on the quotations from the section most pertinent to the study. With this delimitation it left a lot of documents out of the final data set, but it was the only way in which to narrow this study and answer the initial research question posed at the beginning of the chapter.

The limitations and delimitations placed on this research design, more so on the data collected, helped condense the amount of data used in this study. These limitations and delimitations gave an even more precise understanding of the effects of the 2002-2004 privatization of waste management on the Zabaleen community.

Summary

This chapter re-introduced the research question and the method that would answer that question. The methodology explained the rationale behind the decision to use document analysis and the chapter continued on to explain the data attained for this study. The chapter further went on to give a description of how the data was collected, analyzed, and recorded clearing the way for the findings to be presented in the next chapter. I explained what data was chosen, how it was collected, how it was analyzed, and finally recorded. All of this with the limitations and delimitations within the study gave the reader a full understanding of how the information was gathered and would present a valid answer for the research question.

Data Presentation

The data from this study contained codes, categories, and finally themes found after the use of document and then thematic analysis. The 26 documents used in this analysis were coded twice in the initial analysis and a third time in the transcription of statements and exerts. Within the 26 documents, 50 different codes emerged appearing 307 times throughout the documents. From those 50 codes there were five categories: *emotions, perceptions, survival, identity, and actions*. These five categories helped develop four themes: *loss of identity, loss of economic livelihood, adaptation, and transition of recognition*, which were comprised of a mixture of the five previously stated categories. The five categories and four themes will be presented within this chapter with data of statements and exerts from published sources used to give a greater understanding of the categories.

Categories

The coding process produced 50 different codes some of those codes being used multiple times while others were only used once. The categories with their corresponding codes are listed in Figure 1. This chapter will explain each category discovered with an example of the highest occurring codes within each category.

Emotions	Perceptions	Survival	Identity	Actions
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fear • Hopelessness • Distrust • Frustration • Uncertain of Future • Fear of Future • Sadness • Anger • Loss • Trapped • Feeling of Nothing • Trust • Pride • Determination • Powerless • Disregard • Loss of Worth • Loss of Identity • Difficulty 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of Recognition • Recognition • Building Recognition • Importance • Awareness • Need • Understanding • Praise • Preference • Dependability • Reliance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Livelihood • Loss/Lack of Livelihood • Fighting for Life • Struggle • Economics • Death • Loss of Dreams • Removal • Sense of Security • Challenges 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experts • Identity • History • Way of Life 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Change • Adaptation • Empowerment • Hostility • Perseverance • Giving Up

Figure 1.

Emotions

The *emotions* category contained the largest amount of codes. Since there was a significant amount of *emotions* codes presented in the documents with a majority of those codes crossing over with other coding categories it was best to begin the process by having *emotions* as its own separate category. 19 codes made up the *emotions* category with codes such as fear, distrust, and hopelessness appearing numerous times throughout the documents. Codes such as frustration, fear of future, uncertain future, and pride also appeared a number of times but not as predominantly as the first three. For the code fear, statements from published

sources such as: “I am always scared,”¹²³ “it’s their very identity, and they are afraid the government is going to take it away,”¹²⁴ “an identity, however, that’s in constant peril of being taken away,”¹²⁵ and “it’s our livelihood. There is nothing else that we can do to survive”¹²⁶ were some of the dominant statements from the data. The distrust code was more focused on the government and the authorities, but still very much present in a majority of the documents especially when discussing the contracts with the new waste management companies. Some examples of statements of the distrust code from published sources were: “the Egyptian government does not recognize our work. They sold out Cairo’s trash to multinationals without consulting or informing the Zabaleen,”¹²⁷ “no. [I don’t trust the government] not really,”¹²⁸ and “this was all done behind our backs.”¹²⁹ Finally the last main *emotions* code was the feeling of hopelessness with examples from published sources was: “it’s our livelihood. There is nothing else we can do to

¹²³ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹²⁴ Slackman, Michael. “A Way of Life Threatened in Cairo with their Pigs Seized, the City’s Trash Collectors Worry what could be Next.” *International Herald Tribune*: 2. May 26 2009. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015.

¹²⁵ Bell, Devereaux. “In Garbage City, Trash Is a Way of Life | MNN - Mother Nature Network.” *Mother Nature Network*. N.p., 24 Oct. 2014. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

<<http://www.mnn.com/lifestyle/recycling/stories/in-garbage-city-trash-is-a-way-of-life>>.

¹²⁶ Epstein, Jack. “From Cairo’s Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate.” *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

<<http://www.sfgate.com/news/article/From-Cairo-s-trash-a-model-of-recycling-Old-2495640.php>>.

¹²⁷ “Cairo’s Zabaleen Reclaim their Share in Garbage Collection.” *Daily News Egypt*. Jun 25 2010. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹²⁸ Osbourne, Louise. “Egypt’s Persecuted Zabaleen Garbage Collectors.” *DW.DE*. N.p., 7 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2015. <<http://www.dw.de/egypts-persecuted-zabaleen-garbage-collectors/a-17729385>>.

¹²⁹ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

survive,”¹³⁰ “we’re at our wits end looking for solutions,”¹³¹ and “I feel powerless, but there is nothing I can do to help my family and the Zabaleen.”¹³² Of the 19 codes present in the *emotions* category those 19 emotions were used 72 times and a majority of the time simultaneously with codes of some of the other categories which will be presented later in this chapter.

Perceptions

The *perceptions* category was the second largest code category with 11 codes used 82 times throughout the data. The *perceptions* category focused on the acknowledgement or lack of acknowledgement by the government, the Cairo residents, and global community on the Zabaleen community. The three major codes of this category were lack of recognition, building recognition, and recognition. Some of the secondary codes were need, importance, and awareness. When it came to the code lack of recognition this code represented the lack of notice or importance given to the Zabaleen community as perceived by the Zabaleen and those organization that worked with the community. Some of the statements from published sources that best represented a lack of recognition were: “the Zabaleen were pushed out of the garbage business, with no compensation for the loss of livelihood,”¹³³ “however, despite employing them in this job decades ago, the

¹³⁰ Epstein, Jack. “From Cairo’s Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate.” *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

¹³¹ Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. “Egypt Dumps ‘Garbage People’ ; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors.” *The Christian Science Monitor*: 07. Jan 06 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹³² *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹³³ Kadduri, Alan. “Turning Waste into Wealth with Cairo’s Garbage People (PHOTOS) - Your Middle East.” *Your Middle East*. N.p., 26 May 2015. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

government does not officially recognize them,"¹³⁴ "the Egyptian government regards the trash collectors as a shameful remnant of the past and wants to put them out of business,"¹³⁵ and "the Egyptian government does not recognize our work."¹³⁶ The code, building recognition, was comprised of the perceptions of the residents in Cairo and the Zabaleen believing that the Zabaleen were beginning to be recognized within Cairo. Some examples from published sources of building recognition were: "many Zabaleen seem to have accepted that they will have to wait for legitimacy until the government's contracts with multinationals expire,"¹³⁷ "I don't think anyone appreciated what service the Zabaleen were performing for the city at no expense at all,"¹³⁸ and "I feel people around the world are starting to care about trash. Some people now respect the Zabaleen."¹³⁹ All of these forms of recognition finished with the code, recognition. The perceptions of the Zabaleen and the residents in Cairo were able to provide a timeline of the transition with the final stage being recognition which was comprised of statements from published sources,

<http://www.yourmiddleeast.com/culture/turning-waste-into-wealth-with-cairos-garbage-people-photos_31874>.

¹³⁴ Viney, Steven. "Zabaleen | Egyptarchive." *Despite a New Regime, Cairo's Garbage Collectors Face the Same Hardships*. 19 Feb. 2013. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

<<https://egyptarchive.wordpress.com/tag/zabaleen/>>.

¹³⁵ Epstein, Jack. "From Cairo's Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate." *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

¹³⁶ "Cairo's Zabbaleen Reclaim their Share in Garbage Collection." *Daily News Egypt*. Jun 25 2010. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹³⁷ Viney, Steven. "Zabaleen | Egyptarchive." *Despite a New Regime, Cairo's Garbage Collectors Face the Same Hardships*. 19 Feb. 2013. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

¹³⁸ Knell, Yolande. "Air Quality among the Worst in the World." *Financial Times*: 12. Dec 17 2009. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹³⁹ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

such as, “Zabaleen are the backbone of the economy,”¹⁴⁰ “the Zabaleen were doing a much better job,”¹⁴¹ and “the Zabaleen’s system has won awards, been applauded at international conferences.”¹⁴² The codes in the *perceptions* category were powerful and an important category to begin to start answering the research question to what the effects privatization had on the Zabaleen community.

Survival

Survival was the third most populated category, which comprised of 10 codes that were present 95 times throughout the documents. The *survival* category was based more on economics than actual violence or destruction done onto the community. The three most prevalent codes were the loss/lack of livelihood, livelihood, and fighting for life. Those three made up a majority of the codes in this category. The loss/ lack of livelihood was prevalent in almost all documents and was one of the codes most associated with codes from the *emotions* category. Examples from published sources of loss/lack of livelihood were: “only one thing really seems to worry them: the thought that their livelihood dealing in Cairo’s trash will be taken away,”¹⁴³ “the income and livelihood of the Zabaleen was threatened,”¹⁴⁴ “the government will stop renewing the Zabaleen’s licenses, and over the coming months

¹⁴⁰ "As Cairo's Rubbish Grows, Residents Lament Decline of Street Collectors." *The National*. Aug 14 2011. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

¹⁴¹ Ibid.

¹⁴² Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People'; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors."

¹⁴³ Bell, Devereaux. "In Garbage City, Trash Is a Way of Life | MNN - Mother Nature Network."

¹⁴⁴ Baraka, Hoda. "Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories." *Egypt: Learning and Earning in Cairo's Garbage City; Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories; 2012* (2012): 1-3. UNESCO. UNESCO, 2012. Web. 17 July 2015.

foreign contractors will gradually replace them,”¹⁴⁵ “they will soon take all our work,”¹⁴⁶ and “they’ll take our trash.”¹⁴⁷ The discussion throughout most of the documents was the loss of access to the garbage, which was a commodity that the Zabaleen needed to secure an income to support their lives and the lives of their family. The code livelihood focused on the exact livelihood of the Zabaleen, it was important to acknowledge what exactly was described as livelihood when it comes to this community. Some examples of livelihood from published sources were: “many families in the Zabaleen community earn their living from collecting and recycling garbage,”¹⁴⁸ “it’s our livelihood. There is nothing else that we can do to survive,”¹⁴⁹ and “scraped a living by collecting and recycling Cairo’s vast quantities of garbage.”¹⁵⁰ The first two codes showed the importance of garbage to the Zabaleen community, the last code was an example of fighting for life or fighting for livelihood. Statements about fighting from published sources were: “fighting hard against privatization,”¹⁵¹ “because it’s instrumental in securing the future and livelihood of the Zabaleen,”¹⁵² “it became urgent to find the means to become part of

¹⁴⁵ Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People'; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors."

¹⁴⁶ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid.

¹⁴⁸ "It's Not Trash, it's Cash." *The Egyptian Gazette* May 14 2012. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015

¹⁴⁹ Epstein, Jack. "From Cairo's Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate." *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

¹⁵⁰ "Cairo Slum Dwellers Seek Equal Treatment." *The National*. May 20 2014. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹⁵¹ "Meet Focuses on Sharing of Collection Models in Different Nations Pune]." *The Times of India (Online)*. May 01 2012. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015

¹⁵² "Cairo's Zabaleen Reclaim their Share in Garbage Collection." *Daily News Egypt*. Jun 25 2010. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015.

the centralized system,”¹⁵³ and “It’s time to demonstrate this society needs us!”¹⁵⁴

This category had a substantial amount of emotionally charged quotations especially when it came to getting access to the garbage.

Identity

The *identity* category was the smallest of the categories with only four codes present and seen 42 times throughout the data. This category although small was an important category, in Arabic ‘Zabaleen’ means ‘garbage people’ so the identification as a garbage person is extremely strong within this community. It was evident in two major codes: experts and identity. Expert was a code that showed the Zabaleen’s expertise in the garbage- collecting field. Statements from published sources that expressed the expert code were: “cleverness is a Zabaleen trademark,”¹⁵⁵ “considered one of the world’s most innovative and efficient models of solid waste disposal,”¹⁵⁶ “we’re the ones with the most experience in recycling,”¹⁵⁷ and “we’re experts in garbage.”¹⁵⁸ This type of expertise was based on generations of families working within this community in Cairo thus creating its own identity. Identity was one code that when it came to statements given by Zabaleen the responses were very passionate. Statements from published sources about identity

¹⁵³ Baraka, Hoda. "Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories." *Egypt: Learning and Earning in Cairo's Garbage City; Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories; 2012* (2012): 1-3. UNESCO. UNESCO, 2012. Web. 17 July 2015.

¹⁵⁴ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁵⁵ Salopek, Paul. "Cairo's Pickers about to be Dumped:" *The Gazette*: A8. Mar 02 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

¹⁵⁶ Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People'; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors."

¹⁵⁷ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid.

were: “this way of life which has been passed down the generations,”¹⁵⁹ “are consummate outsiders- and not just because they collect refuse for a living,”¹⁶⁰ “in fact, as they’re proud to admit trash isn’t just a lifestyle, it’s an identity,”¹⁶¹ and “it is not a job, it is a life.”¹⁶² Although this is a smaller category it is still an important category especially for this community that had so strongly identified with the work that their community did.

Actions

The final category, which was made up of 6 codes and was only featured 16 times throughout the data, was *action*. The codes in this category were actions taken by the Zabaleen community in response to the privatization of waste management. The most prominent code was change and statements of change from published sources was: “integration into the formal sector of Cairo’s solid waste management”¹⁶³ and “Zabaleen out of the operation was not an option if they wanted to stay in business.”¹⁶⁴ Since this category had specific codes that were different from the rest of the codes and categories, it was determined that it needed its own category. Although this category was small, this category along with codes from the previous four categories emerged as a theme.

¹⁵⁹ Fryberg, Mel. "Egypt's "Greenest of the Green" at Risk." *The Middle East* (2007): 62-63. Web. P. 62.

