

**Bibliographic Essay:
Hugh S. Fullerton and the Ethical
Impulse in His Writing**

Steven Mark Klein
Professor Emeritus/Journalism

Submitted with MA Journalism thesis
Michigan State University
May 1997

Bibliographical Essay: Hugh S. Fullerton and the Ethical Impulse in His Writing

By Steven Mark Klein

From the moment F. Scott Fitzgerald made the crooked World Series of 1919 a central image of disillusionment in his great American novel, *The Great Gatsby* (Charles Scribner's Sons, 1925), the Black Sox scandal has been part of our national consciousness and mythology. Popular literature and the mass media, particularly Eliot Asinof's seminal study, *Eight Men Out: The Black Sox and the 1919 World Series* (Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963) and John Sayles' 1988 film, "Eight Men Out," have helped shape public awareness of the scandal. Those efforts, however, have been as disapproved of and, ultimately, disregarded by organized baseball, as was the journalist Hugh S. Fullerton's efforts to reveal the illegitimate series in 1919. The purpose of this research is to better understand and appreciate Fullerton's role, his possible motivation, and ethical impulse in reporting that the premier sports event in early twentieth century America was not on the level.

To do that, it is important to understand details of the scandal and resulting cover-up; the nature of professional baseball before 1920, commonly regarded as a watershed year in the game's history because of the introduction of the lively ball; and the influence of gambling on the game from its professional beginnings in 1869 through the Speaker-Cobb affair in 1917, which did not come to public attention until 1927.

Outside of that baseball context, Fullerton needs to be examined beyond his sportswriting, for which he is almost exclusively remembered. Even though he was among the most highly regarded baseball writers and World Series prognosticators of his time and later recognized as the man who exposed the Black Sox scandal, Fullerton rarely rates more than a brief reference or footnote in the game's extensive literature. There are no chapters or even a few pages devoted to him whenever the crooked 1919 World Series or the equally execrable cover-up is studied. It is almost as if to mention Fullerton, who loved baseball and was one of sports journalism's earliest pioneers, is to bring up a part of the game that the establishment has chosen to forget. For example, Asinof wrote about baseball Commissioner Ford Frick's campaign to discourage sponsors from backing a television rendering of the book in *Bleeding Between the Lines* (Holt, Rinehart and Winston, New York, 1979). That book serves as the closest substitute to a bibliography for *Eight Men Out*, which contains no documentation, footnotes or references. Also, Ring Lardner Jr. wrote about Sayles' difficulty in bringing the book to the big screen - it took 25 years - in an article, "Foul Ball" (*American Film*, July/August, 1988).

Fullerton, much like the scandal itself, needs to be viewed within the larger social context of the era in which he lived and the fix took place. A lifelong student and

promoter of the grade school textbooks popularized by William Holmes McGuffey in the middle third of the nineteenth century, Fullerton emerged from a Victorian, agrarian America into an urban industrial society influenced by this country's first organized reform movements. Therefore, it is important to understand Victorian society and the reform movements that became known as progressivism, and the America that emerged after World War I. Any examination of the Black Sox scandal, as Fitzgerald so well understood, parallels the disillusionment that most progressives experienced after the Great War. Fullerton, my research indicates, found solace and even renewed hope in a re-emerging McGuffeyism in the 1920's up until his death in late 1945 at the age of 72.

Although Asinof's *Eight Men Out* rightfully remains the starting point for any study of the Black Sox scandal, it is too often the end point as well for many scholars. Written from newspaper and magazine accounts and limited interviews with surviving participants and their families, all of whom were reluctant to talk, the book is, at best, a reconstruction of events based on the best information Asinof could assemble. Before the case came to trial in 1921, important evidence disappeared from the Illinois district attorney's office. Most of the gamblers involved in the fix never testified, and ballplayers, whether involved in the scandal or not, maintained an almost unbroken silence to their death. Arnold "Chick" Gandil, in a first-person story told to Melvin Durslag, gave a self-serving account of the fix in "This Is My Story of the Black Sox Scandal" (*Sports Illustrated*, Sept. 17, 1956). It remains the only first-person version of the fix from one of the eight participating ballplayers. Harold Seymour, who wrote the first serious study of the sport, provides a concise but excellent account of gambling in baseball, the fix and its

aftermath in *Baseball: The Golden Age* (Oxford University Press, Oxford and New York, 1971). The first book of the three-volume history, *Baseball: The Early Years* (Oxford University Press, Oxford and New York, 1960), also is helpful in understanding gambling's early influence in the game. Roderick Nash provides perceptive comments on the cultural significance of the scandal in *The Nervous Generation: American Thought, 1917-1930* (Rand McNally, Chicago, 1970) on pages 130-132. Both lean heavily on *Eight Men Out*, however, which Asinof admitted in his preface was deliberately undocumented: "This book, then, stands as a reconstruction of the Black Sox scandal drawn from a rich variety of sources and from research into all the scattered written material concerning it." Asinof took this approach, he explains in his introduction and in greater detail in *Bleeding Between the Lines*, because of "a residue of fear" of the gambling-gangster world of the 1920's that prevented many of the participants, both from baseball and the underworld, from being more forthcoming. And as Sayles discovered, organized baseball had no desire to reconstruct a significant part of a past that took most of Babe Ruth's 714 home runs to conveniently forget.