¹⁶⁰ Bell, Devereaux. "In Garbage City, Trash Is a Way of Life | MNN - Mother Nature Network."

¹⁶¹ Ibid.

¹⁶² Slackman, Michael. "A Way of Life Threatened in Cairo with their Pigs Seized, the City's Trash Collectors Worry what could be Next." *International Herald Tribune*: 2. May 26 2009.

¹⁶³ Spirit of Youth. *Spirit of Youth Association*. Cairo: Spirit of Youth, n.d. Web. <http://garbagedreams.com/downloads/Spirit_of_Youth_Brochure.pdf>.

¹⁶⁴ Kadduri, Alan. "Turning Waste into Wealth with Cairo's Garbage People (PHOTOS) - Your Middle East." *Your Middle East*. N.p., 26 May 2015. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

Themes

After coding and transcribing the codes in the 26 documents, four themes emerged. The first and most significant was the *loss of identity*. Although the *identity* category had the least amount of codes, it had a significant number of occurrences within the documents. This could be seen as the initial effect that affected the community after the privatization of waste management. A second theme, which was similar theme to the *loss of identity*, was the *loss of economic livelihood*. This theme in correspondence with the *loss of identity* then leads to the theme of *adaptation*. As a result of *adaptation* the final theme to emerge was the *transition of recognition*. These four themes will answer the research question providing not only the negative effects of privatization but also the positive effects that privatization had on the Zabaleen community.

Loss of Identity

Loss of identity along with *loss of economic livelihood* was the two strongest themes expressed throughout the data. As it was stated before Zabaleen means 'garbage people' in Arabic, when the privatization of waste management was established in Cairo in 2002-2004 the *loss of identity* was one of the most predominant themes in the data. Not only were the codes from the *identity* category prevalent in this theme, but *emotions* codes such as loss, fear, anger, frustration, loss of identity, powerlessness, and frustration were present. The related theme statements presented throughout the data were emotionally charged. Since the Zabaleen community strongly identify as garbage people there was a significant

amount of quotations that expressed strong emotions. These types of quotations were a constant fixture in the data and are why this theme was described as an initial effect of the privatization.

Loss of Economic Livelihood

As it was stated earlier the *loss of economic livelihood* and *loss of identity* were two of the strongest themes presented in the data. *Loss of economic livelihood* was almost as prevalent in the documents as *loss of identity*. The two were very similar because not only did the Zabaleen identify themselves as, 'garbage people,' but they also earned a living from said garbage. When the garbage was taken away not only was their identity taken away but their economic livelihood. This theme was explained by the *survival* category where a majority of the documents touched on the loss of income and jobs for the Zabaleen after the privatization. In addition to the *survival* codes, *emotions* codes such as fear of the future, uncertain future, distrust, hopelessness, and fear were present. This exhibited how emotionally charged both *loss of economic livelihood* and *loss of identity* were within the data and why those two themes were some of the strongest to emerge.

Adaptation

The theme of *adaptation* was a result of both *loss of identity* and *loss of economic livelihood* themes. Although the discussion was on the losses, there was also a lot of statements and exerts on how the Zabaleen had coped with the loss and how they were going to continue. With *actions* taken by this community such as change, adaptation, empowerment, perseverance, and determination this

community began to adapt. This theme consisted of the smallest and least represented category, but still presented a theme that was vital in the understanding the effects of privatization on this community.

Transition of Recognition

The final theme of *transition of recognition* could be seen as one of the positive effects that privatization had on the Zabaleen community. Throughout the documents and data there were statements and exerts about how the government, authorities, and the residents of Cairo did not recognize the Zabaleen or the job they were doing. Some of the documents were published years after the privatization began; this theme presents the transition that took place. The data began to focus less on loss and more on how recognition by the residents of Cairo and international organization began to change. There was a transition of not being recognized/being seen as nothing to being seen as experts/needed within Cairo. Along with the codes in the *perception* category, emotions such as pride, trust, and determination were present with a lot of the statements. The first two themes discussed were seen as the initial effects of the privatization, but this theme was seen as a result of those initial themes.

The four themes presented in this section will be further discussed in the next chapter. There will be further analysis of the themes and how those themes were able to answer the initial research question of what effects the privatization of Waste Management had on the Zabaleen community of Cairo.

Data Analysis

The five coding categories of data analysis yielded the themes: *loss of identity*, *loss of economic livelihood*, *adaptation*, and *transition of recognition*. Using a thematic analysis approach I discovered four themes that provided a narrative, which described the progression of effects on the Zabaleen after the waste management privatization. These themes capture the human results of the privatization of waste management in Cairo in 2002-2004. The data suggests that two of the themes, *loss of identity* and *loss of economic livelihood*, are immediate effects of the privatization, while the data indicates that the themes *adaptation* and *transition of recognition* result from the *loss of identity* and the *loss of economic livelihood*. In this chapter I will explore the themes presented in the previous chapter and explain why two emerged as an immediate effect while the other two were not seen as a results until years later. I will further analyze the themes presented in this study and why those themes appeared within the data and why those themes are important for addressing the research question. The chapter will begin with the two immediate effects of the privatization, *loss of identity* and *loss of economic livelihood*, and then move on to the two themes that resulted from those aforementioned themes.

Loss of Identity

Loss of identity and *loss of economic livelihood* encompassed the two themes that characterized the initial effect of the privatization. Identity is a social construct that is complex and historically bound but also fundamental to how individuals and communities see themselves.¹⁶⁵ Since identity is non-negotiable and one of the most closely held needs of individuals its loss was significant for the Zabaleen community. The significance of identity loss was profound enough to make this theme the foundation for the balance of the themes presented in this study.

The *loss of identity* comprised statements and excerpts quoted from published sources from categories such as *identity*, *emotions*, and *survival*. Statements quoted from published sources, such as “garbage is all we know,”¹⁶⁶ “this work is all we know,”¹⁶⁷ and “garbage has always been our work”¹⁶⁸ establish the importance of garbage to this community. Since garbage collecting is the only work they have known, it is the only work community members can identify with. The Zabaleens’ first reaction to the threat of losing their profession was a sense of fear or loss, which they expressed most prominently as *loss of identity*.

Statements that further showed the extent to which the community derived its identity was its work with garbage, which included statements such as, “poverty-

¹⁶⁵ Cook-Huffman, Celia. "The Role of Identity in Conflict." *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution* (2009): 19-31. Print. p. 19.

¹⁶⁶ Salopek, Paul. "Cairo's Pickers about to be Dumped:" *The Gazette*: A8. Mar 02 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹⁶⁷ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁶⁸ Ibid.

stricken Coptic Christians who eek out a living from recycling garbage”¹⁶⁹ and “they don’t see we’re poor people who earn a living from trash.”¹⁷⁰ These statements also suggest that the Zabaleen had accepted their lower-class poverty status in a group that happens to be a religious minority in Cairo. A life spent collecting garbage is not seen as desirable, but their statements demonstrate the Zabaleen are proud of their work and their lifestyle; they are proud, for example, to say that they are “experts in garbage”¹⁷¹ and they see their “job as vital for the city’s survival,”¹⁷² because of their expertise their system of garbage collection and recycling, which “has won awards and been applauded at international conferences.”¹⁷³ Statements and excerpts in which community members emphasized the importance of garbage to this community were prominent throughout the data. Garbage to this community is really a way of life, as Bell point out, “in fact, they’re proud to admit trash isn’t just a lifestyle, it’s an identity”¹⁷⁴ Slackman goes as far as to assert that since “it is their very identity... they are afraid the government is going to take it away.”¹⁷⁵

Community members expressed similar sentiments in significant numbers at the onset of privatization. As one community member quoted by Smith states, “the people employed by the city just pick up rubbish because they are paid to. For us

¹⁶⁹ Fryberg, Mel. "Egypt's "Greenest of the Green" at Risk." *The Middle East* (2007): 62-63. Web.p. 62

¹⁷⁰ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁷¹ Ibid.

¹⁷² Smith, Sylvia. “Cairo’s Devoted Refuse Collectors.” *BBC* 2 June 2005. *bbc.co.uk*. Web. 13 Mar. 2015. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/4602185.stm>.

¹⁷³ Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People' ; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors."

¹⁷⁴ Bell, Devereaux. “In Garbage City, Trash Is a Way of Life | MNN - Mother Nature Network.” *Mother Nature Network*. N.p., 24 Oct. 2014. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

¹⁷⁵ SLACKMAN, MICHAEL. "A Way of Life Threatened in Cairo with their Pigs Seized, the City's Trash Collectors Worry what could be Next." *International Herald Tribune*: 2. May 26 2009. *ProQuest*. Web.

(Zabaleen) it's different. It's in our blood."¹⁷⁶Therefore, when the waste management companies entered Cairo in 2002-2004 the Zabaleen felt nothing but loss in their community. A sense of loss as one of the first effects of this privatization is an expected emotion given that some Zabals having started collecting garbage as early as age 7 and having spent their entire lives in the job. This loss was not just loss of a job, but an occupation in which community members were experts who were applauded for by international organizations. As it was stated in past literature Zabaleen in Arabic means "garbage people," thus the job literally defined who they were. This loss of identity was the most significant effect to the community when the government decided to bring in foreign waste management companies; this government action determined the outcome for the remaining events that would take place as a result of privatization.

Loss of Economic Livelihood

Although the Zabaleen suffered because of their *loss of identity*, an economic factor-the loss of their livelihood- also played a key role in how the introduction of foreign waste management companies to Cairo affected the community. Thus, *loss of economic livelihood* emerged as a theme within statements and excerpts quoted in published sources. This theme emerged from the code categories *survival* and *emotions*. The data clearly showed, as noted in an article in *The National*, that "the Zabaleen were the backbone of the economy"¹⁷⁷ and Salopek's observation that the

¹⁷⁶ Smith, Sylvia. "Cairo's Devoted Refuse Collectors." *BBC* 2 June 2005. *bbc.co.uk*. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

¹⁷⁷ "As Cairo's Rubbish Grows, Residents Lament Decline of Street Collectors." *The National* Aug 14 2011. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

garbage that this community collects daily “employs thousands of people in Cairo, not just us (Zabaleen), but technicians to fix our (Zabaleen) machines and trucks to carry our (Zabaleen) goods.”¹⁷⁸ Salopek adds that garbage is an important commodity to the Zabaleen that “has built schools, small factories, and everything else”¹⁷⁹ that is seen within the community. The author notes that the Zabaleen have “used their profits from trash to upgrade their neighborhoods, educate their children (all are currently enrolled in school), create jobs for women and improve their equipment methods.”¹⁸⁰ Gauch points out that, for the Zabaleen, trash “is their world, hundreds of thousands of people who have made lives and a community by collecting Cairo’s trash and transforming it into a commodity.”¹⁸¹ Salopek offers examples of this commodification, characterizing the community as an empire that “transforms other peoples’ discards into shoe heels, vases, coat hanger, and scores of other useful items.”¹⁸² According to a member of the Zabaleen community “it’s not trash, it’s cash.”¹⁸³ These quoted statements showed just how important trash was economically to the Zabaleen community and perhaps entire city of Cairo.

¹⁷⁸ Salopek, Paul. "Cairo's Pickers about to be Dumped:" *The Gazette*: A8. Mar 02 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹⁷⁹ Ibid

¹⁸⁰ Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People' ; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors." *The Christian Science Monitor*: 07. Jan 06 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹⁸¹ Slackman, Michael. "A Way of Life Threatened in Cairo with their Pigs Seized, the City's Trash Collectors Worry what could be Next." *International Herald Tribune*: 2. May 26 2009. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹⁸² Salopek, Paul. "Cairo's Pickers about to be Dumped:" *The Gazette*: A8. Mar 02 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹⁸³ "It's Not Trash, it's Cash." *The Egyptian Gazette*. May 14 2012. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

Hundreds of thousands of people would be affected by this privatization. At the time of the privatization numerous community members feared what would happen to the community if the Zabaleen no longer had access to the garbage. For members of the Zabaleen community, as Slackman quoted a local Coptic priest, “if you move the garbage, you will kill the entire neighborhood.”¹⁸⁴ Iskander similarly quotes a community member: “if that (garbage) gets taken from us we’ll be without our daily bread,”¹⁸⁵ and “there is nothing else that we can do to survive”¹⁸⁶ if it is taken away. When the foreign waste management companies entered Cairo, both the community and those who worked closely with the community were fearful. “The income and livelihood of the Zabaleen was threatened”¹⁸⁷ by the entrance of these companies, as Baraka notes. “The future of the Zabaleen and their livelihood could well... become history,”¹⁸⁸ Fryberg reported, and community leaders were warning that the situation could turn into what Gauch called “turn into a human tragedy for 60,000 people, who will be out of a livelihood- women, children, everyone.”¹⁸⁹ Iskander reported that at the time of the privatization the “foreign

¹⁸⁴ Slackman, Michael. "A Way of Life Threatened in Cairo with their Pigs Seized, the City's Trash Collectors Worry what could be Next." *International Herald Tribune*: 2. May 26 2009. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015 .

¹⁸⁵ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁸⁶ Epstein, Jack. "From Cairo's Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate." *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

¹⁸⁷ Baraka, Hoda. "Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories." *Egypt: Learning and Earning in Cairo's Garbage City; Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories; 2012* (2012): 1-3. UNESCO. UNESCO, 2012. Web. 17 July 2015

¹⁸⁸ Fryberg, Mel. "Egypt's "Greenest of the Green" at Risk." *The Middle East* (2007): 62-63. Web. P. 62.

¹⁸⁹ Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People' ; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors."

contract said that they (foreign companies) own all the garbage”¹⁹⁰ an edict that was extremely difficult for the Zabaleen to understand. The situation was especially hard for the Zabaleen to deal with because for decades they had had access to garbage throughout the city through licenses and agreements with residents.