Other accounts of the Black Sox scandal can be found in Victor Luhrs' aptly titled *The Great Baseball Mystery* (A.S. Barnes, New York, 1966), which argues for reinstatement of the banned ballplayers; Robert I. Goler, "Black Sox," *Chicago History*, 17 (Fall-Winter 1988-89), 42-69; Bill Veeck's *The Hustler's Handbook* (New York, 1966), particularly the chapter "Harry's Diary -1919;" *Judge Landis and Twenty-Five Years of Baseball* (New York, 1947) by J.G. Taylor Spink, then publisher of *The Sporting News* (but which was ghostwritten by sportswriter Fred Lieb); Harvey Frommer's

Shoeless Joe and Ragtime Baseball (Taylor Publishing Company, Dallas, 1992), which includes "Shoeless" Joe Jackson's 1921 grand jury testimony, which mysteriously reappeared in 1924; *Say It Ain't So, Joe!* (Little, Brown & Co., Boston, 1979) by Donald Gropman; "*Commy*": *The Life Story of Charles A. Comiskey* (Reilly & Lee, Chicago, 1919), Gustav Axelsson; *Baseball As I Have Known It* (Coward-McCann & Geoghegan, New York, 1977) by Fred Lieb; Eric Ralph Greenberg's perceptive novel about the pitcher Christy Mathewson, *The Celebrant* (Everest House, New York, 1983); David Quentin Voight's *American Baseball Volume I* (The Pennsylvania University Press, University Park, Pa., 1983), the first of three volumes which, in addition to Seymour's work, are considered the standard of baseball scholarship; *Baseball Babylon: From the Black Sox to Pete Rose, the Real Stories Behind the Scandals that Rocked the Game* (Penguin Books, New York, 1992) by Dan Gutman; *Our Game: An American Baseball History* (Henry Holt and Company, New York, 1991) by Charles C. Alexander; *Baseball: A History of America's Game* (University of Illinois Press, Urbana and Chicago, 1992) by Benjamin G. Rader; and the most recent history of the game, *Creating the National Pastime: Baseball Transforms Itself, 1903-1953* (Princeton University Press, Princeton, N.J., 1996) by G. Edward White.

Lawrence S. Ritter's *The Glory of Their Times: The Story of the Early Days of Baseball Told by the Men Who Played It* (Collier Books, New York, 1966), which includes a chapter with Cincinnati pitcher Ed Roush, has become a classic oral history of baseball. Perhaps the most complete bibliography of baseball's immense literature is

Baseball: A Comprehensive Bibliography (Jefferson, N.C., 1986), compiled by Myron J.

Smith.

Professor Ronald Story of the University of Massachusetts-Amherst has compiled a useful collection of newspaper (primarily drawn from the *Chicago Tribune* and *New York Times*) and magazine articles on the Black Sox scandal for course work at that school and, earlier, at George Mason University. Reading packets include “Baseball Players: 1880-1930;” “Baseball Fans and the City of Chicago: 1900-1940;” “The Black Sox Scandal of 1919,” and an accompany set of articles, “Owners and Players;” and “The Chicago White Sox and the World Series Scandal of 1919: A Press Record.”

Also helpful are a pair of books by Peter Levine: *A.G. Spalding and the Rise of Baseball: The Promise of American Sport* (Oxford University Press, Oxford and New York, 1985), and *Ellis Island to Ebbets Field: Sport and the American Jewish Experience* (Oxford University Press, Oxford and New York, 1992), particularly pages 103-108 on ethnic characterizations during the scandal.

Also, Donald Dewey and Nicholas Acocella, *The Ball Clubs: Every Franchise, Past & Present, Officially Recognized by Major League Baseball* (Harper Perrenial, New York, 1996); *The Bill James Historical Baseball Abstract* (Villard Books, New York, 1986), Bill James, a later-day Hugh Fullerton; Geoffrey C. Ward and Ken Burns, *Baseball: An Illustrated History* (Alfred A. Knopf, New York, 1994); and “Third Inning, 1910-1920, The Faith of Fifty Million People,” part of *Baseball: A Film by Ken Burns* (PBS Home Video, Turner Broadcasting System, Inc., 1994), which, much like Sayles’ film, helps bring the era and the scandal to life.

Sadly, the comprehensive history of sportswriting and its place in American journalism has yet to be written. But it can be somewhat pieced together from a variety of sources. Good starting points include Stanley Walker's classic *City Editor* (Frederick A. Stokes Company, New York, 1934), specifically the chapter "Sports - Valhalla's Bull-Pen;" *Sports in American Life* (University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1953), specifically the chapter "The Sports Page," by Frederick W. Cozens and Florence Scovill Stumpf; Stanley Woodward's *Sports Page* (Greenwood Press Publishers, New York, 1949); and "The Rise of the Sports Page" by John Stevens in *Sports and Mass Media* (Gannett Center for Media Studies, New York, Vol. 1, No. 2, Fall 1987).

For an overview of the technological revolution that helped to popularize the Penny Press in America in the late nineteenth century, Michael Schudson's *Discovering the News: A Social History of American Newspapers* (Basic Books, Inc., Publishers, New York, 1978) provides as much information in a 25-page notes section as it does in the 191 pages of actual text. Michael and Edwin Emery provide a useful overview of print journalism in *The Press and America: An Interpretive History of the Mass Media*, seventh edition (Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1992).

The early years of the *Chicago Tribune* are meticulously and favorably detailed in *Chicago Tribune: The Rise of Great American Newspaper* (Rand McNally & Company, Chicago, 1979), by Lloyd Wendt, although the sports section is hardly mentioned. Alan Richman provides some modern-day perspective in "The Death of Sportswriting" from *GQ* (September, 1991). Sportswriting in Chicago is dealt with in the introduction to *The Greatest Sports Stories from the Chicago Tribune* (A.S. Barnes and Company, New

York, 1953), edited by former *Tribune* sports editor Arch Ward. The book includes a series of six stories by Harvey T. Woodruff and James Crusinberry from October 6, 1919 to September 29, 1920, that demonstrates that newspaper's coverage of baseball and the fix. Alfred Lawrence Lorenz adds an important chapter to Chicago sportswriting history with "In the Wake of the News: The Beginnings of a Sports Column, by HEK" *American Journalism* (Winter-Spring, 1992). Fullerton succeeded the column's original author, Hugh Edmund Keough, in 1912, and turned the column, which continues to this day in the *Tribune*, over to his protégé, Ring Lardner, less than a year later. Norma Green, Stephen Lacy and Jean Folkerts provide context for the newspaper world Fullerton was part of in "Chicago Journalists at the Turn Of the Century: Bohemians All?" in *Journalism Quarterly* (Winter, 1989). Fullerton himself wrote about the birth of Chicago sportswriting, but sadly omitted himself, in "The Fellows Who Made the Game" in *The Saturday Evening Post* (April 21, 1928). Fullerton earlier wrote about some of his more successful colleagues in "Baseball Reporters Who Broke Into Literature" (*The Literary Digest*, April 9, 1921). Peter D. Vroom writes about the early years of sportswriting and includes Fullerton in "Chicago's Baseball Writers" (*Baseball Magazine*, September 1908).

Other significant contributions to the history of American sportswriting include the *New York Times*' Robert Lipsyte, perhaps the most important sports columnist working today, in *SportsWorld: An American Dreamland* (Quadrangle Books, 1975). Chapter Six, "The Back Page," is perhaps the best and most concise single essay on the development of sportswriting styles. Lipsyte's first chapter on desk editors may also

provide insight into the nature of Fullerton's professional life after the Black Sox scandal, when his writing output dwindled. Also, Leonard Koppett, *Sports Illusion, Sports Reality: A Reporter's View of Sports, Journalism, and Society* (University of Illinois Press, Urbana and Chicago, 1981, 1994); Grantland Rice, *The Tumult and the Shouting: My Life in Sport* (A.S. Barnes, New York, 1954), in which he gives himself more credit than he deserves for his coverage of the scandal (pages 105-106); Charles Fountain's reverential biography of Rice, *Sportswriter: The Life and Times of Grantland Rice* (Oxford University Press, Oxford and New York, 1993), contains wonderful anecdotes about many of Rice's peers, including Fullerton; Paul Gallico, *The Golden People* (Doubleday & Co., Garden City, N.J., 1965); Murray Sperber, *Shake Down the Thunder: The Creation of Notre Dame Football* (Henry Holt and Company, New York, 1993), particularly pages 173-182, "The Four Horsemen - Grantland Rice versus Reality," which provides a brief overview of the development of sportswriting styles in the 1920's.

No examination of the development of sportswriting would be complete without an examination of Fullerton's now better-known peer but then protégé, Ring Lardner. Fountain, in his autobiography of Rice, made this important point: "Had Ring Lardner and Daymon Runyon - contemporaries and close friends of Rice - not turned their attentions from sportswriting to other pursuits, our sense of sport would almost certainly be different, filtered, as it would be, through the prism of Lardner's cynicism or Runyon's irreverence, instead of Rice's compassionate optimism (page 7)." Matthew J. Bruccoli has made a successful career studying and writing about the lives and literature of F. Scott Fitzgerald and Lardner. Therefore, good starting points include *Ring W. Lardner: A*

Descriptive Bibliography (University of Pittsburgh Press, Pittsburgh, 1976), Matthew J.

Brucoli and Richard Layman; *Ring Around the Bases: The Complete Baseball Stories of Ring Lardner* (Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1992), edited and with an introduction by Matthew J. Brucoli, foreword by Ring Lardner Jr.; *The Annotated Baseball Stories of Ring W. Lardner, 1914-1919* (Stanford University Press, Stanford, Calif., 1995), edited by George W. Hilton; and *Letters of Ring Lardner* (Orchises, Washington, D.C., 1995), edited by Clifford M. Caruthers, with a foreword by Ring Lardner Jr. The earliest biography of Lardner is Donald Elder's *Ring Lardner: A Biography* (Doubleday & Co., Garden City, N.Y., 1956). Jonathan Yardley does a more complete and readable job in *Ring: A Biography of Ring Lardner* (Random House, New York, 1977), in which Fullerton clearly emerges as Lardner's earliest sponsor. Ring Lardner Jr. provides additional insight in *The Lardners: My Family Remembered* (Harper and Row, New York, 1976).