After the foreign companies entered Cairo the amount of waste available to the Zabaleen decreased dramatically, and the Zabaleen were adversely affected by that drop in available garbage. They were losing their garbage, and, as Iskander reported, “everyone was struggling”¹⁹¹ Iskander quotes a community member’s observation that on “some days, there’s trash. Some days, there’s none.”¹⁹² The community was clearly struggling economically after the intrusion of the foreign waste management companies, with individuals in the community saying, as quoted by Iskander, that “there’s no more money in trash.”¹⁹³ These Zabaleen experts in trash had no other choice but to endure the economic losses; not only was this life the only one most of them had known, but also no other jobs were available for them to do to provide a livelihood for themselves or their families, as one community member, by Epstein, quoted “there is nothing else we can do to survive.”¹⁹⁴ This loss of economic livelihood clearly affected the Zabaleen not only economically, but emotionally, as well creating a distrust of outsiders and an anger and frustration toward the government. These types of emotions that emerge in

¹⁹⁰ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁹¹ Ibid.

¹⁹² Ibid.

¹⁹³ Ibid.

¹⁹⁴ Epstein, Jack. “From Cairo’s Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate.” *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

both the themes of loss of identity and the loss of economic livelihood lead to what is described in the third theme – adaptation.

Adaptation

Ultimately, adaptation to the privatization of waste management resulted from the community's emotionally charged discontent, characterized by the *loss of identity* and the *loss of economic livelihood*. The theme of *adaptation* emerged from statements and excerpts from published sources from the code categories of *action*, *perception*, and *survival*. As a result of the tremendous loss that the community felt, the only action the community members felt they could take was to adapt to the situation they were facing. A level of hopelessness expressed from within the community engendered the community's adaptation, which can be characterized as an unintended consequence of the privatization. The community with the help of NGOs started to campaign aggressively, as Rathke reported, "against the contracts that had been awarded to replace them with routes and trucks and had gone directly to the client to continue to provide door-to-door collection to try to hold on to the vestiges of their program."¹⁹⁵ Baraka wrote that "integration of the Zabaleen into the formal system was of utmost importance...Otherwise, we (Zabaleen) will remain on the fringes forever."¹⁹⁶ Statements like these showed that community members were willing to try anything to continue to gain access to the garbage even if that meant joining with the companies that took it from them in the first place.

¹⁹⁵ Rathke, Wade. "Zabaleen of Cairo." *Social Policy* (2011): 70-74. Web.

¹⁹⁶ Baraka, Hoda. "Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories." *Egypt: Learning and Earning in Cairo's Garbage City; Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories; 2012* (2012): 1-3. UNESCO. UNESCO, 2012. Web. 17 July 2015.

The Zabaleen realized that being “out of the operation was not an option if they wanted to stay in business,”¹⁹⁷ as Kadduri notes, so not only were they trying to gain access through the formal routes, but also through their clients, the residents of Cairo. They created and modernized their operations and asked for residents’ help to establish new garbage-collecting procedures, and in some instances, as Iskander reported, the “residents were receptive. Nine out of ten residents liked our (Zabaleen) ideas and cooperated with us (Zabaleen).”¹⁹⁸ The Zabaleen took the comments given to them as reasons for hiring the foreign waste management companies and decided to prove the community’s importance to the residents. Supporting the contention that the Zabaleen sought to demonstrate their importance to residents, Iskander quotes a community member as saying the “people need to see that we’re (Zabaleen) essential. We (Zabaleen) must have a plan of action. We (Zabaleen) have to modernize our trade.”¹⁹⁹ Iskander notes evidence of this same kind of modernization community members engaged in when they “mastered computers and maps.”²⁰⁰ They remained the Zabaleen, but they developed their work. Perseverance and the actions taken since the privatization provide the foundation for the last theme to emerge in the data- transition of recognition.

¹⁹⁷ Kadduri, Alan. “Turning Waste into Wealth with Cairo’s Garbage People (PHOTOS) - Your Middle East.” *Your Middle East*. N.p., 26 May 2015. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

¹⁹⁸ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

¹⁹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰⁰ Ibid.

Transition of Recognition

The final theme to emerge within the data was the *transition of recognition* for the Zabaleen within the Cairo population. Throughout the data a definite evolution is apparent from little to no recognition of the Zabaleen to an acknowledgement of need for the Zabaleen within Cairo. The statement and excerpts quoted from published sources within this theme derived from the codes present in the *perception* category. At the initial contracting of the foreign waste management companies, the government was criticized because, as Viney explained, “instead of holding discussions with the Zabaleen to explore ways to improve their services and recognize them, these deals were privately signed, without consultation.”²⁰¹ Zabaleen community members stated, as Epstein observed, that the government was “embarrassed by the Zabaleen.”²⁰² Viney noted “despite employing them (the Zabaleen) in this job decades ago, the government does not officially recognize them.”²⁰³ Epstein reported that some believe that the “Egyptian government regards trash collectors as a shameful remnant of the past and wants to put them out of business,”²⁰⁴ and because the government does not recognize the work of the Zabaleen, as the *Daily News Egypt* noted, “they sold out Cairo’s trash to

²⁰¹ Viney, Steven. “Zabaleen | Egyptarchive.” *Despite a New Regime, Cairo’s Garbage Collectors Face the Same Hardships*. 19 Feb. 2013. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

²⁰² Epstein, Jack. “From Cairo’s Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate.” *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

²⁰³ Viney, Steven. “Zabaleen | Egyptarchive.” *Despite a New Regime, Cairo’s Garbage Collectors Face the Same Hardships*. 19 Feb. 2013. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

²⁰⁴ Epstein, Jack. “From Cairo’s Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate.” *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

multinationals without consulting or informing the Zabaleen.”²⁰⁵ This type of treatment as perceived by the Zabaleen made them feel even less recognized in the sight of the government with many Zabaleen describing their social class as “the nothing class,” that “no one cares” about them, and “the authorities aren’t listening.”²⁰⁶ These excerpts describe the feeling and beliefs about the Zabaleen at the onset of the privatization of the waste management companies in 2002-2004, but as time progressed a shift occurred in the perceptions of the Zabaleen.

The shift began slowly with the actions taken by the Zabaleen as described by the *adaptation* theme. The community believed, according to Iskander, that “people will start to appreciate us (Zabaleen)”²⁰⁷ and that the society needed them. During the decades that the Zabaleen oversaw the garbage operation, Cairo residents had grown accustomed to their ways. Thus, as Kadduri reported, the “foreign companies realized how much trust and flexibility means for the garbage business.”²⁰⁸ Once the Zabaleen were removed from the picture, residents began to realize, as noted in *The National*, that “the Zabaleen were doing a much better job”²⁰⁹ because “they understood Egyptian culture.”²¹⁰ Thus recognition could have motivated residents to continue to use or revert back to using the Zabaleen as the unofficial garbage collector as Suzie Greiss stated in Guénard’s piece that “most people continued to

²⁰⁵ "Cairo's Zabbaleen Reclaim their Share in Garbage Collection." *Daily News Egypt*. Jun 25 2010. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

²⁰⁶ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

²⁰⁷ Ibid.

²⁰⁸ Kadduri, Alan. “Turning Waste into Wealth with Cairo’s Garbage People (PHOTOS) - Your Middle East.” *Your Middle East*. N.p., 26 May 2015. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

²⁰⁹ "As Cairo's Rubbish Grows, Residents Lament Decline of Street Collectors." *The National*. Aug 14 2011. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

²¹⁰ Ibid.

pay the Zabaleen to come up and get their garbage unofficially.”²¹¹ Subsequently, residents turned against the foreign waste management companies and requested, as Guénard reported, that they “bring back the Zabaleen back to the core of the waste collection and disposal process.”²¹² The residents realized that they preferred the ways in which the Zabaleen collected the trash and that, Iskander observed, “people around the would are starting to care about trash, some people now respect the Zabaleen.”²¹³ As one resident told the *Daily News Egypt*, “I think they make life possible for us. We spoil the atmosphere and they clean it for us. We should call them the nazzafine [cleaners] not the Zabaleen [garbage people].”²¹⁴ This type of change in the perceptions toward the Zabaleen community caused residents within Cairo to begin to express gratitude in the system that the Zabaleen had created while also critiquing the government’s handling of the privatization. The *Daily News Egypt*, for example, reported:

“The government should have prolonged their efforts, instead of asking the international societies to come and destroy their system. They found a way out of poverty, they managed the recycling business at the expense of their well-being, and they took care of our garbage. They succeeded in this complex business much better than the Western countries. We look too much towards the West, and do not see what is creative in our country.”²¹⁵

This exert showed that the individual quoted thought not only what the government had done was ineffective, but also acknowledged the good work that the Zabaleen

²¹¹ Guénard, Marion. “Cairo Puts Its Faith in Ragpickers to Manage the City’s Waste Problem.” *the Guardian*. N.p., 19 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

<<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/nov/19/cairo-ragpickers-zabaleen-egypt-recycling>>.

²¹² Ibid.

²¹³ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

²¹⁴ “A Landfill Called Cairo.” *Daily News Egypt*. Sep 07 2009. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015

²¹⁵ Ibid.

had been doing for years. As expressed in previous sections, the Zabaleen believed themselves to be the experts in this industry but were not recognized among in their own city and country. The privatization generated a newfound respect for the community.

Implications

Based on the information gathered from the four themes an argument could be made that the privatization had a positive impact on the Zabaleen community. At the onset of the privatization obviously the community suffered losses to both their identity and economic livelihood, but that loss triggered actions to take place within the community. Those actions had the community reevaluate their place within Cairo and realize their importance to the community, thus they decided to fight to retain their place in Cairo as garbage collectors. That fighting and adaptation that took place within the community brought recognition to the Zabaleen community. Residents were recognizing the community and the Zabaleen had seen to found a newfound respect amongst residents. Had the privatization not come into effect in 2002-2004 the Zabaleen would have remained stagnant and not have modernized their ways or become recognized within their community.

The privatization did not work within the economic scheme within Cairo, but it could be argued that when imposing neoliberal practices, such as privatization, on a marginalized community that is tightly connected to an economic industry that is to be privatized the chance of success could be diminished. If a marginalized community is emotionally and economically attached to an industry that is to be

privatized, it would be better to include instead of exclude because the marginalized community will fight to retain their position within the economic system as it was seen in the narrative previously presented on the Zabaleen.

These four themes represent the immediate and prolonged reactions to how the Zabaleen were affected by the privatization. The community suffered a loss at the onset of the privatization, and instead of accepting that fate, they decided to fight back through adaptation, which garnered them the recognition and respect that they felt they had not had and deserved. The privatization enacted by the Cairo government may have seemed to be a good idea at the time, with the casualties of the privatization limited to just one community. After some time with the foreign waste management companies, the privatization was deemed a system that would not work in Cairo, and eventually the system reverted back to the old ways, with the Zabaleen creating a better system and gaining a newfound recognition.

Synthesis

In this chapter I will discuss how the results of the thematic analysis corresponds with previously presented literature where in some instances the data supports what had been previously presented and in other instances it adds to the research. The chapter will continue with a discussion of the unintended consequences followed by a discussion on how the Zabaleen community fits within the realm of conflict analysis and resolution. The discussion on how the Zabaleen fit into the realm of conflict analysis and resolution moves the discussion of the Zabaleen from a focus in areas such as urban development and sustainability to areas that focus on conflict analysis and resolution. Finally, the chapter will conclude with an explanation of the limitations faced within the study and how those limitations could have affected the results.

Comparison with Previous Literature

At the beginning of this study past literature was presented on neoliberalism, privatization, marginalized communities, Egypt, and the Zabaleen. The results of the study will confirm what was stated in previous literature or will show how the data did not correlate with past literature. Based on the literature on neoliberalism and privatization the results vary when discussing the Zabaleen community. The

description of marginalized communities and the description of the Zabaleen community were verified by the data presented in this study. Finally the themes on *loss of identity* and *transition of recognition* confirm information presented in past literature on both the Zabaleen and Egypt.

Neoliberalism and Privatization

Neoliberalism is an economic system that is urged by international agencies in a lot of developing countries, which encourages innovation to be showcased and the idea of a welfare state is discouraged.²¹⁶ Looking at these two topics and comparing it to the situation with the Zabaleen it could be argued that those reasons would not be a reason to use neoliberal practices against the Zabaleen. As it had been noted within the data from Fryberg and Gauch, the “ingenuity of the Zabaleen”²¹⁷ “have what is considered one of the world’s most innovative and efficient models of solid waste disposal.”²¹⁸ These quotations show that the Zabaleen could fit well within a neoliberal model of economics because they will continue to create more efficient ways to improve their waste management procedures and the type of ingenuity present in this community could be capitalized on when using neoliberal policies. The Zabaleen as seen in the *adaptation* theme continued to improve their sorting and recycling methods to improve, which allowed the community to be able to recycle even more garbage. These types of

²¹⁶ Jessop, Bob. "Liberalism, Neoliberalism, and Urban Governance: A State-Theoretical Perspective." *Spaces of Neoliberalism: Urban Restructuring in North America and Western Europe*. By Neil Brenner and Nikolas Theodore. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2002. 452-72. Print. P. 454-456.

²¹⁷ Fryberg, Mel. "Egypt's 'Greenest of the Green' at Risk." *The Middle East* (2007): 62-63. Web.

²¹⁸ Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People' ; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors." *The Christian Science Monitor*:

actions could be seen as what would be required in an industry when using neoliberal practices and the inclusion of the Zabaleen would have been more beneficial to the economy instead of the exclusion that was present at the time of privatization.

The neoliberal objective to not have a welfare state was mentioned in past literature and what was shown in the the data was that the Zabaleen did not rely on the state.²¹⁹ As it was previously discussed the Zabaleen had built their homes, schools and factories with their own money and the community as, Viney reported, had “little to no access to health and social services.”²²⁰ As noted in a published source by Epstein, this community was seen, as “shameful”²²¹ and an “embarrassment”²²² to the government, but the community did not live off the state like some marginalized communities can in a state. This community contributed and worked within the economic structures of the Cairo economy at little to no cost to the government or any other sector. Since the community already did not use the services provided by the government, because they were excluded from those services, it would go against the practices of neoliberalism to not allow this community to continue its practices within Cairo.

²¹⁹ Alamazzini, Kim. *Egypt-The Zabbaleen Environmental Development Program (ZEDP)*. Paris: Enda Europe, n.d. Print. P. 4.

²²⁰ Viney, Steven. “Zabaleen | Egyptarchive.” *Despite a New Regime, Cairo’s Garbage Collectors Face the Same Hardships*. 19 Feb. 2013. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

<<https://egyptarchive.wordpress.com/tag/zabaleen/>>.

²²¹ Epstein, Jack. “From Cairo’s Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate.” *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

²²² Ibid

When focusing more on the practices within neoliberalism, privatization is one of the key ideals when using this economic model. Privatization, as Adams noted, is when there is a transfer of state owned enterprises to that of private owners and in particular in Egypt the use of contracts is a common practice.²²³ The reason for privatization, as stated by Bienen, is that the public sector is seen as inefficient while the private sector is seen as efficient and it can provide economic growth. The transfer of state owned property also reduces governmental costs.²²⁴ Privatization, according to Prizzia, has unfavorable effects on a society and usually affects the high risk and poor sectors causing them to fend for themselves and require new government services.²²⁵ Based on what happened in 2002-2004 the privatization of waste management in Cairo did not appear to justify the use of privatization. First, the waste management in Cairo was not a state owned entity. As it was previously stated, the city of Cairo had informal garbage collectors for decades, the Zabaleen. When the state decided to bring in foreign waste management companies the government did so through contracts, which the government paid.²²⁶ The reason that a state would use privatization was to reduce costs, when in 2002-2004 the Egyptian government increased expenditures, which

²²³ Adams, Samuel. "The Impact of Privatization on Economic Growth and Income Inequality in Sub-Saharan Africa." *The Journal of Social, Political, and Economic Studies* 31.3 (2006): 295-320. Web. 17 July 2015. P. 301.

²²⁴ Bienen, Henry, and John Waterbury. "The Political Economy of Privatization in Developing Countries." *World Development* 17.5 (1989): 617-32. Web. P. 617.

²²⁵ Prizzia, Ross. "Privatization and Social Responsibility: A Critical Evaluation of Economic Performance." *The International Journal of Public Sector Management* 14.6 (2001): 450-64. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015. P. 456.

²²⁶ Butter, Inge. "An Informal Waste Management System in Cairo: The Garbage Collectors and Their Settlements." Thesis. University of Leiden, 2006. *Word Press*. Web. <<https://mobileafricarevisited.files.wordpress.com/2010/03/scriptie-inge-butter.pdf>>. p. 42-43.

contradicts that statement. The Zabaleen community perceived its system of garbage collection as efficient while it appears from the data that the government did not. The introduction of the foreign waste management companies appeared to not make the garbage collection in Cairo better; after a short time of attempting to collect garbage within Cairo, residents began complaining about the new system and eventually reverted back to using the Zabaleen.²²⁷ This privatization not only sold an entity that was not state owned but also affected the one sector of the society, the one sector most affected by privatization, the high risk and poor. In a lot of situations the affected community will then turn to the state to provide service the community needs due to the loss of income and employment, but in this situation the Zabaleen couldn't acquire new government services. The government at the time hadn't recognized the Zabaleen so they were left to fend for themselves, which was something they had been doing for decades.

In previous studies, by Adams for example, the rationale why privatization could fail is that there is a lack of appropriate regulatory and institutional framework.²²⁸ This could explain the issues that the foreign waste management companies faced after the privatization in 2002-2004. From the data it was established that residents wanted the Zabaleen back, complaining that the foreign waste management companies were not doing their jobs correctly. This could be

²²⁷ Guénard, Marion. "Cairo Puts Its Faith in Ragpickers to Manage the City's Waste Problem." *the Guardian*. N.p., 19 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

<<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/nov/19/cairo-ragpickers-zabaleen-egypt-recycling>>.

²²⁸ Adams, Samuel. "The Impact of Privatization on Economic Growth and Income Inequality in Sub-Saharan Africa." *The Journal of Social, Political, and Economic Studies* 31.3 (2006): 295-320. Web. 17 July 2015. P. 304.

due to the lack of infrastructural framework within Cairo. The state never owned or managed waste management operations within Cairo and the decision to bring in foreign waste management companies showed a lack of understanding of the waste collection within Cairo. The appearance and technology of these foreign waste management companies may have appeared to be successful but as it was discussed in the data the companies were not culturally adept to Cairo. As Viney reported in his published work, the Zabaleen had “their thumbs on the pulse of the city’s waste management problems”²²⁹ and as *The National* reported, they “do a better job because they understand Egyptian culture.”²³⁰ The desire by the government to bring in what was believed to be a more efficient and aesthetically pleasing way of garbage collection may have been a valid reason to bring in these waste management companies, but the lack of infrastructure and cultural knowledge of the landscape could be the ultimate downfall of the foreign waste management companies.

Based off of the previous literature on neoliberal policies more specifically privatization, the use of privatization should not have been instituted in regards to the waste management of Cairo. It could be argued that the Zabaleen community was already using neoliberal practices so to exclude them from the economic system of Cairo was not the correct way to implement this type of economic system in

²²⁹ Viney, Steven. “Zabaleen Sidelined by Morsy’s ‘Clean Homeland’ Campaign | Egypt Independent.” N.p., 14 Aug. 2012. Web. 13 Mar. 2015. <<http://www.egyptindependent.com/news/zabaleen-sidelined-morsy-s-clean-homeland-campaign>>.

²³⁰ “As Cairo's Rubbish Grows, Residents Lament Decline of Street Collectors.” *The National*. Aug 14 2011. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

Cairo. It was believed by the authorities in Cairo that the privatization of the waste management system would work, but the lack of ownership of the industry by the government and the lack of infrastructural knowledge may have lead to the ultimate demise of the cohesion between the residents of Cairo and the foreign waste management companies.

The Zabaleen and Egypt

When comparing the data from the study with the previous literature on the the Zabaleen and Egypt the data corroborates a majority of the information presented in previous literature. There were only slight differences, which could be explained by the types of documents used in both the previous literature and the documents used in document analysis.

In the previous literature the history of the Zabaleen mainly touched on their migration to Cairo and the work that they had done in Cairo for decades. There was a significant emphasis on the history, the ways in which they worked and evolved their craft, and emphasized the importance of it being a family business as well as how important religion was to this community.²³¹ The literature emphasized the importance of the Zabaleen to the city of Cairo and how the Zabaleen were experts in their craft. The codes within the *identity* category confirmed that assessment of the Zabaleen and validated the findings done in previous studies on the Zabaleen. The importance of identity to this community further corroborated the importance of their identity in previous literature.

²³¹ "The Zabbaleen: A History." *A.P.E.* A.P.E, 2010. Web. 21 May 2015.
<<http://www.ape.org.eg/TheZabbaleenHistory.html>>.

In the previous literature one example of Egyptian identity was that it was believed that individuals or communities that came from the desert were not Egyptian.²³² This belief amongst Egyptians along with the description of the Zabaleen as outsiders could explain why the Zabaleen, who emigrated from the desert, were treated differently in Egypt. As it was also established within the literature the lack of recognition to the Christian minority was common practice within Egypt along with the constitutional article asserting Islam as the state religion.²³³ This also explains why in the data the Zabaleen emphasized their Christian minority status and why they believed they were being marginalized and persecuted by the government.

The only difference amongst the newly found data and that in the previous literature was the emotional presence within the documents analyzed, which could be due to the fact that the documents were primarily comprised of media sources.

Marginalized Communities

In previous literature, as noted by Cook, a marginalized community was described as a population that is excluded from the mainstream social, economic, cultural, or political life.²³⁴ Those that are marginalized are done so through marginalization, which is described as a way to keep others from threatening the

²³² Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. P. 26.

²³³ "Report on Religious Freedom in Egypt." *U.S. Justice Department*. The Institute on Religion and Public Policy, n.d. Web. 1 July 2015.

<<http://www.justice.gov/sites/default/files/eoir/legacy/2014/09/29/29%2FEgypt%2520Immigration%2520Report.pdf%3Fid%3D1994>>.

²³⁴ Cook, Kay E. "Marginalized Populations." *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Ed. Lisa M. Given. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. 496-97. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 16 July 2015. p. 496.

ideological, cultural economic and political power of the dominant. Those that are seen as marginalized are generally poor or oppressed, but are always able to earn a living and create possibilities in their margins of the world.

Based on the data previously described the Zabaleen would be considered a marginalized community in a number of these categories especially in regards to their economic status and their religious beliefs. Not only do the Zabaleen live on the margins of society in Cairo but also they are relegated to the job at the lowest possible position in Cairo. As Bell noted in her published work, the Zabaleen are seen as the “consummate outsiders- and not just because they collect refuse for a living.”²³⁵ Because of their economic situation and their jobs as garbage collectors they were moved to the fringes of society both economically and physically. The Zabaleen were moved to the outskirts of Cairo in the 1970s so that their operations did not interfere with life in Cairo.²³⁶ They were seen as outsiders in Cairo even though they had been living and working there for decades. Garbage collecting is not a glamorous job but was an important job in Cairo. The data from this study further corroborated how this community was seen as marginalized.

For the most part the data collected verified the previous research on the Zabaleen’s position as a marginalized community, their place in Egypt, and their described history. When it comes to neoliberalism and privatization the phenomenon in 2002-2004 could add more to studies on privatization and

²³⁵ Bell, Devereaux. “In Garbage City, Trash Is a Way of Life | MNN - Mother Nature Network.” *Mother Nature Network*. N.p., 24 Oct. 2014. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.

²³⁶ Kuppinger, Petra. “Crushed? Cairo’s Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics.” *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621–633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015. P. 625.

neoliberalism in Egypt. The data showed that the Zabaleen could be seen as a beneficial part of neoliberal policies, but in Cairo the community was not utilized. Furthermore previous studies on privatization and the rationale for privatization being used for the waste management in Cairo also could help further understand the repercussions of using privatization in certain situations.

Significance to the Field of Conflict Analysis and Resolution

When looking at the history of the Zabaleen in Cairo and the documents present at the time of the privatization there appeared to be a long-standing conflict between the Zabaleen and the government in Cairo. In this section I will explain the reasoning behind stating that what was happening between the Zabaleen and the government was a conflict, why the Zabaleen would be described as an ethnic group and the implications it has in conflict, the structural violence and subsequent relative deprivation this community endured over the decades, an explanation of why a lack of basic human needs led to the conflict, and finally how this conflict could be described as a protracted social conflict. In the previous literature the Zabaleen community was looked upon from an urban development and sustainability perspective not from the perspective of the community and there isn't much available on the community from a conflict analysis and resolution perspective. In this section there will be further discussion of the Zabaleens' place in that field of study.

Ethnic Group

The Zabaleen could be described as an ethnic group. An ethnic group is “a group that hold in common a set of traditions not shared by others with they are in contact.”²³⁷ As Volkan described, ethnicity is described as a sense of common ancestry that crosses generations, shares a collective history, and is a mode of thought. A lot of the time ethnicity incorporates religious identity with religious uniformity and religious beliefs and practices.²³⁸ As Volkan continues on, what is different about ethnicity is the understanding that there is an in-group and an out-group and that the in-group differentiates itself based on what they are not. This creates “some prejudices for their own group and against the others’ group.”²³⁹ This type of large group identity makes mobilization easier and when the group feels threatened by those that they have identified as the out-group it then strengthens their awareness of their identity.

By these definitions the Zabaleen would be considered an ethnic group because as Coptic Christians they differentiated themselves from the others within Cairo, who were Muslim. Furthermore, their occupation also differentiated them from those within Cairo. To be named a Zabaleen already separates and differentiates the community. The Zabaleen were the only community that collected the garbage in Cairo. The Wahiya played a part in the garbage collection scheme as a

²³⁷ Volkan, Vamik. "Ethnic Tents: Descriptions of Large-Group Identities." *Bloodlines: From Ethnic Pride to Ethnic Terrorism* (1997): 19-29. Web. p. 21

²³⁸ Volkan, Vamik D. "The Seven Threads of Large-group Identity." *Blind Trust: Large Groups and Their Leaders in times of Crisis and Terror*. Charlottesville, VA: Pitchstone Pub., 2004. 23-55. Print. P. 24-25

²³⁹ Volkan, Vamik. "Ethnic Tents: Descriptions of Large-Group Identities." *Bloodlines: From Ethnic Pride to Ethnic Terrorism* (1997): 19-29. Web.p. 24

middleman but clearly they were seen as part of the larger Muslim population.²⁴⁰ As Volkan explained, the “Christian Copts of Egypt, for example, proudly identify according to their religious difference from most people in their region. But they also believe that they are the direct descendants of the Ancient Egyptians... Thus they separate themselves ethnically from the majority of Egyptians, who are ethnically Muslim.”²⁴¹ This separation was acknowledged in past literature on the Zabaleen; one of the first identifying factors of the Zabaleen was that they were a religious minority in Egypt. Based on the data the community used their differences to explain why they were treated differently and used those differences to explain why they were the ones who should be the garbage collectors of Cairo.²⁴²

What can be harmful in having this type of in-group and out-group separation is what is described by Krostelina, as the chance for out-group threat, which is when there is a perceived threat from the out-group towards the in-group, it can lead to an increase in in-group prejudice and hostility toward the out-group.²⁴³ What is perceived as an “out-group threat is unequal economical, cultural, or political positions of ethnic groups; different citizenship of ethnic groups; memories of former domination of an out-group and attribution of the desire for revival; the perception that groups have weaker or worse positions in comparison

²⁴⁰ Fahmi, Wael, and Keith Sutton. “Cairo’s Contested Garbage: Sustainable Solid Waste Management and the Zabaleen’s Right to the City.” *Sustainability* 2010 2.6 1766–1783. Print. P. 1768.

²⁴¹ Volkan, Vamik D. “The Seven Threads of Large-group Identity.” *Blind Trust: Large Groups and Their Leaders in times of Crisis and Terror*. Charlottesville, VA: Pitchstone Pub., 2004. 23-55. Print. p. 24.