Baseball and gamblers had a much closer relationship than the game's establishment would have fans believe. My understanding of gambling's influence on the game was greatly enhanced by Daniel E. Ginsburg's little-known but superb study, *The Fix Is In: A History of Baseball Gambling and Game Fixing Scandals* (McFarland & Company, Inc., Publishers, Jefferson, N.C., and London, 1995). Ginsburg sheds no new light on the Black Sox scandal itself, although he provides as good a summary as Seymour in *Baseball: The Golden Years*. The book's great strength is its detailed analysis of gambling and game fixing in baseball dating from its professional beginnings in 1869 through the Denny McLain and Pete Rose incidents, but particularly into the 1920's.

when Judge Kenesaw Mountain Landis finally cleaned up the game. More concise overviews are available in Seymour's *Baseball: The Golden Years*; and *Total Baseball* (Warner Books, New York, 1989), edited by John Thorn and Pete Palmer with David Reuther, "Scandals and Controversies" by Stephen S. Hall. For an overview of gambling in America, there is *Card Sharps, Dream Books, & Bucket Shops: Gambling in 19th-Century America* (Cornell University Press, Ithaca and London, 1990) by Ann Fabian, and *People of Chance: Gambling in American Society from Jamestown to Las Vegas* (Oxford University Press, Oxford and New York, 1986), by John M. Findlay.

Fullerton made important contributions to the subject beyond his newspaper stories at the time of the Black Sox scandal with a pair of magazine series on gambling. The first appeared in February, March and April, 1914, in *American Magazine*, a leading progressive journal of the time and one to which Fullerton was a frequent contributor from 1909 to 1928. In the introduction to "American Gambling and Gamblers: Preying Upon the Wage Earners" (*American Magazine*, February, 1914), an editor's note reads: "This is a frank study of a phase of life and morals in America. Professional gambling is much changed since 'the old flush times,' but it is still carried on very widely and supported by people of every class. These articles are the result of long travels in many parts of the United States. They are real contributions of human and public interest." Succeeding installments included "American Gambling and Gamblers: How They Prey Upon One Another" (*American Magazine*, March, 1914), and "American Gambling and Gamblers: Gambling With Father's Money" (*American Magazine*, April, 1914). Fullerton revisited the subject 13 years later while serving as an editor of *Liberty* (which was

subtitled, *A Magazine of Religious Freedom*) with “Are Baseball Games Framed? The Inside Story of What Led Up to the Major League Scandals” (*Liberty*, March 19, 1927); “Are Baseball Games Framed? Ty Cobb’s Career Is the Best Answer to Scandal Charges” (*Liberty*, March 26, 1927); and “Are Baseball Games Framed? The Story of SPOKE and SMOKY JOE” (*Liberty*, April 2, 1927). In the first installment, Fullerton wrote: “The truth is that, until the Black Sox scandal, players bet heavily, associated with gamblers, favored opposing players they liked ... Since 1908, I have been ‘off’ baseball - suspicious of some phases of it - and satisfied that the relations between gamblers and some players were so close as to endanger the reputation of the entire institution. I watched for ten years before I could get what I considered sufficient evidence to charge actual crookedness, and then, when I denounced the Chicago Black Sox during and after the World’s Series of 1919, I was assailed from all directions and an attempt was made to assassinate me.” In his final installment, Fullerton concluded: “The fact that organized baseball’s settled policy for years of ‘keeping quiet for the sake of the sport’ has been the very thing that made crookedness possible, is overlooked.” Irving E. (Sy) Sanborn, a beat writer for the *Chicago Tribune* and a well-known Fullerton peer, belatedly joined in with “The Slimy Trail of the Baseball Pool” in *Baseball Magazine* (July, 1925), well after the reality of the scandal had been accepted - and basically forgotten.

Moving on to the social context of the times in which Fullerton lived and worked, several books were particularly helpful in my understanding and analysis of Victorian American culture, the movements that have come to be known as progressivism, and the literature that spirited the era. Beginning with the Victorian period, H. Wayne Morgan’s

Victorian Culture in America, 1865-1914 (F.E. Peacock Publishers, Itasca, Ill., 1973), is part of a series of books of primary sources in American history and provides an excellent bibliography. *Victorian America* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 1976), edited with an introductory essay, "Victorian Culture in America," by Daniel Walker Howe, is both illuminating and valuable for its accompanying notes and references.

My understanding of progressivism and Fullerton's seemingly contradictory but ultimately compatible Victorian/progressive influences was greatly enhanced by *Progressivism* (Harlan Davidson, Inc., Arlington Heights, Ill., 1983) Arthur S. Link and Richard L. McCormick; *The World of Hope: Progressives and the Struggle for an Ethical Public Life* (Temple University Press, Philadelphia, 1987), David B. Danbom; *The American Myth of Success: From Horatio Alger to Norman Vincent Peale* (Basic Books, Inc., Publishers, New York and London, 1969), Richard Weiss; and *Touching Base: Professional Baseball and American Culture in the Progressive Era* (Greenwood Press, Westport, Conn., 1980), Steven A. Riess. The latter book provides an analysis of baseball and social reform as a source of social mobility and the creation of an ideology that coincided with fundamental, if not necessarily accurate, American beliefs at the turn of the century.