²⁴² *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

²⁴³ Korostelina, Karina V. *Social Identity and Conflict ;Structures, Dynamics and Implications*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007. Print.p. 209.

with out-groups; limitation of socioeconomic opportunities of the in-group by out-groups' political extremism, violence, and nationalism."²⁴⁴ When looking at the history of the Zabaleen and that of the Muslim majority or government within Cairo some of the perceptions had been expressed by the Zabaleen. In 2002-2004 the unequal economical position the Zabaleen felt with the privatization of waste management was an example, but also the lack of representation within the political arena was another area in which the Zabaleen were lacking presence.²⁴⁵ As it was stated in the data the Zabaleen also had little or no access to health and social service,²⁴⁶ which could be another perceived injustice.

With these types of perceptions present between the two major ethnic groups in Cairo, the Muslims and the Coptic Christians, it is surprising that there has not been as much physical violence reported within the data. Since the two groups were in such close proximity to each other and deal with each other on a daily basis, the chance for tension erupting into violence would appear to be greater especially since the Zabaleen had been within the Cairo city limits for decades. The strong desire for the Zabaleen to continue to gain access to the garbage, which is mainly controlled by the Muslim majority, probably played a key role in why tensions had not increased to more than discontent amongst the Zabaleen community. The fear that the community may lose their licenses and access to the garbage may have a

²⁴⁴ Ibid, p.209.

²⁴⁵ Viney, Steven. "Zabaleen | Egyptarchive." *Despite a New Regime, Cairo's Garbage Collectors Face the Same Hardships* 19 Feb. 2013. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.
<<https://egyptarchive.wordpress.com/tag/zabaleen/>>.

²⁴⁶ Alamazzini, Kim. *Egypt-The Zabbaleen Environmental Development Program (ZEDP)*. Paris: Enda Europe, n.d. Print. P. 4.

larger hold over the attitudes and actions of the community especially since the government had the final say in who had access. When the privatization came into effect the voicing of discontent and the disregard of the waste management companies' contracts became even more prevalent because the Zabaleen had already lost the access that they needed, thus respecting and following the out-groups' rules was not as important.²⁴⁷ These actions by the government led to a greater amount of distrust of the government by the community. That distrust could also explain why the Zabaleen began to disregard rules and began voicing their opinions more freely since their trust in the government had already diminished. This perceived lack of recognition and distrust felt by the community could explain the perceived loss of needs experienced within the community.

Basic Human Needs

As it was discussed in the previous section, the Zabaleen are an ethnic group and the Zabaleen entered into this group, as Coate and Rosati stated, because "individuals enter into relationships with each other to for groups-in an attempt to establish at least some control over elements of the environment which are essential for needs satisfaction."²⁴⁸ A 'need,' as described by Coate and Rosati, is a "requirement for people's survival, health or basic liberties", and a 'need' is not only a "necessity for biological survival but also for health and development" of the

²⁴⁷ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

²⁴⁸ Coate, Roger A., and Jerel A. Rosati. "Human Needs in World Society." *The Power of Human Needs in World Society*. Boulder: L. Rienner, 1988. 1-20. Print. p. 10.

individual.²⁴⁹ When human needs are deprived individuals will strive to satisfy those needs and in some cases will lead to deviant behavior.

The John Burton's model of Human Needs theory was used in this discussion in which Burton states there are four basic human needs: personal development, security, recognition, and identity.²⁵⁰ He established that "needs such as personal recognition and identity that are the basis of individual development and security in a society" and that "denial by society of recognition and identity would lead, at all social levels, to alternate behavior to satisfy needs."²⁵¹ Needs such, as identity is something that is non-negotiable and is important to individuals. Identity describes who the person is and is essential for individuals. Recognition another important need to the individual is where the individual or group is acknowledged and empathized with by another. Security, as Kanji noted, on an individual level is the sense of safety more specifically "freedom from harm, whether physical or psychological" and for groups it is "freedom from discrimination."²⁵² The final need is the need of personal development and if the other needs are met the individual or group will be able to develop and grow within society because all the other needs are met.

²⁴⁹ Ibid, p. 3.

²⁵⁰ Cook-Huffman, Celia. "The Role of Identity in Conflict." *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution* (2009): 19-31. Print. p. 22.

²⁵¹ Burton, John W. "CONFLICT RESOLUTION: THE HUMAN DIMENSION." *Conflict Resolution: The Human Dimension*. The International Journal of Peace Studies, n.d. Web. 24 Aug. 2015. <http://www.gmu.edu/programs/icar/ijps/vol3_1/burton.htm>.

²⁵² Kanji, Omario. "Security | Beyond Intractability." *Security | Beyond Intractability*. N.p., Oct. 2003. Web. 24 Aug. 2015. <<http://www.beyondintractability.org/essay/security>>.

Based on the data from the study it was clear to see that some of the needs of the Zabaleen community were not being met. As it was established in the *loss of identity* theme, that loss had the most significant effect within the community. When statements from published sources, such as “its their very identity,”²⁵³ “garbage has always been our work”²⁵⁴ and “garbage is all we know”²⁵⁵ the importance and identification of being a garbage collector is clearly established. Since the Zabaleen were so closely related to a profession the economics of the situation was much more damaging to the community. Their identity was based on their access to a commodity, garbage. At the time of the privatization the community was losing the one commodity that described them as a community and that loss was the hardest on the community. The loss of garbage affected all the other needs that Burton had previously stated and it was confirmed within the data. That loss of identity and economic livelihood brought about actions within the community to change and in some cases disregard the contracts and continue to collect the garbage.

As it was stated in the data collected the Zabaleen had a transition of recognition within the society of Cairo after the privatization of waste management. Statements in published sources, provided examples of the sentiments felt within the community before the privatization, “the Egyptian government does not

²⁵³Slackman, Michael. "A Way of Life Threatened in Cairo with their Pigs Seized, the City's Trash Collectors Worry what could be Next." *International Herald Tribune*: 2. May 26 2009. *ProQuest*. Web.

²⁵⁴ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

²⁵⁵ Salopek, Paul. "Cairo's Pickers about to be Dumped:" *The Gazette*: A8. Mar 02 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

recognize our work,"²⁵⁶ "the authorities do not acknowledge us,"²⁵⁷ "no one cares about us,"²⁵⁸ and "they don't recognize our expertise"²⁵⁹ These all showed how frustrated the Zabaleen community felt at the time of privatization. The Zabaleen were kept out of contract negotiations with these foreign waste management companies and they perceived it stemmed from a lack of recognition given to them by the government and authorities in Cairo. This lack of recognition forced the Zabaleen to find ways in which to be recognized and valued by their society. As it was shown in the data international actors had recognized the community for their recycling techniques and eventually there was a transition to recognition amongst the residents in Cairo, but this transition did not happen until after the foreign waste management companies had been in operation for some time.

When looking at the data on security, the physical sense of feeling safe or unsafe was not present amongst the data, but the psychological sense of fear was present, for example when Iskander reported a community member's sentiment of, "I'm always scared."²⁶⁰ This type of fear was featured in the loss of livelihood as a result of the privatization. A sense of survival was more evident than a sense of fear of physical harm. This sense of economical loss can be seen to produce psychological harm because the loss of livelihood places an extra burden onto those that were making a living off of the garbage. In some instance, as reported by Epstein and

²⁵⁶ "Cairo's Zabbaleen Reclaim their Share in Garbage Collection." *Daily News Egypt*. Jun 25 2010. ProQuest. Web. 17 July 2015 .

²⁵⁷ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

²⁵⁸ Ibid.

²⁵⁹ Ibid.

²⁶⁰ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

Osbourne, “it’s our livelihood. There is nothing else that we can do to survive”²⁶¹ and “I have to work by myself to make a living for myself and my children.”²⁶² This shows an immense amount of pressure and fear amongst the community and their access to basic survival needs. This type of pressure and psychological stress could lead to emotional damage within the community, which could affect development within the community.

In personal development the realization that the community had to modernize and grow their recycling business was evident in their discussion on garbage and their future. That need was not as pronounced as the loss of identity and the need for survival within the community, because those two needs superseded the need for growth and development. Salopek reported that, in the past the emphasis on how “garbage has built our schools, our small factories, everything else you see”²⁶³ was an example of how of their identity, recognition, and security needs were met, with the access to garbage the Zabaleen could continue to develop as a community. As Iskander reported, the desire for growth and a future was evident among the youths within the community who stated that, “I dreamed of owning a cans cutting factory”²⁶⁴ and “I plan to open a business in my neighborhood.

²⁶¹ Epstein, Jack. “From Cairo’s Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate.” *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

²⁶² Osbourne, Louise. “Egypt’s Persecuted Zabaleen Garbage Collectors.” *DW.DE*. N.p., 7 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

²⁶³ Salopek, Paul. “Cairo’s Pickers about to be Dumped:” *The Gazette*: A8. Mar 02 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

²⁶⁴ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

That's a dream I have to abandon. I no longer see a future for me here."²⁶⁵ Had the privatization not affected the community so drastically these youths would have had their own enterprises within the Zabaleen community. With the loss of other basic needs their dreams of a future had to be put aside so to survive the events affecting their community.

Before the privatization of waste management in Cairo, it could be argued that the Zabaleen were lacking from some basic human needs such as recognition, but their access to the garbage within the Cairo city limits satisfied their identity and security needs. The lack of recognition did not affect their access to the garbage before the privatization, but once the government decided to contract with foreign waste management companies their deprivation of needs became more evident. The loss of identity that happened with the loss of garbage was seen as the most significant. With that loss of identity a sense of security was lost within the community and that stemmed from the years of not being recognized by the government and authorities. With all of those needs not being met at the time of privatization the desire for personal development no longer appeared to be as important of a need within the community. This deprivation of human needs was a result of a much larger system of issues that were present amongst the government in Cairo.

²⁶⁵ Ibid.

Structural Violence and Relative Deprivation

As it was stated in the previous section the deprivation of needs leads to deviant behavior. This action practiced by the government in Cairo can be described as structural violence. Structural violence, as Sandole described, is a “structurally based discrepancy between actual and potential states of somatic and mental well-being, it need not be perceived by its victims or involve physical violence.”²⁶⁶ The most important factor is the “power to decide over the distribution of resources is unevenly distributed.”²⁶⁷ One theme of structural violence is relative deprivation; Gurr described relative deprivation as “a perceived discrepancy between ‘value expectations’ (VE) (resources or which one feels entitled) and ‘value capabilities’ (VC) (resource which one feels capable of acquiring and keeping).”²⁶⁸ To further explain Gurr notes that, values “are the goal objects of human motivation, presumably attributable to or derived from basic ‘needs’ or ‘instincts.’”²⁶⁹ These values are separated into three categories: welfare, power, and interpersonal values. Welfare values are those that are most connected to the physical well-being of the individual or group, which can include food, shelter, health services and physical comforts. This category is separated into two smaller sub-categories of economic and self-actualization, which is where individuals earn satisfaction from their

²⁶⁶ Sandole, Dennis J. D., and Hugo Van Der Merwe. "Paradigm, Theories, and Metaphors in Conflict and Conflict Resolution: Coherence or Confusion?" *Conflict Resolution Theory and Practice: Integration and Application*. Manchester, UK: Manchester UP, 1993. 3-21. Print.p.11.

²⁶⁷ Ibid, p. 12.

²⁶⁸ Ibid, p.12.

²⁶⁹ Gurr, Ted Robert. "Relative Deprivation and the Impetus to Violence." *Why Men Rebel*. Boulder: Paradigm, 2010. 22-58. Print.p. 25.

intellect or hands.²⁷⁰ The second is power values, which describes the extent to which individuals can influence actions and to avoid unwanted influence.²⁷¹ Power values are further divided into two subcategories of participation and security. The third category is interpersonal values, which is the psychological satisfaction that is sought from interaction with other individuals and groups. This is divided into status, community, and ideational coherence as a sub category.²⁷²

Breaking down the Zabaleen's values into those three categories can help to show how the community perceived their situation in Cairo. First looking at the welfare values, garbage was the commodity that provided food, shelter, health services, and physical comforts to the community. Their position as the garbage collectors in Cairo allowed them access to that commodity. The community then turned the garbage into an income, which led to survival within their community. When the privatization came into effect in Cairo the Zabaleen lost the access to their one commodity that would provide all their welfare values.

When looking at the power values the Zabaleen had little to no power in the influence of actions taken by the government in Cairo. As it had been touched upon in the data and in previous research the Zabaleen had not been consulted to help modernize or improve the waste collection in Cairo. The Zabaleen were excluded from the discussions for improvement and were not even informed of the privatization until after the contracts were signed. The community's access to any

²⁷⁰ Ibid, p. 25.

²⁷¹ Ibid, p. 25.

²⁷² Ibid, p. 26.

position of power within the government in Cairo, as Ibrahim noted, was small with, 2% of Christians holding government positions due to a quota.²⁷³ Also their ability to be included with the foreign waste management companies was virtually nonexistent at the onset of the privatization. In time the power within the community increased after the foreign waste management companies were not able to provide the service they were contracted to do, this led to the residents voicing their discontent and demanding the Zabaleen back.²⁷⁴ The Zabaleen in this instance were given power by the residents who saw the importance of having the Zabaleen being part of the waste collection in Cairo.

As for interpersonal values the Zabaleen were very proud of their profession, throughout the data they expressed how they were experts in garbage collection and that their recycle rate was at 85%, which was far and above that of many western developed nations. They had received accolades from international agencies for their recycling efforts and were used as the model for other nations to improve their garbage collection schemes. When the foreign waste management companies entered Cairo those interpersonal values were threatened because the one industry that they were experts in was being taken away. That left a profound loss on the community and a lack of understanding as to why experts in a field were being excluded from that industry.

²⁷³ Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print. p.26.

²⁷⁴ *Garbage Dreams*. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

It could be argued before the privatization the Zabaleen did not see themselves as relatively deprived. They had access to the garbage throughout Cairo and were given licenses to collect that garbage so their welfare and interpersonal values were equal in values expectations and capabilities. As for the power values the Zabaleen could be seen as relatively deprived in that area because they had no power within the government, but before the privatization there wasn't a need to influence actions because all their values were being met. When the foreign waste management companies entered the economic fold in Cairo that was when signs of relative deprivation began to take place amongst the Zabaleen community. The lack of power was evident from the onset, because the Zabaleen and their leadership were unable to interact with the government to either improve the waste management system in Cairo or to work in accordance with the newly contracted foreign waste management companies. When the Zabaleen lost their access to the garbage there was a change in the value expectation and the values capabilities. The Zabaleen expected to have full access to the garbage like they had had for decades and when they lost the access to the garbage their welfare and interpersonal values suffered. The Zabaleen were threatened with the loss of food, shelter, health services, and physical comforts. They suffered physiologically because they were excluded from the one industry that they were praised and received self-satisfaction and was the one area they were experts. Based on past actions the Zabaleen were capable of handling the waste management in Cairo, because the community had prospered in the industry for decades. The privatization of waste management

caused relative deprivation within the community and as a result the Zabaleen community started using deviant behaviors to regain their access to the garbage.