Other useful contributions by Riess include *City Games* (Urbana, Ill., 1990) and *The American Sporting Experience: A Historical Anthology of Sport in America* (Leisure Press, New York, 1984), particularly "The Technological Revolution and the Rise of Sport, 1850-1900" by John Rickards Betts, and "Baseball and the National Life," by H. Addington Bruce, which was written in 1913. Also, *Baseball: America's Diamond Mind*,

1919-1941 (University Presses of Florida, Orlando, Fla., 1980) by Richard Crepeau adds

to an understanding of the creation of an idealized baseball ideology.

Other books that were helpful in understanding the diverse threads of progressivism include *The Age of Reform: From Bryan to FDR* (Knopf, New York, 1955), Richard Hofstadter; *Rendezvous With Destiny: A History of Modern American Reform* (New York, 1952), Eric F. Goldman; *The Triumph of Conservatism, 1900-1916* (Free Press of Glencoe, New York, 1963), Gabriel Kolko; *The Progressive Years* (Dodd, Mead, New York, 1975), William L. O'Neill; Robert H. Wiebe's *The Search for Order, 1877-1920* (Hill & Wang, New York, 1967), and "The Progressive Years, 1900-1917," in William H. Cartwright and Richard L. Watson Jr., editors, *The Reinterpretation of American History and Culture* (National Council for the Social Studies, Washington, D.C., 1973); *Progressivism: The Critical Issues* (Little, Brown and Company, Boston, 1971), edited by David M. Kennedy; *Paths Into American Culture: Psychology, Medicine, and Morals* (Temple University Press, Philadelphia, 1988), John C. Burnham, particularly the chapter "The Cultural Interpretation of the Progressive Movement;" *The Response to Industrialism, 1885-1914* (University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1957), Samuel P. Hays; and Tom Lutz's quirky but fascinating look at the national condition of neurasthenia in *American Nervousness, 1903: An Anecdotal History* (Cornell University Press, Ithaca and London, 1991).

An argument could be made for describing Fullerton as a sports muckraker - certainly baseball officials might have done so by 1920 had muckrakers still been in vogue - but sportswriters are ignored in existing studies. Helpful background on

muckraking journalism includes *Muckraking and Progressivism in the American Tradition* (Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick, N.J., and London, 1976, 1996), Louis Filler; and *The Muckrakers: The Era in Journalism that Moved America to Reform - The Most Significant Magazine Articles of 1902-1912* (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1961).

Several books were helpful in describing the changes in American society and culture at and around the time of the Black Sox scandal, most notably *America Finding Herself, Vol. 2 of Our Times: The United States, 1900-1925* (Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1927), by Mark Sullivan; *Our Times: America at the Birth of the Twentieth Century* (Scribner, New York, 1996), edited and with new material by Dan Rather, based on Sullivan's landmark study; *Only Yesterday: An Informal History of the Nineteen-Twenties* (Harper & Row, Publishers, New York, 1931), Frederick Lewis Allen; *Culture as History: The Transformation of American Society in the Twentieth Century* (Pantheon Books, New York, 1984), Warren I. Susman; *1919: America's Loss of Innocence* (Donald I. Fine, Inc., New York, 1990), by Eliot Asinof, which concludes, not surprisingly, with a long chapter on the Black Sox scandal; *The End of American Innocence: The First Years of Our Own Time, 1912-1917* (Oxford University Press, New York and London, 1959), Henry F. May; *The Damned and the Beautiful: American Youth in the 1920's* (Oxford University Press, New York and London, 1977), Paula S. Fass; *Modern Temper: American Culture and Society in the 1920s* (Hill and Wang, New York, 1995), Lynn Dumenil; *Mass Media Between the Wars: Perceptions of Cultural Tension, 1918-1941* (Syracuse University Press, 1984), edited by Catherine L. Covert and John D. Stevens;

Ain't We Got Fun? Essays, Lyrics and Stories of the Twenties (New American Library, New York, 1980), edited and with an introduction by Barbara Solomon; and two books by Paul A. Carter, *The Twenties in America* (Thomas Y. Crowell Company, New York, 1968), and *Another Part of the Twenties* (Columbia University Press, New York, 1977).

Several sources, in addition to Weiss' *The American Myth of Success*, help to classify Fullerton's writing, including "Baseball in American Fiction," *English Journal* (56:November 1967); "The All-American Boys: A Study of Boys' Sports Fiction," *Journal of Popular Culture* (6:Summer 1972); *A History of American Magazines*, Vol. 4, 1885-1905 (Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Mass., 1957), Frank L. Mott; and *From Rags to Riches: Horatio Alger Jr. and The American Dream* (The Macmillan Company, New York, 1963), John Tebbel.

There is no definitive bibliography of Fullerton's work, although his grandson, Hugh S. Fullerton V, compiled a listing of more than 150 articles and seven books in 1987. Making the job more difficult are three things: Fullerton often wrote without a byline; some of the publications he wrote for are not carried in index services or commonly found in library collections; and he often wrote under another name, including the pen name Ralph Stuart (a brother-in-law) in the years immediately preceding the Black Sox scandal. In personal correspondence between Fullerton and Ralph T. Hale, editor of Small, Maynard & Company Publishers in Boston, in early 1917, Hale wrote: "You may be sure that I shall not give away the identity of Ralph Stuart. It is a curious fact which is constantly being exemplified in the careers of various friends of mine, that when a man is particularly successful, as you have been, in any one kind of writing,

nobody wants him to write anything else.” Fullerton likely considered that good advice; he also was as prolific as Stephen King/Richard Bachman is today.

Fullerton wrote a great deal else, however, in a genre generally categorized as success literature that had its roots in early American Puritanism and crystallized in the middle third of the nineteenth century. This rags-to-riches tradition centered around many of the same ethical concepts institutionalized in Middle Border education (Fullerton was born in 1873 in Hillsboro, Ohio) through McGuffey Readers and popularized in the novels of Horatio Alger. McGuffey may have been the most influential American moralizer of the nineteenth century; Alger, a kindred spirit to Fullerton, may have been its most popular. Fullerton’s most obvious tie to Alger and this style of literature was a three-volume series of youth baseball novels published in 1915 called the Jimmy Kirkland Stories: *Jimmy Kirkland of the Shasta Boys’ Team* (John C. Winston Company Publisher, Philadelphia, 1915), *Jimmy Kirkland of the Cascade College Team* (John C. Winston Company Publisher, Philadelphia, 1915), and *Jimmy Kirkland and the Plot for a Pennant* (John C. Winston Company Publisher, Philadelphia, 1915). A further connection between Fullerton and Alger is “Remember That the Game Is the Thing: Hugh S. Fullerton and the Jimmy Kirkland Series” (*Horatio Alger Society Newsboy*, Mundelein, Ill., 32:3 May-June 1994), by Kathleen E. Chamberlain, a colleague of Hugh Fullerton V.

Although he was employed by newspapers in Columbus, Cincinnati, Chicago, New York and Philadelphia from around 1893, shortly after he left Ohio State University, for almost five decades, Fullerton was a prolific author and magazine writer. Of his roughly 150 identifiable articles, less than half were sports related and more than a third

were fiction. Also, Fullerton rarely remained in a specific general interest pattern for long. Although greatly respected in his own time as a baseball writer and prognosticator, Fullerton was adept at telling a story and wrote about a wide variety of subjects for a wide variety of publications. From 1909, when his first magazine articles appeared (four on baseball, one on market economies), to 1928, Fullerton published more than 80 stories in the progressive *American Magazine* (the majority of them before 1922). His earliest baseball work dealt with what Fullerton called the science of baseball, as did his final published story, "Inside Baseball," printed posthumously in *Esquire* (May 1946). A series of five articles in *American Magazine* (1910-11) paralleled the classic book he wrote with the great Chicago Cubs second baseman Johnny Evers (of Tinkers to Evers to Chance), *Touching Second: The Science of Baseball* (The Reilly & Britton Company, Chicago, 1910). Eerily similar in tone to Frederick Winslow Taylor's classic essay, *The Principles of Scientific Management* (W.W. Norton & Company, New York and London, 1911), the book and system that Fullerton perfected combined the application of scientific management with the high moral purpose, or ethical impulse, so dominant in most of his writing, and in progressivism in general. In 1912, Fullerton demonstrated his range in "Eating: A Study in the Preparation, Location and Mastication of Food" (*American Magazine*, 73:March 1912). By 1913, though he was near the height of his forecasting fame and writing "The Wake of the News" column in the *Chicago Tribune*, Fullerton never again published more sports articles than general interest stories in magazines. In 1916, for example, his most prolific year as a magazine writer, he published just two baseball stories and 21 general interest stories.

One of the baseball stories, however, "A Daring Baseball Prediction: This Year's

Winner Picked in Both Leagues" (*American Magazine*, 81:May 1916) detailed

Fullerton's mathematical system of "doping" the relative strengths of ballplayers and teams, in which he assigned numerical values to each position. He had been using the system for about a dozen years and continued well into the 1930's. Fullerton made his reputation in 1906, not only picking the Hitless Wonder Chicago White Sox to defeat their powerful cross-town rivals, the Chicago Cubs (winners of a still-record 116 regular-season games), four games to two, but he accurately predicted the scores of each game (and that the Friday game would be rained out!). When he repeated his success in 1907, 1908 and 1909 (the string was broken in 1910, 1914 and, as a result of the fix, 1919), Fullerton's reputation as the Bill James of his day was solidified. In fact, it took the scandal and the introduction of the live ball in 1920 to undo Fullerton's doping system and his unmatched string of prognosticating success.

Fullerton's first piece of fiction, "Test o' Nerve" (*American Magazine*, 76: December 1913), a thinly disguised account of a real baseball situation, was inspirational in tone and laid the groundwork for his three Alger-style, Kirkland youth baseball novels two years later. Fullerton's fiction period picked up in earnest in 1914. Of the 17 magazine articles he wrote, 11 were fiction and five had baseball as the subject. This was also the year Fullerton wrote his "American Gambling and Gamblers" series in *American Magazine*. The year after the Kirkland books were published, Fullerton wrote 11 pieces of magazine fiction, three baseball related.