This type of structural violence led the Zabaleen to intensify the underlying conflict that had been present between the community and the government in Cairo. The loss of basic human needs and values to the systematic changes enforced by the government led to actions being taken by the community that eventually led to reprisal of their position back in the waste management fold in Cairo, but not until enduring years of hardship.

Conflict

According to Galtung conflict could be “viewed as a triangle, with Contradiction I, Attitude (A), and Behavior (B).”²⁷⁵ Contradiction, as described by Coate and Rosati, is the underlying conflict situation which is made up of “incompatibility of goals” and is “defined by the parties, their interests, and the clash of interests between them.”²⁷⁶ Attitude is described by the “parties perceptions and misperceptions” of each other and is usually influenced by “emotions such as fear, anger, bitterness, and hatred.”²⁷⁷ The third and final element is behavior, which is described by cooperation or coercion, or gestures that signify conciliation or hostility.²⁷⁸

²⁷⁵ Coate, Roger A., and Jerel A. Rosati. "Human Needs in World Society." *The Power of Human Needs in World Society*. Boulder: L. Rienner, 1988. 1-20. Print. p. 9.

²⁷⁶ Ibid, p. 9.

²⁷⁷ Ibid, p. 10.

²⁷⁸ Ibid, p. 11.

Based on the past literature and the data acquired in this study the interaction between the two main parties, the Zabaleen and the government in Cairo, could be described as a conflict. Looking at the first part of the triangle contradiction, the Zabaleen have always wanted access to the garbage so that they could turn it into a commodity by recycling it. Even before the privatization of waste management, the Zabaleen had fought for the access to the garbage. In the past the government required the community to move settlements and to upgrade equipment to maintain the access. In the past the Zabaleen had conformed to the demands by the government, but in 2002-2004 with the signing of contracts with foreign waste management companies, the community's access to the garbage was no longer available. These actions along with the demands by the government to relocate settlements in the 1970s and the modernization of technology in the 1990s, could make the argument that the government was trying to remove the Zabaleen from Cairo by using forms of structural violence.

When looking to the second point on the triangle, Attitude (A), the emotions present in the *emotions* coding category provided evidence for this section of the conflict. The Zabaleen on a number of occasions expressed distrust in the government due in part to a lack of inclusion or communication in the decision-making processes. Other emotions expressed were anger, because of the government's decision to deny access to the garbage and frustration, because revoking of the licenses lead to a potential loss of livelihood. The attitude of the government towards that of the Zabaleen was, expressed in the data as,

embarrassment and shame. This could be seen as one of the underlying factors as to why the government in Cairo wanted the Zabaleen removed from their position as garbage collectors. Garbage collection was seen as a low status profession, something that the Muslim majority would not partake in. This view along with the religious differences could have contributed to the attitudes present within the conflict.

Finally, Behavior (B) of the triangle was seen in 2002-2004 with the contracting of foreign waste management companies. This action was another way in which the government of Cairo tried to forcibly remove the Zabaleen from its garbage collection practices. At the time, privatization was the most recent policy enacted against the Zabaleen. Policies such a relocation to the outskirts of Cairo in the 1970s, the requirement of improving all infrastructural services within the Zabaleen community, and the required upgrade of donkey carts to trucks in the early 1990s were just some of the requirements that the government decreed to persuade the Zabaleen into either relocating or abandoning the garbage collection in Cairo. As for the Zabaleen, in most instances the community complied with the required policy changes. Before the privatization of waste management was finalized the community leadership tried to communicate with the government so that the community could be included in the new garbage collection process.²⁷⁹

Although it wasn't expressed as much in the data, there was one instance where a

²⁷⁹ Fahmi, Wael Salah, and Keith Sutton. "Cairo's Zabaleen Garbage Recyclers: Multi-nationals' Takeover and State Relocation Plans." *Habitat International* 30.4 (2006): 809-37. *Proquest*. Web. 3 Oct. 2014. P. 824.

member of the community did take actions that led to violence. The incident involved a waste management company, as Hessler reported, where a waste management employee was “stabbed in the lungs after infringing on a zabal’s turf” and according to the respondent “if you go into a zabal’s neighborhood and ask him for his trash, he is going to slap you in the face.”²⁸⁰ Although this was the only recorded instance in the data of physical violence towards one of the parties, this still demonstrates that hostility could take place amongst the two parties.

Based on the diagram that Galtung presented on determining if conflict existed amongst these parties it can be seen how the Zabaleen and the government in Cairo have had an ongoing conflict and this discussion will be continued in the next section on protracted social conflict.

Protracted Social Conflict

As this section on conflict analysis and resolution concludes, discussions on ethnic group, basic human needs, and relative deprivation developed an overlying understanding of the conflict between the Zabaleen and the government. That conflict could be further explained as a protracted social conflict. A protracted social conflict, as stated by Cook-Huffman, is a “result from the denial of basic needs that fundamentally connected to issues of identity, including the ability to develop collective identity, to have fair access to the system and structures that support and

²⁸⁰ Hessler, Peter. “What the Garbageman Knows.” *The New Yorker*. N.p., 6 Oct. 2014. Web. 8 Oct. 2014. <<http://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2014/10/13/tales-trash>>.

define the conditions that allow for the achievement and building of identity.”²⁸¹ In protracted social conflicts, as noted by Ramsbotham, the “focus is on identity groups” and “revolves around questions of communal identity” as well as a “disjunction between the state and society as a whole.”²⁸²

Azar, who founded the protracted social conflict theory, describes four internal state variables that when are present heighten the chance that conflicts will become prolonged and violent. The first of the four variables is that the focus for analysis needs to be on the identity group, (religious, ethnic, or cultural) instead of focusing on the state.²⁸³ In a lot of cases the structures of the state benefit or are controlled by one communal group and are unresponsive to the needs of other groups. This type of inequality leads to “frustration, fragmentation, a lack of system legitimacy, and finally conflict.”²⁸⁴ The second variable focuses on intercommunal dynamics and explains what the denial of human needs is a source of conflict.²⁸⁵ The third variable is on “the state’s ability to satisfy the collective social needs of citizens.” This happens “when a dominant group uses the state system to fulfill their interest at the expense of other groups” and in a lot of cases the elites are the ones that exacerbate the situation.²⁸⁶ The elites will mobilize exclusive identities so to exclude the minorities as a part of counter identification. The fourth variable is “that

²⁸¹ Cook-Huffman, Celia. "The Role of Identity in Conflict." *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution* (2009): 19-31. Print. p. 22.

²⁸² Ramsbotham, Oliver. "The Analysis of Protracted Social Conflict: A Tribute to Edward Azar." *Review of International Studies Rev. Int. Stud.* 31.01 (2005): 109-26. Web.p.114-15

²⁸³ Cook-Huffman, Celia. "The Role of Identity in Conflict." *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution* (2009): 19-31. Print. p.22.

²⁸⁴ Ibid, p. 23.

²⁸⁵ Ibid, p. 23.

²⁸⁶ Ibid, p. 23.

many emerging states have little resistance to the forces of globalization buffeting them from without.” This variable is the when institutions within the state focus more on relations to economic dependency and the focus is more international than of that of its citizens.²⁸⁷

As stated in the first variable the focus should be on the identity group, which in this case was the Zabaleen. As it was established earlier on in this section the Zabaleen are an ethnic group of Coptic Christians residing in Egypt, where there majority population is Muslim. In this variable the focus should be on the identity group, who are unequal to the Muslim majority in opportunities for economic growth, access to social services, and access to government positions/representation. This situation was further exacerbated at the time of privatization because the Zabaleen lost access to the garbage, which was the one commodity that provided some economic stability as well as provided the community social services. When there is this type of inequality it leads to frustration and fragmentation, which was within the data when a number of community members were frustrated with the government for not allowing the Zabaleen a voice in the privatization discussion. This frustration and lack of communication led to a lack of trust in the government and caused the community to further separate themselves from the state.

In the second variable the focus is on the denial of human needs, which was discussed previously in the basic human needs section. According to Burton the four

²⁸⁷ Ibid, p. 23.

basic human needs are: identity, recognition, security, and personal development. The theme *loss of identity* was one of the results of the privatization and it could be argued that the loss stemmed from a lack of recognition by the government in Cairo. At the time of the privatization the Zabaleen had lost their identity, had no recognition, their security was threatened with the loss of economic livelihood, and without the garbage to help the community to continue to thrive the chance for personal development was severely hindered. The community has had its needs deprived for decades but since they had access to the garbage a lot of the community's needs were fulfilled, but once that access was taken away the their basic human needs were then denied.

The state's ability to satisfy the needs is the third variable and is one area in which the state was absent with regards to the Zabaleen. As it had been stated in the data and in previous literature the lack of social service afforded to the Zabaleen were non-existent. Although the state did not provide services to the community, the access to the garbage provided the services the state did not. Once the government decided to deny the access to the garbage, the community's needs were no longer met. If those actions caused the community to vacate the land they occupied, the elites would benefit most from that decision because the chance for land development on the vacated land could benefit the elites within that sector.

The fourth and final variable is the little resistance to the forces of globalizations with a focus on economic dependency and a more international outlook. This was seen with the decision to privatize, which is one of the basic

practices in a neoliberal economic system. Egypt had been influenced tremendously by Western developed nations and international monetary agencies. These nations and agencies had pushed for a neoliberal economic approach. This type of approach could benefit the state economically but at the cost of its citizens. By bringing in these ideals from the outside, it caused the state to neglect its own citizens' needs and values thus continuing to help the elites within the country. This was demonstrated at the time of the privatization, the community was pushed into further economic disparity with feelings of hopelessness and fear of the future spread throughout the community.

With all of these variables present amongst the Zabaleen and the government of Cairo it could be argued that the conflict within Cairo at the time of the privatization was a protracted social conflict, and had it continued, could have turned more violent. The amount of violence brought on by the privatization was minimal or not discussed in the documents collected, but because of the *transition of recognition* that occurred amongst the residents of Cairo and the *adaptation* of the community there was a chance for the Zabaleen to regain some of their basic needs. This type of adaptation along with the community's lack of power within Cairo could explain why the community chose to not violently react against the state and its system for fear of retribution and to eventually gain access back to the garbage.

Unintended Results

At the onset of this study as the researcher I expected there to be results related to loss, specifically economic loss since this community was known for its

garbage collection. Other factors that appeared in the themes after collection brought more dimensions to the community that I wasn't expecting or even thought of when I initially started this study. In this section I further discuss the findings that I hadn't anticipated.

The *loss of economic livelihood* was an outcome of the privatization that I expected when I began this study. Since the Zabaleen had always been described as garbage collectors and their industry was comprised of numerous families living in a large community on the outskirts of Cairo I felt that the economic loss would be detrimental to the community. As it was described in the theme of *loss of economic livelihood*, this was one of the initial effects of the privatization, but it was not the only one. The *loss of identity* was seen to have an even larger effect on the community. The *loss of identity*, I believed, would play a part in the results of the study but not such a significant and emotional effect as was presented in the data. What was anticipated was the loss of work and access to garbage, not the amount of times identity was present in the data. The community's passionate description of the loss of identity due to the privatization was unexpected.

Another area within the results that was unexpected was the actions taken by the community and the recognition that the community gained from those actions. Taking action was not as much of a surprise especially when the loss of identity was prevalent within the community, but the type of action was more unexpected. If there was a loss of identity or economic livelihood violent actions could be seen as a result, but the violent actions taken by the Zabaleen were little to

non-existent within the data. The Zabaleen tried to adapt to the changing environment with hopes that they could work their way back into the system. The community disregarded the rules and still collected garbage from their residents, but those actions could be seen as passive, especially when the survival of a community is of importance. The final area that was unexpected in the results was the recognition the community gained within Cairo. Previous literature and the data suggested that the Zabaleen were seen as nothing and that no one wanted the Zabaleen around. What was unexpected was that after some time with the foreign waste management companies the residents of Cairo realized how important the Zabaleen were to Cairo and requested their presence as the city's garbage collectors. This type of recognition garnered the community a newfound respect that wasn't seen before the privatization.

The results from the data further added to the previous literature about the Zabaleen community and to the overall understanding of the events after the privatization in 2002-2004. These unintended results gave a broader understanding of the Zabaleen community that was missing in previous literature as well as showed how their conflict evolved within the city of Cairo.

Limitations within the Study

Within this study there were some limitations within the data. As it was discussed in the research design chapter a lot of the limitations within the potential data were present at the end of the study. Although there was a significant amount of documents collected, the data that emerged was still missing voices and opinions

from one side of the conflict, the government and the foreign waste management companies. The number of available statements or excerpts from the Zabaleen community could be seen as another limitation within the study. Although there were limitations within the study the data collected from this study still gave a clear understanding of the phenomenon in 2002-2004 and could still answer the research question as to what was the effect of waste management privatization on the Zabaleen community.

One of the main limitations in the data was the lack of governmental statements or excerpts regarding the Zabaleen or the foreign waste management companies. Although the study was focused on understanding the effects on the Zabaleen community, having the government's voice present in the data could have given another element to the data results. There were instances where government officials were quoted, but more so in a reactionary tone than in an explanatory tone. Furthermore, any statements or excerpts from the foreign waste management companies were virtually nonexistent within the data. This led to the belief that the foreign waste management companies had no interaction with the Zabaleen community. Not having the opposition present in the data did not affect the results of the study when the initial research question was the effects on the Zabaleen community, but could have furthered the discussion on privatization. Including the voices of the government and the foreign waste management companies in the discussion could have provided a different picture of the events in 2002-2004.