In 1916, Fullerton also started writing an occasional series for *American* about the Get Out and Get On (GOGO) Club, supposedly a club in a Midwestern city, probably Chicago, whose members were involved in helping each other achieve success. When a member was successful, he had to leave the club, which became a gold mine of success stories. Five such stories, all unbylined but unmistakably written in Fullerton's style and included in his grandson's bibliography, appeared through 1917. Fullerton seemed especially interested in real-life Horatio Alger types, and this style of success literature dominated this next phase of his published work.

Fullerton published at least eight short stories about baseball in 1917 and 12 magazine pieces in total. By 1920, only two of nine published articles were about baseball, although one was his often-quoted lament about the Black Sox scandal, "Baseball on Trial" (*The New Republic*, October 20, 1920) in which he wrote: "Information that all was not well with the series was furnished to me prior to the opening game (page 183)."

Fullerton's magazine output dwindled after that, perhaps due in part to his age, his new role as an editor at *Liberty Magazine* and later at newspapers in Philadelphia and Columbus, and to his failing health (he suffered from liver and gall bladder problems). One article is particularly significant, however, "That Guy McGuffey" (*The Saturday Evening Post*, November 26, 1927). It signaled a new and consuming interest involving the schoolbooks of his youth and their revival through McGuffey Societies throughout the country, particularly in the Midwest. In the article, Fullerton amplifies the significant influence the Readers had on his early education, calling McGuffey's system "the finest

moral and cultural force in the United States during the formative period of the West (page 14).” In the article, Fullerton also refers to the only lesson in any edition of the Readers dealing with gambling: “Then there was Timothy Flint’s Effects of Gambling. Gosh, after we read that we were almost afraid to play seven-up, and Lonny Pierson refused to say ‘Shuffle’ when we played authors with cards for fear he would become a confirmed gambler. McGuffey’s moral lessons sank home with some of us, anyhow (page 63).” Most certainly, it sunk home with Fullerton.

Fullerton’s near-obsession with the Readers is apparent in his participation in a project that resulted in the publication of *Old Favorites from the McGuffey Readers* (American Book Company, New York, 1936), edited by Harvey C. Minnich, curator of the McGuffey Museum at Miami University in Oxford, Ohio. Fullerton is listed as one of 13 associate editors that include Henry Ford, John W. Studebaker, James M. Cox, Mark Sullivan and Hamlin Garland. Fullerton also wrote the preface to the book, in which he wrote of McGuffey: “He taught millions how and what to read and study. He taught generations of American boys and girls the joy of labor - whether manual or mental. And the man who taught us how to study and work, also taught us how to play. More than forty selections in his Readers taught fair play and sportsmanship. In a time when sports and games were rude, rough, sometimes almost savage he preached the doctrine of fair play and honor. He was, in fact, the father of sportsmanship in the classroom, the workshop, and on the playing field (page vi).”

Other than the Jimmy Kirkland series, perhaps the closest Fullerton came to putting McGuffey’s lessons into action was an article he wrote in 1921, “The Ten

Commandments of Sport, and of Everything Else” (*American Magazine*, 92:August

1921). Fullerton’s “Code of a Good Sport” included: “1. Though shalt not quit. 2. Thou shalt not alibi. 3. Though shalt not gloat over winning. 4. Though shalt not be a rotten loser. 5. Though shalt not take unfair advantage. 6. Though shalt not ask odds thou art unwilling to give. 7. Thou shalt always be ready to give thine opponent the shade. 8. Thou shalt not *under* estimate an opponent, nor *over* estimate thyself. 9. Remember that the game is the thing, and that he who thinketh otherwise is a mucker and no true sportsman. 10. Honor the game thou playest, for he who playeth the game straight and hard wins even when he loses (page 54).” Every element of the code is present and elaborated upon in the Kirkland books.

My understanding of Fullerton devotion to McGuffey Readers was greatly enhanced by personal correspondence between Fullerton and Minnich on a variety of subjects between May 14, 1938 and February 27, 1945, just a few months before Fullerton died. Through those letters, Fullerton was able to learn from Minnich that his grandfather, Hugh I, was prepared for the ministry by McGuffey personally and that his grandfather sent his four sons, including Hugh’s father, to study at Miami, where McGuffey was president at the time. Fullerton wrote one more piece on McGuffey, “Two Jolly Old Pedagogues” (*The Saturday Evening Post*, June 14, 1941) that focused on Minnich’s efforts to erect a statue of the educator at Miami in 1941. “I feel the influence of McGuffey is growing,” Fullerton wrote to Minnich on September 8, 1940. And in a remarkable letter dated February 13, 1945, Fullerton asked Minnich “if any plan has been evolved to carry on the McGuffey tradition after we are gone ... My wife and I have been

working on a plan to organize small groups in many communities to study and teach youngsters the arts, crafts, traditions and songs of early America which naturally fits in with the McGuffey idea. We have a few organized and they report lots of fun and unexpected interest among the new generation ... I feel that something must be done to save the American form of government and to offset the trend toward Sovietizing the United States - and hope to contribute a little to that end." This was Fullerton's final project.