As it had been expressed in previous chapters the lack of access to the Zabaleen would be a limitation within this study. Although there were a decent amount of statements from those within the Zabaleen community there could have been more. The lack of statements or exerts could be due in part to the Zabaleen community not trusting outsiders or a fear of retribution if individuals within the community were to speak out against the government. This lack of statements and exerts by members of the Zabaleen did not adversely affect the data collected because as it was previously stated there was still a significant amount of data processed from the documents.

With those statements or exerts another limitation could be the amount of emotions appearing within the documents. Since a majority of the documents were media based, emotions seemed to be more prevalent, which could in some instance be seen as a bias. As a researcher the emotionally charged statements or exerts lead me to placing importance on those statements or exerts especially when the statements or exerts came from individuals within the community. Those types of statements or exerts seemed to highlight the importance that the data in the themes *loss of identity* and *loss of economic livelihood* had on the community at the time of the privatization.

Although the lack of government and foreign company statements or exerts were seen as a limitation it did not effect the results of this study. The amount of statements and exerts from those within the Zabaleen community were seen as a limitation, but the amount present were still enough to provide a clear

understanding of the effects of privatization in 2002-2004. The limitations previously expressed although small needed to be considered when understanding how the data was analyzed and why certain avenues were left undiscovered by the researcher.

Conclusion

In this study I sought to answer the research question: “what was the effects of waste management privatization on the Zabaleen community in Cairo?” Through document and thematic analysis of 26 sources, from those sources I established fifty codes spread across five categories and from those five categories yielded four themes: *loss of identity*, *loss of economic livelihood*, *adaptation*, and *transition of recognition* to answer my research question through a thematic narrative.

At the beginning of this studied, it was established that some of decisions made by the Egyptian government were influenced by Western developed nations and international monetary funds, which affected the society within Egypt. The use of privatization and the lack of recognition for the marginalized within Cairo had a profound effect on the society of Cairo. The disparity amongst the elites and the marginalized grew due to economic decisions made by those in positions of power.

This study focused on one marginalized community in Cairo, known as the Zabaleen, with the desire to understand how one phenomenon in 2002-2004 affected the community and how those results could help in future research. In previous literature there was discussion on the Zabaleen, but that was written from urban development and sustainability perspective, not from a perspective of the

community. This study tried to understand the perceptions of the community so to see the events of 2002-2004 from the community's point of view.

In chapter 2 of this study I introduced past literature related to the phenomenon in Egypt. I began the chapter with a basic overview of the very broad economic policy of neoliberalism. I then narrowed the scope of the economic policy to the neoliberal policy of privatization, a practice prominently used by the Mubarak administration in Egypt. I then touched up marginalization and marginalized communities, moving onto the group of this study the Zabaleen. After focusing on the Zabaleen I moved the scope larger to the country that this community inhabited, Egypt. Following a description of historical events and Egyptian identity the focus shifted to three of Egypt's leaders; Nasser, Sadat, and Mubarak; and their economic policies. Looking at the progression of their economic policies helped to understand the economic environment in Cairo at the time of the privatization. Finally I looked at the privatization of the waste management that took place in 2002-2004 in Cairo. This chapter gave the reader a basic understanding of the economics and culture within Cairo at the time of the phenomenon and provided a base for understanding the data collected through document analysis.

In chapter 3, the research design was presented. As it was touched upon at the beginning of the conclusion I used document analysis to gather the codes that would be categorized and then separated into themes for thematic analysis. The documents were published media source, brochures from international organizations and NGOs, and a documentary. The documents were then coded three

times, two of those times done with the use of a document analysis sheet and the third time was done through transcription of the codes to an Excel spreadsheet. Once the codes were comprised they were sorted into five categories: *emotions*, *perceptions*, *survival*, *identity*, and *action*. Codes from those five categories yielded the four themes of: *loss of identity*, *loss of economic livelihood*, *adaptation*, and *transition of recognition*. The second half of the chapter focused on methodology with an explanation of the pros and cons of using document and thematic analysis eventually ending with why the method was chosen. The chapter concluded with the limitations and delimitations that appeared at the onset of the data collection and analysis. Those limitations and delimitations focused on lack of access to the community, lack of language skills on the part of the researcher, and expenditures needed to do a more comprehensive study.

In Chapter 4, the data from the document analysis was presented. The five code categories: *emotions*, *perceptions*, *survival*, *identity*, and *actions*; were presented with examples from the data that confirmed the creation of the categories. Statements and exerts from published sources were presented throughout the chapter, with the attempt to introduce as much of the data to the reader as possible, because as it was established in the chapter the document analysis produced 50 codes that were seen 307 times throughout the 26 documents analyzed. The chapter concluded with a brief description of the four themes that appeared from the five coding categories.

In chapter 5, the data was analyzed using thematic analysis, it established a thematic narrative based on the four themes of *loss of identity*, *loss of economic livelihood*, *adaptation*, and *transition of recognition*. In the theme, *loss of identity*, the data provided from the published sources showed how important it was for the Zabaleen to continue to collect garbage. The data within the *loss of identity* theme also showed that when the privatization took affect in 2002-2004 there was a profound loss of identity amongst members in the community. The *loss of economic livelihood* theme was similar to the *loss of identity* theme and it was comprised of data from published sources on the economically effects the privatization had on the community, especially the loss of livelihood that occurred when access to the garbage was denied to the community. The *adaptation* theme was based off of the data from published sources that explained the actions taken by the Zabaleen community to maintain the access to garbage after the privatization. The final theme was the *transition of recognition*, which showed the progression through the published sources beginning with the Zabaleen having little to no recognition to gaining recognition after taking actions to continue to be relevant in Cairo. Those four themes created a sequential narrative that explained the effects that the privatization had on the community in 2002-2004.

In Chapter 6, the results were further discussed by first comparing the data with previous literature. These comparisons showed how the data either corroborated what was already present in the field of study as well as add extra dimensions to the previous research. The chapter continued with the significance of

a study on the Zabaleen and how it could be to the field of conflict analysis and resolution. A majority of academic sources on the Zabaleen community is from the fields of urban development, sustainability, and international financial sectors. While discussing ethnic groups, basic human needs, relative deprivation, conflict, and protracted social conflict this section brings to light the need for more studies on this community in the field of conflict analysis and resolution. This section is followed by the unintended consequences I as the researcher faced while analyzing the data, which was based on the findings from the themes of *adaptation* and *transition of recognition*. The chapter concludes with a discussion on the limitations present within the study, for example the lack of government statements or exerts as well as the lack of statements and exerts from the Zabaleen community due to the community's lack of trust of outsiders. These limitations explain the type of data that was collected and also provides motivation for future studies done with this community.

When there was a discussion of privatization at the onset of the study, I as the researcher believed that the effects on the community would be economically based and the community would suffer negatively from the privatization. As I analyzed the data, the resulting themes presented the economical losses from the time of the privatization, but the identity loss seemed to be the most profound effect on the community. The type of emotional loss that was associated with the loss of identity seemed to actually fuel the desire to adapt and take action. The most unexpected finding was the change in recognition for the Zabaleen community. The

losses were profound to the community, but I think that the privatization was actually good for the Zabaleen. This privatization may have taken away the access to the garbage for a period of time, but the loss and actions this community took brought about an even better result. The community began to be recognized and acknowledged by the residents in Cairo. Their expertise became recognized, which made an argument to bring back the Zabaleen to the economic fold of waste management. This type of recognition could allow the Zabaleen to be seen as important and be included in the future.

What this study means for the Zabaleen is that the hardship that they suffered at the privatization in 2002-2004 were positive, because it caused the community to adapt and modernize their system thus bringing acknowledgment and recognition to this marginalized community. This understanding could bring about more inclusion instead of exclusion within the society of Egypt.

Understanding it from the privatization and neoliberalism perspective, it shows that in some cases privatization is not going to help a state economically. Sometimes those on the fringes of the society have the best understanding of a society and can actually be the ones to provide the economic assistance in certain situations.

Implications of the Study

This study showcased the effects of privatization on a marginalized community with a progression of *loss of identity*, *loss of economic livelihood*, *adaptation*, and *transition of recognition*. Those four themes explained the progression and how a marginalized community that was so emotionally connected

to a profession, could suffer from economic factors, but also how that community could adapt and modernize so to be brought back in the economic fold. This was all done while gaining recognition from the society that may not have seen them before.

The results of this study are for those in positions of power and those that make economic decisions within a state. What this study showed was that the exclusion of this marginalized community, especially when that community identifies emotionally with an economic industry, will bring about conflict. It is also for those in the economic sector that are entering a new environment or landscape; showcasing that the exclusion of the local population will make the transition into the new market harder because there had been no inclusion. Those within positions of power or are entering from the outside usually do not understand the inner workings of the society as a whole. In the case of the Egyptian privatization, the foreign waste management companies came from Europe, where there are cultural and infrastructural differences, by engaging with the Zabaleen instead of excluding the Zabaleen the society as whole would have been more receptive to the new waste management system.

As it has been discussed throughout the study the Zabaleen were affected both negatively and positively from the privatization of waste management in 2002-2004. The negative results appeared at the onset of the privatization with the positive effects appearing after a prolonged period of time. From these results I as a researcher wanted to know more about the government and foreign waste

management's perspective of the privatization as well as the after effects of the privatization. As it was discussed in the limitations of the study, the lack of government statements and exerts was expressed as one of the limitations. When looking to improve on this study or to carry out future studies, a focus on the government's rationale may be an area of inquiry. As the researcher I was unable to attain access to anything containing to the government's perspective of the privatization of waste management. Understanding the rationale behind the introduction of foreign waste management companies to Cairo would be a new way to approach this phenomenon. This type of study could be done through document analysis as this study was or more effectively through interviews. With document analysis if the researcher is able to gather access to government documents both in English and Arabic the data produced from the study will provide new insight into why privatization was used in 2002-2004 also bring understanding to what were the intended results of using privatization. Interviews along with the document analysis would provide a broader picture of the events at the time of the privatization in 2002-2004 thus providing results for other states in similar situation to help in a the decision making process of whether to enact privatization or not.

In the research design chapter I had expressed in the data collection procedures that I had to exclude a significant number of documents from my initial data gathering because the documents focused on the 2009 pig cull in Cairo. Since there was a tremendous amount of documents addressing this phenomenon, further

studies on the effects that that event had on the Zabaleen would, I believe, result in different results from what I uncovered in my study on the effects of privatization. Since there are a significant amount of documents that focus on this period of time in Cairo, document analysis would be a useful method to use in understanding the effects that the 2009 pig cull had on the community. This type of study, I believe, would have more of an identity and ethnicity focused results, because of the religious difference on the consumption of pork. This phenomenon could further add to research in another area in which raised question in this study for me as a researcher. The last area of inquiry I as a researcher had at the end of this study was the dynamic between the two ethnic groups in Cairo, the Coptic Christian and the Muslims. In the past literature and the data there were allusions of perceived persecution and discrimination amongst the groups. Further study on the dynamics between these two communities could bring about understanding between the two groups and create a relationship between the two seemingly different communities in Cairo.

This study helped me as the researcher further understand economic implications for marginalized communities. The subject of neoliberalism and privatization were new areas of inquiry for me as researcher so familiarizing myself with those economic principles has given me a new perspective on how the decision of the state can affect all levels of a society, thus emphasizing the importance of including all communities in a society when making a decision that will affect all.

Appendices

Table 1

<u>Documents</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>Author</u>
Egypt's Persecuted Zabaleen garbage collectors	dw.com	Louise Osbourne
Spirit of Youth Association Brochure	Spirit of the Youth	Spirit of the Youth
Zabaleen sidelined by Morsy's 'clean homeland' campaign	egyptindependent.com	Steven Viney
Cairo's devoted refuse collectors	bbc.com	Sylvia Smith
From Cairo's trash, a model of recycling old door-to-door method boasts 85% reuse rate	sfgate.com	Jack Epstein
Tales of the Trash	thenewyorker.com	Peter Hessler
In Garbage City, trash is a way of life	mothenaturenetwork.com	Devereaux Bell
A landfill called Cairo	Daily News Egypt	Daily News Egypt
A way of life threatened in Cairo with the pigs seized	The New York Times	Michael Slackman
Air quality among the worst in the world	Financial times	Yolanda Knell
As Cairo's rubbish grows, residents lament decline of street collectors	The National	The National
Cairo's pickers about to be dumped	The Gazette	Paul Salopek

<u>Documents</u>	<u>Source</u>	<u>Author</u>
ESD-Egypt: Learning and earning in Cairo's Garbage City	UNESCO	Hoda Baraka
Cairo slum dwellers seek equal treatment Cairo's Zabbaleen reclaim their share in garbage collection	The National Daily News Egypt	The National Daily News Egypt The Egyptian Gazette
Cleaning up Cairo	The Egyptian Gazette	Gazette
Egypt dumps 'Garbage People'	The Christian Science Monitor	Sarah Gauch The Egyptian Gazette
It's not trash, it's cash Meet focuses on sharing of collection models in different nations	The Egyptian Gazette The Time of India	The Times of India Daily News
The road to a culture of sustainability Turning waste into wealth with Cairo's garbage people Despite a New Regime, Cairo's Garbage Collectors Face the same Hardships	Daily News Egypt Yourmiddleeast.com egyptarchive.com	Egypt Alan Kadduri Steven Viney Wade
Zabaleen of Cairo- A Special Report	Social Policy	Rathke Mel
Egypt's "greenest of the green" at risk Cairo puts its faith in ragpickers to manage the city's waste problem	The Middle East The Guardian	Fryberg Marion Guénard
Garbage Dreams	GarbageDreams.com	Mai Iskander

Table 2

Document Analysis Form		
Case _____	Reviewer _____	Date Reviewed _____
Source of Document _____	Author _____	Date Prepared _____
Prepared For _____	Date Received _____	
Summary of Contents		

Issues		

Potential Benefit		

Potential Prejudice		

How Admitted or Excluded		

Comments		

288

²⁸⁸ "Document Analysis Systems." (1995): n. pag. *Benchmark Institute*. Benchmark Institute. Web. 23 July 2015.