Several sources contributed additional background on Fullerton's life and career: "Interesting People: Hugh S. Fullerton" (*American Magazine*, June 1912), by Grantland Rice; "Hugh, Who Was Game's Original Dopester, Dies at 72," (*Sporting News*, January 3, 1946), by Fred Lieb; "Hugh Fullerton, Greatest of the Baseball Writers" (*The Magazine of Sigma Chi*, November-December 1947); "Fullerton Praised for Versatility, Persistence" (*The Ohio Newspaper*, December 1956), by Laurence R. Connor; and "Fullerton, Famed Forecaster, Named Spink Award Winner" (*The Sporting News*, November 7, 1964), by Fred Lieb.

To complete the picture of Fullerton and the ethical impulse in his sportswriting, it is important to understand the impact of education on the Middle Border in the last third of the nineteenth century, where and when Fullerton was schooled. The impact of education in late nineteenth century America is examined in *Main Street in the Middle Border* (Indiana University Press, Bloomington, Ind., 1954), Lewis Atherton; *Culture in the Moving Frontier* (Indiana University Press, Bloomington, Ind., 1955), Louis B. Wright; *Small Town America: A Narrative History, 1620-The Present* (Houghton Mifflin

Company, Boston, 1980); *The Transformation of the School* (Knopf, New York, 1962),

Lawrence A. Cremin; *Education in the United States* (Free Press, New York, 1976),

Robert L. Church and Michael W. Sedlak; and *The Social Ideas of American Educators*

(Pageant Books, Patterson, N.J., 1959), Merle Eugene Curti. Jonathan Raban, in *Bad*

Land: An American Romance (Pantheon Book, New York, 1996) writes about the impact

of another influential set of schoolbooks, the Atlantic Readers, “and their relentlessly

improving tone (page 146),” on the Plains States. The similarities to McGuffey Readers is striking.

There are a number of studies on McGuffey and his Readers, although references to the impact of the schoolbooks are infrequent in general studies of nineteenth century and progressive American education. Most recent, and benefiting from the work done before her, is Dolores P. Sullivan’s *William Holmes McGuffey: Schoolmaster to the Nation* (Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, London and Toronto, 1994), which includes several Fullerton references and a useful chapter on the Federation of McGuffey Clubs. Other sources include the highly favorable *William Holmes McGuffey and His Readers* (American Book Company, New York, 1936), written by Harvey C. Minnich in conjunction with the publication of *Old Favorites From the McGuffey Readers; Making the American Mind: Social and Moral Ideas in the McGuffey Readers* (Russell and Russell, New York), 1965; *McGuffey and His Readers* (Abingdon, Nashville, 1978), John H. Westerhof; *Our Times* by Mark Sullivan; *A History of the McGuffey Readers* (The Burrows Brothers Company, 1911). Henry Vail: *Son of the Middle Border* (The Macmillan Company, New York, 1917). Hamlin Garland: *The Miami Years* (G.P.

Putnam & Sons, New York, 1969). Walter Havighurst, particular Chapter V, "Primer for a Green World;" *The Annotated McGuffey* (Van Nostrand Reinhold, New York, 1976), Stanley W. Lindberg; "McGuffey and His Readers" (*Saturday Review of Literature*, June 16, 1962), Henry Steele Commager; "Lessons for Today from McGuffey's Readers" (*The New York Times Magazine*, May 20, 1951), Phyllis McGinley; "He Scared the Devil Out of Grandpa" (*The Saturday Evening Post*, January 22, 1955), Henry F. Katherine Pringle; "The Most Influential Volumes in America: McGuffey's Eclectic Readers, Food for Our Nineteenth Century" (*New York Herald Tribune*, January 2, 1937), reviews of *Old Favorites From the McGuffey Readers* and *William Holmes McGuffey and His Readers* written by Mark Sullivan; "McGuffey Lessons - and Non-Lessons" (*The New York Times Magazine*, December 3, 1961), Henry F. Graft; "McGuffey Centennial Celebration Big Success; Delegates Laud Program, Town's Civic Spirit" (*Oxford Press*, Oxford, Ohio, July 30, 1936); and "McGuffey Celebration Commemorating the Centenary of the Appearance of the Third and Fourth McGuffey Readers," program, July 31-August 1, 1937.

Finally, my understanding of the differences between the piety of the early editions and the more secular nature of the post-1857 editions, with which Fullerton was most likely to have come into contact, was enhanced by *Death Education in McGuffey's Readers, 1836-1896* (unpublished Ph.D. thesis, University of Minnesota, 1979), by Ronald Fred Dorr, now a professor at Michigan State University. Dorr's first chapters, "The Success of McGuffey's Readers," "The Audience for McGuffey's Readers," and the "Impact of McGuffey's Readers," are as insightful as anything else written. Dorr's

“Bibliography of McGuffey’s Readers” clearly differentiates the various editions of the Readers, and his concluding “Bibliographical Essay” is a frank assessment of the literature surrounding William Holmes McGuffey, the man, and his Readers. Fullerton would have enjoyed it.