References

"A Landfill Called Cairo." *Daily News Egypt*. Sep 07 2009. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

"About Thematic Analysis." *The University of Auckland- New Zealand*. School of Psychology, n.d. Web. 23 July 2015.

Adams, Samuel. "The Impact of Privatization on Economic Growth and Income Inequality in Sub-Saharan Africa." *The Journal of Social, Political, and Economic Studies* 31.3 (2006): 295-320. Web. 17 July 2015.

Alamazzini, Kim. *Egypt-The Zabbaleen Environmental Development Program (ZEDP)*. Paris: Enda Europe, n.d. Print.

"As Cairo's Rubbish Grows, Residents Lament Decline of Street Collectors." *The National*. Aug 14 2011. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

Ates, Davut. "Economic Liberalization and Changes in Fundamentalism: The Case of Egypt." *Middle East Policy* 12.4 (2005): 133-44. Web.

Baraka, Hoda. "Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories." *Egypt: Learning and Earning in Cairo's Garbage City; Education for Sustainable Development Success Stories; 2012* (2012): 1-3. *UNESCO*. UNESCO, 2012. Web. 17 July 2015

Bell, Devereaux. "In Garbage City, Trash Is a Way of Life | MNN - Mother Nature Network." *Mother Nature Network*. N.p., 24 Oct. 2014. Web. 2 Aug. 2015.
<<http://www.mnn.com/lifestyle/recycling/stories/in-garbage-city-trash-is-a-way-of-life>>.

Bienen, Henry, and John Waterbury. "The Political Economy of Privatization in Developing Countries." *World Development* 17.5 (1989): 617-32. Web.

Boles, Imad. "Egypt - Persecution: Disappearing Christians of the Middle East." *Middle East Forum*. The Middle East Quarterly, Winter 2001. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://www.meforum.org/23/egypt-persecution>>.

Börner, Kira. "The Political Economy of Privatization." doc-type:workingPaper. N.p., Jan. 2004. Web. 8 Aug. 2015. <<http://epub.ub.uni-muenchen.de/296/>>.

Bourdieu, Pierre. "The Essence of Neoliberalism - Le Monde Diplomatique - English Edition." *Le Monde diplomatique*. N.p., Dec. 1998. Web. 20 Mar. 2015. <<http://mondediplo.com/1998/12/08/bourdieu>>.

Bowen, Glenn. "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method." *Qualitative Research Journal* 9.2 (2009): 27-40. Web.

Buda, Octavian. "Marginalization Versus Mental Illness and Stigmatization. Bioethical Dilemmas." *Revista Romana de Bioetica* 6.2 (2008) *ProQuest*. Web. 18 July 2015.

Burton, John W. "CONFLICT RESOLUTION: THE HUMAN DIMENSION." *Conflict Resolution: The Human Dimension*. The International Journal of Peace Studies, n.d. Web. 24 Aug. 2015. <http://www.gmu.edu/programs/icar/ijps/vol3_1/burton.htm>.

Butter, Inge. "An Informal Waste Management System in Cairo: The Garbage Collectors and Their Settlements." Thesis. University of Leiden, 2006. *Word Press*. Web. <<https://mobileafricarevisited.files.wordpress.com/2010/03/scriptie-inge-butter.pdf>>.

"Cairo Slum Dwellers Seek Equal Treatment." *The National*. May 20 2014. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

"Cairo's Zabbaleen Reclaim their Share in Garbage Collection." *Daily News Egypt*. Jun 25 2010. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

"Cleaning Up Cairo." *The Egyptian Gazette*. Dec 24 2010. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

Coate, Roger A., and Jerel A. Rosati. "Human Needs in World Society." *The Power of Human Needs in World Society*. Boulder: L. Rienner, 1988. 1-20. Print.

Cook, Kay E. "Marginalized Populations." *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Ed. Lisa M. Given. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. 496-97. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 16 July 2015.

Cook-Huffman, Celia. "The Role of Identity in Conflict." *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution* (2009): 19-31. Print.

"Document Analysis Systems." (1995): n. pag. *Benchmark Institute*. Benchmark Institute. Web. 23 July 2015.

Doyle, David. "Politics and Privatization: Exogenous Pressures, Domestic Incentives and State Divestiture in Latin America." *Journal of Public Policy* 30.3 (2010): 291-320. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015.

Epstein, Jack. "From Cairo's Trash, a Model of Recycling / Old Door-to-Door Method Boasts 85% Reuse Rate." *SFGate*. N.p., 3 June 2006. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.
<<http://www.sfgate.com/news/article/From-Cairo-s-trash-a-model-of-recycling-Old-2495640.php>>.

Fahmi, Wael Salah. "The Impact of Privatization of Solid Waste Management on the Zabaleen Garbage Collectors of Cairo." *Environment and Urbanization* 17.2 (2005): 155-170. *eau.sagepub.com*. Web.

Fahmi, Wael, and Keith Sutton. "Cairo's Contested Garbage: Sustainable Solid Waste Management and the Zabaleen's Right to the City." *Sustainability* 2010 2.6 1766-1783. Print.

Fahmi, Wael Salah, and Keith Sutton. "Cairo's Zabaleen Garbage Recyclers: Multi-nationals' Takeover and State Relocation Plans." *Habitat International* 30.4 (2006): 809-37. *Proquest*. Web. 3 Oct. 2014.

Fryberg, Mel. "Egypt's "Greenest of the Green" at Risk." *The Middle East* (2007): 62-63. Web.

Garbage Dreams. Dir. Mai Iskander. MotiveART and Chicken & Egg, 2009. Internet.

"General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) | International Relations." *Encyclopedia Britannica Online*. Encyclopedia Britannica, n.d. Web. 12 June 2015.

Gorman, Anthony, and Andrew Newman. "Copts." Ed. Jamie Stokes. *Encyclopedia of The Peoples of Africa and the Middle East*. New York: Infobase, 2009. 168-70. Print.

Guénard, Marion. "Cairo Puts Its Faith in Ragpickers to Manage the City's Waste Problem." *the Guardian*. N.p., 19 Nov. 2013. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.
<<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/nov/19/cairo-ragpickers-zabaleen-egypt-recycling>>.

Gurr, Ted Robert. "Relative Deprivation and the Impetus to Violence." *Why Men Rebel*. Boulder: Paradigm, 2010. 22-58. Print.

Hessler, Peter. "What the Garbageman Knows." *The New Yorker*. N.p., 6 Oct. 2014. Web. 8 Oct. 2014. <<http://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2014/10/13/tales-trash>>.

Ibrahim, Fouad N., and Barbara Ibrahim. *Egypt: An Economic Geography*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2003. Print.

"It's Not Trash, it's Cash." *The Egyptian Gazette*. May 14 2012. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

Jessop, Bob. "Liberalism, Neoliberalism, and Urban Governance: A State-Theoretical Perspective." *Spaces of Neoliberalism: Urban Restructuring in North America and Western Europe*. By Neil Brenner and Nikolas Theodore. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2002. 452-72. Print.

Kadduri, Alan. "Turning Waste into Wealth with Cairo's Garbage People (PHOTOS) - Your Middle East." *Your Middle East*. N.p., 26 May 2015. Web. 2 Aug. 2015. <http://www.yourmiddleeast.com/culture/turning-waste-into-wealth-with-cairos-garbage-people-photos_31874>.

Kanji, Omario. "Security | Beyond Intractability." *Security | Beyond Intractability*. N.p., Oct. 2003. Web. 24 Aug. 2015. <<http://www.beyondintractability.org/essay/security>>.

Knell, Yolande. "Air Quality among the Worst in the World." *Financial Times*: 12. Dec 17 2009. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

Korostelina, Karina V. *Social Identity and Conflict; Structures, Dynamics and Implications*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007. Print.

Kuppinger, Petra. "Crushed? Cairo's Garbage Collectors and Neoliberal Urban Politics." *Journal of Urban Affairs* 36.s2 (2014): 621-633. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 19 Mar. 2015.

Maddy-Weitzman, Bruce, ed. *Middle East Contemporary Survey*. Vol. 21. Boulder, CO: Westview, 1997. Print.

"Meet Focuses on Sharing of Collection Models in Different Nations Pune]." *The Times of India (Online)*. May 01 2012. *ProQuest*. Web. 21 July 2015 .

Metz, Helen Chapin. "Egypt - Nasser's Legacy." *Egypt - Nasser's Legacy*. Library of Congress, n.d. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://countrystudies.us/egypt/39.htm>>.

Metz, Helen Chapin. "Egypt - Nasser and Arab Socialism." *Egypt - Nasser and Arab Socialism*. Library of Congress, n.d. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://countrystudies.us/egypt/34.htm>>.

Metz, Helen Chapin. "Egypt - Husni Mubarak." *Egypt - Husni Mubarak*. Library of Congress, n.d. Web. 30 July 2015. <<http://countrystudies.us/egypt/46.htm>>.

O'Leary, Zina. "Marginalization." *The Social Science Jargon Buster*. London, England: SAGE Publications Ltd., 2007. 153-55. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 6 July 2015.

Osbourne, Louise. "Egypt's Persecuted Zabaleen Garbage Collectors." *DW.DE*. N.p., 7 July 2014. Web. 13 Mar. 2015. <<http://www.dw.de/egypts-persecuted-zabaleen-garbage-collectors/a-17729385>>.

Peretz, Don. *The Middle East Today*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963. Print.

Preissle, Judith. "Analytic Induction." *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Ed. Lisa M. Given. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. 16-17. *SAGE Research Methods*. Web. 26 July 2015.

Prizzia, Ross. "Privatization and Social Responsibility: A Critical Evaluation of Economic Performance." *The International Journal of Public Sector Management* 14.6 (2001): 450-64. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015.

Ramsbotham, Oliver. "The Analysis of Protracted Social Conflict: A Tribute to Edward Azar." *Review of International Studies Rev. Int. Stud.* 31.01 (2005): 109-26. Web.

Rathke, Wade. "Zabaleen of Cairo." *Social Policy* (2011): 70-74. Web.

"Report on Religious Freedom in Egypt." *U.S. Justice Department*. The Institute on Religion and Public Policy, n.d. Web. 1 July 2015. <<http%3A%2F%2Fwww.justice.gov%2Fsites%2Fdefault%2Ffiles%2Feoir%2Flegacy%2F2014%2F09%2F29%2FEgypt%2520Immigration%2520Report.pdf%3Fid%3D1994>>.

Rodriguez, Agustin Martin G. "Marginalization and the Multiplicity of Rationalities: A Discourse Theory of Poverty." *Theory in Action* 5.2 (2012): 104-21. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015.

Salopek, Paul. "Cairo's Pickers about to be Dumped:" *The Gazette*: A8. Mar 02 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

Sandole, Dennis J. D., and Hugo Van Der Merwe. "Paradigm, Theories, and Metaphors in Conflict and Conflict Resolution: Coherence or Confusion?" *Conflict Resolution Theory and Practice: Integration and Application*. Manchester, UK: Manchester UP, 1993. 3-21. Print.

Sarah Gauch Special to The Christian, Science Monitor. "Egypt Dumps 'Garbage People'; on Jan. 1, Foreign Contractors Began Replacing Grass-Roots Garbage Collectors." *The Christian Science Monitor*: 07. Jan 06 2003. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015 .

Slackman, Michael. "A Way of Life Threatened in Cairo with their Pigs Seized, the City's Trash Collectors Worry what could be Next." *International Herald Tribune*: 2. May 26 2009. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

Smith, Sylvia. "Cairo's Devoted Refuse Collectors." *BBC 2* June 2005. *bbc.co.uk*. Web. 13 Mar. 2015. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/4602185.stm>.

Spirit of Youth. *Spirit of Youth Association*. Cairo: Spirit of Youth, n.d. Web. <http://garbagedreams.com/downloads/Spirit_of_Youth_Brochure.pdf>.

Steger, Manfred B., and Ravi K. Roy. *Neoliberalism: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2010. Print

"The Road to a Culture of Sustainability." *Daily News Egypt*. Oct 30 2009. *ProQuest*. Web. 17 July 2015.

"The Zabbaleen: A History." *A.P.E.* A.P.E, 2010. Web. 21 May 2015. <<http://www.ape.org.eg/TheZabbaleenHistory.html>>.

Veltmeyer, Henry. "Unrest and Change: Dispatches from the Frontline of a Class War in Egypt." *Globalizations* 8.5 (2011): 609-16. Web.

Viney, Steven. "Zabaleen | Egyptarchive." *Despite a New Regime, Cairo's Garbage Collectors Face the Same Hardships* 19 Feb. 2013. Web. 2 Aug. 2015. <<https://egyptarchive.wordpress.com/tag/zabaleen/>>.

Viney, Steven. "Zabaleen Sidelined by Morsy's 'Clean Homeland' Campaign | Egypt Independent." N.p., 14 Aug. 2012. Web. 13 Mar. 2015.

<<http://www.egyptindependent.com/news/zabaleen-sidelined-morsy-s-clean-homeland-campaign>>.

Volkan, Vamik. "Ethnic Tents: Descriptions of Large-Group Identities." *Bloodlines: From Ethnic Pride to Ethnic Terrorism* (1997): 19-29. Web.

Volkan, Vamik D. "The Seven Threads of Large-group Identity." *Blind Trust: Large Groups and Their Leaders in times of Crisis and Terror*. Charlottesville, VA: Pitchstone Pub., 2004. 23-55. Print.

Weinbaum, Marvin G. "Egypt's Infitah and the Politics of US Economic Assistance." *Middle Eastern Studies* 21.2 (1985): 206-22. *JSTOR* [*JSTOR*]. Web.

Younis, Talib. "Privatization: A Review of Policy and Implementation in Selected Arab Countries." *The International Journal of Public Sector Management* 9.3 (1996): 18-25. *ProQuest*. Web. 6 July 2015.

Biography

Nicole A. Eisenschenk graduated from Key West High School, Key West, Florida in 2004. She received her Bachelor of Business Administration in Management from Stetson University in 2007. She received her Master of Science in Conflict Analysis and Resolution from George Mason University in 2015 and Master of Arts in Conflict Resolution in Mediterranean Security from University of Malta in 2015.